

## **ANNEXURE 4**

# NOTIFICATION, REGISTRATION, COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

## Interested and Affected Parties (I&APs) & Organs of State



N/C DENC REF: NC/EIA/10/JTG/GA/MAM/2013  
DMR REF: NC 30/1/2/2/10031 MR

ENVASS REF: 145\_12-13

### PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCESS (PPP) FOR AN INTEGRATED ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT PROCESS FOR THE MAMATWAN MINE MANGANESE & IRON ORE MINE, NORTHERN CAPE

Table 1: I&AP Notifications, Registrations, Comments and Responses

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
Mamatwan 331	3	Hotazel Manganese Mines (Pty) Ltd  Mr RJ Langford (Director)	Postal: PO Box 8186 Johannesburg 2000  Dineo Peta Team Lead: Mineral Rights  6 Hollard Street, Johannesburg T: +27 11 376 2627 <a href="mailto:dineo.peta@bhpbilliton.com">dineo.peta@bhpbilliton.com</a>	11/12/13:  Email received from Dineo Peta (Team Lead: Mineral Rights): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Confirming that the MPRDA Scoping Process has been completed for this project;</li> <li>➤ We are in process of finalising the NEMA;</li> <li>➤ The EIA has not commenced as yet;</li> <li>➤ BHP will receive notice thereof upon commencement</li> <li>➤ Requested Mpho Letsoalo's contact details to obtain clarification regarding land use during prospecting.</li> </ul>	11/12/13:  ENVASS responded: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Concurred to Dineo Peta's comments; and</li> <li>- Provided the contact details for Mpho Letsoalo.</li> </ul>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
Mamatwan 331	8	<p>Tshipi E Ntle Manganese Mines (Pty) Ltd</p> <p>Mr Finn Behnken (CEO)</p> <p>Webber Wentzel (on behalf of Tshipi)</p> <p>Mr S. Peverelle (Consultant)</p>	<p>Postal: PO Box 652286 Benmore 2010</p> <p>Tel: 011 706 9004</p> <p>Fax: 086 240 4925</p> <p>Email: finn@tshipi.co.za</p>	<p>21/02/14:</p> <p>Letter received from Sylvester Peverelle (Webber Wentzel Attorneys – representing Tshipi è Ntle Manganese Proprietary Limited 'Tshipi' and Ntsimbintle Mining Proprietary Limited 'Ntsimbintle'):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Webber Wentzel represent Tshipi and Ntsimbintle.</li> <li>2. They refer to our email dated 20 December 2013 and the invitation to comment on the Draft Scoping Report and Annexures.</li> <li>3. It is reiterated that Mamatwan Manganese (MM) has to date not meaningfully consulted with Tshipi or Ntsimbintle.</li> <li>4. <b>Comment on Draft Social and Labour Plan:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4.1 The properties included in the various documents are confusing.</li> <li>4.2 They do not agree that Portion 8 of Mamatwan 331 is not populated. Tshipi records they currently occupy the Portion.</li> </ol> </li> <li>5. <b>Comments on Draft Scoping Report:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5.1 Tshipi commented that the south of Portion 8 and Portion 18 of Mamatwan 331, are not mineralised. It is not competent to include these portions in Mamatwan Manganese's (MM) project.</li> <li>5.2 Tshipi is of the opinion that the study area is located within the Joe Morolong Local Municipality and not those described within the Draft Scoping Report.</li> <li>5.3 The cone of depression caused by the Project, will have an adverse effect on the availability of water which Tshipi itself requires for its own mining operations. This will oblige Tshipi to increasingly rely on water sourced from Sedibeng – with a resultant significant increase in the cost of water to Tshipi.</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	<p>25/02/14:</p> <p>ENVASS responded, confirmed receipt of comments raised. ENVASS indicated that a formal response will be submitted in due course.</p> <p><i>Note: These comments were raised during the NEMA Scoping process and therefore the formal responses will be provided within the NEMA timeline prior to the release of the FINAL Scoping Report in due course.</i></p>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
				<p><b>Comments on Draft Scoping Report Continues:</b></p> <p>5.4 Thisipi is concerned that the Project may result in the influx of migrant workers to the area.</p> <p>5.5 Thisipi agrees that the Project will result in increased vehicular, rail and pedestrian traffic.</p> <p>5.6 Tshipi is concerned that the Project may have an adverse effect on the local Viermuisleegte watercourse.</p> <p>5.7 See comments under 6.2 below.</p> <p>5.8 Tshipi points out that no boreholes are indicated on Portion 3 of the farm Mamatwan 331 ("Portion 3") or for Portion 18 (a Portion of Portion 3).</p> <p>5.9 Ad "Location of the Mine" on page 14 of the Draft Scoping Report (DSR). 5.1 applies.</p> <p>5.10 The owners of Portion 8 (not Remaining Extent of 8) and Portion 18 (not Remaining extent of 18) are not correct. Tshipi however records that it has acquired Portion 18 from the current registered owner that it is in lawful occupation thereof and that registration of transfer will be attended to in due course. Refer to 5.1.</p> <p>5.11 The locality of the Project site is not correctly stated in the last paragraph on page 16 and the first paragraph on page 17 of the DSR. The statement regarding the Sishem-Saldanha and Sishen PE railway routes is not correct.</p> <p>5.12 Ad the paragraph numbered 28. (1) (c) on page 19 - Tshipi holds the view that the DSR does not satisfy the requirements of this paragraph.</p> <p>5.13 Ad the paragraph numbered 28.(1)(d) Tshipi holds the view that the DSR does not satisfy the requirements of this paragraph. Refer to 5.1 above.</p> <p>5.14 An expansion of the Middelplaats siding is not possible. It is a private siding and it cannot be accessed without such access crossing and impinging on Tshipi's own railway access. MM's proposal is not practically possible. MM's requirements will have to link into the Main railway line.</p> <p>5.15 The "facilities and infrastructure" which MM requires to be "expanded" is privately owned.</p>	

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
				<p>5.16 The road that needs to be "widened" is privately owned by Tshipi and a third party.</p> <p>5.17 The position of the area which MM intends occupying is not clear and MM has to date not provided clarity in regard thereto nor any detail of the layout of its proposed infrastructure. Any position and layout in close proximity to Tshipi's own mining operation and activities incidental thereto, will undoubtedly limit Tshipi's ability to conduct its own mining operations.</p> <p>5.18 The DSR does not make reference to the Mine Health and Safety Act. MM did not pay due consideration to the safety and health of its own nor that of the employees of lawful users of the properties concerned. MM wants to locate some of their infrastructure on areas where Tshipi's lawful mining and activities incidental thereto will pose a threat to the safety and health of MM's employees and also of Tshipi's employees.</p> <p>5.19 The relevance of the Integrated Development Plan ("IDP") of the Ga-Segonyane local Municipality is not clear. MM should consider the IDP of the Local Municipality where the Project is located.</p> <p>5.20 Ad "Question A2" on Page 32 of the DSR it is not clear which town should be expanded.</p> <p>5.21 Ad "Question A4" on page 33 of the DSR - MM should add that it requires infrastructure which will afford it access to railway facilities and that such infrastructure has yet to be developed.</p> <p>5.22 Ad "Question B4" on page 34 of the DSR - MM's statement in regard to the locality of its infrastructure is not correct. It is possible for MM to find suitable alternative locations for its required infrastructure and that it is indeed imperative that MM does so by duly consulting with all relevant parties.</p> <p>5.23 Ad "Question B5" on page 34 of the DSR - the locality of the proposed mine is not correctly stated.</p>	

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
				<p>5.24 Ad the paragraph dealing with "Climate" on page 35 of the DSR – the temperature patterns of Kuruman are not representative of the area due to the hilly topography.</p> <p>5.25 The occurrence of Puff adder and Green (not Brown boomslang are high and Rock python is low.</p> <p>5.26 Ad paragraph 6.9 on page 45 of the DSR – tshipi questions the correctness of the reference to "Mothibistad".</p> <p>5.27 Ad paragraph 7.1 on page 46 – MM seems to disregard the fact that the existing access road is a private road.</p> <p>5.28 Ad "Table 8" on page 47 – Tshipi submits that the stated value "0.6 for development" is inconsistent with an earlier stated value of "0.4".</p> <p>5.29 Tshipi questions the correctness of the reference to flammable gas as a potential pollutant.</p> <p>5.30 Ad paragraph 9.1 on page 56 - Comments under 5.14 applies.</p> <p>5.31 Tshipi questions the correctness of the reference to "Western Cape".</p> <p>5.32 Copy of the DSR with highlighted sections attached to comments.</p> <p>6. <b>Comment of draft Plan of Study:</b> The comments on the draft Scoping Report above also apply to the draft Plan of Study.</p>	

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
				<p><b>7. Comments on draft Potential Direct Impacts of the Project:</b></p> <p>7.1 Refer to comment 5.1 and the document does not in all cases propose remedial/mitigation measures for identified impacts.</p> <p><b>8. Comments of draft Potential Cumulative Impacts of the Project:</b></p> <p>8.1 Refer to point 7.1 above</p> <p>8.2 There will be a significant increase in traffic over all level crossings and that upgrading of affected roads will be essential.</p> <p>8.3 Refer to comment 5.3.</p> <p>8.4 The DSR neither any other provided documents identify and address the impacts which the Project will have on Tshipi's existing mining operation, e.g. the effect on Tshipi's ability to conduct its own mining operations in a safe and effective manner including but not limited to the adverse effect on Tshipi's ability to conduct blasting operations, the adverse effect of MM's proposed surface infrastructure on Tshipi's ability to safely and effectively access its own operations, the limitation of Tshipi's area required to dump discard and attend to its own rehabilitation operations.</p> <p>8.5 We enclose a scanned copy of the draft Potential Cumulative Impacts document for easy reference.</p>	

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
				<p><b>9. Comment on draft Maps in respect of the Project:</b></p> <p>9.1 Comment 5.1 also applies to some of the maps. Specifically where there is reference to Portions 3 and 18 of Mamatwan 331.</p> <p>9.2 We enclose scanned copies of the maps for easy reference.</p> <p><b>10. Comments on draft Concept (Engineering ) Study:</b></p> <p>10.1 Ad the sixth introductory page – AS FAR AS Tshipi is aware, Eskom has no excess power available in the area. Tshipi's information is that the pipeline might only be upgraded by Sedibng water during 2017;</p> <p>10.2 Ad paragraph 1.3 on pages 1 and 2 of 79 – in Tshipi's view all protected plant species in the area should be listed here;</p> <p>10.3 Ad paragraph 4 on page 14 of 79 – Tshipi's comment in general in respect of geological information reflected in the document is that it confirms Tshipi's contention, as set out in detail in the Objection, that Portion 18 and the southern portion of Portion 8 are not mineralised;</p> <p>10.4 Ad "Table 7.1" on page 26 of 79 – Tshipi questions the correctness of the value of 0% as stated against "Dilution". In Tshipi's view the steep dips result in inevitable dilution;</p> <p>10.5 Ad paragraph 11.1 on page 53 of 79 – their comment under 5.14 applies;</p> <p>10.6 Ad Figure 11.1 on page 54 of 79 – their comment under 5.14 applies. They point out that the property/Project boundaries are not correct;</p> <p>10.7 Ad paragraph 15.2.2 on page 69 of 79 – they note that there is correctly no mention of the resource extending on to either Portion 18 or the southern portion of Portion 8 – as such properties are proven to not be mineralised – as set out in detail in the Objection;</p>	



PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
				<p>10.8 Ad paragraph 16.4 on pages 73 and 74 of 79 – Tshipi notes that the option of transporting run of mine (RoM) product to the intended Transnet rail siding will require significant upgrading of the relevant roads;</p> <p>10.9 Ad paragraph 16.5 on pages 73 and 74 of 79 – Tshipi notes that the "Transnet shared loading facility" referred to is in fact a marshalling yard and it is accordingly, in Tshipi's view, not fit for intended purpose;</p> <p>10.10 Ad Appendix 2 – Drawings and in specific the first drawing which shows the schematic room(s) and pillar(s) – it is not clear, in the proposed layout, whether the effect of Tshipi's own future blasting on its side of the boundary pillar has been taken into account;</p> <p>10.11 Ad Appendix 2 – Drawings and in specific the second last drawing which shows the proposed layout of surface infrastructure – it is clear that the proposed surface infrastructure will definitely be within Tshipi's own blasting safety zone;</p> <p>10.12 They enclosed a scanned copy of the draft Concept (Engineering) Study for easy reference;</p> <p>11. They reserve their client's rights to be meaningfully consulted with in accordance with relevant legislation as well as its rights to supplement its comments on the documents commented on in terms of this letter and on any further draft documents and process which MM may be developing in respect of the Project;</p> <p>12. They trust ENVASS finds the above in order and await acknowledgement of receipt of their comments.</p>	

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
Mamatwan 331	18	<p>Tshipi E Ntle Manganese Mines (Pty) Ltd</p> <p>Jeff Leader (Owner's representative)</p> <p>Webber Wentzel (on behalf of Tshipi)</p> <p>Ms M. Erasmus (Associate) Mr S. Peverelle (Consultant)</p>	<p>Email: <a href="mailto:jeff@tshipi.co.za">jeff@tshipi.co.za</a> <a href="mailto:Maxie.Erasmus@webberwentzel.com">Maxie.Erasmus@webberwentzel.com</a> <a href="mailto:Sylvester.Peverelle@webberwentzel.com">Sylvester.Peverelle@webberwentzel.com</a></p>	<p><b>28/08/13:</b></p> <p>Telecom and email received from Ms. Erasmus from Webber Wentzel:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Webber Wentzel is acting on behalf of Tshipi E Ntle Manganese Proprietary Limited; and</li> <li>2. Requested a copy of the acceptance letter from the DMR for the Mining Right Application.</li> </ol> <p><b>28/08/13:</b></p> <p>Email received from Mr. Leader. He attached the consolidated SG diagram which he indicated also coincides with Tshipi's EMP and with Ntsimbintle's surface rights. He noted that the mining right excludes Mamatwan 331 portion 18.</p> <p><b>06/09/13:</b></p> <p>Email received with the objection against application for a mining right by Mamatwan Manganese South Africa (Pty) Ltd [IWOV-WS_JHB.FID1552360] from Mr. Peverelle for ENVASS records for inclusion in the PPP of the EIA process. This included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>~ Letter of objection 06.09.2013</li> <li>~ Annexure A –G referred to in Objection</li> <li>~ Proof of lodgement of above mentioned documents</li> </ul> <p>Mr Peverelle further specifically highlighted paragraphs 1.1 and 1.2 of enclosed letter to DMR, as well as paragraph 5.4 Mr Peverelle requested a copy of the MMSA's application for mining right and all covering letters. A copy of MMSA's Mining Work Programme and Social and Labour Plan and EMP was also requested.</p> <p><b>** REFER TO ANNEXURE FOR A COPY OF THE OBJECTION AND SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION.</b></p>	<p><b>28/08/13:</b></p> <p>ENVASS responded to Ms. Erasmus, acknowledged receipt of correspondence and provided them with a copy of the acceptance letter issued by the DMR on 05/07/13 for the Mining Right Application submitted. ENVASS confirmed that the MPRDA Scoping Report has been completed and submitted to the DMR.</p>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
Mamatwan 331	18	<p>Tshipi E Ntle Manganese Mines (Pty) Ltd</p> <p>Jeff Leader (Owner's representative)</p> <p>Webber Wentzel (on behalf of Tshipi)</p> <p>Ms M. Erasmus (Associate)</p> <p>Mr S. Peverelle (Consultant)</p>	<p>Email:  <a href="mailto:jeff@tshipi.co.za">jeff@tshipi.co.za</a>  <a href="mailto:Maxie.Erasmus@webberwentzel.com">Maxie.Erasmus@webberwentzel.com</a>  <a href="mailto:Sylvester.Peverelle@webberwentzel.com">Sylvester.Peverelle@webberwentzel.com</a></p>	<p>23/10/13:</p> <p>Letter sent from Webber Wentzel (on behalf of Tshipi E Ntle Manganese):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Confirming I&amp;AP registration;</li> <li>2. Objection;</li> <li>3. Requesting additional documents <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A copy of the complete Mamatwan Application for mining right.</li> <li>• An appropriately redacted copy of the Mining Work programme which Mamatwan lodged in support of the application.</li> </ul> </li> </ol> <p><b>** REFER TO ANNEXURE FOR A COPY OF THE LETTER REQUESTING THE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTATION.</b></p>	<p>08/11/13:</p> <p>Mamatwan Manganese responded and provided the documentation requested to Tshipi E Ntle Manganese.</p>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
Mamatwan 331	RE	Mr Dries van de Berg (Owner)	<p>Cell: 0824954409  <b>Email:</b>  <a href="mailto:dries@tshipi.co.za">dries@tshipi.co.za</a>  <a href="mailto:ayres.philip@gmail.com">ayres.philip@gmail.com</a>  <a href="mailto:andriesvdb1@gmail.com">andriesvdb1@gmail.com</a></p>	<p><b>12/08/13:</b>  Email received from Mr. Philip Ayres:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mr. Dries van de Berg is his father in law and that the proposed mine will be located in the area of his farm and on his farm itself;</li> <li>He requested I&amp;AP registration and noted that all correspondence must be sent to his email address;</li> <li>He confirmed the due date for comments and questions regarding the EIA;</li> <li>He enquired whether the project was on schedule as per the EIA process depicted in the BID; and</li> <li>He enquired access requirements on his father in laws farm for the specialist assessments.</li> </ol> <p><b>13/08/13:</b>  Email received from Mr. Ayres confirming:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>He will send their comments before 05/09/13.</li> <li>Access for specialists must be arranged with his father in law (Dries van de Berg) or brother in law.</li> <li>His request for a list of specialists that will require access to the site.</li> </ol> <p><b>06/09/13:</b>  Email received from Mr. Van de Berg with comments and concerns regarding the following</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>~ The wellbeing of the ecology, animals and birds on farm;</li> <li>~ Impacts on rare species found on his farm (footless lizard) ;</li> <li>~ Heritage impact <i>inter alia</i>:  Farm house was been built in 1922; and  Graves of forefathers on the farm;</li> </ul> <p><b>09/09/13:</b>  Email received from Mr. Ayres:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Thanking ENVASS for the correspondence to date;</li> <li>- Requesting that their comments raised on 06/09/13 be taken into consideration with the identification of required specialist studies which must inform the plan of study for the EIA.</li> </ul>	<p><b>12/08/13:</b>  ENVASS responded to Mr. Ayres and Mr. van de Berg:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Confirming I&amp;AP registration and channel of communication w.r.t. the project;</li> <li>Confirming the current EIA project status;</li> <li>Requesting any comments or concerns that they have at this stage so that these can be assessed in the respective specialist assessments;</li> <li>Confirming that the specialists will require access in August – September; and the</li> <li>Access arrangements were confirmed.</li> </ol> <p><b>09/09/13:</b>  ENVASS responded, thanked Mr. Van de Berg for the comments raised. ENVASS confirmed I&amp;AP registration and indicated to him that a formal response on his comments will be send to him in due course.</p> <p><b>09/09/13:</b>  ENVASS responded to Mr. Ayres and confirmed that:.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• I&amp;AP registration.</li> </ul>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
Mamatwan 331	RE	Mr Dries van de Berg (Owner)	<p>Cell: 0824954409  Email:  dries@tshipi.co.za  ayres.philip@gmail.com  andriesvdb1@gmail.com</p>	<p>- Confirmation was also requested from ENVASS on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• I&amp;AP registration and that they expect to be treated as such with regard the distribution and communication of information. In this context personal engagement and provision of Scoping and EIA documentation to them personally (especially his father-in-law) is appropriate and required;</li> <li>• In terms of the National Water Act, early discussions with his father-in-law towards land owner consent for submission of license applications will be required, the provision of which is not implied;</li> <li>• A formal Public Participation Process will commence, where opportunity for comment will be afforded following a presentation detailing the proposed project, activities and anticipated impacts;</li> <li>• Their comments will be documented and confirmed with them in the issues and response register and adequately addressed in specialist studies terms of reference for inclusion into the final specialist reports; and</li> <li>• Access to the property will be afforded to pre-arranged individuals only, facilitated by ENVASS upon appointment.</li> </ul> <p>Mr. Ayres also requested the following</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A project schedule with anticipated time frames and milestones for the Scoping and EIA phase, including the IWUL application.</li> <li>• List of specialist names anticipated to conduct work and scheduled site work dates.</li> </ul> <p><b>** NOTE THIS IS A SUMMARISED VERSION OF COMMENTS RAISED. REFER TO ANNEXURE FOR THE ACTUAL COMMENTS.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ENVASS will provide them with the relevant NEMA Scoping and EIA documentation as and when it becomes available.</li> <li>• The IWULA process has not commenced. The required discussions with his father-in-law towards land owner consent for submission of license applications will still be undertaken.</li> <li>• A formal Public Participation Process (undertaken in accordance with the requirements of Chapter 6 (Regulations 54-57) of the EIA Regulations 2010) is ongoing, and all stakeholders, landowners and other parties is provided with the opportunity for comments and input.</li> <li>• An open house / public meeting will be held in due course where there will be a presentation detailing the proposed project, activities and anticipated impacts.</li> <li>• All comments received is documented in a issues and responses register (as per the requirements of Regulations 56 and 57 of the EIA Regulations 2010). Note the issues and response register shall be included in all Draft and Final Documentation to be distributed to the public for comment as well as to the Component Authority.</li> <li>• All comments raised to date shall be considered and incorporated into the terms of reference for the specialist studies and Plan of Study for the EIA.</li> <li>• Access to the property will be arranged with them before hand and by appointment only. ENVASS shall facilitate this as confirmed previously.</li> <li>• Draft project schedule was provided.</li> </ul>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
Mamatwan 331	RE	Mr Dries van de Berg (Owner)	Cell: 0824954409 Email: <a href="mailto:dries@tshipi.co.za">dries@tshipi.co.za</a> <a href="mailto:ayres.philip@gmail.com">ayres.philip@gmail.com</a> <a href="mailto:andriesvdb1@gmail.com">andriesvdb1@gmail.com</a>	04/11/13: Email received from Mr. Philip Ayres: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Requesting confirmation, status updates and findings on the specialist studies, specifically the Ecological and Heritage that has been completed.</li> <li>2. Confirmation that the proposed mining will be underground.</li> </ol>	08/11/13: ENVASS responded and confirmed that they are preparing a formal response on Mr. Ayres comments raised.  08/11/13: Subsequent to a telephone call from Mr. Ayres, ENVASS formally provided the following responses which included: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- An apology for the late response (this was due to ENVASS still confirming information requested);</li> <li>- Scope of the Ecological and Heritage Assessments was provided and clarified;</li> <li>- Confirmation that their comments and concerns raised to date has been incorporated into the specialist assessments;</li> <li>- Confirmation that all specialist assessments will be released during the EIA phase of the project.</li> <li>- Outstanding specialist studies includes:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>&gt; Visual</li> <li>&gt; Noise baseline</li> <li>&gt; Geohydrological</li> <li>&gt; Surface water</li> <li>&gt; Traffic</li> <li>&gt; Land capability</li> </ul> </li> <li>- Project schedule going forward was detailed.</li> <li>- Confirmation on the process required for arranging access to the farm for specialist studies.</li> <li>- Confirmation that the proposed mining method for this mine will be underground and not opencast mining.</li> </ul> <b>** NOTE THIS IS A SUMMARISED VERSION OF RESPONSES PROVIDED. REFER TO ANNEXURE FOR THE ACTUAL CORRESPONDENCE.</b>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
Mamatwan 331	RE	Mr Dries van de Berg (Owner)	<p>Cell: 0824954409  Email:  dries@tshipi.co.za  ayres.philip@gmail.com  andriesvdb1@gmail.com</p>	<p><b>24/02/14:</b>  <b>Socio-economic sustainability:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Concern that the DSR makes reference to the sustainability of the mine with regards to job creation and other benefits for local communities, but the lifespan of the mine will only be 10 years;</li> <li>- The mine is not sustainable and farm land for wildlife or livestock will be permanently altered and lost;</li> </ul> <p><b>Cumulative impacts identified – Increased traffic volumes:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Currently gravel and tar roads in the area is deteriorated due to the high traffic or haulage trucks. Many mining contractors also do not respect other road users and the environment;</li> <li>- High volume of litter next to roads causing hazards to livestock and wildlife;</li> <li>- Increase in road kill; and</li> <li>- Dust pollution from roads will increase.</li> </ul> <p><b>Noise vibration and shock:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Warning reverse sirens on vehicles are disturbing;</li> </ul> <p><b>Page 16 of DSR:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Surname of Mr. Dries van de Berg is incorrectly spelled.</li> </ul> <p><b>Need and desirability:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Income generation through tourism: Tourism in the area is a limited option, except maybe for eco-tourism which may be an option.</li> </ul> <p><b>Desirability:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The I&amp;AP do not agree that leaving the area in its current state could potentially, if not adequately managed, result in degradation and transformation due to further overgrazing'</li> <li>- He is of the opinion that the area also has the potential to be transformed into a nature reserve;</li> </ul>	<p><b>24/02/14:</b></p> <p>ENVASS responded, confirmed receipt of comments raised. ENVASS indicated that a formal response will be submitted in due course.</p> <p><i>Note: These comments were raised during the NEMA Scoping process and therefore the formal responses will be provided within the NEMA timeline prior to the release of the final DSR.</i></p>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- He agrees that the many farms in the area are overgrazed, but the area had recently gone through a drought, which increases the likelihood of overgrazing. Certain farmers, like the landowner try not to overgraze their farms. Farmers who are over-utilising their properties could be educated to implement proper grazing strategies and thereby protecting the environment;</li> <li>- The DSR states that both human and environment will benefit from the development after mitigation, but fails to see how the environment has benefitted from mining in the area;</li> <li>- Page 34 – Question B5 of the DSR states that the area is severely disturbed. He is of the opinion that there are still healthy ecological, natural systems in place in the area;</li> <li>- Page 34 – Question B7 of the DSR – depending on which guidelines are being used, all large scale mining projects will have unacceptable cumulative impacts; and</li> <li>- Page 58 – Alternatives – Railway loop. Is there an alternative route to the current railway loop which crosses my father in laws property?</li> </ul> <p><b>Post-closure:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- What is the proposed end land use for the area to be used for mining?; and</li> <li>- More focus should be placed on post-closure. This will not only benefit the environment and the local communities, but also the application, because of decrease in overall liabilities.</li> </ul>	
MOAB 700	RE	Mr. M.A. Kruger Ms. H.S. Kruger (Owners)	Physical: 327 Milner Street Hotazel 8490 Postal: PO Box 308 Kuruman 8460 Tel: 053 741 1612		



PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
SINTERFON TIEN 784	RE	Hotazel Manganese Mines (Pty) Ltd  Mr RJ Langford (Director)	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 8186 Johannesburg 2000	No comments received.	No comments received.
MOAB 700	3	Hotazel Manganese Mines (Pty) Ltd  Mr RJ Langford (Director)	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 8186 Johannesburg 2000	No comments received.	No comments received.
SHIRLEY 367	RE	Leatitia Penny Trust	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 123 Dibeng 8460	No comments received.	No comments received.
MIDDELPLA ATS 332	RE	Saltrim Ranches  Mr. D Venter Mr. H.P. Venter (Directors)	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 8 Hotazel 8490	Requested to confirm I&AP registration.	<b>14/08/13:</b> ENVASS responded to Mr. Venter confirming I&AP registration.
SHIRLEY 730	RE	Mr Andrew. Pyper (Owner)	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 132 Kuruman 8460	<b>14/10/13:</b> Mr. Pyper contacted ENVASS and raised various comments. ENVASS confirmed all his comments in a follow up email.	<b>14/10/13:</b> ENVASS confirmed: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. I&amp;AP registration.</li> <li>2. He is the owner of Middelplaats 730;</li> <li>3. He has grazing rights on Portion 1 of Farm 332 Middelplaats; and</li> <li>4. The proposed mine will have a negative impact on his access to Farm Middelplaats 730; and</li> <li>5. Contact details.</li> </ol>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
SHIRLEY 367	1	Ms Annalien Fourie (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 5 Cunningham Street Wrenchville 8460 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 1281 Kuruman Dibeng 8460 <b>Tel:</b> 053 712 1919 <b>Cell:</b> 073 556 6842 <b>Email:</b> anfour@absamail.co.za	No comments received.	No comments received.
MIDDELPLA ATS 332	1	Saltrim Ranches  Mr. D Venter Mr. H.P. Vente (Directors)r	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 8 Hotazel 8490	No comments received.	No comments received.
MAMATWAN 331	1	Hotazel Manganese Mines (Pty) Ltd  Mr RJ Langford (Director)	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 8186 Johannesburg 2000	No comments received.	No comments received.
MAMATWAN 331	2	Hotazel Manganese Mines (Pty) Ltd  Mr RJ Langford (Director)	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 8186 Johannesburg 2000	No comments received.	No comments received.
ALTON 368	RE	Ms M.J. Booysen	<b>Physical:</b> Cnr Dolomite & Karee streets F1 Heuwelsig Flats Kuruman 8460 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 55 Kuruman 8460 <b>Tel:</b> 053 712 3346 / 053 712 3346	No comments received.	No comments received.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
ALTON 368	1	Andries Matthys Duvenhage Testamentere Trust	Unknown	No comments received.	No comments received.
ERITH 389	RE	Mr. W.J. Maritz (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 430 Chertsey Street Dibeng 8463 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 140 Dibeng 8463 <b>Tel:</b> 053 731 0272 <b>Cell:</b> 072 152 3706	No comments received.	No comments received.
WALTON 390	RE	Mr H. van Dyk (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 23 Kerk street Mesinna 0900 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 1593 Messina 0900	No comments received.	No comments received.
WALTON 390	2	Mr P.J. Maritz (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 781 Arcadia Street Arcadia 0083 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 150 Dibeng 8463 <b>Tel:</b> 053 723 1377 <b>Cell:</b> 083 292 0479 <b>Email:</b> sadiatomite@gmail.com	No comments received.	No comments received.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
WALTON 390	3	Mr P.A. Pienaar (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 38 Huis street Crysbestos 1307 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 66 Crysbestos 1307 <b>Tel:</b> 011 908 3392 / 013 485 0080 <b>Cell:</b> 082 399 0691	No comments received.	No comments received.
BYFLEET 391	RE	Byfleet Trust Mr Du Toit Viljoen	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 153 Dibeng 8460 <b>Tel:</b> 083 994 4141 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:dutoit.viljoen@hotmail.com">dutoit.viljoen@hotmail.com</a>	<b>24/09/13:</b> Email received from Mr. Viljoen requesting I&AP registration. He raised the following comments and concerns: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Drying up of borehole water in use of his farm animals</li> <li>- Water and environment pollution</li> <li>- Security risk increases with more mines in the area for both cattle robbery and farm attacks</li> <li>- Land value will fall, no one want to farm next to a mine</li> <li>- Road infrastructure will be damaged with overuse and poor maintenance</li> </ul>	<b>25/09/13:</b> ENVASS responded and confirmed I&AP registration and further noted that that his comments and concerns raised will be addressed in the EIA process.
LUTON 692	RE	GRASLAND BEMARKING CC Mr P.J. Odendaal (Director)	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 524 Bethal 2310 <b>Tel:</b> 017 647 2054 / 017 647 5358 <b>Cell:</b> 082 443 4789 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:peter.odendaal@absa.co.za">peter.odendaal@absa.co.za</a>	No comments received.	No comments received.
LUTON 692	RE	GRASLAND BEMARKING CC Mr D.C. van Rooyen (Director)	<b>Physical:</b> Farm Luton Kuruman 8460 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 18346 Sunward Park 1470	No comments received.	No comments received.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
COBHAM 393	RE	Hope Trust Flip van der Merwe	<p>Postal: PO Box 121 Dibeng 8460 Flip van der Merwe flipvdmerwe8@yahoo.com</p>	<p><b>21/09/13:</b> Email received from Mr. Van der Merwe noting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Hope Trust is the owner of farm land close to the proposed new mines. The farm can only be used for farming extensively with animals like cattle, sheep, goats and game. These animals need good clean drinking water on a daily basis.</li> <li>- His concern is that the operations of the new mines will have a negative effect on the natural water supply via boreholes in the area as happen around Kathu and that he would have no more drinking water for the animals.</li> <li>- The new mines will attract people looking for work and behind them the criminals that will have a detrimental affect on security in the area.</li> <li>- His experience is that if it is not tackle properly it could make farming impossible and deprived me of an income that he needs to live from. One of the farms is in the family from 1897 and it is unthinkable that the operations of the mine could make it in possible to farm any longer.</li> <li>- Dust on the grass could also make that the animals don't want to eat it. The operations of the new mines will also have a negative effect on the infrastructure specifically on the buildings, roads and the supply of electricity.</li> </ul> <p><b>03/02/14:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr van der Merwe stated that ENVASS acknowledged his complaints, but did not include it in the DSR.</li> <li>- Mr van der Merwe requested that his complaints be included in paragraphs 4.5.1; 5.5; 5.4 and 5.7 in the report;</li> </ul>	<p><b>23/09/13:</b> ENVASS thanked Mr. Van der Merwe for his correspondence and confirmed I&amp;AP registration. ENVASS noted that his comments has been noted and will be incorporated and addressed in the EIA process.</p> <p>- ENVASS responded that the comments and responses was included in the Public Participation Process (PPP) report as one of the Annexures of the DSR.</p> <p>- ENVASS confirmed that this will be mentioned in the Final Scoping Report (FSR).</p>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
COBHAM 393	1	J P MARKRAM PLASE PTY LTD  Mr P.R. Markram Ms S.M. Markram (Owners)	<b>Physical:</b> Farm Sutton Dibeng 8463 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 69 Dibeng 8463 <b>Cell:</b> 073 2289 555	<b>24/09/13:</b> Email received from Mr. Markram requesting I&AP registration. He raised the following comments and concerns: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Drying up of borehole water in use of his farm animals</li> <li>- Water and environment pollution</li> <li>- Security risk increases with more mines in the area for both cattle robbery and farm attacks</li> <li>- Land value will fall, no one want to farm next to a mine</li> <li>- Road infrastructure will be damaged with overuse and poor maintenance</li> </ul>	<b>13/11/13:</b> ENVASS responded and confirmed I&AP registration and further noted that that his comments and concerns raised will be addressed in the EIA process.
CHELMSFORD 365	RE	Ms J.M. de Kock (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 08 Mopani Avenue Kathu 8446 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 1213 Kathu 8446 <b>Tel:</b> 053 723 1937 <b>Cell:</b> 081 393 5809 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:hannetjiedekock@gmail.com">hannetjiedekock@gmail.com</a>	<b>12/08/13:</b> Email from Mrs. De Kock received requesting I&AP registration. The following comments were raised: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mrs. De Kock runs an agricultural cattle and game breeding business which falls within the immediate surroundings of the proposed mine.</li> <li>- Concerned was raised with the impact on surface and groundwater quality and recourses, air quality and ecology.</li> </ul>	<b>11/11/13:</b> ENVASS responded and confirmed I&AP registration. ENVASS also indicated to Mrs. De Kock that her comments have been noted and will be addressed in the EIA phase.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
MOFFAT 366	RE	Mr J.H. Loots (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 57 Nevada Street Vorstershoop 8615 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 36 Kuruman 8460 <b>Tel:</b> 053 781 0479 / 053 377 4668 <b>Cell:</b> 082 377 5668 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:jloots@loots@gmail.com">jloots@loots@gmail.com</a>	<b>20/09/13:</b> Email received from Mr. Loots noting: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- He was not contacted by any party to inform him of the proposed mine.</li> <li>- The mine will be less than 3 km away from his farm border.</li> <li>- A big new building was erected a few hundred meters from his fence. I run a guest farm with cattle and exotic game.</li> </ul> Concerns were raised w.r.t.: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Noise and air pollution to tourists, hunters and livestock.</li> <li>- ground water (Quantity and quality ) impacts</li> <li>- Illegal hunting on his farm.</li> <li>- Jackal numbers are not being kept under control in the mine area and are cause to species like springbok and impala not able to raise the young.</li> <li>- The overall ecology already suffers and he will definitely lose income in his kind of farming.</li> </ul>	<b>23/09/13:</b> ENVASS responded, confirmed I&AP registration and thanked Mr. Loots for his comments raised. ENVASS confirmed that his comments and concerns will be incorporated into the EIA process for consideration. ENVASS also confirmed that Mr. Loots was indeed notified (proof provided) about the project as per the requirements of Chapter 6 Regulation 54 of the NEMA EIA Regulations (2010).
HEUNINGDRAAI 334	RE	Mr G.V.Z Loots (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 5 Geelhout Street Dibeng 8446 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 114 Kathu 8446 <b>Tel:</b> 053 739 2894 <b>Cell:</b> 083 300 7116 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:gjie.loots@angloamerican.com">gjie.loots@angloamerican.com</a>	<b>12/08/13:</b> Email received from Mr. Loots requesting I&AP registration. The following comments were raised <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mrs. Loots runs an agricultural business consisting of game, cattle and goat farming (on the Farm Henuning Draai) which falls within the immediate surroundings of the proposed mine.</li> <li>- Concerned was raised with the impact on surface and groundwater quality and recourses, air quality and ecology.</li> </ul> <b>03/09/13:</b> Email received from Mr. Loots noting an additional concern: The contractor hostel is located next to his farm. He already has problems with trespassing and poaching. Mr. Loots requested that this is addressed as soon as possible.	<b>12/08/13:</b> ENVASS responded and confirmed I&AP registration. ENVASS also indicated to Mr. Loots that his comments have been noted. ENVASS further indicated that all potential impacts on surface and groundwater quality and resources, air quality and the ecology will be assessed through specialist assessments in the EIA phase. A copy of the Background Information Document was also sent to Mr. Loots.
HEUNINGDR AAI 334	1	Mr G.A. Coetsee (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 6 Tsening Road Kuruman 8460 <b>Postal:</b>	No comments received.	No comments received.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
ROLDRAAI 333	RE		6 Tsening Road Kuruman 8460 Tel: 053 712 1765 Cell: 073 156 5535		
BOTHA 314	RE	TERRA NOMINEES PTY LTD  Mr P.C.E. Bierman (director)	<b>Physical:</b> 23 Monarch Lane Eagle Canyon Golf Estate Honeydew 2170 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 21789 Honeydew 1725 <b>Tel:</b> 011 794 2014 / 011 376 2304 <b>Cell:</b> 082 492 6338 <b>Email:</b> piet.bierman@bhpbilliton.com	No comments received.	No comments received.
BOTHA 314	RE	TERRA NOMINEES PTY LTD  Mr E.P.W. Swindell (Director)	<b>Physical:</b> 6 Kalkoentjie Road Randpark Ridge Randburg 2169 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 18 Randburg 2125 <b>Tel:</b> 011 795 2756 / 011 376 3342 <b>Cell:</b> 082 497 6603	No comments received.	No comments received.
SMARTT 314	RE				
RISSIK 330	RE	Ms T. Steyn (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 25 Rorich Circle Fichardt Park 9301 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 346 Hotazel 8490	No comments received.	No comments received.



PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
RISSIK 330	1	Mr H. Steyn (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 330 Rissik Street Hotazel 8490 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 346 Kuruman 8460	No comments received.	No comments received.
ADAMS 328	RE	Saltrim Ranches  Mr. D Venter Mr. H.P. Venter (Directors)	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 8 Hotazel 8490	No comments received.	No comments received.
GOOLD 329	5	Hotazel Manganese Mines (Pty) Ltd  Mr R.J Langford (Director)	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 8186 Johannesburg 2000	No comments received.	No comments received.
GOOLD 329	6	Ms T. Steyn (Owner)	<b>Physical:</b> 25 Rorich Circle Fichardt Park 9301 <b>Postal:</b> PO Box 346 Hotazel 8490	No comments received.	No comments received.
		Manganese South Africa BHP Billiton  Mr. Glenton A. Moses (Specialist: Environmental)	<b>Physical:</b> 6 Hollard Street Johannesburg 2001 South Africa <b>Postal:</b> <b>Tel:</b> 011 376 2585 <b>Fax:</b> 011 688 4585 <b>Cell:</b> 082 492 6338 <b>Email:</b> glenton.moses@bhpbilliton.com	<b>06/09/13:</b> Mr. Glenton Moses requested a copy of the BID and MPRDA Scoping Report. He also enquired about the closing date for leaving comments.	<b>06/09/13:</b> ENVASS responded and sent him the requested documentation. ENVASS also noted that Mr. Moses can submit his comments by 23/09/13.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
		Manganese SA Assest BHP Billiton Dineo Peta Team Lead: Mineral Rights	<p><b>Physical:</b> 6 Hollard Street Johannesburg 2001 South Africa <b>Postal:</b> <b>Tel:</b> 011 376 2627 <b>Fax:</b> 011 376 2323 <b>Cell:</b> 082 082 5529 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:dineo.peta@bhpbilliton.com">dineo.peta@bhpbilliton.com</a></p>	<p><b>11/12/13:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Ms. Dineo Peta confirmed a telephone conversation with Ms Rachele Stoffberg of Environmental Assurance (Pty) Ltd regarding the completion of the MPRDA scoping phase and that the NEMA process has started. The EIA process has not commenced and they will receive notice when it does;</li> <li>➤ Ms. Peta contacted the applicant and asked whether a land use agreement over portion 3 of Mamatwan (which they are the owners of) and if possible to send her a copy;</li> </ul> <p><b>12/12/13:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Ms. Peta asked the applicant whether the prospecting right expired and when they intend to commence with the mining activities;</li> <li>➤ She also stated that the agreements provides for the conducting of quarterly meetings and asked when the last time it was conducted; and</li> <li>➤ She also asked whether the consideration or rental amount was paid during this period and requested proof.</li> </ul> <p><b>15/01/14 and 25/02/14:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Ms Peta requested a copy of the prospecting right from the client;</li> <li>➤ Ms Peta requested when the prospecting right expires; and</li> <li>➤ Ms Peta noted the prospecting right expired on 9 July 2013 and asked whether a renewal have been applied for.</li> </ul>	<p><b>11/12/13:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ ENVASS responded and concurred to Ms Dineo's statements. The DSR will be released within the next week and BHP will be notified;</li> <li>➤ The applicant replied with a copy of the agreement entered into between Hotazel Manganese Mines Proprietary Limited, DMB Minerals CC and Mamatwan Manganese Proprietary Limited in respect of Portion 3 of the Farm Mamatwan as requested;</li> </ul> <p>➤ The applicant does have a copy of the prospecting right;</p> <p>➤ The applicant provided Ms. Peta with a copy of the prospecting right per email; and</p> <p>➤ The applicant responded that instead of a renewal of the prospecting right, they have applied for a mining right;</p>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
		<p>Tshipi E Ntle Manganese Mines (Pty) Ltd</p> <p>Ms N Chengapar (Legal Counsel and Company Secretary)</p>	<p><b>Physical:</b> Fairways Office Park Gleneagles Building 1<sup>st</sup> Floor 52 Grosvenor Road Bryanston</p> <p><b>Postal:</b> PO Box 652286 Benmore 2010 South Africa</p> <p><b>Tel:</b> 011 706 9004 <b>Cel:</b> 073 445 4286 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:natasha@tshipi.co.za">natasha@tshipi.co.za</a></p>	<p><b>01/08/13:</b></p> <p>Email received from Ms Chengapar requesting I&amp;AP registration and a copy of the BID.</p>	<p><b>01/08/13:</b></p> <p>ENVASS responded, confirmed I&amp;AP registration and provided Ms Chengapar with a copy of the BID. ENVASS also confirmed that Tshipi will be notified when the NEMA Scoping Report is released for public comments.</p>
		<p>Hotazel Manganese Mines</p> <p>Mr R. Mudau (Environmental Superintendent)</p>	<p><b>Physical:</b> 1 Peterboom Ave Hotazel 8490</p> <p><b>Tel:</b> 053 742 2286 <b>Cel:</b> 084 916 2179 <b>Fax:</b> 086 560 8510 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:rudzani.mudau@bhpbilliton.com">rudzani.mudau@bhpbilliton.com</a></p>	<p><b>26/08/13:</b></p> <p>Email received from Mr Mudau requesting I&amp;AP registration.</p>	<p><b>26/08/13:</b></p> <p>ENVASS replied confirming I&amp;AP registration.</p>
		<p>AFRIBITS</p> <p>Tumisang Tagane</p>	<p><b>Tel:</b> 079 874 0504 <b>Fax:</b> 086 616 5343 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:info@afribits.co.za">info@afribits.co.za</a> <a href="mailto:ttagane@afribits.co.za">ttagane@afribits.co.za</a></p>	<p><b>03/08/13:</b></p> <p>Email received from Mr. Tagane requesting I&amp;AP registration.</p>	<p><b>05/08/13:</b></p> <p>ENVASS responded and in confirmed I&amp;AP registration.</p>
Chelmsford		<p>Areion Warmblood Horses &amp; Dressage Academy</p> <p>Mr Jaco Fourie</p>	<p><b>Postal:</b> PO Box 2037 Kathu 8446</p> <p><b>Tel:</b> 082 567 5133 <b>Fax:</b> 086 613 0150 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:jaco@areion.co.za">jaco@areion.co.za</a></p>	<p><b>09/08/13:</b></p> <p>Email received from Mr. Fourie requesting I&amp;AP registration. The following comments were raised</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mrs. Fourie runs an agricultural horse, cattle and game breeding business on the Farm Chelmsford, which falls within the immediate surroundings of the proposed mine.</li> <li>- Concerned was raised with the impact on surface and groundwater quality and recourses, air quality and ecology.</li> </ul>	<p><b>09/08/13:</b></p> <p>ENVASS responded and confirmed I&amp;AP registration. ENVASS also indicated to Mr. Fourie that his comments have been noted. ENVASS further indicated that all potential impacts on surface and groundwater quality and resources, air quality and the ecology will be assessed through specialist assessments in the EIA phase. A copy of the Background Information Document was also sent to Mr. Fourie.</p>

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION		I&AP	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
FARM	PTN				
		Farm Smuts / Moffat  Mr Nico Smit	<b>Postal:</b> PO Box 1463 Kathu 8446 <b>Cel:</b> 072 323 3060 <b>Fax:</b> 053 723 1666 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:nico@sanyatibb.co.za">nico@sanyatibb.co.za</a>	<b>25/09/13:</b> Fax received from Mr. Smit raising the following comments: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Integrated global plan which includes availability of water and power usage</li> <li>- Monitoring of boreholes</li> <li>- Drying out of surface and support</li> <li>- Underground desiccation / decreasing / drying up and support</li> <li>- Explosive damage to house and structures</li> <li>- Dust management</li> <li>- Representation in Impact Study Groups</li> </ul>	<b>14/11/13:</b> ENVASS responded, confirmed I&AP registration. ENVASS also confirmed that his comments and concerns will be incorporated into the EIA process for consideration

Table 2: Organs of State Notifications, Registrations, Comments and Responses

STAKEHOLDER	CONTACT PERSON	CONTACT DETAILS	Comment(s)	Response(s)
<p>The Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (DAFF)</p>	<p>Ms Jacoline Mans</p>	<p>Tel: 0543385909            Cell: 0828082737            Fax: 0543340030            Email: jacolinema@daff.gov.za  <b>Postal Address:</b>            P.O Box 2782            Upington            8800  <b>Physical Address:</b>            26 Olien Street            Upington            8800</p>	<p><b>02/01/14:</b></p> <p>Comments raised:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>1. Departmental Mandate:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1.1 Impact on protected tree species. Refer to the National Forests act Act 84 of 1998 (NFA) as amended, section 12(1)(d) read with s15(1) and s62(2)(c). The list of protected tree species was published in GN 877 of 22 November 2013. No protected tree may be cut, destroyed, damaged or disturbed without a license.</li> <li>1.2 The DAFF is also responsible for the administration of the National Veld and Forest Fires act, act 101 of 1998 (NVFFA) as amended. Please take note of roles and responsibilities in terms of the NVFFA.</li> </ol> </li> <li><b>2. Comments on DSR:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2.1 The Northern Cape Nature Conservation Act, Act 9 of 2009 (NCNCA) was mentioned on page 30 under the provincial legislative framework, but not on page 4 under legislative requirements. A Flora permit may be required in terms of the NCNCA for removal of indigenous, protected and specially protected vegetation.</li> <li>2.2 It is not clear whether destruction of flora will be covered in terms of the ecological impact under the "destruction of sensitive habitat". With a development footprint of ± 1090 ha, vegetation clearance and destruction of plant species of special concern may be significant as it is a semi-arid region.</li> <li>2.3 It is requested that the potential impact on plant species of special concern i.e. endemic, protected, specially protected endangered, etc. be assessed. The development should try to avoid areas with higher densities of slow growing protected trees and an ecological sensitivity map should be developed. Sensitive areas should be avoided as far as possible.</li> <li>2.4 Page 27 refers to the National Forests Act,</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	<p><b>06/01/14:</b></p> <p>ENVASS responded, confirmed receipt of comments raised. ENVASS indicated that a formal response will be submitted in due course.</p> <p><i>Note: These comments were raised during the NEMA Scoping process and therefore the formal responses will be provided within the NEMA timeline prior to the release of the FINAL Scoping Report.</i></p>

			<p>1998 (Act 84 of 1998) (NFA) and states "the study area contains protected tree species identified in terms of section 21 of the NFA". It should be noted that Section 21 of the NFA refers to access to forests other than State forests and is thus not applicable. Refer to 1.1 above for the relevant sections of the NFA.</p> <p>2.5 It is requested that an estimate of the number of protected trees (per size class) to be potentially destroyed by the development be given. This should be verified in order to determine whether or not a biodiversity offset will be required to compensate for the permanent loss of slow growing protected trees. This potential impact should be assessed during the EIA phase (in the specialist Ecological Assessment). This information would also need to be include for the Forest Act License.</p> <p>2.6 Page 28 of the DSR in reference to the NFA stated that "a permit for the removal / destruction of protected trees will be applied for with the Department of Water affairs and Forestry. The Department of Forestry is no longer affiliated with the department of Water Affairs. It should read "Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (DAFF)".</p> <p>2.7 Page 34 question B5 refers to impact on sensitive nature areas and then indicate that the proposed site for the mine is within an area already severely disturbed. It should be determined in the EIA phase whether or not the proposed development falls into the Griqualand West Centre of Endemism and Kathu Busveld vegetation type as these are deemed important due to a large number of developments affecting it and the fact that none of the Kathu Bushveld vegetation type is formally conserved with the exception of the Kathu Forest.</p> <p>2.8 It is requested that a more specific vegetation types table be provided relevant to the area seeing that the Province is very large. Also to overlay the layout of the proposed development on the latest vegetation map to determine which vegetation types will be affected.</p> <p>2.9 The DSR mentioned that the protected trees</p>	
--	--	--	--	--

			<p>on the study area is 'endangered', but it is actually 'protected' and not 'endangered' at this stage.</p> <p>2.10 Page 43 refers to the 'National Forestry act, 1998 (Act No. 30 of 1998)'. This is incorrect and should read: National Forests Act, 1998 (Act no. 84 of 1998).</p> <p>2.11 Page 66 confirmed that an ecological assessment will be undertaken during the EIA phase. The department requests a copy for comments.</p>	
Department of Rural Development and Land Reform	Ms Naomi Mashishi	<p><b>Tel:</b> 053 838 9100  <b>Fax:</b> 053 832 6805  <b>Email:</b> nmashishi@ncpg.gov.za  <b>Address:</b>  Private Bag X5018  Kimberley  8300  <b>Physical Address:</b></p>	No comments received.	No comments received.
Northern Cape Department of Rural Development and Land Reform	Mr Kenneth Lembowane	<p><b>Tel:</b> 053 807 5700 / 053 807 5738  <b>Fax:</b> 053 831 6501  <b>Cell:</b> 0795143271  <b>Email:</b>  keliwambano@ruraldevelopment.gov.za  <b>Postal Address:</b>  PO Box 2458  Kimberley  8300  <b>Physical Address:</b></p>	No comments received.	No comments received.
Northern Cape Department of Environment and Nature Conservation (DENC)	Ms Leona Pienaar	<p><b>Tel:</b> 053 807 7430  <b>Fax:</b> 053 831 3530.  <b>Email:</b> LeonaPienaar@ncpg.gov.za  <b>Postal Address:</b>  Private Bag X6102  Kimberley  8301  <b>Physical Address:</b>  Sasko Building  90 Long Street  Kimberley  8301</p>	No comments received.	No comments received.
Department of Mineral Resources (DMR)	Ms Ephesia Semenya Official	<p><b>Tel:</b> 053 807 1700 / 053 807 1787  <b>Fax:</b> 053 832 5631  <b>Email:</b> ephesia.semenya@dmr.gov.za  <b>Postal Address:</b> Private Bag X6093  Kimberley</p>	No comments received.	No comments received.

		8300 <b>Physical Address:</b>		
Northern Cape Department of Water Affairs  (NC DWA)	Ms Lerato Mokhoantle	Tel: 053 836 7613 / 053 836 7600 Fax: 053 830 8804 Cell: 083 655 8312 Email: mokhoantle@dwa.gov.za Address: Private Bag X6101 Kimberley 8300 <b>Physical Address:</b> 28 Central Road Beacon Field Kimberley 8301	No comments received.	No comments received.
Northern Cape Department of Health	Mr. Mokete Motlatla  Assistant Director: Environmental Health	Tel: 053 830 0539 Fax: 053 830 0667 Email: mmotlatla@ncpg.gov.za Postal Address: Private Bag X5049 Kimberley 8300 <b>Physical Address:</b>	No comments received.	No comments received.
Northern Cape Department of Social Development		<b>Physical Address:</b> 90 Long street Sasko Building Kimberley 8301	No comments received.	No comments received.
Northern Cape Department of Labour	Mr Itumeleng Masinda	Tel: 053 712 3873 / 053 712 3872 Cell: 082 908 1849 Fax: 086 623 3487 Email: Itumeleng.masinda@labour.gov.za Postal Address: PO Box 2467 Kuruman 2467 <b>Physical Address:</b>	No comments received.	No comments received.
South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA)	Ms Katie Smuts Ms Jenna Lavin  Heritage Officer: Archaeology, Palaeontology and Meteorites	Tel: 021 462 4502 Fax: 021 462 4509 Email: <a href="mailto:ksmuts@sahra.org.za">ksmuts@sahra.org.za</a> <a href="mailto:jlavin@sahra.org.za">jlavin@sahra.org.za</a> Postal Address: PO Box 4637 Cape Town 8000 <b>Physical Address:</b>	<b>20/09/13:</b> Email with comments received from SAHRA noting: - In terms of the National Heritage Resources Act (NHRA), no 25 of 1999, heritage resources, including archaeological or palaeontological sites over 100 years old, graves older than 60 years, structures older than 60 years are protected. They may not be disturbed without a permit from the relevant heritage resources authority. This means	<b>20/09/13:</b> ENVASS responded to SAHRA and thanked them for their comments. ENVASS noted that SAHRA was also notified of the NEMA process (proof provided).  ENVASS further confirmed that a Heritage Impact Assessment will be undertaken in accordance with the requirements of Section



			that before such sites are disturbed by development it is incumbent on the developer (or mine) to ensure that a Heritage Impact Assessment is done in terms of Section 38(8) of the National Heritage Resources Act. This must include the archaeological component as well as any other applicable heritage components. Appropriate mitigation, which may involve recording, sampling and dating sites that are to be destroyed, must be done as required. In the EMP submitted to SAHRA, you indicate that an HIA will be completed. SAHRA endorses this recommendation and requires that the completed HIA comply with Section 38(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act as well as SAHRA's Minimum Standards for Impact Assessments (2007).	38(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act as well as SAHRA's Minimum Standards for Impact Assessments (2007).
Department of Nature Conservation	Mr Marvin Matthews Official	Tel: 053 773 1239 Cell: 079 507 3836 Fax: 053 831 3530 Email: mmathewsdenc@gmail.com Postal Address: Private Bag X6102 Kimberley 8301 Physical Address:	No comments received.	No comments received.
Northern Cape Department of Roads and Public Works	Itumeleng Bulane	Tel: 053 839 2241 Fax: 053 839 2291 / 053 839 2117 Email: leechal@vodamail.co.za Postal Address: P O Box 3132 Kimberley 8300 Physical Address:	No comments received.	No comments received.
John Taola Gaetsewe District Municipality	Ms Molemoeng Bokgwathile Municipal Manager	Tel: 053 712 8731 Fax: 053 712 2502 Email: bokgwathilem@taologaetsewe.gov.za Postal Address: P O Box 1480 Kuruman 8460 Physical Address: 4 Federal Mynbou Street Kuruman 8460	No comments received.	No comments received.

<p><b>John Taola Gaetsewe District Municipality</b></p>	<p>Mr Gerrie van der Westhuizen  Assistant Manager: Corporate Management</p>	<p><b>Tel:</b> 053 712 8748 <b>Fax:</b> 053 712 2502 <b>Email:</b> vanderwesthuizeng@taologaetsewe.gov.za <b>Postal Address:</b> P O Box 1480 Kuruman 8460 <b>Physical Address:</b> 4 Federal Mynbou Street Kuruman 8460</p>	<p>No comments received.</p>	<p>No comments received.</p>
<p><b>John Taola Gaetsewe District Municipality</b></p>	<p>Klaas Teise  Acting Director: Economic Development</p>	<p><b>Tel:</b> 053 712 8700 / 053 712 1001 <b>Cell:</b> 082 712 0363 / 082 922 7251 <b>Fax:</b> 053 773 1758 <b>Email:</b> teisek@taologaetsewe.gov.za <b>Postal Address:</b> P O Box 1480 Kuruman 8460 <b>Physical Address:</b> 4 Federal Mynbou Street Kuruman 8460</p>	<p>No comments received.</p>	<p>No comments received.</p>
<p><b>Ga Segonyana Local Municipality</b></p>	<p>Mr Edward Ntesang</p>	<p><b>Tel:</b> 053 712 9310 <b>Fax:</b> 053 712 3581 <b>Email:</b> ntesang@ga-segonyana.co.za <b>Postal Address:</b> Private Bag X1522 Kuruman 8460 <b>Physical Address:</b> C/O Voortrekker and Skool streets Kuruman 8460</p>	<p>No comments received.</p>	<p>No comments received.</p>
<p><b>Gamagara Local Municipality</b></p>	<p>Mr Clement Itumeleng  Municipal Manager</p>	<p><b>Tel:</b> 053 723 2261 <b>Fax:</b> 053 723 2021 <b>Email:</b> clementi@gamagara.co.za <b>Postal Address:</b> PO Box 1001 Kathu 8446 <b>Physical Address:</b> Civic Centre C/O Hendrik van Eck and Frikkie Meyer roads</p>	<p>No comments received.</p>	<p>No comments received.</p>

		Kathu 8446		
Joe Morolong Local Municipality	Seneo Seleka Environmental Manager	Tel: 053 773 9300 Cell: 072 740 4561 Fax: 053 773 9350 Email: <a href="mailto:sseleka@webmail.co.za">sseleka@webmail.co.za</a> Postal Address: Private Bag X117 Mothibistad 8474 Physical Address: D320 Cardington Road Churchill Village Kuruman 8460	No comments received.	No comments received.
Transvaal Agriculture Union (TAU)	Mr Chris van Zyl Assistant General Manager - Policy Liaison	Tel: 012 804 8031 Fax: 012 804 2014 Email: <a href="mailto:dienste@tlu.co.za">dienste@tlu.co.za</a> <a href="mailto:willem.fourie5@gmail.com">willem.fourie5@gmail.com</a> <a href="mailto:gertc10@gmail.com">gertc10@gmail.com</a> Postal Address: PO Box 91251 Silverton 0184 Physical Address: 194 James Drive Silverton Pretoria 0127	30/07/12: Email forwarded by Chris van Zyl to Gert Cruywagen and Willem Fourie for consideration.	