

# **Kozette Myburgh**

From: Lauren Williams <Lwilliams@environment.gov.za>

**Sent:** 21 August 2019 12:41 PM

To: Kozette Myburgh; Nicolette Vink; Funanani Ditinti; Siyabonga Dlulisa; Daisy Kotsedi;

Radia Razack; Ryan Peter

**Subject:** Re: Walker Bay MPA boundary

Attachments: WBMPA.jpg

#### Dear Kozette

The pdf is the metadata, all other files are components of a shapefile that you can open in GIS software.

The HWM on the coastal viewer is a draft line that was done by the WCG for the Coastal Management Lines project. I do not know which line was used when delineating the boundary of the MPA, but the MPA definitely preceded the generation of the HWM.

When I add the elevation to the area you focussed on, it seems like quite a drop between the buildings and the water, so my assumption is that the MPA "coastline" was taken from the bottom of the cliff. The buildings are seemingly situated >10m above mean sea level.

### Kind regards,

Lauren Williams Pr.Sci Nat | GTg GISc0832

## GISc Professional / Acting OCIMS & MIMS Manager

Department of Environmental Affairs **CD:** Oceans and Coastal Research

A: 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Foretrust Bldg, Martin Hammerschlag Way, Cape Town

M: Private Bag X4390, Cape Town 8000, South Africa

T: +27 21 819 5105

E: LWilliams@environment.gov.za

W: www.environment.gov.za / www.ocims.gov.za

From: Kozette Myburgh <kozette@ecosense.co.za>

**Sent:** 21 August 2019 11:55

To: Lauren Williams; Nicolette Vink; Funanani Ditinti; Siyabonga Dlulisa; Daisy Kotsedi; Radia Razack; Ryan Peter

Subject: RE: Walker Bay MPA boundary

Hi Lauren,

As discussed, I managed to download the shape files, but could not open them – the file with the shp extension is actually a pdf document and doesn't want to open (please see attached).

I then went onto the DEA coastal viewer and accordingly I could find a draft HMW line and the MPA boundary, which shows a separation between the HWM and the boundary. Can we interpret the boundary then to be at the LWM according to that (please see attached)?

Kind regards,

Kozette Myburgh

**Ecosense CC** 

Direct: +27 21 161 0258

Mobile: +27 82 783 9860 Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

**From:** Lauren Williams [mailto:Lwilliams@environment.gov.za]

**Sent:** 21 August 2019 09:45 AM

To: Nicolette Vink; Kozette Myburgh; Funanani Ditinti; Siyabonga Dlulisa; Daisy Kotsedi; Radia Razack

Subject: Re: Walker Bay MPA boundary

## Good morning

The data is recorded in the Protected Areas register and the shapefile can be downloaded from: https://egis.environment.gov.za/

## Kind regards,

Lauren Williams Pr.Sci Nat | GTg GISc0832

#### GISc Professional / Acting OCIMS & MIMS Manager

Department of Environmental Affairs **CD:** Oceans and Coastal Research

A: 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Foretrust Bldg, Martin Hammerschlag Way, Cape Town

M: Private Bag X4390, Cape Town 8000, South Africa

T: +27 21 819 5105

E: LWilliams@environment.gov.za

W: www.environment.gov.za / www.ocims.gov.za



From: Nicolette Vink

Sent: 20 August 2019 13:49

To: Kozette Myburgh; Funanani Ditinti; Siyabonga Dlulisa; Daisy Kotsedi; Radia Razack; Lauren Williams

Subject: RE: Walker Bay MPA boundary

#### **Dear Kozette**

This is beyond my area of expertise maybe Lauren can assist – I seem to remember these points were plotted – this could possibly assist with whether or not it is HWM or LWM.

## Kind regards Nikki

Adv Nikki Vink (de Kock)

Director: Law Reform and Appeals (CT) Department of Environmental Affairs

Tel: 021 8192417

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

Sent: Tuesday, 20 August 2019 13:19

To: Nicolette Vink; Funanani Ditinti; Siyabonga Dlulisa; Daisy Kotsedi; Radia Razack; Lauren Williams

Subject: RE: Walker Bay MPA boundary

Importance: High

Dear Nikki,

Thank you so much. That clarifies the seasonal aspect.

What we also need to get clarification on the Whale sanctuary area boundary:

The Westcliffe beacon 34°25`.782S; 19°13`.768E (19.2295E) then east and south east along the coast point onshore at Sopiesklip 34°27'.199S; 19 (34.4533S; 19.3353E) to a point offshore of 34°29`.65S; 19°16`.80E (34.4942S; 19.28E) to the beacon 34°25`.782S; 19°13`.768E (34.4297S; 19.229).

This description refers to "east and south east along the coastline". We are not clear on what "coastline" means and if it refers to the high water mark or low water mark.

There is no definition of coastline in NEMICMA or the National Environmental Management Protected Areas Act 57 of 2003 and the ordinary definition according to the Oxford dictionary is "the particular shape of the coast, especially as seen from above, from the sea, or on a map" (which is also not specific). Other definitions include: a line that forms the boundary between the land and the ocean (therefore the HWM?)

Hence our inquiry whether the boundary of the MPA falls along the HWM or LWM. The implication is that if the boundary falls along the HWM, the development could not be allowed to go ahead because of the NEMPAA requirements.

Please advise at your earliest convenience.

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

#### **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258

Mobile: +27 82 783 9860

Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

**From:** Nicolette Vink [mailto:NVink@environment.gov.za]

Sent: 20 August 2019 01:07 PM

To: Kozette Myburgh; Funanani Ditinti; Siyabonga Dlulisa; Daisy Kotsedi; Radia Razack; Lauren Williams

**Subject:** RE: Walker Bay MPA boundary

**Dear Colleagues** 

Attached is the Walker Bay Gazette with coordinates for the boundaries of the MPA. The MPA itself is not seasonal but the restrictions on movement of vessels relating to whales is seasonal.

Kind regards Nikki

Adv Nikki Vink (de Kock)

Director: Law Reform and Appeals (CT) Department of Environmental Affairs

Tel: 021 8192417

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

Sent: Tuesday, 20 August 2019 12:56

To: Funanani Ditinti; Siyabonga Dlulisa; Daisy Kotsedi; Radia Razack; Nicolette Vink; Lauren Williams

Subject: RE: Walker Bay MPA boundary

Importance: High

Dear All,

As we are busy revising the Basic Assessment Report, it is really crucial that we receive your feedback on the status of the MPA. It would determine whether the project can go ahead or not.

Will it be possible to provide me with such before the end of the week, please?

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

#### **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258 Mobile: +27 82 783 9860 Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

**Sent:** 18 August 2019 04:19 PM

To: 'Funanani Ditinti'; 'Siyabonga Dlulisa'; 'Daisy Kotsedi'; 'Rrazack@environment.gov.za';

'NVink@environment.gov.za'; 'lwilliams@environment.gov.za'

Subject: RE: Walker Bay MPA boundary

**Importance:** High

Hi All,

I am just following up if you have any feedback for me yet. Could we perhaps also call on the input of Radia Razack, Nicolette Vink and Lauren Williams, who were present at the meeting where we discussed the issue of the MPA boundary? Please see trailing email correspondence below.

It has also been brought to my attention that the Walker Bay MPA is a seasonal MPA. Can you confirm and what does this mean?

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

### **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258

Mobile: +27 82 783 9860

Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

From: Funanani Ditinti [mailto:FDitinti@environment.gov.za]

**Sent:** 13 August 2019 10:41 AM **To:** Siyabonga Dlulisa; Daisy Kotsedi

Cc: Kozette Myburgh

Subject: FW: Walker Bay MPA boundary

Good day Colleagues

Please assist with responding further.

K.Regards Funanani

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

Sent: Thursday, August 8, 2019 12:14 PM

**To:** Funanani Ditinti **Cc:** Thandeka Mbambo

Subject: RE: Walker Bay MPA boundary

Hi Funanani,

Thank you. We did consider this already, but because the description refers to "east and south along the coastline" we were not clear on what coastline means and if it refers to the high water mark or low water mark.

There is no definition of coastline in NEMICMA or the National Environmental Management Protected Areas Act 57 of 2003 and the ordinary definition according to the Oxford dictionary is "the particular shape of the coast, especially as seen from above, from the sea, or on a map" (which is also not specific). Other definitions include: a line that forms the boundary between the land and the ocean (therefore the HWM?)

Hence our inquiry whether the boundary of the MPA falls along the HWM or LWM. The implication is that if the boundary falls along the HWM, the development could not be allowed to go ahead because of the NEMPAA requirements.

## Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

# **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258
Mobile: +27 82 783 9860
Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

From: Funanani Ditinti [mailto:FDitinti@environment.gov.za]

Sent: 08 August 2019 11:48 AM

**To:** Kozette Myburgh **Cc:** Thandeka Mbambo

Subject: FW: Walker Bay MPA boundary

#### Good day Kozette

Please find attached Regs for your perusal in response to your query.

# K.Regards Funanani

From: Daisy Kotsedi

Sent: Thursday, August 8, 2019 11:42 AM To: Funanani Ditinti; Siyabonga Dlulisa Cc: Thandeka Mbambo; Nontsasa Tonjeni Subject: RE: Walker Bay MPA boundary

## Dear colleagues

Please see the attached Walker Bay regs with the boundaries of the MPA.

#### **Thanks**

From: Funanani Ditinti

Sent: Thursday, 08 August 2019 11:32
To: Siyabonga Dlulisa; Daisy Kotsedi
Cc: Thandeka Mbambo; Nontsasa Tonjeni
Subject: FW: Walker Bay MPA boundary

## **Good day Colleagues**

Please provide me with the information required. The EAP requires this information in order for her to continue with the project phase (draft BAR)

# K.Regards Funanani

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

Sent: Thursday, August 8, 2019 11:28 AM

To: Funanani Ditinti

**Cc:** Thandeka Mbambo; Nontsasa Tonjeni **Subject:** Walker Bay MPA boundary

## (DEA&DP) REF # 16/3/3/6/7/1/E2/15/1135/19

Dear Funanani,

Our discussion of this morning refers.

At the meeting in March (notes attached), we requested clarity on the boundary of the Walker Bay MPA, as this could affect the application for the path substantially. The proclamation is not clear on the exact boundary. The

attendees at the meeting was of the opinion that the boundary was at the Low water mark, but opted to respond formally upon receiving the first draft BAR for comment.

This issue came up during public participation and we really depend on clarification going forward.

It would assist our process to a great extent if you could provide a preliminary comment in this regard.

Kind regards,

## **Kozette Myburgh**

Director: Environmental Impact Assessment B.A, M.Phil, LL.M (Env Law)



#### Ecosense

Direct: +27 21 161 0258 Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849 Fax: +27 86 547 4221 Cell: +27 82 783 9860 Web:www.ecosense.co.za

#### **20** Years of Environmental Excellence

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the

sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

This message and any attachments transmitted with it are intended solely for the addressee(s) and may be legally privileged and/or confidential. If you have received this message in error please destroy it and notify the sender. Any unauthorized usage, disclosure, alteration or dissemination is prohibited. The Department of Environmental Affairs accepts no responsibility for any loss whether it be direct, indirect or consequential, arising from information made available and actions resulting there from. The views and opinions expressed in this e-mail message may not necessarily be those of Management.

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

This message and any attachments transmitted with it are intended solely for the addressee(s) and may be legally privileged and/or confidential. If you have received this message in error please destroy it and notify the sender. Any unauthorized usage, disclosure, alteration or dissemination is prohibited. The Department of Environmental Affairs accepts no responsibility for any loss whether it be direct, indirect or consequential, arising from information made available and actions resulting there from. The views and opinions expressed in this e-mail message may not necessarily be those of Management.

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

This message and any attachments transmitted with it are intended solely for the addressee(s) and may be legally privileged and/or confidential. If you have received this message in error please destroy it and notify the sender. Any unauthorized usage, disclosure, alteration or dissemination is prohibited. The Department of Environmental Affairs accepts no responsibility for any loss whether it be direct, indirect or consequential, arising from information made available and actions resulting there from. The views and opinions expressed in this e-mail message may not necessarily be those of Management.

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

This message and any attachments transmitted with it are intended solely for the addressee(s) and may be legally privileged and/or confidential. If you have received this message in error please destroy it and notify the sender. Any unauthorized usage, disclosure, alteration or dissemination is prohibited. The Department of Environmental Affairs accepts no responsibility for any loss whether it be direct, indirect or consequential, arising from information made available and actions resulting there from. The views and opinions expressed in this e-mail message may not necessarily be those of Management.

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

'Please consider the environment before you print this email'

This message and any attachments transmitted with it are intended solely for the addressee(s) and may be legally privileged and/or confidential. If you have received this message in error please destroy it and notify the sender. Any unauthorized usage, disclosure, alteration or dissemination is prohibited. The Department of Environmental Affairs accepts no responsibility for any loss whether it be direct, indirect or consequential, arising from information made available and actions resulting there from. The views and opinions expressed in this e-mail message may not necessarily be those of Management.

# **Kozette Myburgh**

From: Kozette Myburgh <kozette@ecosense.co.za>

**Sent:** 13 March 2020 02:10 PM

**To:** 'ieptieshaam.bekko@westerncape.gov.za'

Subject: RE: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - MPA issue - scheduled call

request

**Categories:** Authority engagement

Hi leptieshaam,

Our discussion of earlier this week refers.

I met with Funanani Ditinti on another site this week and asked her also – when she gets the updated report to comment, she will also circulate internally and source the MPA conditions / restrictions, in case the border does fall on the HWM.

For now we will use the general opinion at our March 2019 meeting as the assumption that the MPA is seasonal and due to its nature being a whale sanctuary, that the boundary could well be the LWM.

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

#### **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258 Mobile: +27 82 783 9860 Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

**From:** Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

Sent: 04 March 2020 03:24 PM

To: 'ieptieshaam.bekko@westerncape.gov.za'

Subject: FW: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - MPA issue - scheduled call request

**Importance:** High

Hi leptieshaam,

I have not had a response from you about this matter and I was wondering if we could schedule a call again. Please let me know when will be convenient for you – perhaps Friday or Monday morning at 8h00?

I am worried about the MPA issue and losing track—things are picking up to go further with the application and we need to know the implications of the MPA if any.

Kind regards,

### Kozette Myburgh

## **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258
Mobile: +27 82 783 9860
Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

**Sent:** 15 February 2020 09:08 AM

To: 'Ieptieshaam Bekko'

Subject: RE: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - MPA issue

**Importance:** High

Hi leptieshaam,

I trust you are well.

Fortunately for the Cliff path process there has been some 'quiet time' over the holidays, but we are picking up strings again.

My previous emails below and meeting with the land surveyor last year which I noted refers.

He previously inquired to the SG's office regarding various descriptions of the property boundaries and received the attached response. Accordingly, coastline on SG Diagrams is regarded as the HWM. My concern is that this will then also apply to the MPA boundary because of the wording in the proclamation.

We please need a definitive legal interpretation on this to present the correct information in our reports and address the MPA and National Environmental Management Protected Areas Act 57 of 2003 requirements if necessary.

Would you kindly see if you could engage with DEFF about this matter again, as you previously offered?

I would really appreciate your help!

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

## **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258 Mobile: +27 82 783 9860 Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

**From:** Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

**Sent:** 29 November 2019 07:43 AM

To: 'Ieptieshaam Bekko'

Subject: RE: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - MPA issue

**Importance:** High

Hi leptieshaam,

Hope you are well.

I know this is a crazy time of year, but did you manage at all to engage with DEFF about this matter again?

We are planning the next and official phase of the application and don't want to submit with the risk of the path being in the MPA, in which case DEFF / you could perhaps advise if there is another way to still pursue it.

I am looking forward to hearing from you.

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

### **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258

Mobile: +27 82 783 9860

Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

**From:** Ieptieshaam Bekko [mailto:Ieptieshaam.Bekko@westerncape.gov.za]

**Sent:** 04 October 2019 02:40 PM

To: Kozette Myburgh

Subject: RE: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCECSS (AUTH)

Good day Kozette,

Your email below refers.

I will engage with DEFF: Oceans and Coasts on this matter and revert back to you.

Best regards,

leptieshaam Bekko

Sub-Directorate: Coastal Management

Directorate: Biodiversity and Coastal Management Chief Directorate: Environmental Sustainability

Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Western Cape Government

4th Floor, Leeusig Building, 1 Dorp Street, Cape Town

Private Bag X9086, CAPE TOWN, 8000

Tel: (021) 483 3370

E-mail: <u>leptieshaam.Bekko@westerncape.gov.za</u>

Website: www.westerncape.gov.za

From: Kozette Myburgh <kozette@ecosense.co.za>

Sent: Thursday, 3 October, 2019 10:37 AM

To: leptieshaam Bekko <leptieshaam.Bekko@westerncape.gov.za>

Cc: FDitinti@environment.gov.za; 'Radia Razack' <Rrazack@environment.gov.za>; 'Nicolette Vink'

<NVink@environment.gov.za>; 'Lauren Williams' <Lwilliams@environment.gov.za>

Subject: RE: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCECSS (AUTH)

Importance: High

Good morning leptieshaam,

Hope you are well?

We did not receive further feedback from DEA O&C regarding the MPA boundary and I am just following up if you had any further discussions in this regard, as per our tele-meeting discussions below?

We had a recent meeting with a land surveyor who previously inquired to the SG's office regarding various descriptions of the property boundaries and received the attached response. Accordingly, coastline on SG Diagrams is regarded as the HWM. My concern is that this will then also apply to the MPA boundary because of the wording in the proclamation.

We please need a definitive legal interpretation on this to present the correct information in our reports and address the MPA and National Environmental Management Protected Areas Act 57 of 2003 requirements if necessary.

Kind regards,

# Kozette Myburgh

#### **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258 Mobile: +27 82 783 9860 Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

**Sent:** 26 August 2019 08:45 AM

To: 'Ieptieshaam Bekko'

Subject: RE: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCECSS (AUTH)

**Importance:** High

Hi leptieshaam,

Thank you for your time this morning to discuss the Poole's Bay path application we are currently busy with.

Just a few notes:

#### 1. Comment -

We would appreciate your comment from a coastal access point of view. You would be able to send it through within the next two weeks.

Although I have spoken to Funanani about requiring detailed comment (they only reacted on our letter stating that they would comment in the next round) I highlighted the importance of confirmation on the boundary of the MPA, but have not received formal comment yet.

## 2. MPA –

Although it is normally assumed that an MPA boundary is at the HWM, it was discussed at the meeting with DEA in March that, considering the purpose of the Walker Bay MPA being associated with whales, that it would rather be regarded as the LWM. It was also stated that DEA would address this formally in their comment on the BAR. We have not received this comment yet and in follow up inquiries from me, there has not been formal confirmation that it is in fact the LWM. I did receive feedback from Lauren Wiliams (please see email attached, with trailing emails, also from Nikki Vink indicating that it is beyond her area of expertise), her assumption is that the boundary is MPA "coastline" was taken from the bottom of the cliff, which also doesn't confirm LWM clearly. You will follow up with them to issue formal confirmation.

#### 3. Landowners consent –

We must continue including both DPW (for landowners consent) and the Cape Nature Seashore lease when the time comes to submit an application, although the Seashore Act would likely be repealed before the authorisation is granted, which will then obviate the need for it.

#### 4. Liabilities -

Needs to be addressed in the EMPr, proper signage is required (also illustrative), or signing of a disclaimer. You also noted the municipality's more positive attitude towards the project and that there would have to be an agreement on responsibilities, e.g. litter removal.

### 5. Black Oyster Catcher in IBA -

Although you don't regard there to be a great risk, we will nevertheless obtain an opinion from a bird specialist as there might be some disturbance during construction.

Please let me know if there is anything to add.

We look forward to receiving your comment.

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

### **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258 Mobile: +27 82 783 9860 Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

**Sent:** 22 August 2019 12:24 PM

To: 'Ieptieshaam Bekko'

Subject: RE: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCECSS (AUTH)

Hi leptieshaam,

Thanks for your email.

Your comment will be very valuable, so I will give you a call on Monday around 8h00 to discuss if ok and also by when we will need your comment.

I have minutes where the statement re the LWM boundary was made, but they also indicated that they would formally provide comment in response to the application. We have not received that yet. Are you perhaps referring to a different meeting? If so, then those minutes will be of help if I may refer to them in our report.

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

### **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258

Mobile: +27 82 783 9860

Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views

contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

From: Ieptieshaam Bekko [mailto:Ieptieshaam.Bekko@westerncape.gov.za]

**Sent:** 22 August 2019 12:16 PM

To: Kozette Myburgh

**Cc:** Mercia J Liddle; Lynn Jacobs

Subject: RE: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCECSS (AUTH)

#### Hi Kozette

I was on leave for a while and am still catching up on all my emails.

We would appreciate the opportunity to provide input in light of work that we commissioned in terms of the Coastal Access Audit for the Overberg.

At a meeting held with DEFF: Oceans and Coasts it was stated that the boundary for the MPA is the low water mark. I will check if there was minutes of the meeting that could be referred to in order to confirm this.

I am out of office today and tomorrow. By when would you require our comments?

Best regards,

leptieshaam Bekko

Sub-Directorate: Coastal Management

Directorate: Biodiversity and Coastal Management Chief Directorate: Environmental Sustainability

Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning

Western Cape Government

4th Floor, Leeusig Building, 1 Dorp Street, Cape Town

Private Bag X9086, CAPE TOWN, 8000

Tel: (021) 483 3370

E-mail: leptieshaam.Bekko@westerncape.gov.za

Website: <u>www.westerncape.gov.za</u>

From: Kozette Myburgh <kozette@ecosense.co.za>

Sent: Wednesday, 21 August, 2019 5:37 PM

To: leptieshaam Bekko < leptieshaam.Bekko@westerncape.gov.za >

Subject: FW: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCECSS (AUTH)

Importance: High

Hi leptieshaam,

I trust you are well and that you had a good break.

I am just following up on if you will still be commenting on the pre-application BAR. I am not ready with the revised report yet and could still incorporate comment, should you have any.

I have received feedback from Andrew Ballantyne, which basically says that the SG will not confirm the HWM in this case. The Land Survey Act only makes provision for that where subdivision of private properties are involved.

I am also awaiting feedback regarding the position of DoPW on the custodianship for the Coastal Public Property and whether they should be the ones to give consent as landowner, or whether it should simply be a lease through Cape Nature under the Seashore Act. It seems to veer towards the Cape Nature responsibility. There would have been a meeting today in this regard.

On the MPA issue, the boundary is still unclear due to lack of definition, but on the maps there is a definite divide between the draft HWM and boundary and Lauren Williams (DEA GIS) is also of the opinion that the boundary determination preceded the HWM determination and therefore it could be the LWM. In absence of confirmation, I will have to present this information as it is on the map (see attached), although when you add elevations, it may tell a different story. Any comment from your side on that?

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

### **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258

Mobile: +27 82 783 9860

Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

**Sent:** 07 August 2019 10:52 AM

**To:** 'ieptieshaam.bekko@westerncape.gov.za'; 'Rrazack@environment.gov.za'; <u>FDitinti@environment.gov.za</u> **Subject:** FW: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCECSS (AUTH)

**Importance:** High

Dear leptieshaam, Radia and Funanani,

We are finalising the comments received and I would like to know if you will still be commenting on the preapplication draft BAR. If possible, could I have your feedback then by Tuesday 13 August?

At the meeting in March we discussed issues around your stance on the HWM and also about the boundary of the MPA (see notes attached again, which was also included with the BAR that went out for comment). We would really appreciate your input in this regard, so we may confirm / address it in the process.

I have also spoken to Basson Geldenhuys on the landowner issue as well as confirmation of the HWM and he has put me in touch with Andrew Ballantine from the SG's office. I am hoping to arrange a meeting with him to determine their exact requirements. I would really appreciate any additional advice on this matter as well.

I am looking forward to hearing from you.

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

## **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +27 21 161 0258 Mobile: +27 82 783 9860 Admin Office: +27 44 384 0849

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

**Sent:** 22 July 2019 08:09 AM

**To:** 'Rrazack@environment.gov.za'; 'FDitinti@environment.gov.za'; 'saa-rah.adams@westerncape.gov.za'; 'marbe.coetzee@westerncape.gov.za'; 'wilna.kloppers@westerncape.gov.za';

'ieptieshaam.bekko@westerncape.gov.za'; 'dreyerw@dws.gov.za'; 'Andrew.september@westercape.gov.za'; 'tierck@capenature.co.za'; 'tourism@overstrand.gov.za'; 'fkotze@odm.org.za'; 'mayor@overstrand.gov.za'; 'egillion@overstrand.gov.za'; 'smuller@overstrand.gov.za'; 'hvdstoep@overstrand.gov.za'; 'ldevilliers@overstrand.gov.za'; 'paplon@overstrand.gov.za'; 'smadikane@overstrand.gov.za'; 'mazalalulama4@gmail.com'; <a href="mailto:vhudson@capenature.co.za">vhudson@capenature.co.za</a>; 'mazalalulama4@gmail.com'; <a href="mailto:vhudson@capenature.co.za">vhudson@capenature.co.za</a>; Rulien Volschenk (<a href="mailto:rvolschenk@odm.org.za">rvolschenk@odm.org.za</a>); <a href="mailto:basson.geldenhuys@dpw.gov.za">basson.geldenhuys@dpw.gov.za</a>; basson.geldenhuys@gmail.com

Cc: 'Ernest Fortoh'

Subject: RE: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCECSS (AUTH)

**Importance:** High

#### (DEA&DP) REF # 16/3/3/6/7/1/E2/15/1135/19

Dear Sir or Madam,

My correspondence of 21 June 2019 below refers.

This is just a friendly reminder that your comments for the above must please be submitted by Wednesday 24 July 2019.

Thank you to those from whom I have already received comments. These will be addressed in the revision to the current draft Basic Assessment Report.

Kind regards,

## Kozette Myburgh

### **Ecosense CC**

Direct: +2721 1610258 Admin Office: +27 44 3840849 Mobile: +27 82 783 9860

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference.

From: Kozette Myburgh [mailto:kozette@ecosense.co.za]

**Sent:** 21 June 2019 01:44 PM

**To:** 'Rrazack@environment.gov.za'; 'FDitinti@environment.gov.za'; 'saa-rah.adams@westerncape.gov.za'; 'marbe.coetzee@westerncape.gov.za'; 'wilna.kloppers@westerncape.gov.za';

'ieptieshaam.bekko@westerncape.gov.za'; 'dreyerw@dws.gov.za'; 'Andrew.september@westercape.gov.za';

'tierck@capenature.co.za'; 'tourism@overstrand.gov.za'; 'fkotze@odm.org.za'; 'mayor@overstrand.gov.za';

'egillion@overstrand.gov.za'; 'cgroenewald@overstrand.gov.za'; 'smuller@overstrand.gov.za';

'hvdstoep@overstrand.gov.za'; 'ldevilliers@overstrand.gov.za'; 'paplon@overstrand.gov.za';

'smadikane@overstrand.gov.za'; 'mazalalulama4@gmail.com'; vhudson@capenature.co.za;

<u>crampartab@capenature.co.za</u>; Rulien Volschenk (<u>rvolschenk@odm.org.za</u>); <u>svdmerwe@overstrand.gov.za</u>

Cc: 'Ernest Fortoh'

Subject: PROPOSED POOLE'S BAY PEDESTRIAN PATH - PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCECSS (AUTH)

# (DEA&DP) REF # 16/3/3/6/7/1/E2/15/1135/19

Dear Sir or Madam,

The attached letter regarding the above proposed development refers.

We are currently in the pre-application phase of the environmental assessment process and would like to invite you to participate and register as a stakeholder.

A draft Basic Assessment Report has been prepared for comment, which will be available at the Hermanus Public Library from 24 June 2019. For your convenience, the documents are also available at the following link:

### POOLES BAY PATH PRE-APPLICATION DBAR

Please do let me know if you have any comments or inquiries.

Kind regards,

## **Kozette Myburgh**

Director: Environmental Impact Assessment B.A, M.Phil, LL.M (Env Law)



## **Ecosense**

Web:www.ecosense.co.za

Direct: +27 21 161 0258 Admin Office Phone: +27 44 384 0849 Fax: +27 86 547 4221 Cell: +27 82 783 9860

## 20 Years of Environmental Excellence

DISCLAIMER: All advice or assistance rendered is given in 'good faith', is specific to the relevant facts and the information provided and cannot therefore be used as precedent.

This e-mail, the information that it contains and any files transmitted with it are confidential and are intended solely for the individuals or entity to which it has been addressed. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the content in any way is strictly prohibited and may give rise to claims against you. Please notify the sender of the error immediately. Any views contained herein are those of the sender unless specifically stated to be those of Ecosense CC. It is not represented, warranted or guaranteed that the integrity of this communication has been maintained, nor that it is free of errors, viruses, interception or interference

"All views or opinions expressed in this electronic message and its attachments are the view of the sender and do not necessarily reflect the views and opinions of the Western Cape Government (the WCG). No employee of the WCG is entitled to conclude a binding contract on behalf of the WCG unless he/she is an accounting officer of the WCG, or his or her authorised representative. The information contained in this message and its attachments may be confidential or privileged and is for the use of the named recipient only, except where the sender specifically states otherwise.

If you are not the intended recipient you may not copy or deliver this message to anyone."

"All views or opinions expressed in this electronic message and its attachments are the view of the sender and do not necessarily reflect the views and opinions of the Western Cape Government (the WCG). No employee of the WCG is entitled to conclude a binding contract on behalf of the WCG unless he/she is an accounting officer of the WCG, or his or her authorised representative. The information contained in this message and its attachments may be confidential or privileged and is for the use of the named recipient only, except where the sender specifically states otherwise.

If you are not the intended recipient you may not copy or deliver this message to anyone."