



Technical Report

AS-R-2014-10-27

**Comments and Response Report as part of the
Environmental Impact Assessment process for
the proposed Separation Plant on Portion 6 of
the farm Langeberg 188, Saldanha Bay
Municipality**

October 2014

Prepared for: **Frontier Separation (Pty) Ltd**
Document version 1.0 – Final for review



Proudly Supporting
TOUCHING AFRICA

Comments and Response Report as part of the Environmental Impact Assessment Process for the Proposed Separation Plant on Portion 6 of the Farm Langeberg 188, Saldanha Bay Municipality

27 October 2014

Conducted on behalf of:

Frontier Separation (Pty) Ltd

Compiled by:

C Smith (BHSC Hons. Archaeology)

HD Gildenhuys (Bsc. Hons. Wildlife Management, Pr.Sci.Nat)

JC Vivier (PhD Environmental Management)

GAUTENG PROVINCE: Block E, The Village Office Park, 309 Glenwood Road, Faerie Glen, Postnet no 74, Private Bag X07, Arcadia, 0007 Tel: +27-12 751 2160 Fax: +27 (0) 86 607 2406 www.ages-group.com

Offices: Eastern Cape Gauteng Limpopo Province Namibia North-West Province Western Cape Zimbabwe

*AGES Board of Directors: SJ Pretorius JA Myburgh JJP Vivier JH Botha H Pretorius THG Ngoepe SM Haasbroek R Crosby
JC Vivier FN de Jager CJH Smit AS Potgieter AGES Gauteng Directors: JJP Vivier JC Vivier E van Zyl M Grobler*

REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

Name	Institution
Registered Interested & Affected Parties	Refer to register
Western Cape Government DEADP	Ms T Dreyer
Cyril Thomas	Frontier Separation
Derick de Wit & Drikus Janse van Rensburg	Frontier Separation

Although Africa Geo-Environmental Services Gauteng (Pty) Ltd exercises due care and diligence in rendering services and preparing documents, Africa Geo-Environmental Services Gauteng (Pty) Ltd accepts no liability, and the client, by receiving this document, indemnifies Africa Geo-Environmental Services Gauteng (Pty) Ltd and its directors, managers, agents and employees against all actions, claims, demands, losses, liabilities, costs, damages and expenses arising from or in connection with services rendered, directly or indirectly by Africa Geo-Environmental Services Gauteng (Pty) Ltd and by the use of the information contained in this document.



This document contains confidential and proprietary information of Africa Geo-Environmental Services Gauteng (Pty) Ltd and is protected by copyright in favour of Africa Geo-Environmental Services Gauteng (Pty) Ltd and may not be reproduced, or used without the written consent of Africa Geo-Environmental Services Gauteng (Pty) Ltd, which has been obtained beforehand. This document is prepared exclusively for *Frontier Separation (Pty) Ltd* and is subject to all confidentiality, copyright and trade secrets, rules, intellectual property law and practices of South Africa.

Table of contents

1. INTRODUCTION..... 1

2. PROCESS FOLLOWED 2

 2.1 NEWSPAPER ADVERTISEMENT2

 2.2 SITE NOTICE2

 2.3 DIRECT NOTIFICATION OF IDENTIFIED I&APs2

 2.4 FOCUS GROUP MEETINGS3

 2.5 DRAFT SCOPING REPORT4

 2.6 FINAL SCOPING REPORT5

 2.7 DRAFT EIA REPORT5

 2.8 FINAL EIA REPORT5

 2.9 PUBLIC OPEN DAY.....6

3. COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT 6

4. CONCLUSIONS..... 93

List of Tables

Table 1 Site notice localities.....	2
Table 2 Comments and Responses.....	7

1. INTRODUCTION

Public Participation is one of the most important aspects of the environmental authorisation process. This stems from the requirement that people have the right to be informed about potential decisions that may affect them and that they must be afforded an opportunity to influence those decisions. Effective public participation also improves the ability of the competent authority to make informed decisions and results in improved decision-making as the views of all parties are considered.

The Public Participation Process:

- Provides an opportunity for interested and affected parties (I&APs) to obtain clear, accurate and comprehensive information about the proposed activity, its alternatives or the decisions and the environmental impacts thereof;
- Provides I&APs with an opportunity to indicate their viewpoints, issues and concerns regarding the activity, alternatives and/or the decisions;
- Provides I&APs with the opportunity of suggesting ways of avoiding, reducing or mitigating negative impacts of an activity and for enhancing positive impacts;
- Enables an applicant to incorporate the needs, preferences and values of the affected parties into the activity;
- Provides opportunities to avoid and resolve disputes and reconcile conflicting interests; and
- Enhance transparency and accountability in decision - making

Public Participation therefore allows interested and affected parties the opportunity to give their viewpoints and influence the process and the decisions of the competent authority.

2. PROCESS FOLLOWED

The following process was undertaken to facilitate the public participation process for the proposed project:

2.1 Newspaper Advertisement

Advertisements, notifying the public of the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) application and process and requesting I&APs to register their comments with Africa Geo-Environmental Services Gauteng (Pty) Ltd (AGES), were placed in both English and Afrikaans in the Weslander on the 4th of July 2013. In addition an advertisement was also placed in English in the Cape Times on the 5th of July 2013. These advertisements were placed in accordance with regulation 54(2)(c) of the EIA Regulations of 2010 and Section 38 (3)(b) of the National Environment Management: Air Quality Act (Act 39 of 2004).

2.2 Site notice

In order to inform surrounding communities and adjacent landowners of the proposed development, notice boards (in accordance with regulation 54(2)(a) and 54(3) of the EIA Regulations) were erected at the following places on the 4th of July 2013:

Table 1 Site notice localities

Site notice number	Placement	Language
1	On site – facing the gravel road to the north	English and Afrikaans
2	Within close proximity to the site – at the Weskus Spens padstal intersection of the R27 and the gravel road leading to the site (facing the R27)	English and Afrikaans
3	Within close proximity to the site – at the intersection of the R27 and R79 (facing the R27)	English and Afrikaans
4	Saldanha (municipal offices)	English and Afrikaans
5	Langebaan Primary School	English and Afrikaans
6	Vredenburg (municipal offices)	English and Afrikaans

2.3 Direct Notification of Identified I&APs

Key stakeholders, from the following sectors, were directly informed by means of hand deliveries, emails, faxes or registered post of the proposed development:

- The owners and occupiers of land adjacent to the site where the activity is or is to be

undertaken or to any alternative site;

- The owners and occupiers of land within 100 metres from the boundary of the site or alternative site who are or may be directly affected by the activity;
- West Coast District Municipality;
- Saldanha Bay Municipality;
- Department of Environmental Affairs: Branch Oceans & Coast;
- Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning (DEA&DP): Coastal Management;
- Department of Agriculture;
- Department of Water Affairs;
- Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works;
- Western Cape Department of Economic Development and Tourism;
- South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA);
- West Coast Biosphere Reserve;
- Cape Nature;
- West Coast Fossil Park;
- Eskom; and
- Transnet.

Please note that Public Participation process was started during the Scoping phase of the project, and will extend to the EIA Phase. A final Comments and Response Report, detailing all comments received from the I&APs will be included in the EIA.

2.4 Focus Group Meetings

A focus group meeting was held on the 11th of April 2013 with the Air Quality Officials from the West Coast District Municipality in order to determine the applicable listed activities

according to the National Environmental Management Air Quality Act (Act No. 39 of 2004). The meeting was also held to get the official's input to inform the Atmospheric Emission License Application Process.

A focus group meeting was also held on the 14th of June 2013 with the Department of Water Affairs and Department of Oceans & Coast in order to determine the way forward as well as to involve the Departments from the start of the process.

Key notes of these two meetings are attached as Appendix A to the Environmental Impact Report.

A site visit / site meeting was also held with two officials from the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning (DEADP) on the 13th of August 2014. The attendance register of this meeting is attached as Appendix A to the Environmental Impact Report.

2.5 Draft Scoping Report

The EIA Regulations specify that I&APs must have an opportunity to verify that their comments or concerns have been captured. A period of 30 days (27 August to 30 September 2013) was made available for public comment on the Draft Scoping Report as part of the environmental impact assessment process. The availability of the Draft Scoping Report was announced via personal notification (email, faxes and registered letters) to all the registered I&APs on the distribution list.

In addition, the Draft Scoping Report was distributed for comment as follows:

- Published on the AGES website at www.ages-docs.co.za;
- Electronic copies on request; and
- Hard copies were made available for viewing at the Vredenburg Public Library and the Blue Bay Lodge in Saldanha. Hard copies as well as electronic copies were also provided to the following state departments for comment:
 - Saldanha Bay Local Municipality
 - West Coast District Municipality
 - West Coast District Municipality: Air Quality Management
 - Western Cape Department of Agriculture

- Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA): Chemicals and Waste Management
- Department of Water Affairs (DWA)
- Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA): Branch Oceans and Coasts

2.6 Final Scoping Report

The Comments and Response Report and Draft Scoping Report were updated after the draft review period to incorporate the comments received and issues raised by I&APs. The Final Scoping Report was then made available to I&APs for a further 21 days (11 November to 2 December 2013) prior to being submitted to the DEADP. The final scoping report was made available as follows:

- Published on the AGES website at www.ages-docs.co.za;
- Hard copies were made available at Blue Bay Lodge in Saldanha and the Vredenburg Public Library; and
- Electronic copies were distributed upon request.

2.7 Draft EIA Report

The Draft EIA Report was compiled following the departmental review and approval of the Final Scoping Report. The Draft EIA Report was made available to I&APs for review (for a period of 60 days (9 July to 8 September 2014) as follows:

- Published on the AGES website at www.ages-docs.co.za;
- Hard copies were made available at Blue Bay Lodge in Saldanha and the Vredenburg Public Library; and
- Hard copies and electronic copies were distributed upon request.

2.8 Final EIA Report

The Comments and Response Report and Draft EIA Report were updated after the draft review period to incorporate the comments received and issues raised by I&APs. The Final EIA Report will be made available to I&APs for review for a period of 21 days. The Final EIA Report will be made available as follows:

- Published on the AGES website at www.ages-docs.co.za;

- Hard copies will be made available at Blue Bay Lodge in Saldanha and the Vredenburg Public Library; and
- Electronic copies will be distributed upon request.

2.9 Public Open Days

An initial public open day was held on the 10th of September 2013 at the Blue Bay Lodge in Saldanha. A second public open day was held on the 12th of August 2014 at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha to provide I&APs with feedback on the Draft EIA Report. All the issues raised by I&APs during the above open days were captured in this Comments and Response Report as contemplated in regulation 57(1) of the EIA Regulations (GNR 543 of 18 June 2010).

3. COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

The following table forms the core of the Comments and Response Report as part of the Public Participation process for the project.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Table 2 Comments and Responses

Organisation /Company/ Individual	Contact Details	Date	Notification	Comment	Response
Municipalities					
West Coast District Municipality	Municipal Manager PO Box 242 Moorreesburg 7310 Doretha Kotze Town and Regional Planner PO Box 242 Moorreesburg 7310 Tel: 022 433 8523 Fax: 086 692 6113 dkotze@wcdm.co.za	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the municipality.	No comment received from the Municipal Manager to date.	Via email: On 16 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Mrs Kotze for her comments and informed her that the West Coast District Municipality has been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed her that the Scoping and EIA reports, inclusive of the specialist studies, will be made available during the course of the process, and that she will be notified in advance when the reports become available. 1. An Atmospheric Emission License (AEL) Application has been submitted to the West Coast District Municipality and a reference number has been awarded for the AEL. 2. The current land use of the property is agricultural. A change of land use application will need to be submitted.
		16/07/2013		Via email: On 16 July 2013 Mrs Kotze provided the consultant with a registration form with the following comments: 1. Atmospheric Emissions Licence 2. Land Use	
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the municipality.	No further comment received.	
		27/08/2013	Via courier: On the 27 th of August 2013 a copy of the Draft Scoping Report was provided to the department for comment.	No further comment received.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		08/11/2013	Via registered letter: On 8 November 2013 a notification letter informing the I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the municipality.	No further comment received.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the municipality.	No further comment received.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the municipality.	Via email: On 8 September 2014 Ms Kotze provided Ms Smith with the West Coast District Municipality's (WCDM) comments on the Draft EIA Report: 1. The WCDM contends that preferred alternative, as set out in the Draft EIR, will have the least negative effect on biodiversity and should be pursued. The WCDM has no further comment of the Draft EIR. 2. The Municipality's Air Quality Officer has been in negotiations with the EAP regarding the submission of an Atmospheric Emissions Licence (AEL) for the separation plant.	Noted. Noted. An AEL application for the separation plant was submitted to the municipality in May 2013. An updated AEL application will be submitted along with the Final EIA Report in response to the comments received from Mr Fabricius (WCDM – Air Pollution) dated 2 October 2014 (please refer to Appendix A2.3 of the Final EIR).

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

West Coast District Municipality (WCDM) Air Pollution	Cindy Ganten-Bein Tel: 022 715 5950 cgbein@wcdm.co.za Piet Fabricius (Manager: Air Quality) Tel: 022 751 5950 Cell: 082 337 6131 Fax: 022 7135952 pietfab@gmail.com	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the municipality.	Via focus group meeting: A focus group meeting was held on the 11 th of April 2013. The following was discussed: 1. Project details including layouts, description, waste streams and process flows 2. Applicable legislation was discussed and it was agreed that category 4.1 and 4.2 according to the NEMAQA listed activities are applicable to the project.	An Atmospheric Emission Licence (AEL) Application for the project was submitted to the WCDM for the listed activities mentioned.
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the municipality.	No further comment received.	
		27/08/2013	Via courier: On the 27 th of August 2013 a copy of the Draft Scoping Report was provided to the department for comment.	No further comment received.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the municipality.	No further comment received.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the municipality.</p>	<p>Via email: On 2 October Mr Fabricius provided Ms Smith with the following comments from the municipality:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> With regards to the coal stock yard the following contradictory statements are made in the Draft EIA Report and Air Quality Impact Report that requires further clarity: Draft EIA Report (Page 127: "6. Planning of Coal Yard) Potential Impact: An open coal yard without proper flooring may lead to groundwater contamination. Mitigation measures: The coal stock yard must be a roofed unit that is weather and wind proof with a floor that will prevent leaching of water. The stocked coal must not be allowed to get wet. A storm water network around the coal yard must be sufficient to allow for at least a 1:50 year storm event. Loading of coal must be done during low wind speed periods to prevent coal dust to escape. Air Quality Impact Report (Page 7-2 of Air Quality Baseline Assessment) "7.1.2.3 Windblown Dust: "All stockpiles except the coal stockpile at the plant will be covered or enclosed. Although wind erosion may potentially occur at the plant these emissions were not quantified as the coal's moisture content is high and a significant amount of wind-blown dust is unlikely to results." In the abovementioned regard it is important that coal stockpiles be properly enclosed in order to prevent dust emissions during handling of material. 	<p>Via email: On 2 October 2014 Mr Gildenhuys thanked Mr Fabricius for the comments and informed him that the comments will be addressed in the Final EIR and that a revised AEL application will also be submitted as requested.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The Air Quality Impact Assessment Report has been updated as per the management measure provided in the EIA Report. Please refer to Appendix J of the EIA Report. The coal stockpile although not situated in a building will still be under a roofed area and situated on an impermeable floor.
--	--	------------	--	---	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				2. With regards to the application for an Atmospheric Emission Licence (AEL) it is important that a duly completed revised application form be submitted and be made an integral part of the final EIA report.	Noted. Please note that the updated AEL will be submitted to the WCDM along with the Final EIA Report.
Saldanha Bay Municipality	Mr. Gerrit Smith gerrits@saldanhabay.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the municipality.	No comment received to date.	
	Municipal Manager: Ms. Louise Scheepers Private Bag X12 VREDENBURG 7380 Tel: 022 701 7000 Fax: 022 715 1518 mun@sbm.gov.za	05/07/2013	Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the municipality.	No comment received to date.	
	Nazeema Duarte – Environmental Officer Private Bag x12 Vredenburg Cape Town South Africa Tel: 022 701 7000 Fax: 022 715 1101 / 086 511 3411 Nazeema.Duarte@sbm.gov.za	16/07/2013	Via email: On 16 July 2013 Ms Duarte requested the consultant to provide her with the BID.	Via email: On 17 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Ms Duarte for her email and informed her that the Saldanha Bay Municipality had been registered as an I&AP on the project. Ms Smith provided her with a copy of the BID and the registration form. She furthermore informed her that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that she will be notified in advance when the reports become available.	
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the municipality.	No further comment received.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	Via courier: On the 27 th of August 2013 a copy of the Draft Scoping Report was provided to the department for comment.	No further comment received.	
		11/11/2013	Via fax: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the municipality.	No further comment received.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		11/11/2013	<p>Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the municipality.</p>	<p>Via email: On 2 December 2013, the municipality provided Ms Smith with the following comments on the Scoping Report:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The Department: Land Use and Development Control opposes any further discharge into Danger Bay because of the possible accidental discharge of radioactive metals and Rare Earth Elements; since the effect on marine species and its interaction with natural organic compounds is unknown. 	<p>Via email: On 18 December 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of the Municipality's comments on the SR and provided the municipality with the following response:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Please note that this discharge of the brine into Danger Bay forms part of the Saldanha Regional Marine Outfall (SRMO) Project, (EIA Reference no: 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3009/13). In this regard it is important to note that any impurities (including potentially radioactive materials) will be removed at the Zandkopsdrift mine site operation (Garies), prior to transporting the Rare Earth Element (REE) Salts to the SP (Saldanha). The Zandkopsdrift mine & minerals processing plant falls within the scope of a separate company and EIA. (EIA reference number NC/EIA/NAM/KAM/ZAN/2012). <p>In order to monitor radioactivity in the REE salts produced at Zandkopsdrift minerals processing plant, three separate monitoring systems are planned:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Firstly, real time online radioactive monitoring will be conducted to ensure that REE salts produced at the mine, prior to shipment to the SP, are within legislative and acceptable limits determined during the EIA for the Zandkopsdrift Mine. Should the online monitoring system determine that radio activity levels are not within specification, the REE salts produced will automatically be rejected at the Zandkopsdrift minerals processing plant and not be allowed to move to the packing and transport facility (to be determined) to confirm the results of the real time monitoring instrumentation.
--	--	------------	--	---	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Secondly, manual samples will be taken of the REE salts produced at the mine during each operating shift, at predetermined intervals, and tested at a laboratory (to be determined) to confirm the results of the real time monitoring instrumentation. • Thirdly, REE salt samples will be tested for radioactivity at the (National Nuclear Regulator) NNR. <p>The frequency of the different radioactive assessments (real time monitoring, manual sampling and NNR assessment) will be determined during the EIA for the Zandkopsdrift Mine.</p> <p>On receipt of a REE salt shipment at the Separation Plant, additional radioactive tests will be completed to confirm that the product is within the required pre-determined specification limits:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Firstly, real-time radioactive monitoring will be installed on the materials offloading system at the SP. Any material found not to meet the specifications will automatically be diverted for return to the Zandkopsdrift Processing Facility, thereby not being processed any further at the SP. • Secondly, manual samples will be taken at the SP of the REE salts received during each operating shift, at predetermined intervals, and tested at a laboratory.
--	--	--	--	--	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

					<p>In summary it is not expected that radioactive material will be received by the SP and in the unlikely event of radioactive materials reaching the plant, it will be returned to the Zandkopsdrift minerals processing plant within a predetermined limited timeframe.</p> <p>The final radioactive monitoring will be performed by real time monitoring on the brine effluent stream from the SP to the SRMO brine transfer tank to ensure that the brine effluent entering the SRMO system is within the prescribed limits of the EIA RoD. Should the limits be breached the system will automatically prevent the brine from entering the SRMO system.</p> <p>Thus the risk of any accidental discharge is obsolete due to the number of control systems at both the supply and receive portions of the projects. In addition it is expected that any radioactive elements that may be present will not report to the brine produced but rather to the REE oxide product that will affect the quality of the SP's production. Thus any radioactive material will depreciate the quality of REE produced (product) which would lead to revenue losses. It would therefore not be beneficial to Frontier Separation to allow any radioactive material into the SP; necessitating control over radioactive limits.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				<p>2. Please explain why no mention is made of the radioactive metals which might be discharged with the brine into Danger Bay.</p> <p>3. The Saldanha Regional Outfall Pipeline Report states that Vissershok is not willing to accept the waste, yet this report makes reference to disposal at a disposal facility like Vissershok as a possibility.</p>	<p>2. Please note that this discharge of the brine into Danger Bay forms part of the Saldanha Regional Marine Outfall (SRMO) Project, (EIA Reference no: 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3009/. You're comments have been forwarded to Mr S Johnson who is the Public Participation Officer for this project as appointed by the CSIR conducting that EIA. However, please refer to point 1 above.</p> <p>3. The SP will generate the following waste products:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A brine effluent containing a high amount of salt (NaCl, commonly referred to as table salt) • The unsalable mixed rare earth carbonates of Ho/Er/Tm/Yb/Lu • Organic waste (Insoluble REEs present in the feed material to the SP). <p>The alternatives for the disposal of the brine and carbonates are discussed in Section 5.2.2.1.2 and 5.2.2.1.3 of the Draft EIAR.</p> <p>Organic waste will be collected and temporarily stored in a tank, and picked up on demand by external approved contractors for disposal.</p>
--	--	--	--	---	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and an invitation to the Public Open Day on the 12th of August 2014 was sent to the municipality.</p>	<p>4. Please state why Vissershok is not willing to accept the waste material.</p> <p>5. Any fossil finds should also be reported to the Saldanha Bay Municipality.</p> <p>6. Further comments are reserved for the EIA phase.</p>	<p>Disposal of the waste salt within the brine effluent to Vissershok as an alternative disposal compared to marine disposal was considered. However, Vissershok was not considered a viable option for disposal of waste salt due to the high saline load which will have a negative impact on the operation of the sensitive leachate treatment system at Vissershok. A letter from City of Cape Town confirming this was received.</p> <p>4. See above, only the carbonate wastes are considered for disposal to Vissershok.</p> <p>5. Noted.</p> <p>6. Noted.</p>
		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the municipality.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	
Ward Councillor - Ward 2	Joubert Skei PO Box 12 Vredenburg 7380	05/07/2013	<p>Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the ward councillor.</p>	<p>No comment received to date.</p>	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	Via registered letter: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the councillor.	No comment received to date.	
		08/11/2013	Via registered letter: On 8 November 2013 a notification letter informing the I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the councillor.	No comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via registered letter: On 9 July August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and an invitation to the Public Open Day on the 12 th of August 2014 was sent to the councillor.	No comment received to date.	
Ward Councillor - Ward 5	Frank Pronk PO Box 19 Saldanha 7395 Tel:701 7000 Cell: 073 388 3491 frank.pronk@sbm.gov.za	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the ward councillor.	Via fax: On 29 July 2013 Mr Pronk sent his registration form to the consultant with the following comments: 1. Impact of heavy vehicles on road infrastructure during construction. 2. Impact of traffic on roads during the operational phase.	Via email: On 29 July 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of Mr Pronk's registration form. She informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available. A Traffic Impact Assessment was undertaken during the EIA phase in order to address Mr Pronk's comments. Please refer to Appendix P of the Draft EIAR.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the councillor.	No further comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the councillor.	No further comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the councillor.	No further comment received to date.	
Ward Councillor - Ward 6	Andre Kruger Tel: 022 772 2412 Cell: 073 664 0506 info@wowlangebaan.co.za	10/07/2013		Via email: On 10 July 2013 Mr Kruger requested to be registered as and interested and affected party and provided his details to the consultant. He stated that he is the ward councillor for Langebaan and the speaker for the West Coast District Municipality and as such involved in all developments that take place on the West Coast. He reserved his right to comment at present and stated that he would provide input as the project progressed. He further stated that he was pro development in general but also very aware of the environmental issues.	Via email: On 11 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Mr Kruger for his email and informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the councillor.	No further comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email and sms: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the councillor.	No further comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the councillor.	No further comment received to date.	
Ward Councillor - Ward 8	Stephan Louw PO Box 12 Vredenburg 7380	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the ward councillor.	No comment received to date.	
		27/08/2013	Via registered letter: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the councillor.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		08/11/2013	Via registered letter: On 8 November 2013 a notification letter informing the I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the councillor.	No comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via registered letter: On 9 July August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and an invitation to the Public Open Day on the 12 th of August 2014 was sent to the councillor.	No comment received to date.	
Government Departments					
Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning (DEADP)	A. Matoli Tel: 021 483 2748 Fax: 021 483 4372 amatoli@pgwc.gov.za Deon Stoltz Waste Management Licencing Private Bag X9086 Cape Town 8000 Tel: 021 483 2805 Fax: 021 483 4425 Deon.Stoltz@westerncape.gov.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.	Via fax: On 25 September 2013 the Waste Management division of the department provided Ms Smith with the following comments on the Draft SR: 1. The waste settling dams must be lined with impervious layers to avoid any contamination of groundwater. More detail needs to be given as to what kind of liners will be used.	Via email: On 1 November 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of the department's comments and informed Mr Stoltz that the department's comments will be addressed in the Comments and Response Report. 1. Please refer to Section 4.4.5.2 of the Draft EIAR for details of the lining to be used for waste settling ponds and stormwater dams on site.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				<p>2. The applicant must ensure that sludge is tested and handled according to "The Guidelines for the Utilisation and Disposal of Waste Water Sludge, dated March 2007", prepared by the Water Research Commission, or any amendment to the guideline series.</p> <p>3. Which licensed waste disposal facility will be able to accept the insoluble solids, mixed rare earth carbonates and organic waste. Confirmation must be obtained from the waste disposal facility that it will be able to accept the types of waste.</p> <p>4. The Directorate reserves the right to revise initial comments and request further information.</p> <p>No further comment received to date.</p>	<p>2. Noted. The waste sludge would consist mainly of NaCl and the City of Cape Town's Solid Waste Management Department has indicated that they are unable to accept a salt waste sludge at Vissershok due to the high saline load (refer to a letter from the City of Cape Town attached as Appendix RS). Since there is currently no disposal facility able to accept this waste sludge it was decided to exclude the reverse osmosis process water treatment alternatives for the project but rather include for alternative water treatment processes.</p> <p>3. Noted. Various alternatives were considered for the disposal of the insoluble solids, mixed rare earth carbonates and organic waste. These alternatives are discussed in Section 5 of the Draft EIAR.</p> <p>4. Noted.</p>
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.		
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the department.		

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

<p>Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA): Chemicals and Waste Management</p>	<p>Shehaam Brinkhuis Private Bag X9086 Cape Town 8000 Tel: 021 483 8309 Fax:021 483 3254 Shehaam.Brinkhuis@westerncape.gov.za</p> <p>Zayed Brown Zayed.Brown@westerncape.gov.za</p>	<p>27/08/2013</p>	<p>Via courier: On the 27th of August 2013 a copy of the Draft Scoping Report was provided to the department for comment.</p>	<p>Via email: On 14 October 2013 Mr Brinkhuis contacted the consultants and requested an extension date for the purpose of commenting on the application. He requested extension for the submission date for comments until the 25th of October 2013.</p> <p>Via fax: On 29 October 2013 the department provided Ms Smith with the following comments on the Scoping Report with regards to pollution and waste management:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Although the Rare Earth (RE) metals are not as toxic as the other transition metals, exposure to RE is known to cause acute pneumonitis of the lungs and necrosis of the liver and hence all mitigation efforts to limit exposure to humans and the environment must be reflected in the final documents. 2. Trucks delivering RE salts to the Saldanha Bay Separation Plant must be covered with tarpaulins to prevent dust emissions. Should the conveyor belts be used (in the future), dust suppression methods must be applied to ensure minimisation of fugitive product; these must be detailed in the EIA. 	<p>Via email: Mr Gildenhuys informed Mr Brinkhuis that the department's request for extension is granted and gave them until the 28th of October 2013 to provide comments on the report. He stated that they had extended the commenting period for government departments until this date.</p> <p>Via email: On 1 November 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of the department's comments and informed Mr Stoltz that the department's comments will be addressed in the Comments and Response Report.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Noted. Please note that an Air Quality Impact Assessment and Health Impact Assessment were conducted as part of the EIA. Please refer to Appendix J and K of the Draft EIR. 2. Noted. Dust suppression management measures are provided in Section 8.4 of the Draft EIR.
--	---	-------------------	---	---	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				<p>3. During the construction phase of the plant, all materials considered as hazardous, must be contained in an access controlled section. All hazardous chemicals to be used must have an associated Materials Safety Data Sheet (MSDS) available on site; the hazardous chemicals to be used must be identified in the EIA and the storage methods explained.</p> <p>4. All wastes categorised as 'hazardous wastes', and which is generated during the construction phase or during the normal operation of the plant, must be secured in an access controlled area. Such wastes must be discarded in conformance to applicable legislative prescripts.</p> <p>5. Hazardous wastes must be disposed of by a registered and authorised service providers and certificates must be available depicting types of hazardous wastes, volume (or mass) of hazardous wastes and the receiving entity (where such wastes are to be dumped or treated).</p> <p>6. As part of the processed lanthanide oxides will not be sold but will be placed in evaporation ponds, the ponds must be constructed of material that is impermeable to the stored product and won't, under any circumstance, leach from the pond and contaminate the soil or ground water sources; the lining of the pond must be detailed in the EIA.</p>	<p>3. Noted. Please refer to Section 4.2.10 and 7.7.2 of the Draft EIR.</p> <p>4. Noted. Waste storage and disposal management measures are provided in Section 8.4 of the Draft EIR.</p> <p>5. Noted. Waste disposal management measures are provided in Section 8.4 of the Draft EIR.</p> <p>6. Noted. Please refer to Section 4.4.5.2 of the Draft EIR for details of the lining to be used for waste settling ponds and stormwater dams on site.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				<p>7. An explanation of the fate of the unsold (un-economical) lanthanide salts must be described in the Environmental Management Plan (EMP). The disposal of such unused product must be done in accordance to best international practice and detailed in the EIA.</p> <p>8. Raw materials which will include hydrochloric acid, sodium hydroxide, kerosene, etc. must be stored under stratified conditions so as to minimise the risk of comingling or release to the surroundings, Hydrochloric acid fumes are corrosive and the necessary controls must be described. All materials shall be stored under access controlled conditions and within bunded areas. The bund shall have a volume of 20% more than the volume of liquid material (per stratified storage).</p> <p>9. A map which clearly depicts the plant in relation to the 1:100 year Floodline must be included in the Environmental Management Plan (EMP).</p> <p>10. A storm water management plan must be described in the EMP.</p> <p>11. Any storm water generated on-site must be treated before release to the surroundings (National Water Act, Government Ground No. 20526, 8 October 1999).</p>	<p>7. Noted. Various alternatives were considered for the disposal of the rare earth carbonate waste. These alternatives are discussed in Section 5.2.2.1.3 of the Draft EIR.</p> <p>8. Noted. Please refer to Section 8.4 of the Draft EIR.</p> <p>9. Please note that no water courses or drainage lines occur on or adjacent to the site.</p> <p>10. Please note that storm water management measures are provided in Section 8.4 of the EIR.</p> <p>11. Noted.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		<p align="center">11/11/2013</p>	<p>Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.</p>	<p>12. Any water produced during the construction- and the operational phases must be treated to General Standards (National Water Act, Government Gazette No. 20526, 8 October 1999) or water use licence conditions set by the Department of Water Affairs, before discharge to the environment.</p> <p>13. Any kerosene and water mixture or 2-Erhyhexyl 2-Ethyhexul Phosphate mixture must be passed through an oil-water separator and the water treated to the applicable general standards.</p> <p>14. Any accidental spills must be responded to as per Section 30 (National Environmental Management Act (Act 107 of 1998) with subsections 30(3), 30(4) and 30(5) being triggered.</p> <p>Via telephone: On 21 November 2013 Mr Brown contacted the consultants with regards to the due date for comments to be submitted on the Draft Scoping Report.</p>	<p>12. Noted.</p> <p>13. Noted.</p> <p>14. Noted.</p> <p>Via telephone and email: Mr Gildenhuis informed Mr Brown that comments on the Draft Scoping Report had been received from DEADP Pollution Management and provided him with a copy of the comments. He further informed him that the Final Scoping Report was currently out for review until the 2nd of December. He requested that comments be submitted to himself or his colleague Chantal Smith (the public participation coordinator). He further requested that the contact person and contact details as wrongly indicated on the initial comments previously received by the Department should be corrected with AGES's details.</p>
--	--	----------------------------------	--	--	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				<p>Via fax: On 22 November 2013 the department provided Ms Smith with comments on the Scoping Report. The department stated that they have undertaken to reserve their comments to final reports, however the following matters must be addressed by the applicant so that they are included in the final report:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The department recommends that should the monitoring of the groundwater identify seepage containing excess quantities of salts, then the problem should be rectified. 2. The applicant shall develop a comprehensive contingency plan for transportation of the residue of the plant site to the disposal facility when details of materials handling and transportation have been finalised. 3. The applicant will dispose of all non-process wastes in an environmentally acceptable manner, and in accordance with the set requirements. 4. A comprehensive network of groundwater monitoring bores should be constructed and monitored for both water level and groundwater salt content on a routine basis. The results of this monitoring will be made available to the Department in the form of an annual report, except that if results indicate leakage from the ponds is occurring, then the Authority will be notified forthwith. 	<p>Via email: On 18 December 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of the Department's letter with comments on the SR and provided Ms Brinkhuis with the following response:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A hydrogeological impact assessment was undertaken as part of the EIA phase. Please refer to Appendix H of the Draft EIR. 2. Noted. This will form part of the operational procedures at both Zandkopsdrift minerals processing plant and the SP. 3. Noted. Waste disposal management measures are provided in Section 8.4 of the Draft EIR. 4. A hydrogeological impact assessment was undertaken as part of the EIA phase and provides recommendations with regards to the monitoring of groundwater, as well as the positioning of the monitoring boreholes. Please note that no groundwater will be abstracted and therefore no impact on groundwater levels is foreseen. Please refer to Appendix H of the Draft EIR.
--	--	--	--	---	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the department.</p>	<p>5. Water should be recycled wherever possible in the process, in order to reduce both economic and environmental effects of substantial usage.</p> <p>Via telephone: On 25 September 2014 Mr Brown contacted the consultants with regards to the Draft EIA Report.</p>	<p>5. Water recycling options are discussed under process water treatment alternatives (Section 5.2.2.1.1 of the Draft EIR).</p> <p>Via email: On 25 September Mr Gildenhuys responded to Mr Brown via email and provided him with the notification with the details for downloading the Draft EIR from the website. He also advised Mr Brown to use Firefox or Internet Explorer when downloading the reports. He further informed Mr Brown that a hard copy of the Final EIR will be provided to the Department for comment once it becomes available. He stated that the Department was welcome to still provide comments on the draft report as they were in the final stages of compiling the final EIR and asked that he please provide comments by the 30th of September 2014.</p>
		26/09/2014		<p>Via email: On 26 September 2014 Mr Brown informed Mr Gildenhuys that his browser was not compatible with the website. He stated that he would do his best to accede to the request for comment on the Draft report but that he needed access to the report. He indicated that he may have to request extension of a few days.</p>	<p>Via email: On 26 September 2014 Mr Gildenhuys provided Mr Brown with an electronic copy of the Draft EIR. He asked Mr Brown to please confirm receipt thereof and to also indicate should he wish to receive any of the attachments to the Draft EIR. He also asked by when Mr Brown would be able to provide comments.</p> <p>No further comment has been received to date.</p>
DEA&DP: Coastal Management	Zain Jumai Tel: 021 483 2889 / 084 402 3030 Fax: 021 483 4527 zjumai@pgwc.gov.za	05/07/2013	<p>Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.</p>	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		11/11/2013 09/07/2014	<p>Via fax: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.</p> <p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the department.</p>	<p>No comment received to date.</p> <p>No comment received to date.</p>	
Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning (DEADP)	<p>Caren George Chief Directorate: Environment and Land Management Coastal Management Unit Tel: 021 483 2724 Fax: 021 483 8326 caren.george@westerncape.gov.za</p> <p>Kishan Sankar Kishan.Sankar@westerncape.gov.za</p>	29/11/2013		<p>Via email: On 29 November 2013 Ms George informed Ms Smith that she was unable to access the AGES website and requested to be forwarded an electronic copy of the report.</p>	<p>Via email: On 2 December 2013 Ms Smith provided Ms George with the Ages Docs website link, username and password. She further informed her that the password was case sensitive and requested that she make use of Firefox or Google Chrome to access the website. In addition she provided her with an electronic copy of the Final Scoping Report, Comments and Response Report and Plan of Study for EIA. She requested that she inform her should she have any further difficulty in downloading the documents. She also stated that the commenting period for the Final Scoping Report ended on the 2nd of December as per the notification letter dating 11 November 2013 and requested that comments on the report be submitted by the end of the day, or latest the next morning.</p>

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		02/12/2013		<p>Via email: On 2 December 2013 Ms Smith received an automatic reply from Ms George informing her that she was currently out of the office until the 23rd of December.</p>	<p>Via email: On 2 December 2013 Ms Smith informed Mr Sankar that she had received a request for an electronic copy of the Final Scoping Report from Ms George but was informed that she was currently out of the office. She provided him with an electronic copy of the Final Scoping Report, Comments and Response Report and Plan of Study for EIA. She requested that he inform her should he have any difficulty in downloading the documents. She also stated that the commenting period for the Final Scoping Report ended on the 2nd of December as per the notification letter dating 11 November 2013 and requested that comments on the report be submitted by the end of the day or latest the next morning.</p>
		02/12/2013		<p>Via email: On 2 December 2013 Mr Sankar thanked Ms Smith for the report and informed her that the CMU will provide comments on the report by the next morning.</p>	<p>Noted.</p>

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		05/12/2013		<p>Via email: On 5 December 2013 Mr Sankar provided Ms Smith with the following comments:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A different EIA application (DEADP reference; 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3009/13) is currently being considered by the department for the proposed discharge of effluent into Danger Bay. The department had commented on this EIA application and provided the consultants with a copy of the comments. 2. Provisions of the Integrated Coastal Management Act, as stipulated in the comments on the above EIA application, must be taken into consideration for the assessment of the alternative that entails the proposed discharge of effluent into Danger Bay. 3. The CMU does not support the preferred alternative which entails the construction of an out flow pipe into Danger Bay, as this alternative poses a potential risk of radioactive material being released onto the bay unless appropriate mitigation measures are in place to prohibit radioactive material from entering the bay. 	<p>Via email: On 18 December 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of the letter from Mr Sankar and provided him with a response (refer to Appendix A2.3).</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Noted. Brine discharge from the SP into Danger Bay forms part of the Saldanha Regional Marine Outfall (SRMO) Project, (EIA Reference no: 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3009/13). 2. The comments will be taken into consideration for the assessment of alternatives as part of the EIA phase for the Saldanha Regional Marine Outfall (SRMO) Project, (EIA Reference no: 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3009/13). 3. Noted. Brine discharge of the SP into Danger Bay forms part of the Saldanha Regional Marine Outfall (SRMO) Project, (EIA Reference no: 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3009/13). Comments have been forwarded to Mr S Johnson who is the Public Participation Officer for this project as appointed by the CSIR conducting the EIA.
--	--	------------	--	--	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

					<p>In this regard it is important to note that any impurities (including potentially radioactive materials) will be removed at the Zandkopsdrift mine site operation (Garies), prior to transporting the Rare Earth Element (REE) Salts to the SP (Saldanha). The Zandkopsdrift mine & minerals processing plant falls within the scope of a separate company and EIA. (EIA reference number NC/EIA/NAM/KAM/ZAN/2012)</p> <p>In order to monitor radioactivity in the REE salts produced at Zandkopsdrift minerals processing plant, three separate monitoring systems are planned:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Firstly, real time online radioactive monitoring will be conducted to ensure that REE salts produced at the mine, prior to shipment to the SP, are within legislative and acceptable limits determined during the EIA for the Zandkopsdrift Mine. Should the online monitoring system determine that radio activity levels are not within specification, the REE salts produced will automatically be rejected at the Zandkopsdrift minerals processing plant and not be allowed to move to the packing and transport facility. (to be determined) to confirm the results of the real time monitoring instrumentation.
--	--	--	--	--	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Secondly, manual samples will be taken of the REE salts produced at the mine during each operating shift, at predetermined intervals, and tested at a laboratory (to be determined) to confirm the results of the real time monitoring instrumentation. • Thirdly, REE salt samples will be tested for radioactivity at the (National Nuclear Regulator) NNR. The frequency of the different radioactive assessments (real time monitoring, manual sampling and NNR assessment) will be determined during the EIA for the Zandkopsdrift Mine. <p>On receipt of a REE salt shipment at the Separation Plant (SP), additional radioactive tests will be completed to confirm that the product is within the required pre-determined specification limits:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Firstly, real-time radioactive monitoring will be installed on the materials offloading system at the SP. Any material found not to meet the specifications will automatically be diverted for return to the Zandkopsdrift Processing Facility, thereby not being processed any further at the SP. • Secondly, manual samples will be taken at the SP of the REE salts received during each operating shift, at predetermined intervals, and tested at a laboratory.
--	--	--	--	--	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

					<p>In summary it is not expected that radioactive material will be received by the SP and in the unlikely event of radioactive materials reaching the plant, if any does it will be returned to the Zandkopsdrift minerals processing plant within a predetermined limited timeframe.</p> <p>The final radioactive monitoring will be performed by real time monitoring on the brine effluent stream from the SP to the SRMO brine transfer tank to ensure that the brine effluent entering the SRMO system is within the prescribed limits of the EIA RoD. Should the limits be breached the system will automatically prevent the brine from entering the SRMO system.</p> <p>Thus the risk of any accidental discharge is obsolete due to the number of control systems at both the supply and receive portions of the projects. In addition it is expected that any radioactive elements that may be present will not report to the brine produced but rather to the REE oxide product that will affect the quality of the SP's production. Thus any radioactive material will depreciate the quality of REE produced (product) which would lead to revenue losses. It would therefore not be beneficial to Frontier Separation to allow any radioactive material into the SP; necessitating control over radioactive limits. And thus is not beneficial to Frontier Separation to allow any radioactive material into the SP and thus the reason for the control over radioactive limits.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the department.	No further comment received to date.	
--	--	------------	--	--------------------------------------	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

<p>Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA): Branch Oceans and Coasts</p>	<p>Mr. Ulrich van Bloemestein (Principal Oceanographer: Coastal Pollution Management) PO Box 52126 Oceans and Coasts V&A Waterfront 8002</p> <p>No. 2 East Pier Shed East Pier Road V&A Waterfront Cape Town Tel: 021 819 2456 Fax: 021 819 2445 Cell: 073 368 2818 uvbloem@environment.gov.za</p> <p>Thilivhali Mereg Tel: 021 819 2494 tmeregi@environment.gov.za</p> <p>Funanani Ditinti Tel: 021 819 2499 fditinti@environment.gov.za</p> <p>Wake Vinathi Tel: 021 819 2442 wvinathi@environment.gov.za</p> <p>Mulalo Tshikotshi Tel: 021 819 2455 mtshikot@environment.gov.za</p> <p>Siyasanga Garane Cell: 083 690 0049 sgarane@environment.gov.za</p>	<p>05/07/2013</p>	<p>Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.</p>	<p>Via focus group meeting: A focus group meeting was held on the 14th of June 2013. The comments provided by DEA (Oceans & Coast) were largely only relevant to the Regional Marine Outfall EIA project (different EIA process). This EIA was also discussed at the meeting and only comments applicable to this EIA was included in the meeting minutes. Refer to Appendix A5.1 of the Scoping Report for Meeting Minutes of the focus group meeting. The DEA (Oceans & Coast branch) was nevertheless registered on the EIA in order to keep them informed of the project.</p> <p>No comment with specific relevance to the Frontier Separation Plant EIA was provided. Also refer to comments by DWA in the section directly below.</p>	<p>The DEA (Oceans and Coast) was registered as I&APs on the project.</p>
--	---	-------------------	--	--	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

<p>Siyanda Mentyisi PO Box 52126 Victoria and Alfred Waterfront Cape Town 8002 SMentyisi@environment.gov.za</p>	27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.	No further comment received.	
	27/08/2013	Via courier: On the 27 th of August 2013 a copy of the Draft Scoping Report was provided to the department for comment.	No further comment received.	
	11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.	No further comment received.	
	14/07/2014	Via registered letter: On 14 July 2014 an electronic copy of the Draft EIA Report was sent to the Department.	No further comment received.	
	09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the department.	Via email: On 11 July 2014 Ms Mentyisi contacted Ms Smith and requested a soft copy of the Draft EIA Report so that they could commence their review thereof. She also stated that the Department was experiencing network constraints and therefore could not access the digital copy on the website. She also provided her with contact details for future correspondence.	Via email: On 14 July 2014 Ms Smith informed Ms Mentyisi that the Draft EIA Report was 13MB excluding the appendices and asked whether she could receive such large files via email. She further stated that she could alternatively prepare an electronic copy of the report on a CD and courier it to her.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		14/07/2014	<p>Via registered letter: On 14 July 2014 an electronic copy of the Draft EIA Report was sent to the West Coast Bird Club.</p>	<p>Via email: On 14 July 2014 Ms Mentyisi informed Ms Smith that an electronic copy on a CD would be preferable.</p>	<p>Via email: Ms Smith asked Ms Mentyisi to provide her with a postal address to which she could send the CD. Ms Mentyisi provided Ms Smith with the Department's postal address.</p>
		16/07/2014		<p>Via email: On 16 July 2014 Ms Mentyisi thanked Ms Smith and informed her that the Department would send an acknowledgement letter as soon as they have received the report.</p>	<p>On 16 July 2014 Ms Smith informed Ms Mentyisi that an electronic copy of the Draft EIA Report had been posted to the Department on the 15th of July 2014 via registered mail and provided her with the tracking number for the parcel. She also asked her to kindly acknowledge receipt of the parcel once she had received it.</p> <p>No further comment received to date.</p>

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

<p>Department of Water Affairs</p>	<p>Mrs Hester Lyons Private bag x16 Sanlamhoff 7532</p> <p>Warren Dreyer (Berg Proto-CMA: Water Quality Management) Environmental Officer 52 Voortrekker Road Bellville 7530</p> <p>Private Bag X16 Sanlamhof 7532 Cell: 082 600 8684 Tel: 021 941 6185 Fax: 086 556 9985 dreyerw@dwa.gov.za</p>	<p>05/07/2013</p>	<p>Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to Mrs Lyons and Mr Dreyer.</p>	<p>No comment received on the BID and registration from sent.</p> <p>A Pre-Application focus group meeting was however held with the DWA and the DEA (Oceans & Coast Branch) on the 14th of June 2013. The following comments were provided by DWA with reference to the Frontier Separation Plant EIA (also refer to Meeting Minutes attached):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. An overall water balance that shows the water flow between the CAH plant, the Frontier plant and the Regional Marine Outfall pipeline will be a requirement for the Water Use License Application(s). 2. The various effluent streams into the pipeline will need to be measured, both separately before feeding into the pipeline, as well as cumulatively. 3. The various WUL applications should be handed in together in order to synergise the application process. 4. A Lo-Hu 2% MREL lining is recommended for the settling pond(s). 5. The only applicable water use for the Frontier Separation Plant project is Section 21 (g) for the settlings ponds and the honey sucker sewage collection tank. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Please refer to Figure 4.4 and Appendix H1 of the Draft EIR. 2. Noted. 3. Noted. 4. Noted. 5. Noted. A Section 21(g) WUL application will be submitted for the Frontier Separation Plant.
------------------------------------	--	-------------------	---	--	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				<p>6. Clean storm water should be drained into the environment and should not be mixed with dirty water wherever possible. Keep clean and dirty water areas on site separate.</p> <p>7. The storm water and settling pond(s) need to be lined.</p> <p>8. Emergency storage will need to be provided for if the water quality before discharging into the pipeline is not of a good enough quality.</p> <p>9. An advisory forum between the different plants/stakeholders (CAH, Frontier, WCDM) needs to be set up.</p>	<p>6. Noted. Storm Water management measures are provided in Section 8.4 of the Draft EIR.</p> <p>7. Noted.</p> <p>8. Noted.</p> <p>9. Noted.</p>
		27/08/2013	<p>Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	
		27/08/2013	<p>Via courier: On the 27th of August 2013 a copy of the Draft Scoping Report was provided to the department for comment.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	
		08/11/2013	<p>Via registered letter: On 8 November 2013 a notification letter informing the I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.	No further comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the department.	No further comment received to date.	
Department of Agriculture	Mr AS Roux Private Bag X1 Elsenburg 7607 franciss@elsenburg.com Cor van der Walt Landuse Management Tel: 021 808 5099 Fax: 021 808 5092 Landuse.elsenburg@elsenburg.com	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.	Via registered letter: On 19 July 2013 the department informed Ms Smith that the Western Cape Department of Agriculture will comment once more information is available. They further requested that the reference number 20/9/2/2/11/080 be quoted in any future correspondence in respect of the application. They also informed Ms Smith that the department reserves the right to revise initial comments and request further information based on the information received.	Noted.
		27/08/2013	Via courier: On the 27th of August 2013 a copy of the Draft Scoping Report was provided to the department for comment.		

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		28/08/2013	<p>Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.</p>	<p>Via registered letter: On 16 September 2013 the department informed Ms Smith that they had no objection against the proposed construction of a separation plant on portion 9 of the Farm Langeberg No. 188, Saldanha Bay, as this area is contained within the Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone and forms part of the pre-1994 municipal area. It is further excluded from the provisions of the Subdivision of Agricultural Lands Act 70 of 1970. The department requested that the reference number be quoted in any future correspondence in respect of the application and stated that they reserved the right to revise initial comments and request further information based on the information received.</p>	<p>Via email: On 18 December 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of the Department's letter and informed them that their comments had been noted.</p>
		11/11/2013	<p>Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	
		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the department.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	
Department of Agriculture - Vredenburg Office	PO Box 130 Vredendal 8160	05/07/2013	<p>Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.</p>	<p>No comment received to date.</p>	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		08/11/2013	Via registered letter: On 8 November 2013 a notification letter informing the I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.	No comment received to date.	
Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works	Head of department: Mr Johan Fourie Private Bag X9185 Cape Town 8001 Tel:021 483 4391 Fax: 021 483 8755 Johan.Fourie@westerncape.gov.za Transport.Publicworks@westerncape.gov.za Lucy Caplan Tel: 021 483 6755 Lucy.Caplan@westerncape.gov.za	05/07/2013	Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.	Via email: On 8 July 2013 the consultant received an email from the department thanking her for her email and informing her that it will be forwarded to Lucy Caplan, Head of Office for the branch Public Works.	Via email: On 9 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked the department for their assistance in the matter. No comment has to date been received from Ms Caplan.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

<p>Deon Fourie Directorate Property Planning Private Bag X9158 Cape Town 8000 Tel: 021 483 5422 Fax: 021 483 5353 deon.fourie@pgwc.gov.za</p> <p>Danielle Manuel Provincial Infrastructure Policy and Strategy Transport and Public Works Private Bag X9185 Cape Town 8000 Tel: 021 483 0988 Fax: 021 483 8580 danielle.manuel@westerncape.gov.za</p>	12/07/2013		<p>Via email: On 12 July 2013 Mr Fourie commented that the department perused the BID and would like to inform the consultant that the proposed project is not expected to have a negative effect on provincial owned properties in the Vredenburg/Saldanha area and the department would therefore not participate in the Public Participation Process.</p>	Noted.
	11/11/2013	<p>Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.</p>	<p>Via email: On 11 November 2013 Ms Manuel requested that an electronic copy of the Final Scoping Report be sent to her as she is unable to download it.</p>	<p>Via email: On 11 November 2013 Ms Smith provided Ms Manuel with an electronic copy of the final Scoping Report, Comments and Response Report and the Plan of study for EIA. She also requested Ms Manuel to inform her should she require any of the other appendices.</p>
	09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the department.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Provincial Roads and Transport Management: West Coast	Regional Manager: Mr Lars Starke (District Roads Engineer) Private Bag X2 Ceres 6835 Tel: 023 312 1120 Cell: 082 809 6170 Fax: 023 312 2633 Lars.Starke@westerncape.gov.za	05/07/2013	Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.	No comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.	No comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the department.	No comment received to date.	
SAHRA – Heritage Western Cape	Jenna Lavin jlavin@pgwc.gov.za Jenna.Lavin@westerncape.gov.za Guy Thomas Tel: 021 483 9685 Fax: 021 483 9842 Guy.thomas@westerncape.gov.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.	No comment received.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	<p>Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.</p>	<p>Via email: On 27 August 2013 Mr Thomas informed Ms Smith that Heritage Western Cape (HWC) required a Notification of Intent to Develop (NID) to be submitted regarding the application as required by section 38 of the National Heritage Resource Act (Act 25 of 1999). He asked that is this form had not yet been submitted, that it please be completed and that four hard copies and one digital copy along with any associated documentation be submitted to the HWC offices. He further informed Ms Smith that he was the case officer for the project and that he had reviewed the Scoping Report. He noted that the Scoping Report makes mention of two studies conducted in the past regarding the palaeontology and archaeology of option 1. He stated that these studies are not referenced properly and are not included as entries in the reports appendices (John Pether's Palaeontology Study and Jonathan Kaplan's 2006 Archaeological survey). He asked that these reports be included when submitting to HWC.</p>	<p>Via email: Ms Smith informed Mr Thomas that the NID will be submitted by the heritage practitioner for the project, Mr Bruce Eitzen, however she would forward the relevant correspondence to him. She thanked him for his comments on the Draft Scoping Report and informed him that these would be addressed in the Final Scoping Report, which would be made available for review and of which he would be notified in advance. In addition, she would request that the Heritage Practitioner submits the palaeontological and archaeological reports to Heritage Western Cape.</p>
		27/08/2013		<p>Via email: Mr Thomas thanked Ms Smith for the information.</p>	<p>Please note that the palaeontological, archaeological and heritage reports have been uploaded to SAHRIS. The reports are attached as Appendix O to the Draft EIR.</p>

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		06/11/2013	<p>Via hand delivery: On 6 November 2013 a Notice of Intent to Develop (NID) was submitted to Heritage Western Cape.</p>	<p>Via email: On 21 November 2013 Heritage Western Cape (HWC) provided the following comments on the submitted NID:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted upon, HWC requires an HIA in terms of S. 38(3) of the NHRA (Act 25 of 1999) assessing the impacts on the following heritage resources which it has identified; 2. An HIA is required consisting of a palaeontological study as well as a visual impact assessment. 	<p>Via email: On 18 December 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of the letter from HWC and provided him with a response (refer to Appendix A2.3 of the Draft EIR). Please note that a Heritage Impact Assessment, Archaeological Impact Assessment, Palaeontological Study and Visual Impact Assessment was undertaken as part of the EIA process. The specialist reports are attached in Appendix L and O of the Draft EIR.</p>
		11/11/2013	<p>Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department. The SAHRA was also notified that the Final Scoping Report had been uploaded to the SAHRIS website.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	
		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to SAHRA.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Western Cape Department of Economic Development and Tourism (DEDAT)	Nigel Gwynne-Evans (Acting chief director) PO Box 979 Cape Town 8000 Tel: 021 483 3859 Fax: 021 483 4616	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.	No comment received to date.	
	Jim Petrie (Energy director) PO Box 979 Cape Town 8000	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.	No comment received to date.	
	Solly Fourie (Head of department) Box 979 Cape Town 8000 Tel: 021 483 5065 Fax: 021 483 7527 ecohead@westerncape.gov.za	05/07/2013 27/08/2013 11/11/2013 09/07/2014	Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department. Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department. Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department. Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the department.	No comment received to date. No comment received to date. No comment received to date. No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

	Jo-Ann Johnston (Chief Director: Strategic Initiatives) PO Box 979 Cape Town 8000	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department.	No comment received to date.	
	Herman Jonker (Portfolio Manager: Cape Catalyst) PO Box 979 Cape Town 8000	05/07/2013 08/11/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the department. Via registered letter: On 8 November 2013 a notification letter informing the I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the department.	No comment received to date. No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Other					
West Coast Fossil Park	<p>Pippa Haarhof PO Box 42 Langebaanweg 7375 Tel: 022 766 1606 Fax: 022 766 1765 Cell: 083 289 6902 info@fossilpark.org.za pjh@fossilpark.org.za</p> <p>Nicolaas eco@fossilpark.org.za</p>	05/07/2013	<p>Via email, registered letter and hand delivery: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>Via email: On 23 July 2013 Ms Haarhof provided the following preliminary concerns regarding the application:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The need for a palaeontological and archaeological surface survey prior to any earth moving activity 2. Provision for monitoring subsurface activity should the application be approved 3. Provision for rescue excavations of fossil material should the application be approved 4. Dust pollution 5. Increased heavy traffic 6. Noise pollution 7. Potential risks associated with using and storing hazardous chemicals 8. Potential risks associated with processing and storing Rare Earths 	<p>Via email: On 23 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Ms Haarhof for her comments and informed her that she had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed her that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that she will be notified in advance when the reports become available. Please note that the following specialist studies, amongst others, was conducted during the EIA phase, addresses Ms Haarhof's comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Archaeological Impact Assessment (Appendix O1 of the Draft EIR) - Palaeontological Study (Appendix O3 of the Draft EIR) - Air Quality Impact Assessment (Appendix J of the Draft EIR) - Traffic Impact Assessment (Appendix P of the Draft EIR) - Noise Impact Assessment (Appendix Q of the Draft EIR) - Ecological Impact Assessment (Appendix I of the Draft EIR) - Visual Impact Assessment (Appendix L of the Draft EIR)

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		<p>27/08/2013</p> <p>11/11/2013</p>	<p>Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.</p> <p>Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>9. Potential lowering and polluting of the water table</p> <p>10. Potential negative impact on naturally occurring fauna and flora</p> <p>11. Rehabilitation of disturbed areas according to best practice</p> <p>12. Visual impact</p> <p>She stated that she reserved the right to provide further comments. She requested to be registered as an I&AP. She further commented as follows regarding the land diagram: the Samancor – Chemfos mining operations ceased in 1993 and thereafter a rehabilitation and closure process was followed culminating with the issuing of a closure certificate in 2003. Since the mine made a decision to close in 1993, considerable time, effort and cost has gone into establishing the Fossil Park which is now a Provincial Heritage Site and a Nature Reserve and is governed by a Board of Trustees.</p> <p>No further comment received to date.</p> <p>No further comment received to date.</p>	<p>In addition, impacts associated with the storage and use of hazardous chemicals, the processing and storage of Rare Earths are assessed in Section 7 of the Draft EIR.</p> <p>The information regarding the establishment of the West Coast Fossil Park as a Provincial Heritage Site and Nature Reserve is noted.</p>
--	--	-------------------------------------	---	---	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the West Coast Fossil Park.</p>		<p>Via email: On 10 July 2014 Ms Smith informed Nicolaas from the West Coast Fossil Park that she had received his message and could send him the Draft EIA Report via email. She did however state that he report was 13MB excluding the appendices and asked whether he could receive emails that large.</p> <p>She stated that she could alternatively provide him with an electronic copy of the report and appendices on a CD. She also informed him that a hard copy of the report was available at the Vredenburg Public Library as well as the Blue Bay Lodge in Saldanha for review by I&APs.</p>
		15/07/2014	<p>Via registered letter: On 15 July 2014 an electronic copy of the Draft EIA Report was sent to the West Coast Fossil Park.</p>		<p>Via email: On 16 July 2014 Ms Smith informed Nicolaas that an electronic copy of the Draft EIA Report had been posted to him via registered mail on the 15th of July 2014 and provided him with the tracking number. She further asked him to kindly acknowledge receipt thereof.</p>
		16/07/2014		<p>Via email: On 16 July 2014 Nicolaas thanked Ms Smith for her assistance.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve (CWCBR)	Rhett Smart PO Box 283 Darling 7345 Fax: 022 714 1963	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 10 July 2013 Ms Mahlabegwane requested that the Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve be registered as an I&AP on the project.	Via email: On 11 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Ms Mahlabegwane for her email and informed her that she had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed her that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that she will be notified in advance when the reports become available.
	Innocentia Mahlabegwane PO Box 283 Darling 7345 Tel: 022 492 2750 Cell: 073 395 7761 Fax: 086 236 4374 imahlabegwane@capbiosphere.co.za	27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
	Keith Harrison Tel: 022 713 3026 keithharrison@lando.co.za keithharrison@lando.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Cape Nature	Amukelani Nkuna (Catchment Manager: West Coast Cluster) PO Box 26 Porterville 6810 Tel: 022 931 2900 Fax2email: 086 266 2645 Cell: 072 437 4011 ankuna@capenature.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
	Ms Alana Duffel- Canham Private Bag x5014 Stellenbosch 7599 Tel +27 21 866 8029 Fax +27 21 866 1523 Cell +27 082 727 2691 Fax2email +27 86 529 3475 aduffel-canham@capenature.co.za	27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 9 July 2014 Ms Duffel-Canham asked Ms Smith whether a copy of the report had been sent to Cape Nature as per their standard requirements.	Via email: On 10 July Ms Smith replied to Ms Duffel-Canham and informed her that she had not been aware that Cape Nature required a hard copy of the report as the reports are usually made available electronically for download of the AGES website in an effort to save paper, but that a hard copy of the report will be couriered to Cape Nature for review.
		10/07/2014		Via email: On 10 July 2014 Ms Duffel-Canham informed Ms Smith that Cape Nature required a hard copy for auditing and record keeping purposes and because Cape Nature did not have the time or budget to download and print report due to the large volume of reports which they receive. She also requested that an electronic copy on a CD be sent with the hard copy.	Vie email: On 10 July 2014 Ms Smith informed Ms Duffel-Canham that she would provide her with a hard copy and an electronic copy of the report.
		15/07/2014	Via courier: On 15 July 2014 a hard copy of the Draft EIA Report was sent to Cape Nature.	Via email: On 16 July 2014 Ms Smith informed Ms Duffel-Canham that an electronic copy of the Draft EIA Report was couriered to Cape Nature on the 15 th of July 2014 and asked that she kindly confirm receipt thereof.	Via email: On 18 July 2014 Ms Duffel-Canham confirmed receipt of the report and asked when comment in due.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		15/07/2014		<p>Via email: On 24 July 2014 Ms Duffell-Canham from Cape Nature provided the comments below in a letter via email. She also requested the DEADP reference number and case offices for the project.</p> <p>1. The proposed facility site was historically covered by Saldanha Flats Strandveld. Even though this vegetation type is no longer listed as Endangered by the South African vegetation map, a recent survey by Cape Nature found that it meets the criteria for being listed as endangered in terms of Section 52 of the Biodiversity Act.</p> <p>2. The proposed site has however been transformed by agriculture and very little natural vegetation remains.</p> <p>3. Disposal of waste by both separation plant and the proposed chlorine, caustic soda and HCl facility next door was still a high concern to Cape Nature. As both facilities seemed to be dependent on the marine outfall being authorised all three applications would have been better assessed jointly as their viability is inter-dependent. The disposal of waste to the marine environment not only has potential negative impacts on marine ecology but the pipeline required will also impact on terrestrial biodiversity, including Critical Biodiversity Areas.</p>	<p>Via email: On 28 July 2014 Ms Smith thanked Ms Duffell-Canham for the comments from Cape Nature and informed her that the comments will be included and addressed in the CRR which will be made available for public review along with the Final EIA Report. She further provided Ms Duffell-Canham with the DEADP reference number (DEADP Ref no: 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3004/13) and the case officer's contact details.</p> <p>1. Noted.</p> <p>2. Noted.</p> <p>3. Please note that this discharge of the brine into Danger Bay, as well as the terrestrial biodiversity impact of the pipeline, forms part of the Saldanha Regional Marine Outfall (SRMO) Project (EIA Reference no: 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3009/13).</p>
--	--	------------	--	---	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				<p>4. The long term effects of discharging brine into Saldanha Bay or Danger Bay cannot be fully predicted and the exact composition of the discharge is not clear at this stage and it is possible that the discharge could be more toxic to marine life than the effluent which was assessed for the desalination plant. Although it is proposed to monitor the effluent before disposal to ensure that it contains no hazardous chemicals, this risk should still be quantified. Combinations of effluents could also be more hazardous than any one effluent on its own.</p> <p>5. CapeNature therefore cannot support this project until the full extent of the potential impacts resulting from the disposal of effluent and other waste from either or both the above-mentioned plants are fully understood and assessed.</p> <p>6. Regarding the storage of hazardous waste on site. Liners for the ponds that are to contain the waste should be regularly inspected for damage. Groundwater monitoring should take place regularly even if no leaks or infiltration is detected. Stormwater management on site is also essential and we are pleased to note that a detailed stormwater management plan has been drawn up.</p>	<p>4. This impact will be assessed as part of the Saldanha Regional Marine Outfall (SRMO) Project (EIA Reference no: 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3009/13). The constituents of the various proposed effluent streams are addressed as part of the SRMO project EIA.</p> <p>5. Noted. The draft EIRs for both the proposed chlorine, caustic soda and HCl facility and the SRMO Projects are expected to be available before the end of 2014 and therefore the full extent of the potential impacts will soon be available for CapeNature to review.</p> <p>6. The waste settling pond will be lined with a three layer lining (top layer, middle leak detection layer, and bottom layer). All the layers will be made of UV-light and heat stabilised pure high density polyethylene (HDPE). Should there be a leak in the top layer it will release effluent to the middle leak detection layer which will alert operators of the leak in order for it to be fixed. Groundwater monitoring was included in the Environmental Management Plan as specified and base line ground water monitoring boreholes was established on site. The comment regarding the stormwater management plan is noted.</p>
--	--	--	--	---	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				7. The site should be regularly inspected and cleared of invasive alien plants. Note that in terms of rehabilitation and planting of trees for visual screening, alternatives to gum trees should be sought as these are not naturally found within the Strandveld vegetation types and certain species of gum tree can become invasive. A suitable alternative which can grow quickly if planted correctly could include <i>Olea europaea subsp. africana</i> or other olive species.	7. Noted. The recommendation by the Visual Impact Assessment Specialist regarding the planting of gum trees was removed from the Environmental Management Plan and replaced to include indigenous tree species, in particular <i>Olea europaea subsp africana</i> .
Botanical Society	Hednig Slabig Cell: 073 144 3560 slabigh@gmail.com	05/07/2013 09/07/2014	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder. Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
West Coast Bird Club (WCBC)	Keith Harrison PO Box 1404 Vredenburg 7380 keithbharrison@lando.co.za	08/07/2013		Via email: On 8 July 2013 Mr Harrison requested that the consultant register the West Coast Bird Club as an I&AP on the project. He also requested that the BID, Draft Scoping Report and Draft Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIR) be sent to him in CD format.	Via email: On 11 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Mr Harrison for his email and informed him that the WCBC had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She provided him with a copy of the BID and registration form. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the West Coast Bird Club.	Via email: On 10 July 2014 Mr Harrison requested a copy of the draft EIA Report on a CD. He also asked that the West Coast Bird Club be registered as an I&AP.	Via email: On 10 July 2014 Ms Smith informed Mr Harrison that the West Coast Bird Club had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She further informed him that she would prepare an electronic copy of the report and provide him with the tracking number as soon as she has sent it.
		15/07/2014	Via registered letter: On 15 July 2014 an electronic copy of the Draft EIA Report was sent to the West Coast Bird Club.	Via email: On 12 July 2014 Mr Harrison thanked Ms Smith for confirming that the West Coast Bird Club is an I&AP.	Via email: On 16 July 2014 Ms Smith informed Mr Harrison that an electronic copy of the Draft EIA Report had been posted to him via registered mail on the 15 th of July 2014 and provided him with the tracking number. She further asked him to kindly acknowledge receipt thereof.
		21/07/2014		Via email: On 21 July 2014 Mr Harrison confirmed receipt of the electronic copy of the Draft EIA Report.	No further comments received to date.
Eskom	Mr. Richard Jones (Key Customer Executive) PO Box 5736 Tygervalley 7536 Tel: 021 941 5708 Cell: 082 416 0405 jonesr@eskom.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date	
	Mr. Owen Peters (Land Development Distribution) Tel: 021 980 3817 Cell: 084 460 5801 Fax: 086 566 7877 Owen.Peters@eskom.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 11 July 2013 Mr Peters informed the consultant that they do not currently have any comments on the proposed project, but are an interested party due to their involvement with the new power line and substation which will feed the plant. He requested to be registered as an I&AP.	Via email: On 11 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Mr Peters for his email and informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association	<p>LRRA – Jaco Kotze PO Box 120 Langebaan 7357 Cell: 082 889 0685 info@langebaanratepayers.co.za</p> <p>John Selby johnselby@worldonline.co.za</p>	29/07/2013	Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 29 July 2013 Mr Kotze requested the consultant to register the Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association as an I&AP on the project.	Via email: On 29 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Mr Kotze for his email and informed him that the Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available.
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		11/11/2013	<p>Via email and sms: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>Via email: On 24 November 2013 Mr Selby informed Ms Smith that he has been trying to download a copy of the Final Scoping Report from the AGES website but that the login did not appear to work. He requested that an electronic copy of the document be forwarded to him.</p>	<p>Via email: On 25 November 2013 Ms Smith provided Mr Selby with the Ages Docs website link, username and password. She further informed him that the password was case sensitive and requested that he make use of Firefox or Google Chrome to access the website. In addition she provided him with an electronic copy of the Final Scoping Report, Comments and Response Report and Plan of Study for EIA. She requested that he inform her should he have any further difficulty in downloading the documents.</p>
		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>Via email: On 16 July 2014 Mr Selby emailed Ms Smith and informed her that he had a copy of version 2.0 dated November 2013 and asked her if this was the latest version or if there was an update. He also informed her that he would attend the public meeting on the 12th of August.</p>	<p>Via email: On 16 July 2014 Ms Smith informed Mr Selby that the report he was referring to was the Final Scoping Report and that the Draft EIA Report was now available for review. She stated that the Draft EIA Report is a much more detailed report which assesses all the potential impacts of the project and included the EMP with management measures to mitigate the potential impacts. She also stated that the specialist studies are attached to the report.</p> <p>She further informed him that hard copies of the report were available at the Blue Bay Lodge in Saldanha and the Vredenburg Public Library in Vredenburg. A digital copy of the report was also available for download on the AGES website. She provided him with the download details and informed him that they looked forward to seeing him at the Open Day.</p>

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		20/07/2014		<p>Via email: On 20 July 2014 Mr Selby informed Ms Smith that the website didn't seem to be working and requested a digital copy of the Draft EIA Report.</p>	<p>Via email: On 21 July 2014 Ms Smith informed Mr Selby that Firefox or Google Chrome should be used to access the website. She did however offer to send him a digital copy of the report and informed him that the report was 13MB excluding the appendices and asked whether he could receive files that large. Alternatively should he prefer she could post him an electronic copy on a CD. Ms Smith requested Mr Selby's postal address.</p>
		21/07/2014		<p>Via email: On 21 July 2014 Mr Selby informed Ms Smith that he was using Firefox with no success and requested that the report be placed of dropbox. He also requested that the report be emailed to him and provided Ms Smith with his postal address.</p>	<p>Via email: On 22 July Ms Smith informed Mr Selby that she had no difficulty accessing the website but would ask the IT department to have a look at it. She also informed him that she had placed the report and appendices on dropbox and provided him with the dropbox link. She further stated that an electronic copy will also be sent via registered mail.</p>
		22/07/2014		<p>Via email: On 22 July 2014 Mr Selby informed Ms Smith that he had retrieved the documents from Dropbox.</p>	<p>Noted</p>
		06/08/2014		<p>Via email: On 6 August 2014 Mr Selby asked whether he could send comments before the meeting or at the meeting.</p>	<p>Via email: On 6 August 2014 Ms Smith informed Mr Selby that he was welcome to provide comments before the meeting and that his comments would be included and addressed in the CRR which would be made available for public review along with the Final EIA Report. She further stated that he could also provide comments at the open day should he have any further questions and/or comments. In addition, she informed his that he has until the 8th of September to provide comment on the Draft EIA Report and provided him with the notification in this regard.</p>

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		12/08/2014		<p>On 12th of August 2014 Mr Selby attended the public Open Day. He provided a number of comments at the open day and then again submitted the same comments in writing via email on the 16th of August 2014. The comments were as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. What is the status of the proposed chlorine plant that is planned for next door to the site? 2. If the chlor-alkali plant cannot accept the waste brine due to its contaminants; how can these be discharged to the ocean? 3. Will the Saldanha Regional Marine outfall project be operational before the plant starts? If not what is the plan? 4. What trace elements will be in the brine which you propose to discharge to the sea? Will there be any accumulative toxins for marine life? 5. There is no mention of radioactivity or the regulator for this discipline in the draft EIR. It was mentioned during the last round of comments. Why is it not included? 	<p>Mr Selby's comments were in part answered at the open day on the 12th of August and a formal response on all the questions can be found below:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The project is currently still awaiting authorization. The draft Environmental Impact Report will should soon be available for comment by I&APs. The public open day for the CAPF is scheduled for the 16th of October 2014. 2. The CAPF requires clean salt with no impurities as the membrane technology utilised in the CAPF is very sensitive to impurities. The brine produced at the SSP may contain limited impurities not acceptable to the sensitive membrane technology utilised. 3. Yes the SRMO Project is a pre requisite for the operation of the SSP and the CAPF. There is no alternative plan as there is no other disposal option available for salt or brine produced by either the SSP or the CAPF. Drikus to assist. 4. Please refer to the SRMO project EIA (EIA Reference no: 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3009/13) completed by the CSIR. 5. Radioactivity was mentioned in the Comments and Response Report (CRR) that was submitted with the final Scoping Report, as well as the CRR with the draft EIR. The responses to questions by Nazeema Duarte from the Saldanha Bay Municipality and Mr Sankar from the DEADP are again repeated in this CRR.
--	--	------------	--	--	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				<p>6. It is stated the rare earth oxides which are not saleable will be stored in waste settling ponds. Lanthanum is often not readily saleable so could be one of those to be stored in the ponds. Lanthanum and actinium have very similar chemistries and actinium is derived from the U235 chain and can render the lanthanum radioactive. Has this issue been identified and is there a plan?</p> <p>7. Chemical processing of solutions containing low levels of soluble radioactive materials can result in radiation contaminated steel work. There is no mention of this. Is there a plan?</p> <p>8. There is no mention of windblown losses from the waste ponds. The dispersion of red dust from Transnet is a good example of poor management of material that is not supposed to be dusty. How will this be prevented in this project?</p> <p>9. It is planned to store coal ash on site at the rate of 180 tons per month. Coal ash is very dusty but there is no mention of how this will be managed in a very windy area.</p>	<p>6. Lanthanum is one of the SSP main products and will not be stored in the waste settling pond. Only elements, Holmium, Erbium, Thulium, Ytterbium is proposed to be temporarily stored in the waste settling pond. Frontier Separation is aware of the department on the radio nuclide daughter species referred to, however due to the advance process technology utilised, Frontier Separation does not anticipate this to be a major concern as other Rare Earth and Monazite production facilities around the world has mechanisms in place to manage this. In addition it is planned to precipitate radioactive material at the Zandkopsdrift mine.. Frontier Separation has and will be executing additional test work and research in this regard at the Australian national nuclear research and development organisation (Ansto) and thus the latest technology advancements will be implemented at the SSP should there be any department of radio nuclides.</p> <p>7. Please refer to item 6 above.</p> <p>8. The waste settling ponds will be operated at a 40% moisture level and thus minimizing possible dust generation. As part of the occupational health management requirements air quality and dust monitoring will be required and should dust levels from the waste storage pond be perceived, spray systems shall be employed to water down the waste ponds and keep dust generation and windblown losses to a minimum.</p> <p>9. The coal ash produced will be fed onto a wet conveyor system and stored in an enclosed containment vessel under which trucks will park and load ash for removal off the site. Thus the ash is not expected to be exposed to wind.</p>
--	--	--	--	---	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				10. Will there be a ground water impact on the Fossil Park site, as the ground water flow seems to be in that direction?	10. The groundwater flow is in a southerly direction and the Fossil Park is located to the east of the proposed development site. Groundwater flow if therefore not in the direction of the Fossil Park. For a description of the impact on groundwater resources as well as mitigation measures in this regard refer to Section 7.7.2 of the EIR.
Blue Water Bay Home Owners Association	Mike Rothenburg Tel: 022 714 3624 Fax: 022 714 3624 Cell: 076 976 7921 mikero@vodamail.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Air Force base Langebaan	Public Relations Officer - Mr. Paulse Private Bag Langebaanweg 7375	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Amplio Development Services	Albert van Dyk Cell: 083 306 4039 albert@amplio.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Arete Consultants	Wynand van Dyk Cell: 083 655 1278 wynand.vandyk@mmsconsultants.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Atlantis Corporation	Brian Blackbeard PO Box 5870 Tyger Valley 7536 Tel : 021 880 2070 Fax: 021 880 2071 info@atlantiscorp.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Chlor-Alkali Holdings	Corrie Botha (Project manager) CorrieB@caholdings.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Community Policing Forum (CPF) Langebaan	Peter Lindenberg Cell: 082 468 0500 plindenberg@gmail.com	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Fedusa	Willie Goosen Cell: 082 651 7547 healthandtherapy@telkomsa.net	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Licensing Company (LiCo)	Hannes Marais Tel: 082 308 9045 hmarais@eceng.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Licensing Company (LiCo) (WESGRO)	Laura Peinke (IDZ Project Manager) laura@wesgro.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Saldanha Bay Tourism Organisation	Dave Osborn Cell: 083 327 4803 dave@sbto.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Saldanha Bay Water Quality Trust	Christo Van Wyk Tel: 022 714 1156 Cell: 823768529 Fax: 022 714 1099 metsal@imaginet.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Saldanha Freight Services	Graeme Clemitson Cell: 072 869 4520 graemec@salfreight.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
SBF	Christo Van Wyk Cell: 082 376 8529 info@langebaanratepayers.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
SBWQFT	Jimmy Walsh Cell: 072 327 0075 hilltopcottage@telkomsa.net\	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Wattpro Projects	Herman Nortje Cell: 083 232 8137 herman@wattpro.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Weskus Sakekamer	Tel: (022) 715 1968 Fax: 0866 98 3334 info@weskussakekamer.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer	PO Box 1453 Saldanha 7395 Tel: 022 714 1731 Fax: 022 714 2015 info@wcbusinessdevelopment.org.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Mr Jonathan Venter	Private Bag X2 Rhine Road 8050 Tel: 022 715 3029 Cell: 072 725 7956 Faxes: 022 715 3422 joon@sgh.co.za	05/08/2013		Via email: On 5 August 2013 Mr Venter send a registration form to the consultant with the following comments: 1. He expressed concern with the possibility of groundwater pollution as well as pollution of Saldanha Bay should stormwater not be managed effectively.	Via email: On 5 August 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of Mr Venter's registration form and informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available. Please note that a Surface and Groundwater Impact Assessment as well as a Storm Water Management Study were conducted during the EIA phase. Please refer to Appendix H and H1 of the Draft EIR.	
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.			
		10/09/2013		On 10 September 2013 Mr Venter attended the public Open Day. He raised questions with regards to the Regional Marine Outfall Project being developed together with the WCDM.	The consultants informed Mr Venter that the Regional Marine Outfall (RMO) Project does not form part of this EIA.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.		No further comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.		No further comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Rudi Schoeman Aquadam	Tel: 012 810 0940 Fax: 086 685 3642 Sales2@aquadam.co.za	31/07/2013		Via email: On 31 July 2013 Mr Schoeman asked the consultant to please keep him updated with regards to the project.	Via email: On 1 August 2013 Ms Smith thanked Mr Schoeman for his email and informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available.
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Pieter Jantjies	jantjiesp@yahoo.com	10/07/2013		Via email: On 10 July 2013 Mr Jantjies provided the consultant with the following comments: 1. He supports development as long as it is done in a positive way. 2. Economic upliftment: the local people must benefit from the project and that the creation of local jobs is very important. 3. He supports employment opportunities that new developments might bring.	Via email: On 16 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Mr Jantjies for his email and informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available. Please note that the socio-economic impacts relating to job creation were assessed during the EIA phase as part of the Social Impact Assessment and Economic Impact Assessment. Please refer to Appendix M and N of the Draft EIR.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	<p>Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>Via email: On 27 August 2013 Mr Jantjies informed Ms Smith that he was currently in Kuruman for the week, but that he would attend the meeting (open day).</p>	Noted.
		11/11/2013	<p>Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	
		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>No further comment received to date.</p>	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

<p>Mike Longden-Thurgood (retired radiological specialist – nuclear industry)</p>	<p>5 Nerina Street Milnerton 7441 Tel: 021 552 6634 Cell: 072 345 6507 Mike.thurgood@imaginet.co.za</p>	<p>08/07/2013</p>		<p>Via email: On 8 July 2013 Mr Longden-Thurgood provided the following comments with regards to the project:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. He requested that the Draft EIR should provide more information on how liquid and solid and acid liquid wastes will be dealt with. 2. A brief mention is made in the BID of rare earth supply problems induced by China. He assumed that they are protecting their own valuable rare earth resources and not allowing them to be exported, to be used for their own electronics manufacturing industries. He requested that the EIA report should elaborate on this matter. 3. He requested more information about the specific rare earth elements which will be separated, and what additional rare earths there will be in what is referred to in the BID as "wastes". 4. He mentioned that these "wastes" could contain vital trace rare earths which may not have a use at the present time, but which research work could demonstrate their eventual need. He recommended that these "wastes" could still contain rare earths, and that it needs to be dealt with in a way to allow recovery for further processing in the future. 	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Mr Longden-Thurgood for his comments and informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available. The comments are noted. Please note that the beneficiation and the processing and separation of rare earths are discussed in more detail in Section 4 of the Draft EIR. The currently non-saleable or non-profitable elements or "wastes" will be precipitated as carbonates and then temporarily stored in a settling pond for 6 months prior to further disposal or possible future use. Please refer to Section 5.2.2.1.3 of the Draft EIR.</p>
---	---	-------------------	--	--	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				<p>5. He noted that the BID seems to refer to the separation of rare earths as a generic term. Because their chemical properties are very similar they are not readily separable by chemical processes, and special processes have to be used for this purpose. He wanted to know whether their actual separation into purified elements will be a part of the process. He stated that such beneficiation would assuredly greatly enhance the value of these rare earths as exports, rather than bulk mixes of rare earth elements being exported for overseas manufacturers to have to separate into the various purified rare earth elements.</p> <p>6. The separation of the elements would greatly assist South African entrepreneurs, in collaboration with those overseas, to establish our own electronics industry.</p> <p>7. He stated that these REE should rather not be exported to China but could be induced to establish electronic industries in South Africa.</p> <p>8. He appreciates that this is an EIA process, not one concerned directly with the economy of South Africa, although the very nature of the proposal is commercially directed to that end.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	<p>Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>9. He furthermore suggested that the EIR needs to contain more information on the rare earths industry. He was of the opinion that with the most recent developments in the electronics industry these rare earths have become effectively the No.1 priority.</p> <p>Via email: On 12 November 2013 Mr Thurgood informed Ms Smith that he was having some difficulty downloading the Final Scoping Report from the website.</p>	<p>Via email: On 12 November 2013 Ms Smith provided Mr Thurgood with the Ages Docs website link, username and password. She further informed him that the password was case sensitive and requested that he make use of Firefox or Google Chrome to access the website. In addition she provided him with an electronic copy of the Final Scoping Report, Comments and Response Report and Plan of Study for EIA and requested that he inform her should he have any further difficulty in downloading the documents.</p>
		12/11/2013		<p>Via email: On 12 November 2013 Mr Thurgood thanked Ms Smith for the attachments and informed her that the previous communication had given the password "Saldanha" with a capital S.</p>	<p>Via email: Ms Smith apologised for the mistake and informed Mr Thurgood that she had corrected the password on the website to "Saldanha" with a capital S. She further apologised that the website did not give an incorrect password message when the wrong password was entered and assured Mr Thurgood that she would bring this to the IT manager's attention. She requested that Mr Thurgood let her know if she could forward him any further electronic copies of the other attachments.</p>
		11/11/2013	<p>Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.</p>		

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>Via email: On 17 September 2014 Mr Thurgood provided the following comments: Firstly he noted that the number of docs to peruse rather put him off and that he had missed the deadline for replying. He apologised but stated that environmentally, there wouldn't have been any issues for him to raise which wouldn't have satisfactorily been dealt with the people who live in the area.</p> <p>He did however note that there was one important aspect which he did wish to raise and referred to Figure 1 in the BID which lists the major uses for rare earth elements. He stated that there was another extremely important one to add because a new process has been recently developed which use cerium in oxide form with two other metal oxides to catalytically produce methanol from atmospheric carbon dioxide, and is likely to be a much cheaper process than that currently in use. He referred the consultants to an article.</p> <p>He further stated that he had not come across any reference to the separation of cerium and how it will be dealt with in the EIA documents. He emphasised the importance of this development as methanol had lost of uses in the chemical industry, apart from its relatively minor use as a solvent.</p>	<p>Via email: On 22 September 2014 Ms Smith thanked Mr Thurgood for his comments and informed him that the comments would be included and addressed in the CRR which would be made available for review along with the Final EIA Report.</p> <p>With regards to your comments on the use of cerium, Frontier Separation is aware of the uses for cerium as a catalyst in the production of methanol. The uses of rare earths are discussed in Section 4.2.1 of the EIA Report. The downstream uses of cerium is not elaborated upon in the EIA Report as the cerium oxide will be sold to a third party for further use (for example methanol production) and this use will in all probability be subject to a separate EIA process depending on whether any listed activities are triggered.</p>
--	--	------------	---	--	---

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

				He was of the opinion that any company which establishes a manufacturing plant using this catalytic process would be literally on a world-beating track. He noted that this use must be added to the EIA documents in order not to mislead the Minister of Science, Naledi Pandor, on the potential uses of cerium. He noted that if the Minister of Science and Technology was really serious about developments in South Africa, making the production of methanol a major industry in the country.	
Andre Hofmeyer Wicht Blue Bay Lodge Saldanha	PO Box 18 48 Gracillaria Crescent Blouwaterbaai Saldanha 7395 Tel: 022 714 1177 Cell: 082 748 6777 Fax: 022 714 3160 andre@blouwaterbaai.com	17/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 17 July 2013 Mr Wicht send the consultant his registration form and requested to be registered on the project as an I&AP.	Via email: On 18 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Mr Wicht for his email and informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available.
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Mr Marthinus De Beer	Van Dyk Steengroewe 8 Fabriek Street Vredenburg 7380 Tel: 022 713 1244 Fax: 086 603 0636 Vandykstene1@mweb.co.za	22/07/2013		Via email: On 22 July 2013 Mr De Beer sent his registration form to the consultants with the following comment: 1. Supply of building material He requested to be added to the mailing list and to be kept informed on any developments.	Via email: On 22 July 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of Mr De Beer's registration form and informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available.
		27/08/2013	Via email & fax: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Marlaine Anderson	Tel: 0860 846 337 Fax: 033 343 5882 MarlaineA@L2B.co.za	09/07/2013		Via email: On 9 July 2013 Ms Anderson requested to be registered an interested party on the project. She also requested a copy of the Background Information Document (BID).	Via email: On 9 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Ms Anderson for her email and informed her that she had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She provided her with a copy of the BID and the registration form. She furthermore informed her that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available.
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 22 October 2013 Ms Anderson asked Ms Smith to please advise the current status of the EIA and whether the Final Scoping Report had been submitted yet. She stated that any updated information that could be provided would be greatly appreciated.	Via email: Ms Smith informed Ms Anderson that the Final Scoping Report had not yet been submitted, and that the Draft Scoping Report was currently out for review until the 28th of October 2013. She provided Ms Anderson with the notification letter and informed her that she was welcome to provide comment to the consultants on or before the 28th of October 2013.
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
		27/01/2014		Via email: On 27 June 2014 Ms Anderson contacted Ms Smith with regards to the project. She enquired whether approval for the Scoping Report had been received.	Via email: On 30 June 2014 Ms Smith informed Ms Anderson that the Final Scoping Report had been accepted and that the Draft EIA Report would be made available for public review shortly. She further stated that she would provide Ms Anderson with a notification once the report was available for review.
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

<p>Jacques van Heerden – (Director – Protea Hotel Saldanha)</p>	<p>Private Bag X2 Rhine Road 8050 Tel: 021 425 8055 Fax: 021 425 8066 Jacques@sgh.co.za</p>	<p>24/07/2013</p>	<p></p> <p>27/08/2013 Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.</p> <p>11/11/2013 Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.</p> <p>09/07/2014 Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>Via email: On 24 July 2013 Mr van Heerden provided the consultant with his registration form with the following comments: 1. Need to understand potential air and water pollution.</p> <p>No further comment received to date.</p> <p>No further comment received to date.</p> <p>No further comment received to date.</p>	<p>Via email: On 25 July 2013 Ms Smith confirmed receipt of Mr van Heerden’s registration form and informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available. Please note that an Air Quality Impact Assessment and Surface and Groundwater Impact Assessment were conducted during the EIA phase. Please refer to Appendix H and J of the Draft EIR.</p>
<p>Antonio Tonin</p>	<p>PO Box 558 Saldanha 7395 Cell: 082 558 9789 toni@saldanhabayoysters.co.za</p>	<p>10/09/2013</p>	<p></p>	<p>On 10 September 2013 Mr Tonin attended the public Open Day. He raised questions with regards to the Regional Marine Outfall Project being developed together with the West Coast District Municipality (WCDM)</p>	<p>The consultants informed Mr Tonin that the Regional Marine Outfall (RMO) Project does not form part of this EIA.</p>

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 11 November 2013 Mr Tonin informed Ms Smith that the document link on the AGES website was not functional.	Via email: On 11 November 2013 Ms Smith provided Mr Tonin with the Ages Docs website link, username and password. She further informed him that the password was case sensitive and requested that he make use of Firefox or Google Chrome to access the website. In addition she provided him with an electronic copy of the Final Scoping Report and requested that he inform her should he have any further difficulty in downloading the documents.
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
Advanced Fire Suppression Technologies	Mario Pienaar Branch Manager: Cape Town Tel: 021 557 0238 Fax: 021 556 7748 Cell: 082 327 0231 mario@advancedfst.co.za	12/11/2013		Via email: On 12 November 2013 Mr Pienaar contacted Ms Smith and asked whether she was the private developer for the Saldanha Separation Project. He informed her that he was one of the suppliers that were contacted by Leads2Business regarding the project and provided her with his company profiles to see exactly what the company specializes in.	Via email: On 12 November 2013 Ms Smith informed Mr Pienaar that AGES were the environmental consultants for the project and therefore did not deal directly with the suppliers. She informed him that he would need to contact the developer, Frontier Separation (Pty) Ltd, in this regard.
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Green Cape	<p>Helen Seyler Hydrogeologist Green Cape Water&Economy Project Manager Cell: 082 043 8075 helen@green-cape.co.za</p> <p>Chris Millson 44a Bloem Street 2nd Floor Cape Town 8001 Tel: 021 811 0250 Cell: 072 126 8027 chris@green-cape.co.za</p>	18/02/2014		<p>Via email: On 18 February 2014 Ms Seyler contacted Mr Gildenhuis from AGES and requested verification on something in the Frontier SP EIA documents. She stated that the report states that the SP requires 20kl/d potable quality water and 1710kl/d process water. Hence the total demand from the Local Municipality will be 1730kl/d as a maximum, hopefully significantly less if the process water can be derived from treated effluent (from municipal WWTW or from another industry). She further stated that she spoke to someone who mentioned that this estimate for the total demand was very low and that they had heard a figure 5 times this amount in a presentation on the SP project. She asked that the EIA estimates be confirmed as correct for the total demand.</p>	<p>Via email: On 21 February 2014 Mr Gildenhuis informed Ms Seyler that he had received confirmation from the engineers that the figures as per the report were in line with what was applied for with the WCDM for potable/process water. Ideally the regional WWTW would be operational so use can be made of recycled water. He provided her with reports and letter from the WCDM and GLS confirming the water requirements and water applied for. He further stated that he did not know where the confusion with the presentation came from and that he was not aware of a presentation stating the required potable water figures. The confusion may be from the volume of brine water that the SRMO will dispose of for the SP.</p>
		09/07/2014	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>Via email: On 12 August 2014 Mr Millson provided Ms Smith with his details.</p>	<p>Via email: On 16 August 2014 Ms Smith thanked him for his contact details and informed him that she had registered him as an I&AP on the project. She further informed him that the draft EIA report was out for review and comments on the report can be submitted on or before the 8th of September 2014. She provided him with a notification in this regard.</p>

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		28/08/2014		<p>Via email: On 28 August 2014 Mr Millson thanked Ms Smith for the documents. He provided her with a brief background of their company and stated that they were working on a project estimating water demand the will result from ongoing developments in the Saldanha Bay Region. They wished to understand the nature and water demand of all the proposed projects in the region and were using EIA's as an important source of data. He asked if Ms Smith was aware of any other proposals in the Saldanha Bay region and if she had the EIA's relating to these or could put him in touch with the relevant people.</p>	<p>Via email: On 29 August 2014 Ms Smith provided Mr Millson with a list of the proposed projects in the area of which she was aware as well as the environmental consultants' contact details who were undertaking the EIA's.</p>
Chand Environmental Consultants	<p>Marielle Penwarden P O Box 238 Plumstead 7801 Tel: 021 762 3050 Fax: 021 762 3240 marielle@chand.co.za</p>	15/08/2014		<p>Via email: On 15 August 2014 Ms Penwarden thanked Ms Smith for the information on the "Open House" (Open Day) and asked to be registered as an I&AP on the project.</p>	Ms Penwarden was registered as an I&AP on the project.
Landowners					
Portion 6 of Langeberg 188	<p>Gavin Stigling P O BOX 3311 Cape Town 8000 gavstig@mweb.co.za</p>	05/07/2013 27/08/2013	<p>Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder. Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.</p>	<p>Via email: On 9 July 2013 Mr Stigling requested Charlene Simpson to register them as I&APs on the project. No comment received to date.</p>	Mr Stigling was registered as an I&AP on the project.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
	Dries Schreuder (Saldanha Bulk Storage) PO Box 596 Sanlamhof 7532 dries@infiniteprojects.co.za	04/07/2013	Via email and hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
	Charlene Simpson (secretary) PO Box 596 Sanlamhof 7532 Cell: 076 764 0506 Anyskop01@gmail.com	04/07/2013	Via email and hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Adjacent landowners					
RE of Langeberg 188	Trans African Murals PTY LTD PO Box 3311 Cape Town 8000 gavstig@mweb.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 9 July 2013 Mr Stigling requested Charlene Simpson to register them as I&APs on the project.	Please note that Mr Stigling was registered as an I&AP on the project.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013 09/07/2014	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder. Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date. No comment received to date.	
Portion 3 of Langeberg 188	Cook Bruce Douglas PO Box 108 Pietersburg 0700	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 4 of Langeberg 188	Van Niekerk Shawn 93 Scott Street Parow 7500	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
RE and portion 1 of Langeberg 187	Barend Johannes Pieterse Trustees Berna Benecke Cell: 071 851 3903 Protea straat Durbanville 7550 bernab@telkomsa.net	05/07/2013	Via email: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 12 July 2013 Ms Benecke provided the consultant with a registration form with the following comments: 1. Impact of water users in the area 2. Groundwater pollution 3. Safety & Security 4. Impact on farming of livestock and grain as well as bee keeping.	Via email: On 16 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Ms Benecke for her comments and informed hers that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed her that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that she will be notified in advance when the reports become available. Please note that a Surface and Groundwater Impact Assessment was conducted during the EIA phase to assess the impacts on water use and groundwater. Please refer to Appendix H of the Draft EIR. The impact on farming in the local area as well as safety and security was assessed in the Social Impact Assessment. Please refer to Appendix N of the Draft EIR.

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
Portion 4 and 9 of Langeberg 187 Portion 3 of Uyekraal 189	All Billboard Solutions Cape Pty Ltd Gavin Stigling (Director) P O BOX 3311 Cape Town 8000 gavstig@mweb.co.za	05/07/2013	Via email and registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 9 July 2013 Mr Stigling requested Charlene Simpson to register them as I&APs on the project.	Please note that Mr Stigling was registered as an I&AP on the project.
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
Portion 5 of Langeberg 187	Lelieblom Trust PO Box 336 Vredenburg 7380	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 6 and 7 of Langeberg 187	Gloprop Prop Pty Ltd PO Box 95 Stellenbosch 7599 PO Box 66 Vredenburg 7380	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
RE of Farm 133	Parklands Township Developers PTY LTD PO Box 278 Knysna 6570	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 1 of Farm 133	Transnet LTD PO Box 72501 Parkview Johannesburg 2122	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 39 of Eenzaamheid 135	Carl Thom Tel: 022 715 3034	04/07/2013	Via hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was delivered to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 40 of Eenzaamheid 135	CALMAG (SA Kalk & Gips/Lime & Gypsum) Tel: 0860 103 515 Cell: 078 873 3958 Fax: 0860 103 516 calmag@africanlimeindustries.com	04/07/2013	Via hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was delivered to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 40 of Eenzaamheid 135	Corries Construction Tel: 022 715 3010	04/07/2013	Via hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was delivered to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
RE of Uyekraal 189	Iscor LTD/Arcelormittal SA PO Box 2 Vanderbijl Park Gauteng 1900	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 1 of Uyekraal 189	Frederik Gideon Hendrik Tolken PO Box 309 Vredenburg 7380	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 2 of Uyekraal 189	Eskom Holdings LTD PO Box 1091 Johannesburg Gauteng 2000	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 2 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Siltha Inv Holdings Private Bag x2 Rhine Road 8050	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 15 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Exxaro TSA Sands PO Box 9229 Pretoria Gauteng 0001	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 23 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Saldok PTY LTD PO Box 784044 Sandton 2146	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Portion 26 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Early Bird Beleggingsdienste CC PO Box 882 Langebaan 7357	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 29 of Yzervarkensrug 127	G&Z Prop CC PO Box 886 Pinetown 3600	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 32 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Dubrand CC PO Box 3477 Paarl 7620	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 33 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Rennies Prop Holdings PTY LTD PO Box 87274 Houghton 2041	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 34 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Michael David Nathan 1B Cabernet Street Table View 7441	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 37 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Yzervarkensrug Projects and Development CC PO Box 1001 Vredenburg 7380	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 44 of Yzervarkensrug 127	A&M Van Dyk Prop LTD PO Box 309 Vredenburg 7380	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 45 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Misty Blue Trading 31 CC PO Box 309 Vredenburg 7380	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Portion 47 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Jean Nel PO Box 331 Moorreesburg 7310	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 48 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Allweld Inv PTY LTD PO Box 521 Melkbosstrand 7437	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 49 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Evertrade 116 PTY LTD PO Box 265397 Three Rivers 1935	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 50 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Formprops 189 PTY LTD PO Box 265397 Three Rivers 1935	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 52 of Yzervarkensrug 127	SPH Kundalila PTY LTD PO Box 66192 Highveld Centurion 0169	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 54 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Kwaai River Prop Inv PTY LTD PO Box 492 Benoni 1500	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 55 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Dagbreek Ingenieurswerke CC PO Box 655 Worcester 6849	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Portion 56 of Yzervarkensrug 127	Charles Jacob De Villiers Hutchinson PO Box 267 Saldanha 7395	05/07/2013	Via registered letter: On 5 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Africa Lime Industries (Pty) Ltd	Dr Jaco Erasmus Octo Place 2nd Floor Cnr Meson and Electron Avenue Technopark Stellenbosch Tel: 086 010 3515 Cell: 082 310 9612 Fax: 086 010 3516 jaco@sakg.co.za	22/07/2013		Via email: On 22 July 2013 Dr Erasmus provided the consultant with his registration form with the following comments: 1. Water, soil and air pollution 2. He further stated that Africa Lime Industries runs an operation on a closely neighbouring plot and would like to participate and understand the broader impact of the project on its own operations (inclusive of environmental impacts).	Via email: On 22 July 2013 Ms Smith acknowledged receipt of Dr Erasmus's registration form and informed him that he had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available. Please note that a Surface and Groundwater Impact Assessment, Ecological Impact Assessment and Air Quality Impact Assessment were conducted as part of the EIA phase in order to determine potential water, soil and air pollution. Please refer to Appendix H and J of the Draft EIR.
		27/08/2013	Via email & fax: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	Via email: On 17 September 2013 Mr Erasmus informed Ms Smith that he was not able to attend the open day on 10 September and enquired whether it would be possible for him to receive minutes.	Via email: Ms Smith provided Dr Erasmus with a summary of the Scoping Report booklet with the information which was made available in posters on the open day. She further informed him that comments and questions raised during the open day related mainly to the proposed Regional Marine Outfall that is another project which is currently undergoing its own EIA process. The open day of which was scheduled for the 30th of October at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha should he wish to attend.
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

Witteklip 123	KRRC Trust Herman Van As PO Box 629 Stilbaai 6674 Cell: 082 499 9334 hermanva@easycoms.co.za	10/07/2013		Via email: On 10 July 2013 Mr Van As requested to that the KRRC Trust be registered as an I&AP on the project. He stated that the Trust owns the farm Witteklip 123 as well as various other properties in the Saldanha area.	Via email: On 17 July 2013 Ms Smith thanked Mr Van As for his email and informed him that the KRRC Trust had been registered as an I&AP on the project. She furthermore informed him that the Scoping and EIA reports inclusive of the specialist studies will be made available during the course of the process, and that he will be notified in advance when the reports become available.
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
		11/11/2013	Via email: On 11 November 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Final Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
		09/07/2014	Via email: On 9 July 2014 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft EIA Report was available for review and inviting them to the Public Open Day at the Protea Hotel in Saldanha was sent to the stakeholder.	No further comment received to date.	
Abraham Mouton	PO Box 214 Vredenburg O.P.S@moutons.co.za	04/07/2013	Via hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was delivered to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
		27/08/2013	Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

Comments and Response Report - Frontier Separation Plant

BHP Billiton	Andre van den Bergh Cell: 082 467 7877 andre.vanderbergh@b hpbilliton.com	04/07/2013 27/08/2013	Via email: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was sent to the stakeholder. Via email: On 27 August 2013 a notification letter informing I&APs that the Draft Scoping Report was available for review was sent to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date. No comment received to date.	
Lampies Elektries	Cell: 083 252 4445	04/07/2013	Via hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 the consultant attempted to deliver a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form to the stakeholder; however no one was at home. Various calls were made to the landowner and voice messages were left.	No comment received to date.	
Transnet	Akhona Mkalipi (Fidelity) (Reception) Tel: 022 703 3750	04/07/2013	Via hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was delivered to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Tronox (Exxaro Namakwa Sands Smelter)	Ms. Lombard (reception) PO Box 435 Vredenburg 7380 Tel: 022 701 3911	04/07/2013	Via hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was delivered to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Vredenburg Weighbridge	Urshula van Wyk (site manager) Cell: 022 772 1953 vredenburg.sagent@w c.weighbridge.co.za	04/07/2013	Via hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was delivered to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	
Weskus Spens	Padstal on R27 Tel: 022 715 4400	04/07/2013	Via hand delivery: On 4 July 2013 a Background Information Document (BID) and registration form was delivered to the stakeholder.	No comment received to date.	

1	0
	0
2	0

4. CONCLUSIONS

The public participation process followed satisfies the requirements of Chapter 6 of the EIA Regulations of 2010 (GNR 543 of 18 June 2010). In order to facilitate an open and transparent process, I&APs were identified and notified of the proposed development, in accordance with the legislation. Comments/concerns received were incorporated and addressed in this Comments and Response Report and will be mitigated for in the Environmental Impact Assessment Report. Assessing the comments/concerns received during the public participation process, it is evident that the main concerns are:

- Biodiversity impacts
 - Negative impacts on naturally occurring fauna and flora
 - Rehabilitation of disturbed areas according to best practice
 - Clearance of invasive alien plants
 - Rehabilitation and planting of trees for visual screening – *use of Olea europaea subsp. africana* or other olive species
- Palaeontology and archaeology
 - Need for palaeontological and archaeological surface surveys prior to any earth moving activities
 - Availability of previously conducted archaeological and palaeontological reports
 - Provision for monitoring of subsurface activity
 - Rescuing of fossil material during excavations
 - Requirement for a Heritage Impact Assessment
 - Fossil finds to be reported
- Air Quality Impacts
 - Air Pollution originating from the plant
 - The requirement for an Atmospheric Emissions Licence
 - Dust Pollution (windblown dust from waste ponds and boiler ash)
- Soil pollution
- Noise Pollution
- Traffic Impacts
 - Increased heavy traffic impacting on the existing road infrastructure during the construction and operational phases
- Groundwater and surface water pollution and management
 - Impact on water users in the area

- Pollution/contamination of groundwater resources
- Lowering of the groundwater table due to abstraction of water
- Poor storm water management that could lead to pollution of Saldanha Bay
- Groundwater monitoring for water levels and seepage of salts
- Water recycling
- Groundwater impact on the Fossil Park site
- Regular groundwater monitoring
- Stormwater management
- Visual Impact
 - Requirement for a Visual Impact Assessment
- Material handling, storage and transportation
 - Usage and storage of hazardous chemicals
 - Management and disposal of solid and liquid waste
 - Processing and storage of Rare Earths
 - Development of contingency plan for transportation of residue to disposal facility
 - Storage of coal and coal ash
- Socio-Economic Impacts
 - Economic upliftment relating to local job creation and employment
 - Land use impacts
 - Impacts on farming of livestock, grain and bee keeping.
 - Safety and Security
 - Supply of building material
- Health Impacts
 - Concerns regarding possible radioactivity and the regulation thereof
 - Chemical processing of solutions containing low levels of soluble radioactive materials that can result in radiation contaminated steel work
- Economic impacts related to:
 - Rare Earth supply and exporting
 - Rare Earth wastes and recovery of these wastes if possible
 - Separation of Rare Earths and resulting products
 - Beneficiation of South Africa's natural resources, including establishing downstream electronics industries in South Africa
 - Use of REE cerium oxide with other metal oxides to produce methanol from atmospheric carbon dioxide

- Waste impacts
 - Handling and testing of sludge
 - Lining of waste settling dams/evaporation ponds
 - Capacity of waste disposal facility
 - Storage of hazardous waste
 - Disposal of hazardous waste
 - Disposal on unused products
 - Storage of raw materials
 - Disposal of waste to a disposal facility such as Vissershok
 - Disposal of non-process waste
 - Storage of non-saleable rare earth oxides and the actinium rendering lanthanum radioactive
 - Inspection of liners for waste ponds

Concerns received from I&APs regarding marine disposal into Danger Bay will be addressed as part of the EIA for the Saldanha Regional Marine Outfall (SMRO) Project (EIA reference no: 16/3/1/2/F4/17/3009/13).

The above concerns and/or comments have been documented here and were assessed further in the Environmental Impact Phase in order to recommend appropriate mitigation measures where applicable.