

APPENDIX D: COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT OF ISSUES RAISED TO DATE AND RESPONSES BY THE PROJECT TEAM

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Procedural issues			
Objections to the project	An objection is raised towards the proposed mining.	Abrie Landman & Johan Landman (Landowners), meeting, 06/11/2014	Your objection to the project is noted for the decision making authorities.
	One of the proposed access routes goes through my farm and I am completely against this project.	Johan Landman (Landowner and Farmer) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	In principle we are opposed to the proposed project. Initial studies show that the proposed project area is highly sensitive. It would be a good gesture if the areas surrounding the proposed project site could be formally declared. However, for us as key stakeholder to reconsider our objection to the project we would need to be 100% convinced and guaranteed that the proposed project would not impact on the environment which will be a massive challenge. I don't see how you will get around some of these obstacles.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your objection to the project is noted for the decision making authorities.
	We are downstream users of the Pongola River. If we don't stop mining now then mines will just start to develop everywhere. In terms of the use of fertilisers by farmers, yes 30 years ago DDT was used which was harmful to the environment. This has changed; fertilisers are now environmentally friendly as they are biodegradable. In terms of land that is being proclaimed, it needs to be noted that people's views have changed and farmers want to protect their land. Further to this, it must be noted that similar to the Pongola Water Users Association I am against mining upstream and downstream of the Pongola River.	Karsten Hinze, Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your objection to the project is noted for the decision making authorities.
	Just for the record, we acknowledge that mining is important, however due to the sensitivity of this area we don't support the project. We need to convince the DMR not to accept this project. At what stage would we do this?	Unknown IAP, Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your comment is noted for the decision making authorities. All comments received from IAPs throughout the environmental assessment process are collated into this comments and response report which will be submitted to the decision-making authorities for consideration.
Project Support	This project will create job opportunities in the area and will also develop the infrastructure in the area.	L. V Sibeko, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	Your positive comment is noted for the decision-making authorities.
	I support the proposed project because the community will benefit from the mine	Sindisiwe Zwane, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
	I support the proposed project.	Sizwe Vundla and Manzana, IAP response forms, 26/03/2015	Your positive comment is noted for the decision-making authorities.

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Appointed consultant	In our experience, mining houses have changed consultants if the initial consultant's findings were not favourable and the original reports were lost. I am not saying that this will happen however Tholie Logistics needs to stick with SLR throughout the environmental assessment process.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your comment is noted. Tholie Logistics has appointed SLR to conduct the environmental assessment process for this project.
	What is your role in this process?	Jean-Pierre Sniijders, Landowner notification meeting, 02/12/2014	SLR is the independent environmental consultancy that has been appointed by Tholie Logistics to conduct the environmental impact assessment for the project and facilitate the public consultation process.
Independence	Is SLR independent? Who pays you? If the project shouldn't go ahead will you say so?	Johan Kemp Public Scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	SLR is an independent environmental consultancy company which undertakes environmental impact assessment processes. SLR has been appointed by Tholie Logistics to conduct the environmental authorisation process as this is the mechanism provided for in South Africa. SLR is objective and will conduct its services accordingly.
Application processes	Can anyone apply for the prospecting right over Klipplaatdrift if the right has lapsed?	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Yes
	The prospecting right on Commiessiekraal for the proposed project expired in June 2013 therefore an application for a mining right could not be valid.	Jean-Pierre Sniijders, Landowner notification meeting, 02/12/2014	SLR's understanding of the law indicates that an application for a mining right can be submitted by an applicant regardless of the status of the prospecting right, unless the area under question is part of someone else's prospecting right.
EIA process	Angus did mention how we appreciate what SLR has done today. We understand that Tholie Logistics wants to mine and will do anything to achieve this objective. We as IAPs don't want mining. As part of the EIA process can a checklist be compiled on how this process is progressing so that if Tholie Logistics tries to convince us otherwise then we can derail the process. If we find that there is no justification for the mine then it must be accepted. If we can be convinced that the problems can be mitigated then we might accept. You can argue that you have the best intentions but when your lawyer gets involved there will be problems. This is not going to be an easy process because we want to ensure that the area is protected for the future.	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	The objective of the EIA is to put forward the proponent's plan, the findings of the specialists and include the input from the IAPs. This information will be synthesised by SLR into a report authorities can make a decision on. As part of stakeholder engagement process, continuous communication can be undertaken so that in the EIA and EMP report there is a true reflection of what Tholie Logistics believes the benefits of the project are and stakeholders have their input in an equal manner.
	How long is the environmental assessment process?	Christine Meyer (executor of estate Commieskraal 90HT ptn 3) meeting, 06/11/2014	In the normal course, an environmental assessment process can take between 18 and 24 months to complete. This does not include any secondary approvals that may be needed for the project.
	It was mentioned that the mining right would be submitted at the end of the year? Is there still going to be an EIA process?	Greg Martindale (Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Yes

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
EIA process	What effect can the EIA and EMP report have on the decision making process by the departments? Do the departments read these reports? Can an EIA process stop the granting of a mining right?	Ralf Kusel (Elandsberg Protected Environment), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	The EIA and EMP report is a collation and assessment of information collected during the environmental assessment process. The quality of the EIA and EMP report is dependent on the quality of the environmental assessment process and associated tasks. It is SLR's understanding that the Departments do read the EIA and EMP reports in order to provide comments and to make decisions. A department can issue a negative decision if justified.
	Does the department have the capacity to prevent projects to commence?	Christine Meyer (executor of estate Commieskraal 90HT ptn 3) meeting, 06/11/2015	
	The departments do not care about farmers. We will only be victimized.	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	This comment is included for consideration by decision-making authorities.
	The EIA and EMP report will be the document that we will be assessing and our complaints will be recorded in.	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	The EIA and EMP report is the document that will be used by decision-making authorities to inform a decision on the project. IAPs will have an opportunity to review and comment on both the scoping and EIA and EMP reports.
	The timeframe is very short. Will the specialist studies be completed in the proposed time?	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	The baseline biodiversity studies have already been conducted, as these take the longest. The remaining specialist studies will be completed in the following three months.
Potential environmental impacts	Based on our experience with historical mines in the area, mines are associated with bad environmental issues.	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	Potential impacts associated with the project have been identified in the scoping report (see Section 3.4 of the scoping report).
Consultation process	Will you still consult with other farmers? There will be an impact with socio-economics in the area.	Johann Hiester mann (Elandsberg Protected Environment), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	As part of the environmental assessment process, interested and affected parties (IAPs) have been identified and engaged during the consultation process. This included farmers, landowners and land users living in the area (see the stakeholder engagement process outlined in Section 5 of the scoping report).
	Even though we are key stakeholders, we do not live in the area. A meeting with people who live in the area needs to be undertaken because at the end of the day these IAPs will live with the outcome of the project.	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	
	We are happy that SLR is running the environmental assessment process. Today's workshop has been open and transparent. We appreciate that key stakeholders have been taken on board early in the process even before the mining right has been submitted. This is the correct approach.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your positive comment is noted.
	Mpumalanga Parks Board should be involved in the EIA process due to trans-boundary issues.	Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Mpumalanga Parks Board has been registered as an IAP on the project database.

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Consultation process	Mr JP Snijders agrees to be main contact person between SLR and Dr Snijders and the tenants living on the farm.	Jean-Pierre Snijders, Landowner notification meeting, 02/12/2014	This is noted.
	This landowner notification meeting is not considered consultation until enough information and detail with regards to the proposed project is received.	Jean-Pierre Snijders, Landowner notification meeting, 02/12/2014	The meeting referred to is part of the landowner notification process. The consultation process for the EIA has been initiated (see Section 5 of the scoping report).
	We object to the delayed notice with reference to your notice on page 5, "Steps in the Authorisation Process". This delay will have a potential bumper effect on the balance of the above mention process and schedule that will be to the detriment of the IAP's.	Johan Boonzaaier (Impala Water Users Association), IAP response form, 23/03/2015	The NEMA and MPRDA applications were submitted in November 2014 and accepted in December 2014 (NEMA) and 29 January 2015 (MPRDA), respectively. Until such time as the MPRDA application was accepted, SLR was not in a position to formally engage in a public consultation process. Once the MPRDA application was accepted, SLR sent a 'save-the-date' email to identified IAPs on 6 February 2015 to ensure sufficient notification time was given for the scoping meetings. This has not affected the notification and review periods for IAPs.
	When will the EIA be completed?	Pat Collins (Utrecht Municipality) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	It is anticipated that the EIA will be completed in June with feedback meetings planned for July 2015.
	When will the EIA phase start and how long would it take for SLR to report back to the community?	Zandile Mashazi, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	The review period of 40 days. Is this calendar or working days?	Johan Boonzaaier (Impala Water Users Association) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	The review period is calendar days.
	The biodiversity is very rich in the area especially the importance of birds. Wakkerstroom is recognized as a protected bird area. Is birdlife SA involved in this process?	Ayanda Nzimande (WWF SA) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Yes, Birdlife SA is registered on the project IAP database (see Appendix C of the scoping report).
	Once the specialist investigations are completed, will SLR report back to the community because this never happens with past mining project experience?	P. J Msibi, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Yes, a feedback meeting will be held to report back to the community after the specialist studies and EIA report have been completed (see Section 6.7 of the scoping report).
	How will the reports be distributed?	P. J Msibi, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Hardcopy English reports will be left at venues agreed to during the public scoping meetings; these include the Luthilunye Public School, Kemps Lust and Utrecht Public Library. Summaries of the report will be made available in English, Zulu and Afrikaans. These will be distributed by email and/or post. Some will be left at the school for distribution to the parents via the children.
	The traditional council should also be involved with the process.	Bhekinkosi Zwane (Chief), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Thank you. Please provide the contact details of the traditional council.

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Consultation process	SLR shouldn't register anyone as Chiefs before checking with COGTA.	Chief Mabaso, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	SLR will consult COGTA regarding the Chiefs.
	The municipality should hire a tent for the feedback meetings.		Thank you for your suggestion.
	This community falls under the eMadlangeni local municipality but why is the eDumbe municipality at this meeting?	Ushumayo Ndebe, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	eDumbe is attending the public scoping meeting as an interested party.
	Is the WWF part of this process?	Johan Kemp, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	Yes, WWF is registered on the project IAP database (see Appendix C of the scoping report).
	We as AfriForum, a NFO, are representing more than 300 members who provided us with a mandate to provide input and to monitor this application and environmental process.	Julius Kleynhans, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	Your comment and representation noted.
	Has tourism businesses in the area been consulted?		Thank you for your input, this will be considered in the EIA process.
Community awareness	Is tourism being considered in this EIA? I haven't heard or seen anything mentioned about tourism and this area is a great tourist attraction.	Julius Kleynhans (Afri Forum) Public scoping meetings, 26/03/2015	
	Communities are only looking at the possibility of jobs however they should be educated about the negative impacts of the mines as their livelihoods depend on the natural water systems	Johan Mahne (Landowner and Farmer) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Your comment is noted and will be considered in the EIA process.
Appeal process	Does this imply that the better the EIA document the better we as stakeholders can assess it? And use it to object against the project?	Ralf Kusel (Elandsberg Protected Environment), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Yes
	If we appeal, can the mining commence while discussions are being undertaken?	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	No mining can take place if an appeal process is underway.
Regulations and law enforcement	I have limitations on my land use. I am not allowed to plant timber on my farm as this will affect water users downstream. We all have to abide to rules and regulations. Are there enough rules and regulations in place in terms of mining? We have had bad experiences with mining companies. Mines make their profits and leave and the impacts of the mine's decisions affect generations later and it is critical that this is taken into consideration.	Ralf Kusel (Elandsberg Protected Environment), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	There are environmental rules and regulations in place. Most include obtaining the necessary authorisations and licenses. Auditing also takes place to measure an operations compliance with the conditions of licenses. SLR has also noted an increase in site inspections by the key departments (Department of Water Affairs, Department of Environmental Affairs and the Department of Mineral Resources) to verify that these conditions are being met. If the conditions of the licenses are not met, directives can be issued and if these directives are not addressed the possibility that the mine can be suspended or shut down is real.

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Regulations and law enforcement	Enforcement is generally lacking in the DMR. It is more likely that a mine is stopped for health and safety reasons rather than environmental reasons. What I would like to see is that Tholie Logistics adopts this approach toward mining and self regulates so that getting the departments involved would not be necessary. I agree that there has been some improvement by the DMR regarding the enforcement of rules and regulations however the enforcement of rules and regulations is more noticeable from the green scorpions rather than the DMR.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your comment is noted.
Social Responsibility	It is a preliminary study. It is a social responsibility of the mine to determine the requirements of the community before anything goes forward.	Pat Collins (Utrecht Municipality), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Thank you. Your comments are noted.
Specialist studies	We wish a detailed description of the cross section of the geological rock formation layers, a soil survey report and the hydrological status in the area with reference to ground water and surface natural water courses.	Johan Boonzaaier (Impala Water Users Association), IAP response form, 23/03/2015	An understanding of the geological rock formations will be provided as part of the groundwater study (see Section 6.4.5 of the scoping report). A soil specialist study will be conducted for the project (see Section 6.4.2 of the scoping report). Hydrological study will be conducted for the project (see Section 6.4.4 of the scoping report).
Technical issues			
Applicant details	Who is Commieskraal Coal?	Abrie Landman & Johan Landman (landowners), meeting, 06/11/2014	Commissiekraal Coal held prospecting rights over a portion of the farm Commissiekraal 90HT. The prospecting right was transferred to Tholie Logistics in terms of the Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Act. The project that is the subject of this environmental assessment process is referred to as the Commissiekraal Coal project.
Applicant details	Who is Tholie Logistics?	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	Tholie Logistics is a coal prospecting company which was originally set-up by Mrs Tholie Cibane. Bright Resources became the operational and financial partner to Tholie Logistics, through "earning into" her projects by contributing finance and expertise. Tholie is a Natal entrepreneur and she is involved in a variety of businesses, with a focus on mining, especially coal mining.
	What is the relationship between Tholie Logistics and Vince Mining?	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Tholie Logistics held two prospecting rights, namely the Commissiekraal Coal and Tholie Logistics prospecting rights. The Commissiekraal right was consolidated into the Tholie Logistics right through a Section 102 process. Vince Mining held prospecting rights on the farm Klipplaatdrift. Interactions between Vince Mining and Tholie Logistics did take place as there was a possibility that Tholie Logistics would potentially take over the Klipplaatdrift project. Based on the findings of assessments undertaken for Tholie Logistics this did not happen. The prospecting right held by Vince Mining over the farm Klipplaatdrift has subsequently lapsed and Tholie Logistics holds no interest over this area. (H Daun, Tholie Logistics)

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Applicant details	Is there a connection between the fracking companies and Tholie Logistics?	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	No, Tholie Logistics has no interest in fracking. (H Daun, Tholie Logistics)
Motivation for the project	A lot of money is needed to build a mine in an area with no infrastructure and especially when the deposit is so isolated. What is in it for the mine?	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2021	Tholie Logistics believes the ore body on Commieskraal is feasible and worth developing. Furthermore, the anticipated market prices in the medium and long-term are considered by Tholie Logistics to be favourable for project development.
	We would like know why this deposit is so important, can this information be supplied at scoping meetings.		
	How will you justify mining in an area that is natural wilderness? We understand why the proposed project site is the targeted area and why mining is important and we can accept that you will do anything possible to get the mining right.	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	
	It seems that the area is ecologically pristine with protected species, why consider this development?	Julius Kleynhans, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
Geological aspects	At what depth is the outcrop?	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Coal reserves occur at various depths across the farm from near surface to more than 70m below ground.
	What are the black lines indicated on the drawing?	Ralf Kusel (Elandsberg Protected Environment), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	With reference to the map displayed at the meeting, the black lines indicate the presence of faults.
	So there is a risk?		The presence of faults will make mining more challenging.
	How was the coal quality determined?	Karsten Hinze (Commondale Farmers) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Through prospecting, Tholie Logistics was able to determine the coal quality using mineralogy studies which involved a series of test work (Heye Daun, Tholie Logistics)
	Do you have an assumption of how much pyrite there is in the area?	Julius Kleynhans (Afri Forum) Public scoping meetings, 26/03/2015	A geochemistry study is currently underway to understand the potential for acid generation and leaching of metals from project infrastructure and this will be used to inform the ground water pollution modelling study.
	Will the mining project cause seismic activity?	Ndumiso Ntuli, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	The eastern part of South Africa is very stable in terms of seismic activity. There is a very small potential for seismic activity in this area. Due to the small scale of the mine, project activities are not expected to affect seismic activity in the area.
	The deeper you mine the higher the methane content. You mentioned that blasting is being considered. Has this been considered as it will lead to operational disasters.	J. P Snijders, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	This issue will be addressed by SLR and technical project team with input from a geologist (see Section 6.4.14 of the scoping report).

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Life of mine	What is the planned life of mine?	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	The life of mine on current planning is scheduled for 10 years. Further exploration, development and optimisation for the mine and for ore processing is being investigated and therefore a mining right of 20 years has been applied for. The scoping report and EIA and EMP report covers the 10 year life of mine period.
	What is the life of the operation?	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	
	What is the lifespan of the mine?	Chris Buthelezi (eDumbe Municipality), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
Proposed operations	Once the ore reserve on the farm Commieskraal has been exploited could mining underground extend towards other farms?	Karsten Hinze, Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014, Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Mining can only take place in an area that forms part of a mining right.
	From a mining perspective Tholie Logistics wants this area to mine. We can accept that you will mine as much as possible in that area, in order to optimally utilise the proposed project area. What is the size of the proposed project area?	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Approximately 2,000ha of the farm is underlain by coal reserves. The footprint of project infrastructure is anticipated at this stage to cover an area of approximately 20ha. (Refer to Section 3.1 of the scoping report)
	Do you anticipate that the mining will be opencast?	Greg Martindale (Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Current planning makes provision for underground mining only. It is not anticipated that opencast activities will take place. (refer to Section 3.1 of the scoping report)
	If opencast mining had to occur where would it happen?		The more shallow ore reserves are located within the northern, central part of the project area.
	Previously we understood that the mine was considering open cast mining however I see now that underground mining is being considered, why the change?	Dawie Cronjje (Impala Water Users Association) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Open cast mining is no longer being considered. The project plan as presented is not the most economically viable plan but Tholie Logistics acknowledges that the area is sensitive and have therefore comprised by only considering underground mining (Heye Daun, Tholie Logistics).
	Will coal cleaning be undertaken on site and how will it take place?	Bradley Gibbons (Endangered Wildlife Trust), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	At this stage in project planning, a coal washing plant is not planned. Only a dry crush and screen plant is envisaged. Further detail is provided in Section 3.1 of the scoping report.
	Where will the coal be washed?		
	Can various grades of coal be mixed together and still be acceptable for market standards?	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Yes, it is possible that the coal could be mixed to meet market requirements. (H Daun, Tholie Logistics)

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Proposed operations	In the information document it states that the mine area will expand for approximately 3000 hectares underground however the farm Commiesiekraal is not that big. Will they only be mining under Commiesiekraal?	J. P Snijders, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	The applicant has applied for a mining right on the farm Commiesiekraal 90HT only. The underground mine extent is 2000 hectares as outlined in the background information document.
	Is Tholie Logistics planning to do the mining themselves or will they sell to another company?	Johan Kemp, Public Scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	It could make sense to partner with another mining company in the future however at this stage Tholie Logistics is well prepared to do the mining themselves (Heye Daun, Tholie Logistics).
	How does the mine propose to handle the waste rock during construction?	Pat Collins (Utrecht Municipality), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Very little waste rock from the mine is anticipated. Any waste rock will be used to create a platform for mine infrastructure.
	As the mine will be trying to access coal from the box-cut, what is going to happen to all the waste rock? Will it be stockpiled and backfilled?	Chief Mabaso, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	How will the waste rock from construction be managed?	Lungi Ndumo (eDumbe Local Municipality), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	How much water would the mine use per day and where will it be sourced from?	Julius Kleynhans, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	At this stage in project planning, it is estimated that approximately 12,500m ³ of water will be required per month.
	What about operational accidents? The nearest hospital is nearly an hour away. How will the employees get medical attention?	J. P Snijders, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	This issue will be considered further by the technical project team during the course of the EIA process.
Rehabilitation	How will the mine be rehabilitated? In our experience the mines are not rehabilitated correctly and the farmers are left to deal with the consequences.	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	At this stage in the project, limited details related to rehabilitation methods are available. A conceptual rehabilitation plan will be included in the EIA and EMP report.
Rehabilitation and associated costs	What safe guarding and rehabilitation is planned and costs provided for the following: 1. During the process of active mining 2. Any possible latent phase during mining of this current entity 3. At mine closure 4. At the selling of mining rights 5. At the transfer of mining rights to any other entity.	Johann Boonzaaier (Impala Water Users Association), IAP response form, 23/03/2015	The EMP will provide an estimate of costs required to manage the project site during construction and operations. The EMP will also include a conceptual closure and rehabilitation plan. In terms of closure, there is a requirement for financial provision for rehabilitation of mines at the closure in the environmental legislation and this responsibility would need to be carried over to any future owner of the mine.
	Tholie Logistics must be reasonable. We've seen mining companies who buy operating mines and end up abandoning the mine without rehabilitating the area due to the economic problems.	Johann Boonzaaier (Impala Water Users Association) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Financial provision	My experience with various mines is that they operate much shorter than anticipated. The concept of financial provisions in a trust fund as required by the Department of Mineral Resources (DMR) is outdated. When considering the sensitive nature of the area, we need a massive amount of money upfront because if the mine liquidates then the financial provision provided to the DMR will not be enough.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your comment is noted and will be taken into consideration in the closure cost estimate.
Financial considerations	Does a percentage of the mine's profit go to the departments?	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	Mining houses are privately owned entities. No profits are directed to government departments. (H Daun, Tholie Logistics)
Land purchase	How much money did the Lens' family get for their land on Commiesiekraal?	Johan Mahne (Landowner) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	No payment for land has been made at this stage (Heye Daun, Tholie Logistics)
Timing	How long is the construction phase of the mine and when will mining commence?	Pat Collins (Utrecht Municipality), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Construction commencement is subject to regulatory approval, economic considerations and funding. Construction could commence in 2016 and take six months to complete.
	When will the mine start operations?	L. V Sibeko, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
Alternatives	In your information document you mentioned that the proposed access routes will involve the upgrading the existing gravel routes? No such gravel roads exist and the route crosses another river.	J. P Snijders, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Both access routes are gravel up to a point from which the roads will need to be extended to reach the project site.
Soil related issues			
Soils	A description of the impact, safe guarding and rehabilitation of stock piling over time on the surrounding soils	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), IAP response form, 23/03/2015	These issues will be investigated as part of the soil and land capability specialist study (see Section 6.4.2 of the scoping report).
Biodiversity related issues			
Specialist study	What was the objective of the biodiversity work that has been completed to date?	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	The objective of the biodiversity work that has completed to date was to determine the baseline situation of the project area by means of desktop reviews of available databases and confirming these findings through field work. This baseline information will provide input to the biodiversity impact assessment process.

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Specialist study	What is a vegetation index score?	Greg Martindale (Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	It is an in-house system, developed by the biodiversity specialist, Scientific Aquatic Services (SAS), used to compare different vegetation types based on regional indices. The methodology used will be included in the specialist report that is compiled as part of the EIA process.
	I want to see what this vegetation index entails. It is concerning that the proposed project site is compared to areas in other provinces.		
	All protected areas, declared and not declared need to be included in the biodiversity study.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	This has been noted and will be included in the relevant assessments. Refer to Section 6.4.3 of the scoping report.
	How long did the biodiversity specialists spend on site?	Glenn Ramke, Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	As part of the baseline assessment three site visits were undertaken. For some of these visits a full week was spent on-site and the team comprised five people.
	We have data that we can share with you. It includes 1) more updated wetland analysis of the general area which we can give to you in shape files, 2) the Pongola Protected Bush Environment is much closer and was only proclaimed this year - the biodiversity study mapping needs to include the layer of the newly protected environment, 3) the stewardship layer the provincial file of the protected area expansion areas - these areas need to be included into the biodiversity study and 4) the point data source (bioblits) information to confirm the presence of species within the proposed project area.	Angus Burns and Greg Martindale (Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Thank you. SLR would appreciate this information.
Importance of biodiversity	The biodiversity work that has been undertaken to date shows that a comprehensive study has been done. The information that has been presented today supports what we have found in the area and that the area is important for conservation. Tholie Logistics is therefore fully aware that the proposed project will face a lot of issues.	Greg Martindale (Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Both SLR and Tholie Logistics acknowledge that biodiversity is an important factor in this area. Biodiversity related impacts will be addressed as part of the biodiversity specialist study (refer to Section 6.4.3 of the scoping report).
	When you spoke about the current state of the environment you mentioned the Wakkerstroom Montane Grassland. How will the mine protect this grassland as it is listed as a threatened biome?	Ayanda Nzimande (WWF SA) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
Conservation initiatives and the applicant's role	If you declare areas surrounding the proposed project area it would not be easy for other companies to get rights over those areas. There would be no harm in participating in a declaration. There is a 40 000 ha area around the proposed project area that is in the process of being declared. We don't want a mine. Let's see what you can up with and maybe it is a viable situation but regardless of the mine, the surrounding area is on the table for declaration and we want a suggestion to protect those areas.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Tholie Logistics is of the opinion that mining and biodiversity can co-exist. It would be open to establishing a partnership in order to work together to protect areas surrounding the project site. Tholie Logistics wants to support initiatives. This aspect will be discussed further between Tholie Logistics and the respective conservation stakeholders during the course of the EIA process. Initial discussions to determine how conservation projects could be incorporated into the project's social and labour plan have taken place between the SLP specialist and WWF representatives.

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Conservation initiatives and the applicant's role	If Tholie Logistics "sterilises" the surrounding farms to ensure that mining cannot take place on these farms in the near future, could Tholie Logistics apply to mine these areas at a later stage?	Karsten Hinze, Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Tholie Logistics is of the opinion that mining and biodiversity can co-exist. It would be open to establishing a partnership in order to work together to protect areas surrounding the project site. Tholie Logistics wants to support initiatives. This aspect will be discussed further between Tholie Logistics and the respective conservation stakeholders during the course of the EIA process. Initial discussions to determine how conservation projects could be incorporated into the project's social and labour plan have taken place between the SLP specialist and WWF representatives.
	We appreciate that you acknowledge that the area is sensitive and have brought us all together. I am worried that things change and that you will try to acquire the mining right in a very short time (by the end of the year). We are generally opposed to mining. Should the mining right be granted within this time and there is a real win-win opportunity, we need a formalised arrangement in place for the "sterilisation" of areas surrounding the proposed project site because of the short time frame. This will ensure that there is an opportunity upfront to assist and commit to the declaration of areas surrounding the proposed project site. If your commitment is leaning toward a sustainable situation it would be honourable and the right thing to do to assist before getting the mining right.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	
	The EIA process is the correct avenue if we as stakeholders were to consider a partnership with Tholie Logistics. It would be inappropriate for us to consider supporting a partnership too early in the EIA process and as such we would only consider exploring a partnership if the mining right was granted. An EIA process can do things in an amicable way and can allow for the consideration of how a partnership could be developed if the mining right was granted. It is important to note that we would not want to be seen as the thin edge of the wedge. We are still concerned about coal mining within these areas and as much as Tholie Logistics may be responsible there are a lot of irresponsible mining houses.	Greg Martindale (Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your comments and concerns are noted.
	What happens if Tholie Logistics sells shares and the new shareholders have different objectives to Tholie Logistics? What is the risk?	Karsten Hinze, Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	A legally binding agreement would need to be signed between stakeholders and Tholie Logistics. There would need to be a clause in the agreement that deals with this issue. (H Daun, Tholie Logistics)
	That is why formal procedures need to be put in place to stop this from happening.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Conservation initiatives and the applicant's role	Economy is the driving system, Tholie Logistics could sell during hard times. We don't know what new companies may do. In the near future there could be an economic demand for coal in which case how can you ensure us that other resources surrounding the proposed project site would not be exploited?	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	A legally binding agreement would need to be signed between stakeholders and Tholie Logistics. There would need to be a clause in the agreement that deals with this issue. (H Daun, Tholie Logistics)
Species identified	Are there any Oribi on the farm?	Bradley Gibbons (Endangered Wildlife Trust), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	No Oribi were observed during the site visits.
	The Southern Barred Minnow, is critically endangered and is located within the proposed project area. Please contact Ezemvelo for further information.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	This will be done through the biodiversity specialist study.
	Concerns over the biodiversity were raised, in particular to the diverse tree species in the area.	Jean-Pierre Snijders, Landowner notification meeting, 02/12/2014	Both SLR and Tholie Logistics acknowledge that biodiversity is an important factor in this area. Biodiversity related impacts will be addressed as part of the biodiversity specialist study (refer to Section 6.4.3 of the scoping report).
Proclamation of land	When was all this land proclaimed - it appears that all this land is being proclaimed to compete against the mines.	Nico Lens (Landowner), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your comment is noted for consideration by the decision-making authorities.
Water related issues			
Water features	There is a watershed near the property.	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	Thank you for this information. This information will be considered as part of the hydrological study (refer to Sections 6.4.4 of the scoping report)
	How do you classify if a river is a flagship river?	Karsten Hinze, Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	A flagship river is identified according to the National Freshwater Ecosystem Priority Areas database which highlights areas of importance.
	I farm downstream of the Pandana River. What do you mean by saying it is not free flowing?	Ralf Kusel (Elandsberg Protected Environment), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	This means that from the source to the sea there are barriers. It is important to note that this statement was made by the biodiversity specialist based on information provided in existing databases.
	You mentioned that the Pandana River is not free-flowing. There is a small section that is classified as a NFEPA. According to my records the Pandana River is free flowing and perennial. It is not dammed.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	This issue will be investigated during the course of the biodiversity and hydrological specialist studies.
	Please double check that the Pandana River is definitely classified as not free flowing as I do not agree with this statement.	Ralf Kusel (Elandsberg Protected Environment), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Water features	This area has an annual rainfall of between 1000 - 1500 mm which supplies downstream water users. The Pongola River is the sole water source of this area so it is a highly critical resource for us.	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your comment is noted. This information will be considered in the EIA and EMP report.
Water use	The rivers and wetlands on the landowner's property are in good condition which is evidence of good land management. These rivers and wetlands provide ecosystem services to downstream users which is why creating protected areas is so important. There are a number of water users downstream that are reliant on this water resource and that is why it is so important to protect the upper catchment area.	Greg Martindale (Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your comment is noted. Details on the rivers and wetlands within the project area are provided in Section 2.6.6 of the scoping report. Downstream water users will be identified during the EIA phase. Biodiversity and water related impacts will be addressed as part of the respective specialist studies (refer to Sections 6.4.3, 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 of the scoping report).
	All livestock obtain water from rivers. Spring water is used for human consumption. There are only a few boreholes in the area.	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	Thank you for this information. A hydrocensus will be undertaken as part of the groundwater study to identify existing water users within a 5km radius of the project site (refer to Section 6.4.5 of the scoping report).
	Water production value is very important and that is why the proposed project site is a red flag area.	Greg Martindale (Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your concern has been noted and will be taken into account during the EIA phase.
	Based on a study done by the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research, the Pongola River covers approximately 8% of the land surface area of South Africa and provides more than 80% of water to South Africa. A technical document and shape files of the CSIR study are available and need to be included into your study. This is a big social economic consideration.	Angus Burns (Manager: WWF-SA Grasslands Programme), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your comment is noted. This information will be considered in the EIA and EMP report.
	What about the downstream users all the way to Mozambique?	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	The surface and groundwater specialist studies will identify the potential impact zone associated with water-related impacts. This will inform the extent to which downstream water users may be affected by project activities.
	The downstream users to Swaziland should then also be considered	J. P Snijders, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
Loss of water supply and/or pollution of water	Springs on our property have dried up since the prospecting commenced.	Abrie Landman & Johan Landman (landowners), meeting, 06/11/2014	It is unlikely that prospecting activities would affect water levels in natural springs. Prospecting activities are generally limited to the drilling of boreholes to obtain core samples.
	At Longride mine, located on Twisthoek, the river disappeared after blasting.	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	Thank you for this information. It will be considered as part of the EIA process.

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Loss of water supply and/or pollution of water	A description of the impact, safe guarding and rehabilitation of stock piling over time on the surrounding surface water and groundwater	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), IAP response form, 23/03/2015	Your concern has been noted. Project-related water quality issues will be addressed as part of the hydrological and groundwater studies that will be undertaken for the project (refer to Sections 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 respectively of the scoping report).
	The mines proposed usage of water is a lot, and you say that the mine intends to source this from the municipality but the municipality cannot currently cope with its demand.	Karsten Hinze (Commondale Farmers), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	With regards to the current issue of water supply from the municipality what security can you give us that the mine will not be pumping water from the rivers which will put all the users downstream in harm?	Johan Landman (Landowner and Farmer), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	Dewatering will cause a large depression in the landscape, how can we be sure that this won't dry up the water courses or groundwater levels in the neighbouring farms?	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Your concern has been noted. Project-related water quality issues will be addressed as part of the hydrological and groundwater studies that will be undertaken for the project (refer to Sections 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 respectively of the scoping report).
	In the past years, during flood events the Pongola River would flood the road and we would not be able to cross the road for months. Recently the river would flood the road for only a few weeks and last year it flooded the road for a few days. The mine will only put more pressure on the catchment.	Dave Smith (NCT Forestry), Public scoping meetings, 26/03/2015	
	What will be done to ensure the water quality and volume remains in a good state?	Johan Kemp, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
	There is an old mine that used to have water problems - brown acid water, 20 years ago. Only now the water is becoming right.	Clement and Nico Lens, Landowner meeting, 25/03/2013	
	There are already concerns regarding safeguarding water for communities downstream of the proposed project site. There is no other water source apart from the Pandana River for downstream water users. You can't change the impact once it has occurred.	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	
	When SLR embarks on the EIA process, site specific sensitivity needs to be addressed in the EIA report. What is important for us to see is how Tholie Logistics will ensure that good water is still provided to downstream users as water is a fundamental issue.	Greg Martindale (Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your comment is noted. The terms of reference for water-related specialist investigations is included in Sections 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 of the scoping report.

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Loss of water supply and/or pollution of water	Even though it is anticipated that the coal associated with the proposed project has a low sulphur content and that acid mine drainage might not be such an issue, we know of mines in the area that have closed down which have caused problems for the first downstream water user. We acknowledge that further downstream it is less of a problem due to the dilution factor however this can't keep on happening.	Ralf Kusel (Elandsberg Protected Environment), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	The issue of acid mine drainage will be investigated as part of the groundwater specialist study with input from the geochemical study (refer to Section 6.4.5 and 6.4.12 respectively of the scoping report).
	Everyone knows what the problems are with the Olifants River emanating from the Witbank area to the Kruger Park and what the risks are due to mining. We are the water users association and we should protect water resources.	Johan Boonzaier (Impala Water Users Association), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your concerns are noted. Project-related water quality issues will be addressed as part of the hydrological and groundwater studies that will be undertaken for the project (refer to Sections 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 respectively of the scoping report).
	I am a user on the Pandana River. My neighbour is a user just below me on the Pandana river so we will be 100% impacted if something goes wrong at the mine. I agree that there will be a dilution effect. For example the stream from the Malatees Kop flows into the Pandana river and it is diluted and people can use it at the moment but if there are three, four, five, six, seven, eight of these mines then eventually nobody will be able to use this water. The users on that first small stream from the proposed project area will be 100% affected.	Ralf Kusel (Elandsberg Protected Environment), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Your concerns are noted. Project-related water quality issues will be addressed as part of the hydrological and groundwater studies that will be undertaken for the project (refer to Sections 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 respectively of the scoping report).
	The stakeholders from the Pongola Water User Association don't know where the water comes from. Our farm is 2000ha; water coming from our farm does not even reach members of the Pongola Water Users association because so many farmers use the water along the way. I am not an expert in mining and I don't know what the impacts will be but it makes no sense to me why the Pongola Water User Association is so concerned about mining when farmers upstream use fertilisers in their lands which reach downstream users. The Pongola Water User Associated never complains about this.	Nico Lens (Landowner), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	
	Water quality monitoring commenced before prospecting started.	Abrie Landman & Johan Landman (landowners), meeting, 06/11/2014	Your comment is noted.
	The catchment in this area provides water to many communities downstream therefore we are concerned about the potential water pollution.	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	Your concerns are noted. Project-related water quality issues will be addressed as part of the hydrological and groundwater studies that will be undertaken for the project (refer to Sections 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 respectively of the scoping report).
	The Kempstust mine is full of water. A nearby neighbour used the water for irrigation close to Kempstust mine and his pivot rusted from the acid in the water.	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	Thank you for this information. Project-related water quality issues will be addressed as part of the hydrological and groundwater studies that will be undertaken for the project (refer to Sections 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 respectively of the scoping report).

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Loss of water supply and/or pollution of water	Concerns over the impacts on the water quality by the proposed project are a concern.	Jean-Pierre Snijders, Landowner notification meeting, 02/12/2014	Thank you for this information. Project-related water quality issues will be addressed as part of the hydrological and groundwater studies that will be undertaken for the project (refer to Sections 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 respectively of the scoping report).
	Water supply is only one part of the equation, what about the waste water from the mine? Where will this be discharged?	J. P Snijders, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Your concerns are noted. Project-related water quality issues will be addressed as part of the hydrological and groundwater studies that will be undertaken for the project (refer to Sections 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 respectively of the scoping report).
	The water from Kemplust is currently brown, aquatic life has decreased therefore it is not only during operation that we see these impacts but also long after the mine has been closed such as the abandoned mines in the area.	Kurt Huile, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	The abandoned mines in the area is a prime example of how mines can impact the water quality years after closure, this will be the same for the new proposed mine. The proposed mine should take these old mines and fix the existing problems to prove to us that they can contain and resolve the current water issues.	Johann Boonzaaier (Impala Water Users Association) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Your concerns are noted. Project-related water quality issues will be addressed as part of the hydrological and groundwater studies that will be undertaken for the project (refer to Sections 6.4.4 and 6.4.5 respectively of the scoping report).
	I've had my ground water tested and already through the abandoned mines there is evidence of pollution. If this new mine pollutes my ground water who will be responsible for my crop failures?	Johan Landman (Landowner and Farmer) Public scoping meetings, 26/03/2015	
	The local municipality fails to give us water therefore we use the rivers as our only source of water. If these rivers are polluted we will have a big problem.	Phindile Buthelezi, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	The proposed mine is positioned in the headwaters of the Pandana River and this river is used by as many as 60-80% of people in the area and many more downstream. How will the mine prevent polluting this water?	Ayanda Nzimande (WWF SA) Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	What effect will the high volume of water runoff, rain and seepage have, taking the slopes and water resources and drainage into consideration, on other water and natural resources, also economic activities as mentioned by Tholie Logistics.	Julius Kleynhans, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
	Where will waste water be discharged and how will it be treated?	Julius Kleynhans, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
Specialist study	Are the water specialist studies all field-work based or modelling based?	Johann Boonzaaier (Impala Water Users Association), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	The study will be based on both a hydrocensus and modelling work.

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Mitigation	Will the mine consider financing baseline studies on these farms to provide a basis for future claims?	Eugene van Aswegan (Afri forum), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Your comment is noted.
Air Quality			
Dust generation	With the tons of coal that will be transported by road there is a high possibility of dust pollution, will I be able to claim from the mine for damaged crops?	Paul Rannifore, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	This is a difficult question to respond to. Claims often require proof and there are usually a number of factors that could contribute to crop damage.
	You made reference to the dominate wind direction in the different seasons. What would the distance and direction of the dust plume be from the proposed mine site?	Karsten Hinze (Commondale Farmers), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Air quality quality issues will be addressed as part of the air quality study that will be undertaken for the project (refer to Sections 6.4.6 of the scoping report).
Socio-economic: transport related issues			
Transport routes	The proposed route (i.e. Route B) intersects workers houses.	Abrie Landman & Johan Landman (landowners), meeting, 06/11/2016	Your comment is noted. This issue will be investigated as part of the EIA process.
	The location of the proposed access route is not appropriately selected due to the number of plantations and residential property of the tenants on the farm that it passes through.	Jean-Pierre Snijders, Landowner notification meeting, 02/12/2014	
	The route between Rooipoort and Commiesiekraal is the most active as the children use it to get to school everyday and generally everyone uses it to get to the main D699 road at the school.	Local gathering by men on the Rooipoort farm , Social scan, 05/03/2015	
	For comparison, the Kempslust mine was mining 20,000 tons per month. The previous mine trucks in the area caused great damage to the roads and these mines were mining 10 times less than the proposed mine. The roads will collapse with the increased pressure.	Johan Kemp, Public Scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	The proposed production rate as presented at the meeting is 480,000 tons per annum. This equates to 40,000 tons per month. This is only double the Kempslust mining rate (Heye Daun, Tholie Logisitics). A traffic study is planned and will consider both road capacity and road safety (see Section 6.4.11 of the scoping report).
Road capacity	The roads are not built to handle mine traffic.	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	A traffic study will be undertaken as part of the EIA process. The terms of reference for the study are included in Section 6.4.11 of the scoping report.
	What will be done to keep the roads in good condition?	Johan Kemp, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
	Who will maintain and upgrade the roads?	Julius Kleynhans, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
Socio-economic: land use related issues			
Depreciation of land values	How will the proposed mine impact the value of the farms should the owners want to sell in the future?	Abrie Landman & Johan Landman (landowners), meeting, 06/11/2014	Socio-economic related issues will be addressed as part of the EIA process. Refer to Section 6.4.11 for the terms of reference for the specialist study.

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Compensation	If the proposed project affects the landowners in any way they should be compensated.	Jean-Pierre Snijders, Landowner notification meeting, 02-12-2014	Your comment is noted and will be taken into consideration in the EIA process.
	What insurance do other economic practices have from this activity to protect their assets, economic activities and staff from issues occurring due to this project. Example water contamination.	Julius Kleynhans, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	Socio-economic related issues will be addressed as part of the EIA process. Refer to Section 6.4.11 for the terms of reference for the specialist study.
Land uses	It was mentioned that the proposed project area is mostly undisturbed apart from some agricultural activities. When you refer to agriculture do you mean ploughing?	Greg Martindale (Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	Yes.
	If the project should not go ahead, what would happen to the current landowners? They have been downscaling due to the fact that there is an expectation that their farms will be bought from Tholie Logistics. What will happen to the farmers and the property if the mine does not go ahead?	Johann Hiestermann (Elandsberg Protected Environment), Biodiversity meeting, 18/08/2014	If the project does not go ahead, the current land uses on the farm would continue.
	In your information document you mention the land use of the area. Is this based on current or potential land use because you say that there are remnants of forestry? This is false because forestry could be a project alternative which could result in economic benefits.	J. P Snijders, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	The EIA will look at both the current and potential future land use.
	What will be done control the veldfires during the winter season?	Johan Kemp, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	Land use related issues will be addressed as part of the EIA process. Refer to Section 6.4.11 for the terms of reference for the specialist study.
Socio-economic: social related issues			
Social ills	We are concerned about crime. There is already a problem with crime in the area because of Mondi. This proposed project has the potential to escalate the crime such as vehicle theft.	Nel Marie Mahne & Johan Mahne (surrounding landowner), meeting, 07/11/2014	Your concerns are noted. Socio-economic related issues will be addressed as part of the EIA process. Refer to Section 6.4.11 for the terms of reference for the specialist study.
	Crime is a big issue in this area, to an extent that farmers are being murdered. Since there will be an influx of people to the area there is a greater chance of crime increasing.	Johan Mahne (Landowner and Farmer), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	What are the mines plan to control the influx of people which will lead to a number of issues such as housing, sewage, and infrastructure?	Pat Collins (Utrecht Municipality), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Social ills	With no housing plan this will lead to another Marikana issue.	J. P Snijders, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	As part of Tholie Logistics' values they do not believe in on-site housing based on past experiences. Tholie Logistics has seen that local towns can benefit from supplying housing to employees. Transport is then provided to transport employees to the proposed mine site (Heye Daun, Tholie Logistics).
	What is the mines housing plans?	Johan Kemp, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
	What will happen to the people that are settled on the proposed mine area? Will they be relocated and/or compensated?	Paul Zwane, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Socio-economic related issues will be addressed as part of the EIA process. Refer to Section 6.4.11 for the terms of reference for the specialist study.
	What is going to happen to the people living on the proposed project area?	Sindisiwe Zwane, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
Social investment	There has always been mining projects in this area and we support these projects but the promises made have never been fulfilled. What is this mine going to do to develop the local community?	Chief Mabaso, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Socio-economic related issues will be addressed as part of the EIA process. Refer to Section 6.4.11 for the terms of reference for the specialist study.
	How does the mine plan to develop community facilities such as educational facilities, network reception, health services and housing? The mine should also have plans to train the local people.	Bhekinkosi Zwane (Chief), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	In terms of the development within the community, will the community have to wait 10 years to see the development?	Nomusa Shabungu, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	How will the community benefit from the proposed project?	L. V Sibeko, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
Socio-economic: employment and skills training			
Employment	Please clarify the job opportunities for the community with regards to the permanent and temporary jobs.	Dawie Cronjje (Impala Water Users Association), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	The proposed mine has the potential to create 160 construction jobs and 200 operational jobs.
	Main concerns among the residents in the area is the high rates of unemployment	Local gathering by men on the Rooipoort farm, Social scan, 05/03/2015	Socio-economic related issues will be addressed as part of the EIA process. Refer to Section 6.4.11 for the terms of reference for the specialist study.
	Unemployment is a big issue in this area so what is the mines entrance strategy to develop the skills of the people living in the area?	Pat Collins (Utrecht Municipality), Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	
	As the youth we don't have skills, how will the mine promise us these jobs?	Phindile Buthelezi, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015)	

Subject	Issue / Question / Comment	By whom, how and when	Response given by the project team and reference to relevant section of the report (where applicable)
Employment	What I understand from what you are saying is that most of the jobs will come from the outside.	Holger Eckhard, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	The plan is to recruit locally as far as possible however certain skilled services may need to be sourced from outside areas (Heye Daun, Tholie Logistics).
	Is Tholie Logistics owned by the government? If so why is the mine only proposing temporary jobs?	P. J Msibi, Public scoping meeting, 26/03/2015	Tholie Logistics is not government owned. It is a private company. Construction and operational phases of a mine often require different set of skills. That's why temporary jobs are often considered for construction.
	As you have mentioned the surrounding area has socio-economic issues and low education levels so how can the local people be sure that they will be employed over the skilled professionals from Johannesburg?	Ayanda Nzimande (WWF SA), Public scoping meetings, 26/03/2015	Socio-economic related issues will be addressed as part of the EIA process. Refer to Section 6.4.11 for the terms of reference for the specialist study.
	The problem with the white community in the area is that they under-pay the farm workers so they are afraid of losing their labourers if the proposed mine goes forward.	L. V Sibeko, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
	Is there an age limit for the proposed job opportunities?	Sindisiwe Zwane, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
	The unemployment rate in the community is very high.	Sizwe Vundla, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
	Our communities are very poverish therefore the job opportunities will make a big difference in our lives.	Sizwe Vundla, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
Training	What type of skills will the mine provide to the community?	L. V Sibeko, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	
	The proposed mine should train the local community to better the chances of job opportunites	Sindisiwe Zwane, IAP response form, 26/03/2015	