

**ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT FOR THE PROPOSED CONTINUOUS ASH DISPOSAL FACILITY AT MAJUBA POWER STATION,
MPUMALANGA PROVINCE**

COMMENT AND RESPONSES REPORT – FINAL SCOPING REPORT

SUMMARY OF ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES/CONCERNS AND SUGGESTIONS RAISED BY INTERESTED AND/OR AFFECTED PARTIES

SEPTEMBER 2012 – DECEMBER 2012

- This Comments and Responses Report (C&RR) is a record of all the contributed issues raised by Stakeholders ranging across all sectors of society.
- A full record of every issue raised is available in the FSR or from Lidwala Consulting.
- The name, affiliation (as at that time) and date of the commentator are also indicated

INDEX TO ISSUES/COMMENTS IN THIS TABLE

1.	Air Quality Related Comments/Issues	3
2.	Agricultural Related Comments/Issues	3
3.	Biodiversity Comments/Issues	4
4.	By-products from disposable ash Comments/Issues	4
5.	Coal Stockpiles Related Comments/Issues.....	5
6.	Construction and Maintenance Related Comments/Issues.....	5
7.	Disposal of Ash Related Comments/Issues	6
8.	EIA Process Impact Related Comments/Issues.....	7
9.	Erosion Related Comments/ Issues	7
10.	Health Impact Related Comments/Issues.....	8
11.	Infrastructure Related Comments/Issues	8
12.	Land Acquisition Related Comments/Issues	9
13.	Land-use Related Comments/Issues	9
14.	Legal / Legislative use Related Comments/Issues	10
15.	Rehabilitation Related Comments/Issues.....	11
16.	Site Alternative Related Comments/Issues	12
17.	Social and Sio-Economic Related Comments/Issues	12
18.	Technical Related Comments/Issues.....	14
19.	Veld Fires Related Comments/ Issues	16
20.	Water (Ground and Surface) Related Comments/Issues	16
21.	General Related Comments/Issues	17

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
1. Air Quality Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was asked what the Air Quality Specialist used as a baseline to measure the air quality.</p>	<p>Van der Merwe, Hendrik Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>An ambient air quality monitoring station near Majuba was utilised. The monitoring station is located 3 km east-south-east of the power station and is equipped for continuous monitoring of ambient concentrations of sulphur dioxide, nitrogen dioxide, and fine particulate matter (PM₁₀). The average daily PM₁₀ concentrations for the period January 2009 to June 2012 were utilised for their Scoping report. <i>Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</i></p>
<p>The project team was informed that cattle are dying because of the air that they breathe which is polluted with dust from the ash dams.</p> <p>The project team was informed that dust from the ash dam settles on the fence and when it rains, a chemical reaction takes place and this causes the fence to become brittle and break. Landowners have to re-fence every 3 years, as opposed to previously where the fences used to last for 45 years. What is a major concern is that landowners have to prove to Eskom that it is the dust that is causing the damage to the fences should they want to submit a claim.</p>	<p>Van Niekerk, Johan Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>The air quality study to be undertaken during the Impact Phase will ensure that the public's concerns are taken into account.</p>
2. Agricultural Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was enquired from Lidwala Environmental that as environmental specialists how they would address the impact on agriculture land which could diminish South Africa's food production if more land is used for ashing facilities. A calculation summary was presented to the team indicating the loss of food to all South Africans as a result of more and more agricultural land being used for development.</p>	<p>Davel, Coenie Chairman: Amersfoort Farmers' Association FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>The information provided is very valuable and it will be submitted to the Agricultural and Social Specialist for assessing during the Impact Phase. <i>Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</i></p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
3. Biodiversity Comments/Issues		
It was asked as how thick is the topsoil that is removed when establishing an ash disposal facility. This question relates to agricultural soil classification.	Struthers, Martin Chairman: Environmental Protection Agency KSW: 21 November 2012	When Tutuka Power Station establishes an ash disposal facility they remove about 25 to 30 cm of topsoil. William Mogwase, Eskom Tutuka Power Station
When Eskom establish an ash disposal facility, does it have an impact on the topsoil; will the topsoil be removed before the ash is disposed of on that site; and will the ash disposal facility be lined.	Venter, Jan DARDLA: Soil Conservationist KSW: 21 November 2012	Before Eskom can dispose of the ash, the topsoil is removed, and stockpiled. In terms of the new legislation, the Authorities, e.g. DWA and DEA, tend to require that waste facilities should be lined, but they make a decision on each case based on its merits. Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental Topsoil is used to rehabilitate the ash disposal facility as they continue with the ashing process. William Mogwase, Eskom Tutuka Power Station
4. By-products from disposable ash Comments/Issues		
Can concrete be made from the ash and if so why can't it be used to fix gravel roads?	Celliers, Johan Chairman: TAUSA (Mpumalanga) KSW: 21 November 2012	Eskom has just established a contract with a consultant who specialises in waste, to investigate whether there are uses for the ash. Once these results are available, it will be made available to the attendees. It was also mentioned that this study is being undertaken to inform the Eskom-Mpumalanga Forum. Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division The Majuba Power Station Team confirmed that they currently sell approximately 10% of their fly ash to external companies for alternative uses.
The project team was informed that the community will find something to make or do with the ash.	Kubheka, TK Resident: Ezamokuhle PM: 22 November 2012	Eskom has just established a contract with a consultant who specialises in waste, to investigate whether there are uses for the ash. It was also mentioned that this study is being undertaken to inform the Eskom-Mpumalanga Forum
It was enquired as to what type of products can be made from the ash. The information could facilitate the Municipality to look	Zwane, Vusi Councillor	There is a recently signed contract with a waste specialist that will identify the safe usage of ash. Once the results are

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
<p>at what possibilities there could be in terms of economic development.</p>	<p>KSW: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>obtained, they can be shared with the Municipality. It needs to be noted that this by-product is classified as waste and it needs to be determined whether it could be used. One cannot make use of this by-product without knowing the risk. TB also added that the utilisation of ash for other businesses is also in the plans of the Mpumalanga – Eskom Forum, in which the two parties have agreed to work together to support each other. Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division</p>
5. Coal Stockpiles Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was asked whether the area where coal is discarded is also lined.</p>	<p>Venter, Jan DARDLA: Soil Conservationist KSW: 21 November 2012</p>	<p>Tutuka Power Station is in the planning process to line waste facilities, as informed by WULs and Duty of Care from Eskom. Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division</p>
6. Construction and Maintenance Related Comments/Issues		
<p>In terms of the Tailings Dams and Ash Disposal Facilities– Dam Safety Requirements in terms of Chapter 12 of the National Water Act, 1998:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. If the operational storage of the free water on top of a tailings dam / mine residue deposit or ash dam does not exceed 50 000 m³, the particular tailings dam or ash dam is not registered or classified as a dam with a safety risk. 2. The requirement that the free water on top of the facility must be reduced to below 50 000 m³, or a more stringent requirement, must be clearly specified in the Operation Manual and /or Code of Practice of the tailings dam / mine residue deposit or ash dam and should be actively enforced throughout the life of the dam. If not, the tailings dam / mine residue deposit or ash dam must be registered as a dam with a safety risk in terms of dam safety legislation. It will then be classified and it must then comply with all the requirements of the dam safety legislation in Chapter 12 of the Water Act and the 	<p>Mr Leo van den Berg, Pr Eng Dam Safety Office Department of Water Affairs E-mail: 28 September 2012</p>	<p>Comment noted and forwarded to the Client for their attention as well as to the Legal Specialist for inclusion in the full legal review to be undertaken in the Impact Phase.</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
<p>requirements of dam safety regulations issued in terms of this chapter.</p> <p>3. If the tailings dam / mine residue deposit or ash dam is part of a mining operation, it must at all times comply with all the applicable legislation administered by the Department of Mineral Resources (DMR). The DMR requires that every tailings dam / mine residue deposit must have a Code of Practice. A guideline for such a Code of Practice has been developed by DMR.</p> <p>4. Pollution control dams associated with ash disposal and tailings facilities must however comply with the dam safety requirements of Chapter 12 of the National Water Act if they comply with the size requirements of a dam with a safety risk. Only dams with a maximum wall height that exceeds 5,0 m and with a storage capacity of more than 50 000 m³, or any other dam declared as a dam with a safety risk) are subject to the dam safety legislation in Chapter 12 of the National Water Act and the Dam Safety Regulations in Government Notice R. 139 of 24 February 2012.</p> <p>For more information about dam safety you can visit the Dam Safety Office website (part of the Department of Water Affairs website at: http://www.dwa.gov.za/DSO/)</p>		
7. Disposal of Ash Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was asked if ash be back-ashed into a mining area.</p>	<p>Celliers, Johan Chairman: TAUSA (Mpumalanga) KSW: 21 November 2012</p>	<p>Suggestions such as this that could reduce the footprint of an ash disposal facility and are always appreciated, but this specific question has its challenges. Typical challenges include liability with respect to groundwater pollution between the mining houses and Eskom, and these are never sorted out. Eskom will continue to keep this option under investigation to ensure the reduction of footprint.</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
		<p>Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division</p> <p>Additional information included in Chapter 7 of the FSR.</p>
8. EIA Process Impact Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was stated that, in terms of this proposed project, economics will overrule the environment and requested Lidwala Environmental to please take note.</p>	<p>Davel, Coenie Chairman: Amersfoort Farmers' Association FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>Comment noted.</p>
<p>The problem with these processes is that the EAP first go and do land identification, yet the crucial information i.e. the environmental findings is not yet there. It needs to be noted that the EMPr and the environmental studies don't talk to each other.</p>	<p>Hlanyane, Dan Environmental Manager GertSibande District Municipality FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>Lidwala can confirm that the sensitivity mapping undertaken to identify potential sites was undertaken with the relevant specialist input. Detailed studies will be undertaken on the identified potential alternative areas during the impact phase. Lidwala will ensure that the outcomes of the impact assessment and the recommended mitigation measures are outlined correctly in the EMPr.</p> <p>Please refer to Chapter 7 of the FSR.</p>
<p>Cumulative impacts should be assessed during the EIA as there are a number of projects taking place in the area. e.g. Tutuka and proposed prospecting activity</p>	<p>Venter, Jan DARDLA: Soil Conservationist KSW: 21 November 2012</p>	<p>Cumulative impacts are being taken into account as it is a requirement in terms of EIA legislation. e.g. existing infrastructure, future applications, etc. It is accepted that the limitation is on what is known about future planning.</p> <p>Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p>
9. Erosion Related Comments/ Issues		
<p>Looking at the diagram presented, it is noted that the surface of the ash disposal facility is flat and ask whether it will remain flat. If so, it would look unnatural and will also cause erosion.</p>	<p>Mells, Hendrik Chairman: Environmental Protection Agency KSW: 21 November 2012</p>	<p>It is correct that a flat surface would cause erosion problems due to water seepage. It is expected that the concept design would provide a design that would be more visually acceptable, avoid standing water, and would allow collection of any run-off water.</p> <p>Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division</p> <p>The ash disposal facility is constructed in a two tier system with the required slopes to prevent erosion.</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
		<p>Tebogo Mashida, Majuba Power Station</p> <p>It should be noted that although Eskom have put forward a proposed site, the scoping phase still identified additional alternative sites to be investigated during the impact phase. The impact phase will identify the most environmentally feasible site. In the event that a different site other than Eskom's proposed site (adjacent to existing facilities) is found to be more preferred, this additional land would need to be purchased.</p>
10. Health Impact Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was commented and raised a concern regarding the negative health impact due to water pollution i.e. ground water is used to water the crops which ends up on consumers tables.</p>	<p>Davel, Coenie Chairman: Amersfoort Farmers' Association FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>The Power Station has a groundwater monitoring network which is used to monitor the quality of the groundwater around the power station and mitigate if required. During the Impact Phase this concern will be assessed in detail during the groundwater study and the specialist's report will be included in the DEIR. Mitigation measures proposed will be included in the draft EMPr.</p>
<p>It was asked what health impacts are associated with ash to human and animal health.</p>	<p>Du Toit, Julius Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>This impact will be investigated during the Impact Phase by the Air Quality Specialist and the assessment will be included in the DEIR. Mitigation measures proposed will be included in the draft EMPr.</p>
<p>It was asked if heavy metals are present in the ash and if the ash is toxic.</p>	<p>Mells, Hendrik Chairman: Environmental Protection Agency KSW: 21 November 2012</p>	<p>Samples from the most recent ash disposed were taken (August 2012) and the preliminary results will be in the Draft Environmental Impact (DEIR). Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p>
<p>A complaint was raised about the dust from the Majuba Power Station when it is windy.</p>	<p>Thabethe, Tshepo Resident: Ezamokuhle PM: 22 November 2012</p>	<p>This concern will be forwarded to the air quality specialist who will investigate the dust impact on humans and propose mitigations. Bongi Mahlangu, Lidwala Environmental</p>
11. Infrastructure Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was enquired as to whether there will be any impact on the current road or infrastructure services. If anticipating additional</p>	<p>Hlanyane, Dan Environmental Manager</p>	<p>The impact on the roads and infrastructure services will be investigated during the Impact Phase of the project through</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
<p>trucks on their road network then the Council need to express their concern that this would be a serious problem to them.</p> <p>He also asked as to who will be responsible (and pay) for road and infrastructure maintenance as the Council is responsible to guide and inform the community regarding this impact.</p>	<p>GertSibande District Municipality FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>both the Traffic study and the Social Impact Assessment. In addition to this the existing impacts of Eskom's business on roads is being addressed through the Mpumalanga-Eskom Forum.</p>
12. Land Acquisition Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was stated that it is believed that the land acquisition process would be a challenge.</p>	<p>Zwane, Vusi Councillor KSW: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>The process of land acquisition is started in parallel with the EIA consultation processes. This is normally in the form of presentation/s on how the purchasing process would be done, and it can be presented to individuals or to individually affected landowners. Thus there is a connection with the Eskom Properties Department which allows the EIA and land purchase processes to support each other. As the EIA process progresses, and once the preferred site has been recommended, Eskom Land & Rights Department (purchase team) will enter into negotiations with the affected landowners and goes through the process to acquire the land. For the land purchase process, Eskom appoints a valuator, but the negotiation process could allow the landowner to appoint his own valuator ~ this is to allow for comparison of the evaluation processes for a satisfactory and agreed valuation result. It needs to be mentioned that once a preferred site (or sites) has been identified the land acquisition and EIA process can run parallel.</p> <p>Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division</p>
13. Land-use Related Comments/Issues		
<p>When Eskom rehabilitate ash disposal facilities, do they look at the land use?</p>	<p>Venter, Jan DARDLA: Soil Conservationist KSW: 21 November 2012</p>	<p>This issue will be addressed under the Land Capability/Agricultural Potential study during the Impact assessment phase. These results will be provided in the DEIR.</p> <p>Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p>
<p>Rehabilitation should be done in such a way that the same land capability is established after rehabilitation has taken place.</p>		<p>Comment noted.</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
<p>The project team was informed that residential expansion in the Municipal area is a challenge and the possible procurement of additional land is a concern to them. 30 Years is a long period and it needs to be determined whether this proposed development would be environmentally sustainable and that all relevant mitigation measures are included in the Environmental Management Programme (EMPr).</p>	<p>Hlanyane, Dan Environmental Manager GertSibande District Municipality FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>This information will be forwarded on to the Social impact specialist for their attention and inclusion in the social impact assessment to be undertaken in the impact phase.</p>
<p>The project team that the Municipality's SDF/IDF/EMF has been updated and that they need to familiarise themselves with these documents to confirm whether the proposed sites have not been earmarked for development, and if earmarked for development, what type of development is proposed by the Municipality. It was also pointed out that land needs to be used sustainably.</p>	<p>Kadanyo, Nadia PixleykaSeme Local Municipality FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>It requested if the team can obtain a copy (per DVD / flash disk) of the Municipality's latest SDF/IDF/EMF. It was also recommended that Lidwala Environmental provides the Municipality's GIS Department with shape files to overlay it on their maps to identify what the possible impact could be. Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p> <p>Documentation as mentioned above was received and will be distributed to the project team for consideration in the Impact Phase.</p>
<p>The project team was informed that the Municipality does not have a GIS Department and advised Lidwala Environmental to speak to the Town Planner and recommends that Lidwala Environmental does the overlay and provide the Municipality with a copy of the map.</p>		<p>The information was obtained after the meeting in electronic format.</p>
<p>14. Legal / Legislative use Related Comments/Issues</p>		
<p>It was asked whether this project would trigger an Amendment to Majuba Power Station's existing Water Use Licence (WUL).</p>	<p>Hlanyane, Dan Environmental Manager GertSibande District Municipality FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>If site A and/or B is the recommended site, it would trigger an Amendment. The team has not yet confirmed whether the other sites would require a WUL, but this could only be determined after the detailed specialist studies have been completed. He further advised that the EIA process tends to include other potential permits for developments, hence the implications with respect to WUL are under consideration, and Eskom will undertake to do these processes together or in parallel, as much as possible.</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
<p>It was pointed out that this proposed project could contradict the existing WUL and the project team needs to have discussions with the District and Local Municipalities now and not in the impact phase.</p>		<p>Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division</p> <p>The Department of Water Affairs (DWA) received a copy of the all relevant Reports and Lidwala awaits their written comments. All the commenting authorities on the project database are kept up to date regarding this proposed project. It also needs to be mentioned that LidwalaEnvironmental's Report will also go through a legal review and this would follow the EIA in detail, and identify any the licence / permitting that would be required.</p> <p>Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p>
15. Rehabilitation Related Comments/Issues		
<p>Does Lidwala have access to information of ash disposal facilities which were closed in the past and the impacts they have on the environment and has Lidwala looked at existing information on Eskom's business?</p>	<p>Du Plessis, D Secretary: TAUSA KSW: 21 November 2012</p>	<p>Lidwala is not aware of any ash disposal facilities that have been closed.</p> <p>Information was received from Eskom regarding their existing ashing facilities and processes and Eskom will continue to forward the required information as and when needed.</p> <p>Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p>
<p>As per confirmation by Eskom, Eskom is looking at purchasing additional land for this proposed continuation of ash disposal. If that is the situation she enquired as to what will happen to the existing land in terms of rehabilitation and is a rehabilitation process in place.</p>	<p>Kadanyo, Nadia PixleykaSeme Local Municipality FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>Eskom will have to decommission the existing ash disposal facility (when it reaches it life span). As mentioned previously, studies are being conducted to look at possible ash utilization.</p> <p>Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division</p> <p>Majuba Power Station has a rehabilitation programme in place and one of the plans is to cover the ash with topsoil and plant grass.</p> <p>Tebogo Mashida, Majuba Power Station</p> <p>It should be noted that although Eskom have put forward a proposed site, the scoping phase still identified additional alternative sites to be investigated during the impact phase. The impact phase will identify the most environmentally feasible site. In the event that a different site other than Eskom's proposed site (adjacent to existing facilities) is found to be more</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
		preferred, this additional land would need to be purchased.
When the top soil is removed it is left outside for a long period of time and this sterilizes the soil. Also, when excavation is done, the topsoil is removed horizontally and tipped overturned over and during rehabilitation it is not replaced in the correct soil condition order.	Venter, Jan DARDLA: Soil Conservationist KSW: 21 November 2012	The stockpiling of topsoil is for a short period of time (up to a month), by which time the soil is used for rehabilitation. William Mogwase, Eskom Tutuka Power Station
It was commented that it is believed that Eskom manages its stock pile in such a manner as to prevent erosion.		Attendee was thanked for this comment, and it was well received. William Mogwase, Eskom Tutuka Power Station
16. Site Alternative Related Comments/Issues		
It was stated that alternatives A & B would be a nightmare in terms of infrastructure and Alternative C would be a no-go area because it is close to town.	Du Toit, Julius Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012	Comment noted. Please refer to Chapter 7 for details of the sensitivity mapping and alternative identification process.
It was stated that any of the five (5) alternatives can be used as there would be no environmental impacts. The environmental impacts are caused due to improper or lack of management at the Power Station		
It was enquired what is the proposed alternatives of the EIA should option 1 not materialise.	Zwane, Vusi Councillor KSW: 20 November 2012	There are five (5) site alternatives, and there is also a combination of alternatives between the five (5) proposed sites. Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental Please refer to Chapter 7 of the FSR.
17. Social and Socio-Economic Related Comments/Issues		
The project team was informed that the country finds itself in an unfortunately situation by getting the balance right between the country's energy need and sustainable use of minerals. Their experience is not rosy regarding EAPs and unfortunately it is disappointing. DH informed the team that he just attended another meeting with an environmental consultancy, and stated that EAPs need to tread careful as to not undermine the capacity and skills of	Hlanyane, Dan Environmental Manager Gert Sibande District Municipality FGM: 20 November 2012	Lidwala will endeavour to ensure that no part of the EIA documentation for this project is misleading in anyway. The sensitivity mapping undertaken for the identification of alternative sites, clearly indicates that the area surrounding the Majuba Power Station is a sensitive environment, and this will be taken into consideration by all the relevant specialists during the Impact phase. The council can refer to Chapter 4 of the FSR for a full description of the project.

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
<p>local people but to be informed that they have lots of knowledge.</p> <p>It was further stated that the presentation given is misleading as this area is an environmental hot spot and the proposed expansion of the ash facility at Majuba Power Station would definitely have an impact on ground water.</p> <p>It is requested that the scope provided to the EAP be forwarded to the Council so that they can familiarise themselves with it and also to be able to the attendees cannot advice the Council as to whether the project needs to be supported or note.</p>		<p>Lidwala will arrange a meeting, if required, with the council early in the impact phase in order to provide further technical information and to present the way forward. If required, this meeting will be arranged prior to the Draft EIR being released for public review.</p>
<p>The project team was informed that most times the EAPs makes the communities believe there could be economic spin offs and the project team present needs to take note that the District and Local Municipality does not want temporary spin offs.</p>		<p>Eskom will be utilising their existing employees working at the current ash disposal facility at Majuba Power Station for the proposed continuous ashing activities. No new permanent job opportunities will be available.</p>
<p>It was asked if there are any jobs that will be created from the project.</p>	<p>Kubheka, TK Resident: Ezamokuhle PM: 22 November 2012</p>	<p>Eskom will be utilising their existing employees working at the current ash disposal facility at Majuba Power Station for the proposed continuous ashing activities. No new permanent job opportunities will be available.</p>
<p>It was requested that the next time the project team comes for a meeting, in our presentation we must say how we are planning to uplift the community of Ezamokuhle.</p>	<p>Vilane, Siyabonga Resident: Ezamokuhle PM: 22 November 2012</p>	<p>The project involves the need to identify an area for the continuous ashing activities at Majuba Power Station. This ash disposal facility needs to be able to accommodate the ashing requirements of the power station for the next 48 years, to 2060. Due to the fact that the power station will utilise their existing employees for the continuous ashing activities no permanent job opportunities are available.</p>
<p>It was asked what is the possible economic benefit of this proposed development of the entire project, i.e. what injection would there be for the community.</p>	<p>Zwane, Vusi Councillor KSW: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>Eskom advises the appointed contractor(s) that should local labour be required, they should be recruited locally through existing databases as provided by the Local Municipality. The SDNL also assist in terms of skills development.</p> <p>Eskom will be utilising their existing employees working at the current ash disposal facility at Majuba Power Station for the proposed continuous ashing activities. No new permanent job</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
<p>An outcry was made to Eskom to leave a legacy behind such as the establishment of an incubator.</p>		<p>opportunities will be available. Tebogo Madisha, Majuba Power Station Request noted.</p>
18. Technical Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was asked why Eskom isn't looking at other power alternative technologies i.e. renewable power. AS responded by saying that there are other technologies that Eskom is looking into such as solar, hydro and wind.</p>	<p>Davel, Coenie Chairman: Amersfoort Farmers' Association FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>Eskom is also looking and implementing various projects that will ensure reduction of its environmental footprint.</p> <p>EIA processes are currently being undertaken for a proposed Nuclear Power Station as well as a 500MW Wind Energy Facility in the Eastern and Northern Cape respectively. A Wind Energy Facility has been authorised in the Western Cape Province. Eskom have plans to install solar plants within a few of the existing power station properties. Eskom is also investigating the further installation and utilisation of biomass energy, further solar production and further wind energy facilities.</p>
<p>It was asked whether the 800 hectares referred to in the presentation is additional land that needs to be secured for the continuation/progression of the ash dam at Majuba Power Station.</p>		<p>Eskom would require additional land (approximately 550ha) for the proposed continuous ash disposal facilities. Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p>
<p>It was asked how much land does Eskom own in the vicinity of Majuba Power Station.</p>		<p>Eskom owns ±2 863ha. Tebogo Madisha, Majuba Power Station</p>
<p>The team was provided with a calculation of how much food could be produced on the area of land that Eskom requires for the expansion of the Majuba Power Station's ash dam. He (CD) also clearly stated, in no uncertain terms, that Eskom would not be allowed to buy another more agricultural land on top of the land that they already own.</p>		<p>It was explained that the resultant amount of Eskom's land may not be suitable for the proposed ashing. Further, the land owned by Eskom is often acquired because, through a land purchase process for a project, the landowner deems the rest of their land to not be feasible for continued operations. In such negotiations, Eskom often purchases the rest of the land as well. Such land, although Eskom owned, may not necessarily be usable for the ash disposal, hence Eskom leases such lands. Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
		The information provided by the delegate will be forwarded to the Agricultural Specialist for consideration in the detailed agricultural potential study which will be undertaken in the impact phase.
It was asked whether Eskom has a Research and Development Department as one cannot understand why Eskom still runs Power Stations and sticking to 60 year old technologies.		Eskom does have a Research, Testing and Development Department and Eskom is looking at renewable energy i.e. wind farm, hydro and solar. Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division
The project team was informed that one of the main reasons he is attending these meetings is try to and get the "Eskom's" of the world's to look at other power generating alternatives. Everyone wants have electricity but not at the current cost to the environment and landowners.	Du Toit, Julius Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012	Comment noted.
It was asked if the ash facility is being managed properly.		Eskom is currently experiencing problems with their dust suppression system and this issue is being addressed through various projects that will be implemented soon. Zama Mkhize, MajubaPower Station
The project team was informed that if Eskom is going to go for alternative D and C, then Eskom would have to buy his and JvN's land because it would be impossible to continue farming on the land due to the impact that they dust will have on their crops and grazing.	Lambrechts, Jan Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012	The dust suppression system was commissioned at the beginning of Power Station's operations. Tebogo Madisha, Majuba Power Station
It was reiterated that their problem is the dust from the current ash disposal facility as it is not properly managed or being managed at all, do understand the need to dispose of the ash.		
It was commented that there are different regulations that Eskom must adhere to e.g. Eskom has to adhere to sewerage, air quality standards, etc, and if Eskom does not adhere to these standards they are penalised.	Mells, Hendrik Chairman: Environmental Protection Agency KSW: 21 November 2012	Eskom (Generation) has an ISO 14001 EMS Certification. Therefore, should landowners notice any non-compliance; it needs to be communicated with the station. The attendees were also provided with the name and contact details of Eskom's Environmental Manager, Ms Deidre Herbst, if there are any issues that they have reported to the station, and

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
		<p>are not getting attention, they are most welcome to give her a call.</p> <p>Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division</p>
<p>It was asked why Eskom does not close Majuba Power Station due to the numerous environmental impacts it's causing.</p>	<p>Van der Merwe, Hendrik Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>Majuba is part of Eskom's electricity generating fleet, which provides power for the country. Majuba power station has obtained an ISO 14001 EMS certification, and is constantly improving on its environmental performance. While the station may have some compliance challenges, the initiatives being implemented are intended to reduce such impacts. It is further encouraged that communities/concerned should contact the station for their issues of concern.</p> <p>Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division</p>
<p>It was asked when the dust suppression system was commissioned.</p>		<p>The suppression system was commissioned at the beginning of Power Station's operations.</p> <p>Tebogo Madisha, Majuba Power Station</p>
<p>It was asked if Eskom (Majuba Power Station) has ever received a non-compliance notice from DEA.</p>		<p>None to date.</p> <p>Zama Mkhize, MajubaPower Station</p>
<p>It was asked how Eskom determines the amount of hectares that would be needed for the new ash facility and what was the original envisaged percentage.</p>	<p>Van Niekerk, Johan Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>The percentage is determined by the amount of ash that is produced by the Power Station and it needs to be noted that a much lower quality coal is being used at the Power Station than was originally planned for. The original planned ashing was about 26%. Currently Majuba Power Station burns 35% of coal.</p> <p>Tebogo Madisha, Majuba Power Station</p>
19. Veld Fires Related Comments/ Issues		
<p>It was asked if the environmental studies looked at the impacts of veld fires that will be associated with the extension of the ash disposal facility.</p>	<p>Van der Merwe, Hendrik Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012</p>	<p>The environmental team have not looked at this impact and it will be taken forward into the Impact Phase.</p> <p>Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p>
20. Water (Ground and Surface) Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was commented that MajubaPower Station's ash sites are moving over a wetland.</p>	<p>Mells, Hendrik Chairman: Environmental Protection Agency</p>	<p>That is exactly the reason why alternatives sites have been identified and what will be assessed in the Impact Phase.</p> <p>Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
<p>In terms of the Tailings Dams and Ash Disposal Facilities– Dam Safety Requirements in terms of Chapter 12 of the National Water Act, 1998:</p> <p>It must also comply with the requirements in Chapter 4 of the National Water Act with respect to the use of water. <u>Pollution control dams and tailings dam / mine residue deposit at mines must also comply with the Regulations on use of water for mining and related activities aimed at the protection of water Resources</u> (Government Gazette 20119, Notice 704), 4 June 1999.</p>	<p>KSW: 21 November 2012</p> <p>Van den Berg, Leo Department of Water Affairs: Dam Safety Office E-mail: 28 September 2012</p>	<p>Comment noted and forwarded to the Client for their attention as well as to the Legal Specialist for inclusion in the full legal review to be undertaken during the impact phase.</p>
21. General Related Comments/Issues		
<p>It was commented that it is sometimes difficult to work through these Reports on the websites as they are not properly named, especially the Appendices and one needs to open them all to find the one that you are looking for.</p>	<p>Celliers, Johan Chairman: TAUSA (Mpumalanga) KSW: 21 November 2012</p>	<p>Assurance was provided that this proposed project's Report is properly indexed with a Table of Context and the Appendices clearly indicates which specialists' report it is. This demarcation is clearly presented even on the websites.</p> <p>Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p>
<p>It was commented that it is Lidwala Environmental responsibility to advise Eskom as to why they are not the most famous neighbour and that they must, at all times, adhere to environmental standards. Eskom is damaging the country with their environmental impacts.</p>		<p>There are different regulations that Eskom must adhere to e.g. Eskom has to adhere to sewerage, air quality standards, etc, and if Eskom does not adhere to these standards they are penalised.</p> <p>William Mogwase, Eskom Tutuka Power Station</p> <p>Eskom (Generation) has an ISO Certification. Therefore, should landowners notice any non-compliance; it needs to be communicated with the station.</p> <p>The attendees were provided with the name and contact details of Eskom's Environmental Manager, Ms Deidre Herbst, and said if there are any issues that you have reported to the station, and are not getting attention, you are most welcome to give her a call.</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
		Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division
It was requested that Lidwala Environmental conduct a public meeting where everyone will be informed of the proposed project.	Dladla, Josi Resident: Ezamokuhle PM: 22 November 2012	The team will be back around February or March next year. Bongi Mahlangu, Lidwala Environmental
Copies of the BID was requested for distribution around the township (schools, shops, etc)		Copies were given to the resident.
It was asked how it is possible that 57% of Mpumalanga has mining rights. As mentioned earlier, should mining be approved it would have a serious impact on food production for the country.	Davel, Coenie Chairman: Amersfoort Farmers' Association FGM: 20 November 2012	The team members present at the meeting are not equipped or informed or mandated to respond to the question and it is recommended that this question be posed to DMR and DEA. Nicolene Venter, Imaginative Africa The problem faced by food producers is noted and it should be noted that Eskom endeavours to follow best practice. Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division
It was commented that the landowners in the area have generally a trust issue towards Eskom and EIA processes.		A brief insight into the operations of the Green Scorpions and the type of work that they do was presented, and further reiterated that Eskom is working for compliance and betterment of its operations. Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division Lidwala can confirm that they are independent Environmental Assessment Practitioner and will ensure that the EIA process is robust, transparent and managed in accordance with the relevant regulations (i.e. EIA Regulation published in Government Notice R543 of the NEMA and Government Notice 718 of 3 July 2009 of the NEMWA).
It was said that just the fact that issues are being discussed is already a positive sign and he sincerely hopes that Eskom is listening.		Comment noted.
The contact details for the green scorpions were requested and it was commented that the existence of the Green Scorpions means that that these processes are being abused.	Du Toit, Julius Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012	Mr SabeloMalaza; Director: Compliance Monitoring Tel.: 012 310 3396 E-mail address: info@greenscorpions.com (website currently

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
		under construction) The Communication Officer at Majuba Power Station is: Ms Vuyo Gwazela, tel no 071 799 3201 and fax 086 666 9947.
The project team was informed of his new e-mail address and requested that the database be updated accordingly.	Fourie, Wynand E-mail: 27 September 2012	Request noted and executed.
Concern was expressed that EAPs approach communities with a proposed development <u>before</u> the project has been presented to the Councillors. It needs to be noted that communities rely on their Councillor to take informed decisions.	Hlanyane, Dan Environmental Manager GertSibande District Municipality FGM: 20 November 2012	Municipal protocol regarding public participation will be observed and taken into account, in future, without compromising the EIA Regulations, PP Guidelines, the independency of the EAP, as well as not compromising the developer's apolitical position
It was request that the team consider holding another meeting after the Council has received LidwalaEnvironmental's Terms of Reference given. He stated that this type of meeting is a waste of the Council's time and as above, request that another meeting to take place to talk about the regarding the "nuts and bolts" of the project and way forward		Detailed information is available in the Draft Scoping Report, and the Plan of Study for EIA for all specialists, and Terms of Reference to Lidwala Environmental is included in this Report. Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division Both the Tutuka and Majuba Continuous Ash Disposal Facility projects' DSR was personally delivered to Mr Hlanyane's offices on 8 November 2012. The delivery receipts were signed by the Security Officer on duty. If required, the project team will hold an additional meeting with the municipality early in the Impact Phase, before the DEIR is released for public review. Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental
The project team was informed that they cannot just consider the immediate farm(s) of the proposed site, but also those immediately adjacent.		The PP team will ensure that the landowners of the entire study are will be consulted with. Lidwala can confirm that they have already undertaken a Windeed search for all the farms within a 12km radius of the power station. Lidwala can also confirm that all the specialist studies will take the alternative sites and their surrounding areas into account when assessing the impacts. Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental
The project team was informed that the Municipality would like to avoid and prevent an unwanted "Marikana" situation. It is stated that the Municipal By-Law outlined the PP process to be followed and in short recommends the PP team to be in touch		Comment noted.

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
with the Speakers Office for arrangements for the next public meeting.		
It was requested that the draft minutes be distributed within a week after the meeting to accommodate the up and coming holiday season		The team will try its utmost to comply with this request. Nicolene Venter, Imaginative Africa
It was requested that the affected Ward Councillors receives hard copies and CDs of the Final Scoping Report.		Request noted.
It was enquired as to whether Eskom is looking at other energy sources than coal.	Mells, Hendrik Chairman: Environmental Protection Agency KSW: 21 November 2012	Eskom does have a Research and Development Department and Eskom is looking at renewable energy i.e. wind farm, hydro and solar. Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division
What is the process involved for the underground coal gasification?		The project team is not able to answer the question as that project does not form part of this EIA. It was committed to providing him with the contact details of the team dealing with the UCG project Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental Post-meeting note: The contact details of SSI (now Royal Haskoning) were forwarded to the attendee on 21 November 2012.
The project team was informed that the Association does not have a major concern regarding the proposed expansion of the ash disposal facilities, but the Association's other main issue is mining. The heavy metals that end up in the water systems as a result of mining, for e.g the Vaal River, and this is unacceptable and a great concern. He enquired whether the project team is aware of the negative effects heavy metals as a result of mining have on humans i.e. it affects ones brain, behaviour and emotions. Women become infertile, people get brain damaged. The biggest irrigation system is in the Vaal River. If the water is polluted it affects the agriculture sector, hence food production which in the end we as humans take in.		The team members present at the meeting are not equipped or informed or mandated to respond to the question and it is recommended that this question be posed to DMR and DEA.

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
It was asked if Lidwala Environmental is the company that is also doing the UCG project who came earlier in the year to conduct a public participation meeting.	Nyongwane, Steven Resident: Ezamokuhle PM: 22 November 2012	It was not Lidwala Environmental but SSI and this is the first time Lidwala Environmental is coming to Ezamokuhle Community to hold a public meeting. BongiMahlanga, Lidwala Environmental
It was said that he hopes that the landowners present have succeeded to enlighten the consultants about key issues of concern to them.	Van der Merwe, Hendrik Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012	All comments and concerns raised at the meeting will be forwarded to the specialist to be considered during the impact phase. Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental
It was said that the as a farmer he does not have time to read through the DSR as it is a thick report and is to technical.	Van Niekerk, Johan Landowner FGM: 20 November 2012	Comment noted.
Requested a map of where the proposed activity will take place as the BID just shows a blank space where the map should've been included.	Whitlow, Liam Environmental Impact Management Services E-mail: 30 October 2012	Request acknowledged and map forwarded.
It was asked what role the Municipality must play in this EIA.	Zwane, Vusi Councillor KSW: 20 November 2012	One of DEA's requirements is to obtain written comments from the Local Municipality in whose jurisdiction the development is planned. BongiMahlanga, Lidwala Environmental The Municipality's SDF and IDPs are considered to ascertain that the sites do not clash with what the Municipality plans for that area / site. Such an assessment is to ensure alignment of the proposed development with municipal plans Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Sustainability Division
The project team was informed that the Council is happy that the team proceed to have their public meeting that evening (22 November 2012). He request that in future the respective Councillor in whose jurisdiction the project is proposed should be met with timeously so that he/she can inform and urge the community to attend.		Comment noted