PROPOSED REFURBISHMENT AND CONSTRUCTION OF COASTAL INFRASTRUCTURE WITHIN THE KING SABATA DALINDYEBO LOCAL MUNICIPALITY (KSDLM), HOLE IN THE WALL, EASTERN CAPE

PROJECT ANNOUNCEMENT PERIOD (23 MARCH 2021 – 26 APRIL 2021)

COMMENTS AND RESPONSES

Name	Organisation
Mr Bossie Bosman	Inchopo Coastal Developments (Pty) Ltd / I&AP
Mr Ruan Brand	South African Heritage Resources Agency – Heritage Officer: Maritime & Underwater Cultural Heritage
Mr Jeff Brown	I&AP – Property owner
Department of Environment, Forestry & Fisheries	Department of Environment, Forestry & Fisheries – Oceans & Coasts
Ms Glenda Esemang	Department of Tourism
Dr Ben Gaunt	I&AP – Property owner
Mr Mike Griessel	I&AP – Property owner
Mr Rory Haschick	Eastern Cape Development Corporation - Sector Specialist: Renewable Energy & Tourism
Mr Peter Lowe	I&AP
Mr David Malherbe	I&AP – Property owner
Mr Sibusiso Owen Ndidi	Eastern Cape Environmental Network – Provincial Co-ordinator
Mamakomoreng Nkhasi-Lesaoana	South African Heritage Resources Agency – Heritage Officer
Ms Onesimo Notobelo	Department of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment
Mr Qondile Paliso	DEDEAT – Eastern Cape
Mr Greg Quin	I&AP – Property owner
Ms Gloria Ramabitle	Iliso Lamatshezi Development Forum – Deputy Chairperson
Olwetu Vongwe	Department of Water and Sanitation – Eastern Cape

Name and Date	Comment	Response
Date: 23 03 2021 (Email) Department of Environment, Forestry & Fisheries – Oceans & Coasts	Received, thank you.	This email serves to inform you that the Announcement Period documents for the above-mentioned project has been loaded onto your departments link: <u>https://environmentza-</u> <u>my.sharepoint.com/:f:/g/personal/fditinti_environment_gov_za/EnSN8C845udHg2gH</u> <u>3dJRQmQBy3sLII3PYMHKKRA9OucVVA?e=zXcx7a</u> Please advise if you have received the documents.
Date: 23 03 2021 (Email) Mr Rory Haschick Eastern Cape Development Corporation Sector Specialist: Renewable Energy & Tourism	Please register me as IAP for the BA for upgrade of coastal infrastructure in KSD as per advert in DD today and send me all the relevant BiD's. Thank you.	Thank you for your acknowledgement. Thank you for your email. Find attached BID documents and Announcement letter as requested. You have been added to the projects database.
Date: 24 03 2021 (Email) Olwetu Vongwe Department of Water and Sanitation – Eastern Cape	The Department of Water and Sanitation would like to register as an Interested & Affected Party. The Background Information Document (BID) has been circulated within the Department's Operational Units for comments. These comments will reach you on or before 26 April 2021.	Thank you for your email. The Department of Water and Sanitation have been added to the projects database.
Date: 25 03 2021 (Email) Mr Jeff Brown I&AP/Property owner	Seems my email from (Email address withheld), requesting to be added as an I&AP, was not received. Please register me as an I&AP? Received, thank you.	ACER has received your email and as discussed, please see the attached project notification documents which have been sent to you.
Date: 25 03 2021 (Email) Mr Greg Quin I&AP/Property owner	Kindly register me as an interested/affected person for the project: KSD upgrade Coffee Bay/Hole in the Wall. I am a property owner at Hole in the Wall. Your assistance will be appreciated. G M Quin	Thank you for your email. ACER has added you to the projects database. Find attached the announcement documents for your review and comment.
Date: 28 03 2021 (Email)	Please register me as an affected party so that my voice can be	Thank you for your email and comments received. You have now been registered

Name and Date	Comment	Response
Dr Ben Gaunt – I&AP/ Property owner	recorded objecting to the rubber-stamped destruction of genuine beauty.	on the projects database. Please find attached Announcement documents for your review and comment.
	While not all the plans you have been appointed as consultants to oversee are disastrous, the number 6 picnic area at the Hole is completely insane. If a company with the word Environmental in its name is happy to be associated with the bulldozing of old growth milkwood forest and its replacement with concrete and litter, then the industry has sunk to new lows. Nevertheless, I wish to be kept informed.	Concerning comments related to the Background Information Document, please note that MBB (in consultation with I&APs, the DFFE, and the EAP) has amended the initial design proposal. The new proposal and design layout will not involve the placement of walkways through the Coastal Dune Forest. Please also note that the new proposal aims to use the existing footpaths, tracks, and hiking trails to traverse the Coastal Dune Forest and as such, no vegetation (including the protected Milkwood species) will be removed or relocated. Furthermore, the dedicated braai and picnic areas have been positioned at strategic locations along the coastline (adjacent to the Mpako Estuary and overlooking Men's Beach) and will not be positioned near trees in the coastal forest habitat.
Date: 28 03 2021 (Email) Mr Peter Lowe – I&AP	Please register me as an I.A.P. in respect of the 'current BID doc' at Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall - Peter Lowe (No. 1 Hole in the Wall).	Thank you for your email. We have registered you on the projects database. Please find attached Announcement documents for your review and comment.
Date: 28 03 2021 (Email) Mr Bongani Figlan DEDEA - Eastern Cape	We reserve all rights in this regard. Document received.	Thank you for your acknowledgement.
Date: 29 03 2021 (Email) Mr Bossie Bosman Inchopo Coastal Developments (Pty) Ltd I&AP	Hi Carina Attached the registration for interested parties. Many thanks.	Thank you for your call. As discussed, find attached the Announcement documents for the above-mentioned project. We have added you to the projects database.
Date: 29 03 2021 (Email) Mr Mike Griessel – I&AP	I would like to register as an IAP for Coffee Bay Hole in the Wall project. Michael Griessel,	Thank you for your email. We have registered you on the projects database. Please find attached the Announcement documents for the project for your review and comment.
Date: 30 03 2021 Ms Gloria Ramabitle Iliso Lamatshezi Development Forum Deputy Chairperson	Mr Ritilili's e-mail address is (Email address withheld) kindly copy our secretary as well Ms Linah Nani, ID Number XXXXX, cell XXXXXX e-mail : XXXXXXX	Thank you for your email and details received. We will add Mr Ritilili and Ms Nani to the database.

Name and Date	Comment	Response
Date: 09 04 2021 (Email) Mr Sibusiso Owen Ndidi Eastern Cape Environmental Network Provincial Co-ordinator	I trust this email will find you in good health, this communique serves to register the Eastern Cape Environmental Network as an interested and affected party. The eastern Cape Environmental Network was established in 2004, it's a network with over 60 organizations whose primary mandate is lobby and advocacy on social and environmental injustices. ECEN has a footprint in all the regions of the Eastern Cape and beyond.	Thank you for your email and information received. ACER has registered the Eastern Cape Environmental Network as an interested and affected party.
Date: 10 04 2021 (Email) Dr Ben Gaunt I&AP / Property owner	Hoping that this email did manage to serve its massive role Please could you clarify what is meant by "initial comments during project announcement" - for which there is a closing date of 26 April 2021.	Please take note that project announcement forms part of the Public Participation Process as outlined in the EIA Regulations (GNR 326 Chapter 6, as amended on the 7 April 2017).
	Initial as opposed to what? Is this the main window to comment and object or are there further windows once the "developers" have a more concrete plan, if you will excuse the rather dark-humoured pun.	The main purpose of the project announcement period is to obtain registrations for possible Interested and Affected Parties (I & AP's). This period also affords I&AP's the chance to comment on the documents as found in the circulated Announcement documents. I&AP's have until the 26 th of April 2021 to confirm their registration for involvement in the Basic Assessment Process (BA).
		In the interim, the Environmental Assessment Practitioner (EAP) is compiling a Basic Assessment Report (BAR) for the proposed developments at Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall. Once the BAR is finalised, a copy of the document will be submitted to the competent authority (Eastern Cape Department of Economic Development, Environmental Affairs and Tourism – DEDEAT) for comment. A copy of the report will also be circulated to all registered I&AP's for comment.
		To confirm, the project announcement period is to inform the public and relevant authorities of the proposed development and allow interested and affected parties to register on the project database. The 30-day commenting and review period for the BAR will also allow an opportunity for I&AP's and other stakeholders to comment.
	19 04 2021 (Email) Thank you for the clarity.	ACER trusts this clarifies this query.
	I'm attaching the Comment Sheet that formed part of the document	

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	pack provided, noting some areas that I think would be beneficial to include in the basic assessment.	
	Most of these comments relate to HITW, especially developments 3, 4, 5 & 6 unless otherwise stated.	
	 Detailed record of the previous attempts by the Municipality to establish a picnic sit at HITW ("beach view picnic site, No 3") and analysis as to why they have not been maintained, or repaired after vandalism and how this will be prevented, to ensure any doesn't become a bigger eyesore. 	Noted – The municipality has been contacted to provide the necessary information. Should the information not be available at the time of the circulation of the Draft Basic Assessment Report, the KSDLMs responses will be added to the Comments and Responses Report for the FBAR comment period.
	2. Detailed records of Municipal refuse removal ACTUALLY PERFORMED in HITW over the past 3 years and analysis as to the impact of intermittent services on the refuse and litter situation in the proposed development.	Noted – The KSDLM has been contacted to provide the necessary information. Should the information not be available at the time of the circulation of the Draft BAR, the KSDLMs responses will be added to the Comments and Responses Report for the FBAR comment period.
	 Please include prospective "before and after" pictures of the picnic areas in both HITW and Coffee Bay for the public holidays 27 April, 1 May and 16 June. 	Thank you for your request. Please note that given the varying COVID 19 restrictions, the project proponent and/or MBB and/or was not able to conduct ongoing sites visits to obtain site photographs before and after social gatherings and public holidays. The EAP has requested that the KSDLM provide any information and/or evidence concerning your comment pre-COVID 19. Should you (or any other I&APs) have before and after pictures of the picnic areas, please feel free to forward it to the EAP.
	4. The HITW milkwood forest needs special attention in the assessment.	Noted.
	 Please include expert comment from a specialist in coastal forests. 	Noted. A Terrestrial Impact Assessment, Aquatic Impact Assessment and Beach & Coastal Impact Assessment has been completed for the proposed developments at Hole in the Wall and Coffee Bay. Specialist comments, findings and/or recommendations have been included in the Draft BAR (Section 5 & Section 7). The specialist reports can be viewed in Appendix D.
	Please source and include a bird list of species identified in	Noted. The ecologist has identified all avifauna that occurs within the study area.

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	the forest, (My personal list is 108 species. I am happy to provide it).	Please refer to Section 5.7.6 of the Draft BAR for a list of avifauna within the area. Please forward your personal list of 108 species to the EAP who will request the ecologist to review and/or comment on any discrepancies. Furthermore, please note that the National DFFE Web Based Screening Tool was used to identify the presence of special species within the proposed development footprint.
	Please source and include a list of other fauna identified in the forest.	Noted. The ecologist has identified all fauna, amphibians, reptiles, insects, and invertebrates that occur within the study area. Please refer to Section 5.7.5 for all fauna and Section 5.7.8 for all amphibians, reptiles, insects and other insects. Furthermore, please note that the National DFFE Web Based Screening Tool was used to identify the presence of special species within the proposed development footprint.
	 A catalogue of all trees within 50 m of proposed development should be obtained with an assessment of their health by a specialist in coastal forests. 	 No catalogue of trees within 50 m of the proposed development has been compiled however the ecologist has identified vegetation species that occur within the study area. Please refer to Section 5.7.4 for all vegetation species within the study area. These vegetation species were assessed based on the following: Threatened or Protected status (TOPS). The International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN, 2015). The IUCN is responsible for detecting the risk of possible extinction of species. The IUCN developed a red list system that is designed to detect the risk of extinction and includes the following categories: Critically endangered. Endangered. Vulnerable. Near threatened. Least concern.
	 An analysis of the risk of fire in the forest, especially in the dry season (May to September) should be undertaken, taking note of the fact that the nearest fire service is in Mthatha and takes 2 to 5 hours to respond to call if they come at all. 	The fire risk of the Coastal Dune Forest associated with the proposed development will not significantly be affected. Currently, the Coastal Dune Forest contains evidence of informal fires and braai areas. The proposed development aims to reduce informal fires and braai areas through the establishment of dedicated braai and picnic area.

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	5. Please conduct interviews with cottage owners in the area to determine how often milkwood is being offered for sale to them.	The protection and conservation of Milkwood species should be an ongoing activity. The illegal collection of firewood and/or coastal vegetation is common near coastal towns. The local authorities and municipality must adopt a proactive approach to address issues concerning the conservation of protected species. These may include education courses and seminars offered to local community members to increase awareness. It should be noted however that the collection of illegal firewood by community members falls outside of the scope of this assessment and cannot be addressed or a solution provided by the EAP.
Date: 12 04 2021 (Email) Mr Jeff Brown I&AP/Property owner	I do apologise for allowing the >5MB of photos through to the list moderator's queue. It won't happen again. Two things I want to mention:	Thank you for your email.
	 I spoke at some length with Cameron from Acer Africa on Friday, and apparently the current proposal IS to 'formalise' the footpath through the forest using recycled plastic. Despite it not saying this explicitly anywhere in the document, besides for the walkway in Coffee Bay, presumably it is meant to be inferred by I&APs. 	The proposed development has been amended to promote the use of existing footpaths, tracks, and hiking trails at Hole in the Wall. Poly-timber will be used to construct the formalised walkways at Coffee Bay.
	 I am arranging meetings with local stakeholders (youth league, sub-headman, wider community, headman, and Tshezi chief) to be able to facilitate the submission of the Heritage Site application as soon as possible. 	Noted. The Heritage Application to declare the Hole in the Wall a heritage site is a separate application and therefore, does not fall part of this Basic Assessment.
Date: 13 04 2021 (Email) Mr Jeff Brown I&AP/Property owner	Thanks for the calls and for your input. As promised, herewith an image showing the place names in and around Hole in the Wall. I've also included the KMZ file for Google Earth, with several other spots mapped but not shown here.	Thank you for accompanying ACER on a site visit undertaken on the 21/04/2021.

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	Vorid Heritage Site	Noted. Your comments were supported by the Beach and Coastal specialist (Appendix D). The beach condition (adjacent to the Mpako Estuary) are often reduced to sand and shingle and boulders at certain times of the year when the sand is washed out to sea.
	I've used this satellite picture from 2017 to illustrate that there is often no beach at the Hole in Wall / Mpako River. It varies, but in my experience the river front often does not have a sandy beach or safe swimming area at all over rainy (peak) season. And for large parts of the year, for that matter.	Noted. As discussed during the site visit, the purpose of the dedicated braai and picnic areas are to create dedicated area for fires/braai area and/or picnic spot. The dedicated braai and picnic area near the Mpako Estuary has been selected to avoid the coastal Milkwood's and is located along the Mpako Estuary back from the bay infront ot he Hole in the Wall feature.
	So besides the conservation issues of opening up the river forest and river front for day trippers, it is actually not the optimal place to situate a picnic area because it is not the safest place to swim; and people actually prefer to picnic at Men's Beach, which a is a beautiful and usually very safe swimming beach. And much easier to get to from their vehicles.	The Coastal Dune Forest is littered with informal fires and picnic area's which often results in disturbance/ destruction of surrounding vegetation. The proposed braai and picnic area will not be located within a densely vegetated area or near ant of the Milkwood's in the coastal forest. Picnic benches and resting areas will be established at strategic locations overlooking Men's beach.
	So, as it is much closer to the existing parking bays and ablutions and is <i>actually</i> preferred by day visitors, it is without a doubt the best place to focus resources and draw people <i>away</i> from the sensitive indigenous forest area, as much as possible.	As discussed on site the proposed development has been amended following review of the area and the main braai facilities will be located at the two parking areas which will be established for day visitors. These facilities will allow visitors to enjoy the surrounding views while picnicking or braaing near to their vehicles.
	Any resources to be expended in the "Nature Reserve" should be focused on conservation and long-term mitigation measures against the dune encroachment. It may interest you to know that in the fifteen years I've been a permanent resident here, I've seen at least a dozen ancient milkwood trees blown down in storms, and many younger ones (at least twenty) were chopped down for firewood in the early years. And whereas we did put a stop to that, it is once again	The proposed developments within the "Nature Reserve" have been amended to ensure that the long-term conservation of the area is promoted. This has been achieved by limiting the level of development within the coastal dune forest, making use of existing informal pathways instead of formalised walkways and ensuring that the proposed development has minimal impact on the receiving environment and coastal vegetation. The issues surrounding the illegal collection of firewood will however be an ongoing issue within the area and can only be stopped through

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	becoming a major problem.	community awareness programmes or through enforcement of the law which falls outside of this assessment.
	Now, in all that time, I can only find three milkwood saplings that have survived and grown sufficiently high enough to be out of reach of the goats.	Noted.
	The forest is dying, and, unless we do something about it, will be gone in no time. If the entire "nature reserve" is not fenced, then at the very least there should be smaller, say, 50m x 50m incubation pens fenced off on a rotational basis over the years. (More on that another time.)	The fencing of the reserve unfortunately falls outside of the ambit of this assessment and it is recommended that the local municipality be consulted to establish if this will be achievable.
	For what it's worth, chatting to Dawn Kennedy whose family own "Pioneer Lodge" which was established here in 1904, I discovered that the "Boiling Pot" has indeed been a name used for that feature located in the Whale's Tail. I'm still somewhat bemused and sceptical, as it has been one of my favourite places on Earth, since I was a child, for solitude and watching the dassies in the rocks when they eventually come out of hiding. I guess it's a matter of perspective. From our family cottage the Whale's Tail is a pretty distinct feature:	Please note that the amended layout does not include the establishment of a viewing deck at the Boiling Pot.
	You'll notice that the hillside in the foreground is where I have marked the <i>optimal</i> picnic site on the Google Earth KMZ file. There is huge potential for picnic sites dotted around the area, if done tastefully, and hopefully with more trees for shade. And perhaps if permission is sought from, and local employment provided to the local youth, who's garden it truly is, they won't be vandalised this time.	The updated proposed development includes a dedicated braai and picnic area opposite the hillside. Furthermore, there will be benches and picnic sets places at strategic locations along the coastline (overlooking Men's beach).

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	As things stand, the local guides I have spoken to are all unanimously against any kind of tampering in their forest. At least, not without proper planning, their foreknowledge, and support.	During the initial site visit and erection of the site notices, the EAP encountered many locals within the area. All expressed interest in and welcomed the prospect of development within the area. Please note that the development does not include the establishment of walkways through the Coastal Dune Forest.
	There are a lot of issues to cover, like proper placement of pedestrian walkways where they are desperately needed, but this will have to do for a start. This is as concise a motivation as I can provide on the first critical issue, being the optimal place to lure the masses away from the critically endangered milkwood forest.	Please note that the development does not include the establishment of walkways through the Coastal Dune Forest.
	Thank you for your email. I would very definitely like to join you. Please let me know your dates and times as soon as you can, so I can make sure I'm available.	
	I will be available.	
Date: 15 04 2021 (Email) Mr Ruan Brand South African Heritage Resources Agency Heritage Officer: Maritime & Underwater Cultural Heritage	Please see attached a comment sheet for the basic assessment of the development titled: "THE PROPOSED UPGRADE AND CONSTRUCTION OF COASTAL INFRASTRUCTURE WITHIN THE KING SABATA DALINDYEBO LOCAL MUNICIPALITY (KSDLM), EASTERN CAPE: COFFEE BAY AND HOLE IN THE WALL" If you have any questions related to the comment, please do not hesitate to contact me.	Thank you for your email and comments received.
	Comments: A Consultant mentioned telephonically that there will be no work done below the high-watermark, and that a part of the development is within the floodplain of the Mpako river (Beachfront Picnic Area) and therefore might be relocated. As part of the Basic Assessment (BA), please remember that if any work is to be done below the high-water	 Please note that a Heritage Practitioner (Active Heritage) has been appointed to conduct a Heritage Impact Assessment for the proposed developments at Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall. The heritage practitioner was responsible for: Identifying the presence of cultural/ historical resources. Identifying the possible impacts on cultural/ historical sensitivity at Coffee Bay

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	mark that a case needs to be created on SAHRIS (sahris.sahra.org.za) to provide the South African Heritage Resources Authority (SAHRA) with an opportunity to comment. SAHRA does not accept emailed documents or hard-copy documents.	 and Hole in the Wall. Managing all applications and submissions to SAHRIS for comment.
	During the BA, please also consider that when working in the dunes, that heritage material, such as historical wreckage, often washes up and becomes buried within dunes. Therefore, the development must consider the potential of finding heritage resources within the dunes as part of the general Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA). Please note that if any materials are found that these must be reported to the relevant authority in line with section 35(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act, No 25 of 1999 (NHRA).	Thank you for the comment. The heritage practitioner conducted a Heritage Impact Assessment and concluded that heritage resources, shell middens, bone fragments etc. were not present at both Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall. If any artefacts and/or remains are encountered during construction, a chance find protocol has been included into the Environmental Management Programme (EMPr) for the contractor to abide by.
	If you have any further queries related to this comment, please do not hesitate to contact me.	
Date: 26 04 2021 (Email) Mr Jeff Brown I&AP/Property owner	Please find attached my initial comments covering most of what we discussed.	
	Thank you for meeting with me and doing a site tour last week.	
	For the record, I'd like to let everyone on the list know that you have kindly accepted all input through this mailing list as part of the participation process. And that you have also agreed to accept late submissions and comments due to the sensitivity of the area, and the initially somewhat confused project proposal. (Apologies. It had to be said. But I have realised that it was impossible for outsiders to even begin to know what they don't know about the area,) I look forward to your detailed feedback and concept plans.	The mailing database is still active and the EAP welcomes all I&AP comments. The amended concept plans/ layouts can be found in Appendix C of the Basic Assessment Report.
	RE: Proposed Upgrade &c of Tourist Facilities in Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall	
	Please find my initial comments and suggestions below.	
	Hole in the Wall	

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	(Page 8) 4.2.2.1 "The paving of the existing access road to access the launch site (approximately 100 m in length)."	
	Point of clarification: this is stated as measuring approximately 300 metres on the previous page (4.2.1). It would be far preferable to pave the entire \pm 300 m length of the road up to the first parking area.	Please note that the proposed development will include the refurbishment of the existing road adjacent to the Hole in the Wall Hotel. The refurbishment will start at the boom gate and end at the boat launch site (+- 100 m in length). Also, please note that the road will not be "paved", instead, it will be refurbished using grass blocks.
	There is a real need for a footbridge across the stream in front of the hotel, which is polluted by hotel effluent, yet is impossible to cross without getting one's feet wet.	MBB was approached to investigate the addition of a footbridge across the Ntonjane Estuary, however, this proposed component has not been included in the financial provisions by the DFFE.
	The walkway bridge across the hotel drainage ditch is dilapidated and a serious potential hazard for all who cross it. This is the only access route for local community members.	Noted. Please refer to the above comment.
	(Pg 9) 4.2.2.2 Hole in the Wall Parking Areas, Walkway and Viewing Deck	
	" the first new parking area to be constructed near the intersection of Hole in the Wall View Drive and Hole in the Wall Cottage Drive (approximately 200 m2 in size)"	The amended project layout includes the addition of two dedicated parking areas. Each parking area will have a footprint of approximately 1,600m ² . Parking area 01 will be positioned directly adjacent to the existing ablution block and will include a formalised walkway accessing the ablution facilities.
	This is the main parking area where the majority of day visitors	The amended project layout has addressed this concern and will now include

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	actually park, above Men's Beach, and it should therefore be the bigger parking area; and should have braai stands and a footbridge to cross over to the existing ablution block. The reality is that for large parts of the year around, the river does not have a beach or safe swimming area, and day visitors tend to congregate at and around Men's Beach, as the most popular swimming beach and picnic area.	benches and picnic sets at strategic locations overlooking Men's beach. These spots will also be equipped with waste receptacles to collect and manage pollution.
	The nearby ablutions have never been inaugurated or opened to the public as there is no running water. A plan should be concluded in this project for the ablutions to be connected to the main municipal water pipe some 450 m up, following the watercourse (white line in image below):	The commissioning of the existing ablution facilities falls under the jurisdiction and responsibility of the KSDLM and will not be included in the current BA process. The EAP has however notified the municipality of your comment provided.
	Middelers JTS Pical: site 20 Pical:	
	"The second parking area will be located to access the beachfront picnic area (approximately 400 m2 in size)." This has not been thought through at all, as there is no easy access to the riverfront from this proposed 'parking area' on the hilltop overlooking Hole in the Wall. The fact is it's a very steep hill and people will always need to park nearer the watercourse and access pathway, some 300 metres before this ill-advised site.	The second dedicated parking area will be located closer to the turning circle and will serve to overlook the Hole in the Wall feature. The parking areas will include braai and picnic facilities for tourists and beach goers to enjoy. The second parking area will not serve to provide hikers/ beach goers access to the Hole in the Wall and beach area. Please note that the proposed parking area has also been located on the inland side of the road to ensure that vehicles are not visible from Hole in the Wall which would detract from sense of place. Similarly, no street lights will be provided along this section of road.

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	Furthermore, the hilltop near the turning circle is in the teeth of the prevailing northeast and southwest winds and in the wind compression zone. Which means that the wind can be up to two and a half times its actual speed, and so the area is therefore uncomfortably exposed; litter will blow into the cliff forest, the river, and surrounds;	Noted. The proposed parking area will not be positioned at the turning circle.
	Any kind of parking area in this location will be inviting further inappropriate developments in future;	Noted.
	A far better location for the parking area is close to the only usable footpath to the river and forest, as illustrated here:	Dedicated parking area no.02 will be established within this region.
	The lower 10 metres or so of the footpath is virtually impassable when wet, and requires a short staircase, with possibly a small deck and viewing benches discretely overlooking the forest canopy.	As per the amended layout a small viewing deck and section of formalised pathway will be provided at this section where the footpath is impassable when wet. The viewing desk will also be provided with a picnic bench for visitors to have a rest when walking up the hill. Please refer to Appendix A for the proposed infrastructure layout plan for Hole in the Wall.
	Point of clarity: 4.2.2.3 Beach View Picnic Area is the "Men's Beach" Picnic Area, discussed in 4.2.2.2 above, as the place where the majority of day visitors congregate.	Noted. Infrastructure has been provided at this area to cater for these visitors.
	Point of clarity: 4.2.2.4 Beachfront Picnic Area is the riverfront and is within Nature Reserve 16-3-1 and should therefore not have formalised braai facilities which, in addition to being used for firewood will be a fire hazard for the milkwood trees, which are a protected species.	The proposed braai and picnic area within the Nature Reserve has been strategically located in an area of previous disturbance and not close to and of the Milkwood's located within the coastal forest. The proposed development aims to reduce the occurrence of informal fires through the provision of a dedicated braai

Name and Date	Comment	Response
		and picnic area.
	No raised walkways are necessary, as the forest paths are delightful as they are;	Noted. The new proposal does not include any formalised walkways through the Coastal Dune Forest.
	Strategically placed benches and waste receptacles (not in photo view of the riverfront and attraction, please!) will be appreciated and well used;	Noted. As per your suggestion, benches and waste receptacles will be strategically placed along the existing footpaths, tracks, and hiking trials, as well as areas overlooking Men's beach and at each braai and picnic area.
	Generally speaking, the riverfront is too far away from the parking area for most people to contemplate actually braaiing there. Keeping braai facilities and picnic sites near the parking area in the watercourse valley will minimise the inevitable litter being blown into sensitive areas;	Noted. The dedicated parking areas will be equipped with braai and picnic facilities.
	This area will also be suitable for ablutions when the need arises, as it is only 300 metres from the municipal water pipe yet will be out of view from the attraction while still being easily accessible for day visitors to the riverfront.	Dedicated parking area no.01 will be located directly adjacent to the existing ablution facilities.
	 4.2.2.5 Walkway Rest Areas -No formalisation of footpaths is required; -Strategically placed benches and waste receptacles (not in photo view of the riverfront and attraction, please!) will be appreciated and well used. 	Noted. As per your suggestion, the proposed development will not include the establishment of walkways through the Coastal Dune Forest. Tourists, beach goers and pedestrians will be encouraged to use the existing footpaths, tracks, and hiking trails to navigate throughout the area. Resting areas and bins will be strategically located along these existing footpaths, tracks, and hiking trails.
	 4.2.2.6 Boiling Pot Viewing Deck -It is strongly inadvisable to do anything here! -Any manmade deck built in this area will be a detraction from the natural beauty, sense of place, and abundant natural features! -Any deck placed over the area will impact the dassie colony very negatively; -The grassy verge overlooking the dassies' breeding ground is soft 	Noted. Thank you for your comments and concerns. Please note that the inidial layout has been amended following further review of the site and discussions with the appointed specialists and I&APs. The new proposal will not include the establishment and/or placement or viewing decks or formalised walkways at the Boiling Pot. Tourists, beach goers and hikers are encouraged to use the existing footpaths, tracks and hiking trails to access the Boiling Pot and other areas of interest.
	and inviting, and any benches or manmade contrivances will be visible from the view sites;The location is very accessible with its current footpaths;	

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	-Signage is not required, beyond possible hand carved direction markers to encourage people to stay on the path. Possibly (hopefully) outsourced to local craftsmen.	Noted. This will be investigated during the construction phase of the development.
	With regards to redundant signage at the attractions, which will become degraded quickly, or even vandalised, it would be a nice idea to have a semi 3-D contour relief sculpture at the first parking area with an X marks the spot, and then the pathways and routes outlined between the attractions and rest areas. Rough illustration:	Noted. MBB was requested to comment on this proposal. However, given the current budget allocation, a task of this undertaking cannot be included into the proposed scope of works. The proposed development will include development signage at the entrance to each development node at Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall.
	I look forward to your detailed feedback, and I reserve my right to make further comments as needed in case of omission.	Noted. Thank you for your comments and concerns raised to date. Please provide additional comments for the circulation of the Draft BAR.
Date: 29 04 2021 (Email) Ms Glenda Esemang Department of Tourism		Kindly find attached hereto Hole in The Wall - Coffee Bay Announcement Period documents.
		Please note that we have now added you to the Project database.