



To: Kwa-Zulu Natal AMAFA & Research Institute
Heritage Identification, Management and Protection
195 Langalibalele Street
Pietermaritzburg
3201
beadmin@AMAFApmb.co.za

Reference: Sandisiwe Matole
Sandisiwe.matole@AMAFainstitute.co.za

Date: 24 October 2022

Dear Madam

REFERENCE NUMBER: 21/014

RE-SUBMISSION OF A SECTION 37 APPLICATION: PARTIAL DEMOLITION OF STRUCTURES ON PORTION 3, 4, 5 AND 68 OF ERF 498, SCOTTSVILLE, PIETERMARITZBURG (ADOWA STUDENT HOUSING)

Attached please find our application submission for the partial demolition of structures on Portion 3, 4, 5 AND 68 OF ERF 498, Scottsville, Pietermaritzburg, in accordance with the National Heritage Act 25 of 1999, Section 34 and 38.

This submission consists of the following:

1. Summary timeline of previous correspondence from AMAFA an submission to date;
2. Completed Form A;
3. Supporting Documentation.

ADOWA Property Developers (referred heron as ADOWA) have been corresponding with AMAFA regarding this property since March 2021. Below is a timeline summary of the correspondence to date:

March 2021 – Section 37 Application is submitted (NHRA Section 34) – for demolition of building structures on portion 3 of Erf 498 Scottsville, Pietermaritzburg.

- Portion 3 of Erf 498 Scottsville, Pietermaritzburg is a large property that stretches from Roseveare Road to Carbis Road;
- The main red facebrick house is estimated to have been built between 1900 – 1910;
- There are various outbuildings on portion 4 of Erf 498, most likely dating back to when the house was first constructed. The plot is however largely vacant;

Phone | +27 111 1630 Fax | +27 (0) 86 232 6537

Address | Cnr January Masilela & Amarand Avenue | 3rd Floor Pegasus Building | Menlyn Maine, Waterkloof Glen Ext 2 | Pretoria | 0181

Directors S. Rafuza | P. Lamola | E. Dube |

- The main house was deemed to be structurally sound with well-preserved original elements (fireplaces, ceilings, doors, windows, door handles, etc.)

March 2021 – Section 41 Application is submitted (NHRA Section 38) – for demolition of all structures on portions 3, 4, 5 and 68 of Erf 498 Scottsville, Pietermaritzburg.

- Section 41 is applicable as the application is dealing with four individual erven, namely:
 - 4 Roseveare Road – Portion 3 of Erf 498 Scottsville;
 - 6 Roseveare Road – Portion 4 of Erf 498 Scottsville;
 - 8 Roseveare Road – Portion 5 of Erf 498 Scottsville (Tennis Court);
 - 8 Carbis Road - Portion 68 of Erf 498 Scottsville;
- The application requests permission to demolish all structures on the sites.

May 2021 - Public Participation Report in support of the Section 41 Application is submitted to AMAFA.

- The public participation process was undertaken by Tsica Heritage Consultants as part of the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) Report compiled in accordance to Section 38 of the National Heritage Resources Act 25 of 1999 and Section 41 and Section 37 of the Kwa-Zulu Natal Heritage Act No 4 of 2008 for portion 3, 4, 5 and 68 of Erf 498;
- Notification was given for the intent to fully demolish all structures on the 4 erven;
- No comments were received within the 30-day period.

June 2021 – Referral Letter issued from AMAFA as follows:

- Application was reviewed on 31 June 2021 by the KZN AMAFA and Research Institute;
- The letter requested a Visual Impact Assessment taking into consideration the surrounding neighbouring properties be submitted.
- Submission to KZN AMAFA was made on 14 July 2021.

02 September 2021 – Response Letter issued from AMAFA as follows:

- Application was received on 9 April 2021;
- The application was reviewed on 31 August by the KZN AMAFA and Research Institute;
- The letter requested a revised HIA identifying the heritage resources that will be impacted, assessment of the significance of the identified heritage resources and a detailed summary of the findings;
- The letter also requested the HIA include an integrated set of recommendations, as well as well as an indication of the grading of the heritage resources.

September 2021 – Re-submission of Section 37 Application is submitted (NHRA Section 34) – for demolition of building structures on portion 3 of Erf 498 Scottsville, Pietermaritzburg

- Section 1.2 of the report includes a motivation for the development – it notes that the house at 4 Roseveare Road is over 60 years old, and demolition of the structure will result in a permanent loss to the built heritage of Scottsville. It recommends that the house be recorded and memorialised, with features of the house being incorporated into the new Student Housing development;

- The motivation also notes that the new development would create employment, bring financial investment into the local and regional economy, and provide much needed student accommodation for UKZN;
- Section 5 of the HIA suggests that the house at 4 Roseveare Road should be graded as 3B, based on the survey done by Tsica Cultural Heritage on 22 September 2021;
- The heritage significance of the house is assessed on the following criteria: Architectural significance, Historical significance, Environmental significance, Social and Spiritual significance, Intangible significance, Technological and Scientific significance;
- Photographs of the interior, exterior and surroundings are included to document the condition of the site;
- Section 8.2 and 8.3 go into more detail on the suggested grading of the property as 3B;
- Section 9 discusses the impact of the demolition and the proposed mitigation methods - The impact of the proposed demolition and the proposed development on the resources identified was found to have a medium to low negative impact with the implementation of mitigation and memorialisation measures that have been incorporated in the proposed development plans and summarised in the recommendations;
- Proposed mitigation measures: It is recommended that the house be recorded and memorialised - the features of the house be incorporated in the new development, Materials from the site such as the red brick be reused in the new design, The foyer or entrance hall of the new building have a permanent exhibition of the pictures and history of the area and the house;
- A visual Impact Assessment (VIA) was included as part of the re-submission (Section 10);
- Development is noted to have a medium-high visual impact before mitigation. After mitigation, these visual impacts can be reduced to low / low-medium;
- Proposed mitigations to minimise overall visual impact: Landscape design must ensure human-scaled outdoor spaces and routes, with climatic wind shelter and shade, and opportunities for sitting, retain as many of the existing large trees as possible, plant indigenous trees and shrubs, multi-use outdoor parking areas, elevations to be articulated in a way that visually breaks up the scale of the building, restrict external lighting to mitigate lighting pollution, and the use of permeable boundary treatments.

23 February 2022 – AMAFA issue a letter refusing permission to demolish the red facebrick house at 4 Roseveare Road. The decision is based on the following:

- The house at 4 Roseveare Road is considered heritage significant, and AMAFA states that it is a Grade 3A listed building.
- ADOWA is given 30 days to request a review/appeal of the decision taken.

23 March 2022 – ADOWA respond to AMAFA, request a review of the decision to deny permission for demolition, noting the following:

- ADOWA queries the Grading of 3A;
- ADOWA requests clarity on whether the other structures on the site can be demolished.

24 May 2022 – AMAFA issue a letter in response as follows:

- AMAFA confirms the grading of the house at 4 Roseveare Road as 3A.

25 May 2022 – ADOWA responds to the letter asking for clarity on AMAFA’s position on the demolition of the remaining structures on the 3 other erven (portions 4, 5 and 68 of erf 498, Scottsville).

18 July 2022 – AMAFA issue a letter as follows:

- The letter explains that due to the fact all properties were included in one application, they cannot grant partial approval for demolition of the other structures, and that they are not in a position to revisit their decision;
- AMAFA states that the only option is to now submit a new section 41 application or to appeal the decision that has already been made.

28 July 2022 – ADOWA sent an email to AMAFA

- ADOWA has requested clarity if they can submit a new Form J only in order to avoid the time constraints involved in a new public participation process.

03 October 2022 – AMAFA responds to the request as follows:

“Given our letter dated 19 January 2021 on the form J application for the consolidation of the site, a no objection for the intention to develop the site was issued. Notwithstanding our no objection comment, no structures older than sixty years or parts thereof are allowed to be demolished, altered, or extended without a permit from the KwaZulu Natal AMAFA and Research Institute. Noting your consolidation approval from the Municipality, you are required to submit a permit application (form A application) for approval of the proposed demolitions and development.”

11 October 2022 – AMAFA confirms that ADOWA will not be required to carry out another public consultation process for the new application as the neighbours had already seen the initial proposal.

END

Your Sincerely



Siyavuya Papu – Head of Development Management