

**Environmental Impact Assessment Environmental Impact and
Waste Management License Application for a proposed
extension of ash disposal facilities and associated infrastructure
at Camden Power Station
(DEA Ref No 12/12/20/2300)
Issues and Responses Report
Version 2**

This report (Version 2) captures the issues raised by stakeholders during the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) process and Waste Management License Application for the proposed extension of ash disposal facilities and associated infrastructure at Camden Power Station.

As part of the announcement, a Background Information Document (BID), with a comment and registration sheet was posted and distributed by hand during May 2011. Letters of notification were also sent out by registered mail in May 2011 to all landowners within a 10 km radius of the Camden Power Station. An advertisement was placed in various newspapers and site notices were also put up in the area of the proposed development during May 2011.

An open house and public meeting to discuss the Draft Scoping Report was held at the Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011. This event was announced by advertisements in various newspapers and letters of invitation were also sent out to stakeholders.

Version 2 of the Issues and Response Report lists the issues that were received as a result of the activities undertaken as described above.

This report will be updated as the EIA unfolds.

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
1	Dust suppression must be done. People suffering from asthma live within 5 km of the Camden power station.	Mr Kenneth Venter, Farmer, PO Box 903 Ermelo, 2350	Fax on 19 May 2011	An irrigation system has been considered previously but was not implemented due to the ash dam already being saturated with large amounts of water used for ashing and dusting. However, a dust suppression system on the sides of the ash dam is to be installed in the very near future.
2	The ash of the current ash facility blows onto our thatched roof buildings.	Mr Frik du Plooy, Indawo Game Farm, PO Box 2825, Ermelo, 2350	Telephonic comment on 11 May 2011	
3	The power station has a direct influence on my farm and farming activities due to the dust from the ash facility, which is a problem.	Mr Sam Hallatt, Postnet Suite 495. Private Bag X 9013, Ermelo, 2350	Letter on 3 June 2011 in response to the announcement.	
4	Waste water from the existing ash dam flows into the nearby stream.	Mr Sam Hallatt, Postnet Suite 495. Private Bag X 9013, Ermelo, 2350	Letter on 3 June 2011 in response to the announcement.	The reverse osmosis plant have been charged, drawing water from De Jagers Pan, and is now running at full capacity at 3.5ML per 24hr day. Due to the extreme high level of the De Jagers Pan, a gradual slow decrease in the De Jagers Pan level over the next few months will be observed.
5	Alternatives 2 and 3 of the proposed ash disposal facility consist of highly productive soil. Soya and maize are planted and these lands produce some of the highest yields per hectare in the district year after year. Alternative 3 lies on a hill. Alternative 1 looks like the best option. This is the most productive part of my farm and I will oppose any development on Alternatives 2 and 3.	Mr Lood de Jager, Uitkomst, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Noted.
6	The pan (De Jagers pan) next to the ash disposal facility started flooding last year and all this contaminated water is running east polluting the water resources of Messrs Sam Hallett and Leon Strydom as well as other neighbours. This water is even running through Camden Power Station.	Messrs Leon Strydom, Witpunt, and Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Noted.
7	Alternative 3 will pose other problems as	Mr Lood de Jager,	Open house to discuss	Noted.

	well, because a water pipeline towards Kriel runs through it and a 400kV transmission line as well as the Richards Bay railway line.	Uitkomst, Ermelo	Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	
8	When I was young we caught fish in the pan (De Jagers pan) next to the existing ash disposal facility. There was still fish in the pan until a few years ago, but pollution from the ash disposal facility has killed everything in the pan.	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Noted.
9	May stakeholders comment at any time during the environmental impact assessment (EIA)? We had previous experiences with EIAs when we were not given the opportunity to comment.	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Yes, stakeholders may comment anytime during the whole process and these comments will become part of the various reports used in the EIA process. All comments will be recorded in an Issues and Response Report (IRR) which will be submitted to the DEA.
10	Who supplies Camden Power Station with coal?	Mr Johannes Kloppe, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Anthony Kuzelj, Camden Station Manager, said coal is currently sourced from eight different suppliers. Some of the coal is supplied from as far as 130 km. Eskom must source coal that is economically viable. Camden was supplied by coal from neighbouring mines before it close down. Once it was started up again, it was not possible to get a contract with one of the neighbouring mines for a variety of reasons. Eskom's head office procures contracts with coal suppliers.
11	Is all your coal transported by road?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said Camden needs 4, 6 million tons of coal per year of which about 50 % is transported by rail. Eskom has a policy to reduce coal trucks on the road and is looking at alternatives to reduce trucks. One of the options that are being investigated is a conveyor belt to transport coal to the power station.

12	Why do you transport the coal from so far away? You can buy it next to you from Coal for Africa.	Mr Johannes Kloppe, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said Eskom buys coal with specific specifications and Eskom cannot buy coal that is too expensive. All the Camden coal contracts are short term contracts and long terms contracts are being investigated. Most of the coal mined around Camden is being exported.
13	Does Eskom know about the De Jagers pan overflowing into water resources towards the east? What caused the overflow?	Mr Johannes Kloppe, Mooiplaats, Ermelo and Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said Eskom is aware of this seepage problem towards the east. Eskom built a water treatment plant (using reverse osmosis technology) next to De Jagers pan and the ash disposal facility to purify water. This plant has been in operation since the beginning of July 2011 and it will be another two months before the seepage will be under control. The plant cost R38 million to construct and took two years to construct. The main problem was that more water was being pumped from the current ash disposal facility into De Jagers pan and too little water was being pumped out. Eskom has solved this problem by balancing the water being extracted from the pan with the water being pumped back to the pan.
14	Where do you measure water quality and what about the sewage problem in Camden Village?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said water samples are taken all around the power station and especially towards the east, because that is the natural flow of water in this area. This groundwater monitoring information is sent to the Department of Water Affairs, as is required by law. Discussions have been held regarding the sewage problem in Camden Village. Camden Power Station also treats the sewage of the military base next to it.

15	I am also a member of an Ermelo conservation organisation. Will it be possible for us to study your groundwater data?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Thabiso Mpongo, environmental officer at the Camden Power Station, said he can be contacted for this information.
16	How many tons of sulphates are emitted by Camden Power Station? Do you monitor the air quality at the station?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said the stacks (chimneys) of the power station are so high that their emissions cannot be monitored at the station itself. The air quality monitors do, however, pick up emissions from Sasol if the wind blows in the right direction.
17	What about the dust problem?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said dust from the existing ash disposal facility is a problem to neighbours. The dust does not come from the top, but the sides of the ash dump. A short-term solution is to put soil on the sides to prevent the dust from blowing away. A 4,5 km sprinkler system has been constructed for dust-suppression.
18	The quality of the water in the De Jagers pan has deteriorated due to seepage from the ash disposal facility. What happened?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said the ash disposal facility receives three times more ash than before due to the low quality of coal being burnt. This has caused the facility to expand very fast, the reason why another ash disposal facility is needed. Another problem was that the whole ash transport system was upgraded while the power station was in full operation. More ash is also being deposited, because the scrubbers in the stacks capture ash that would have polluted the atmosphere.
19	Where does Camden Power Station get its clean water from?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said it comes from Jericho Dam. This water is used for cooling and a small quantity is used for 'ashing' – where water is used to transport the ash to the ash disposal facility.
20	What pollutants can be found in De Jagers pan?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge,	Mr Kuzlej said tests have shown sulphates, nitrates, sodium, chlorine, some magnesium and a little boron to be present

			Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	in the pan.
21	Who uses the 1600MW generated by Camden?	Mr Johannes Kloppe, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said it is not possible to give an exact answer, because Camden power station feeds the 1600 MW into Eskom's national grid that distributes the electricity all over southern Africa.
22	Can the ash be used for something?	Mr Johannes Kloppe, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said ash is used: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • in cement; • as a filler for rubber; • in bricks • as a filler in toothpaste; and • as a substitute for lime by maize farmers. Camden Power Station will be advertising an open tender process later in the year to start selling some of the ash. The problem is that very low volumes are sold and the buyer must use it close to the power station or else the transportation costs do not make it economically viable.
23	Will the new ash disposal facility be lined? What will happen to rain water? Will it not leak into the surrounding soil?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Yes, the whole proposed facility of 120 ha will be lined to prevent leakages. There will be a water recovery dam where the excess water and rain water will be stored. This water will be used to transport the ash to the disposal facility.
24	Can this facility be built on an incline?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kobus Babst from Eskom said it can be built on an incline with no seepage taken place, because the incline will be taken into consideration during the planning and construction phases.
25	What will happen if you cannot find a site for a new ash disposal facility?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said then Camden Power Station will have to shut down once the existing ash facility is full.
26	How do you work out compensation for a	Mr Kenneth Venter,	Open house to discuss	Mr Kuzelj said accredited assessors are

	land owner whose property is needed?	Moreson, Ermelo	Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	used to calculate the price of a property. Various factors will be taken into consideration such as improvements done to a property and a final price will be negotiated with the land owner. The facilitator added that Eskom is not interested in expropriating land from anybody and will always try to negotiate a result that is beneficial to all parties.
27	Common sense should be used in this process to determine which alternative will be used.	Mr Lood de Jager, Uitkomst, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Noted.
28	Once a decision has been taken, to whom must we address our appeal?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	The appeal in this case must be address to the Department of Environmental Affairs.
29	Will this not interfere with the proposed 400kV Camden-Theta line? How far is the EIA on that project?	Mr Johannes Kloppe, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	This ash facility will not impact on the Camden-Theta line. The Final Environmental Impact Report of this process is currently with the Department of Environmental Affairs awaiting environmental authorisation.
30	Will there be work for local contractors on this project?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said it is Eskom policy to use local contractors if the relevant skills are available.
31	It is very difficult to download the Eskom Vendor List.	Johan van der Meulen, Adrianople, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Noted.
32	Will you take the flood lines into consideration for the new ash facility?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Warren Kok said the 1:50 and 1:100 flood lines will be studied during the EIA.
33	There are San rock paintings and figures near the area of the alternatives.	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge,	The facilitator said the specialist studies have not yet been undertaken and that a heritage assessment will be done and this

			Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	person will contact Mr Venter to discuss these paintings.
34	What happens to the land owner who suddenly gets an ash disposal facility next to him? What will happen to his ground water resources? Does he get compensated?	Mr Johannes Kloppe, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kok said the specialist studies will also look at the effect of the facility on neighbours as well as groundwater. The facilitator added that neighbours do not get compensated by Eskom.
35	The value of a property will decrease if it is suddenly next to an ash disposal facility. Who will compensate a farmer who suddenly has a decrease in the annual yield per hectare due to dust from the ash facility?	Mr Johannes Kloppe, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kok said this will be investigated during the specialist studies.
36	What about old underground mines? I think alternative 4 is on top of an old mine.	Mr Jan van Staden, Uitkomst, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Babst said an ash disposal facility may not be built on top of an old mine. This will be investigated.
37	There are mineral rights on my farm which could influence alternative 3	Mr Jan van Staden, Uitkomst, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011.	Mr Kuzelj said Eskom could look at the possibility to buy out a mining right once a preferred site has been identified.

12670

REGISTRASIE- EN KOMMENTAARBLAD

**Omgewingsimpakbepaling en Aansoek vir
Afvalbestuurslisensie vir voorgestelde
uitbreiding van aswegdoenfasiliteite by die
Camden-kragstasie**

Ingevoeg in die Agtergrondinligtingsdokument
Mei 2011

**OIB Kantoor vir Openbare
Deelname**

Anelle Lötter/Florence Rambuda
Zitholele Consulting (Edms) Bpk
Posbus 6002, Halfway House, 1685
Tel: 011 207 2076/2075
Faks: 086 676 9950
E-pos: alotter@zitholele.co.za of
florence@zitholele.co.za

Vul asb in en stuur teen 17 Junie 2011 terug aan die OIB Kantoor vir Openbare Deelname (soos hierbo)

TITEL	MNR	VOORNAAM	SAMUEL
VOORLETTERS	S	VAN	HACCAIT Hallatt
ORGANISASIE	BEER	E-POS	
POSADRES	POSTNET SITE 495 PISAR X 9013 ELMELC		
TEL NO	0824905804	POSKODE	2350
DATUM	2011/05/31	FAKS NO	
Registreer my asb formeel as 'n belanghebbende en geaffekteerde party (B&GP) sodat ek verdere inligting en kennisgewings tydens die Omgewingsimpakbepalingsproses kan ontvang			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> JA <input type="checkbox"/> NEE
Ek wil graag my kennisgewings ontvang per			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Brief (pos) <input type="checkbox"/> E-pos <input type="checkbox"/> Faks <input type="checkbox"/> Telefoon
Ek wil graag die dokumente vir kommentaar soos volg ontvang			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Papierskopies <input type="checkbox"/> Per e-pos <input type="checkbox"/> Op CD
Ingevolge die Regulasies (GK R.543 - 546 – Staatskoerant No. 33306 van 18 Junie 2010) (OIB-prosesregulasies) verklaar ek hieronder enige regstreekse sake-, finansiële, persoonlike of ander belang wat ek by die goedkeuring of weiering van die aansoek het: GEEN			

KOMMENTAAR (Gebruik asb afsonderlike velle indien nodig)

Enige kommentaar wat u in hierdie stadium wil lewer:

Die kragstasie het 'n direkte

Invloed op my as persoon en op my
werk. ① Stoffe wat die bestaande asdam is reeds
in probleem ② Bevestigde water
voer tans aan die asdam af in die dam
en samentrek in

Versoek asb die volgende van my kollegas/vriende/bure om vir hierdie projek te registreer:

DANKIE VIR U BYDRAE

REGISTRATION AND COMMENT SHEET Environmental Impact Assessment and Waste Management License Application for a proposed extension of ash disposal facilities at Camden Power Station Inserted in the Background Information Document May 2011	EIA Public Participation Office Anelle Lötter/Florence Rambuda Zitholele Consulting (Pty) Ltd P O Box 6002, Halfway House, 1685 Tel: (011) 207 2076/2075 Fax: 086-676-9950 Email: alotter@zitholele.co.za or florencer@zitholele.co.za
---	--

Please complete by 17 June 2011 and return to the EIA Public Participation Office (as above)

TITLE	Mr	FIRST NAME	JAPHYA BORCIANI
INITIALS	J.B.	SURNAME	MALUNGISA
ORGANISATION	DEPT OF LABOUR	EMAIL	japhyam@labour.gov.za
POSTAL ADDRESS	PRIVATE BAG 7263 WITBANK 1035		
TEL NO	0829071158	POSTAL CODE	1035
DATE	07/06/2011	FAX NO	0865277146
Please formally register me as an interested and affected party (I&AP) so that I may receive further information and notifications during the Environmental Impact Assessment process			YES NO
I would like my notifications by			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Letter (mail) <input type="checkbox"/> Email <input type="checkbox"/> Fax <input type="checkbox"/> Telephone
I would like to receive documents for comment as follows			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Paper copies <input type="checkbox"/> By email <input type="checkbox"/> On CD
In terms of Regulations GNR 543 - 546 - Government Gazette No. 33306 of 18 June 2010 (EIA process regulations) I disclose below any direct business, financial, personal or other interest that I may have in the approval or refusal of the application:			
.....			

COMMENTS (please use separate sheets if you wish)

Any comments you may have at this stage:

CURRENTLY NO COMMENT.

Please ask the following of my colleagues/friends/neighbours to register for this project:

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONTRIBUTION

REGISTRASIE- EN KOMMENTAARBLAD Omgewingsimpakbepaling en Aansoek vir Afvalbestuurslisensie vir voorgestelde uitbreiding van aswegdoenfasiliteite by die Camden-kragstasie Ingevoeg in die Agtergrondinligtingsdokument Mei 2011	OIB Kantoor vir Openbare Deelname Anelle Lötter/Florence Rambuda Zitholele Consulting (Edms) Bpk Posbus 6002, Halfway House, 1685 Tel: 011 207 2076/2075 Faks: 086 676 9950 E-pos: alotter@zitholele.co.za of florence@zitholele.co.za
--	--

Vul asb in en stuur teen 17 Junie 2011 terug aan die OIB Kantoor vir Openbare Deelname (soos hierbo)

TITEL	Mrs.	VOORNAAM	Kenneth
VOORLETTERS	KM	VAN	Venter
ORGANISASIE	Buer	E-POS	Kenneth.Venter@vodanail.co.za
POSADRES	Bus 903 Ennelo 2350		
TEL NO	0828804079	POSKODE	2350
DATUM	19/05/2011	FAKS NO	07811 1129
Registreer my asb formeel as 'n belanghebbende en geaffekteerde party (B&GP) sodat ek verdere inligting en kennisgewings tydens die Omgewingsimpakbepalingsproses kan ontvang			<input checked="" type="radio"/> JA <input type="radio"/> NEE
Ek wil graag my kennisgewings ontvang per			<input checked="" type="radio"/> Brief (pos) <input checked="" type="radio"/> E-pos <input type="radio"/> Faks <input checked="" type="radio"/> Telefoon
Ek wil graag die dokumente vir kommentaar soos volg ontvang			<input checked="" type="radio"/> Papiereksemplare <input checked="" type="radio"/> Per e-pos <input type="radio"/> Op CD
Ingevolge die Regulasies (GK R.543 - 546 – Staatskoerant No. 33306 van 18 Junie 2010) (OIB-prosesregulasies) verklaar ek hieronder enige regstreekse sake-, finansiële, persoonlike of ander belang wat ek by die goedkeuring of weiering van die aansoek het:			

KOMMENTAAR (Gebruik asb afsonderlike velle indien nodig)

Enige kommentaar wat u in hierdie stadium wil lewer:

Stofbeheer met toegangsweg vir albei Aamafers in
 bestaande neder as 5 km van Camden kragstasie
 af.

Versoek asb die volgende van my kollegas/vriende/bure om vir hierdie projek te registreer:

DANKIE VIR U BYDRAE