PROPOSED REFURBISHMENT AND CONSTRUCTION OF COASTAL INFRASTRUCTURE WITHIN THE KING SABATA DALINDYEBO LOCAL MUNICIPALITY (KSDLM), COFFEE BAY, EASTERN CAPE

PROJECT ANNOUNCEMENT PERIOD (23 MARCH 2021 – 26 APRIL 2021)

COMMENTS AND RESPONSES

Name	Organisation
Mr Bossie Bosman	Inchopo Coastal Developments (Pty) Ltd / I&AP
Mr Ruan Brand	South African Heritage Resources Agency – Heritage Officer: Maritime & Underwater Cultural Heritage
Mr Jeff Brown	I&AP – Property owner
Department of Environment, Forestry & Fisheries	Department of Environment, Forestry & Fisheries – Oceans & Coasts
Ms Glenda Esemang	Department of Tourism
Ms F Mbam	Department of Tourism
Dr Ben Gaunt	I&AP – Property owner
Mr Mike Griessel	I&AP – Property owner
Mr Rory Haschick	Eastern Cape Development Corporation - Sector Specialist: Renewable Energy & Tourism
Mr Peter Lowe	I&AP
Mr David Malherbe	I&AP – Property owner
Mr Sibusiso Owen Ndidi	Eastern Cape Environmental Network – Provincial Co-ordinator
Mamakomoreng Nkhasi-Lesaoana	South African Heritage Resources Agency – Heritage Officer
Ms Onesimo Notobelo	Department of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment
Mr Qondile Paliso	DEDEAT – Eastern Cape
Mr. Bongani Figlan	DEDEAT – Eastern Cape
Mr Greg Quin	I&AP – Property owner
Ms Gloria Ramabitle	Iliso Lamatshezi Development Forum – Deputy Chairperson
Olwetu Vongwe	Department of Water and Sanitation – Eastern Cape

Name and Date	Comment	Response
Date: 18 03 2021 (Email) Mr Qondile Paliso Department of Economic Development, Environmental Affairs & Tourism - Eastern Cape	Thank you, I will look through it and then inform you if there is anything missing.	 Kindly find attached the following for the Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall pre-application meeting that was held on Wednesday, 03 March 2021: 1. A copy of the pre-application meeting minutes. Please review, confirm and approve the meeting minutes (or advise if it requires any amendments). 2. A copy of the Public Participation Programme. Please review, confirm and approve the programme for implementation. Please contact me should you require any other information. Date: 08 04 2021 As per your request, kindly find attached a copy of the pre-application minutes and proposed public participation programme for your review and approval. Please let me know if you require anything else.
Date: 23 03 2021 (Email) Department of Environment, Forestry & Fisheries – Oceans & Coasts	Received, thank you.	This email serves to inform you that the Announcement Period documents for the above-mentioned project has been loaded onto your departments link: <u>https://environmentza-</u> <u>my.sharepoint.com/:f:/g/personal/fditinti_environment_gov_za/EnSN8C845udHg2gH</u> <u>3dJRQmQBy3sLII3PYMHKKRA9OucVVA?e=zXcx7a</u> Please advise if you have received the documents. Thank you for your acknowledgement.
Date: 23 03 2021 (Email) Mr Rory Haschick Eastern Cape Development Corporation Sector Specialist: Renewable Energy & Tourism	Please register me as IAP for the BA for upgrade of coastal infrastructure in KSD as per advert in DD today and send me all the relevant BID's. Thank you.	Thank you for your email. Please find the attached BID documents and Announcement letter as requested. ACER has also added you to the project database.
Date: 23 03 2021 (Email) Mr David Malherbe I&AP/Property owner	Please can I be registered an interested and affected party for the BA for proposed Upgrade & construction by KSD municipality in the Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall area.	Thank you for your email. Find attached the Announcement letter and BID documents for above-mentioned. ACER has added you to the project database as requested.

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	Please can you confirm receipt of this email.	Received
	Thanks for registering me and sending me the info.	You are welcome.
	Do you guys work with Simon - forgot his surname? He was down here research for something similar, particularly from an environmental perspective.	Yes you are correct Simon Bundy was down in the area recently to undertake the dune assessment and to look at the positioning of the proposed infrastructure.
	I have been here for nearly 22 years, and have a successful tourism business (Coffee Shack backpackers Lodge), our local community are 40% shareholders.	
	Environmental issues have been something that obviously have a direct impact on tourism in Coffee Bay. If I can be of assistance, please do not hesitate to contact me, I have decent knowledge and experience of this area. A few comments, having read your document:	ACER has forwarded your email on to the project engineers for their information and as part of the environmental authorisation process we will look at the issues you have raised to try and find a robust, workable solution to improve the tourism experience while ensuring protection of the coastal environment including the dune forest.
	 I think the plan does not cater for the volume of traffic that visits Coffee Bay beach, year round. Infrastructure has to be robust. 	MBB has amended the initial proposal to accommodate additional parking bays at Coffee Bay. The existing road verge (opposite the Nenga River Lodge) will be widened to include additional parking bays. The parking areas will be clearly demarcated and will include the necessary parking signage.
	2. The toilets have never worked, as the conservancy tanks are often below water level, and are hence full, with ground water. This also depends on the state of the Nenga Lagoon. I think there is going to have to have more than renovation to get the toilets working. The toilets are probably about 25 years old and have never been used, because of bad design, conservancy tanks etc. And then who is going to empty them, Mthatha is the nearest waste water treatment plant, 1 1/2 hours away. That said having toilets in an imperative.	A flood line assessment was undertaken to determine the position of the existing ablution facility in relation to the 1:50 and 1:100 year flood line levels. The findings of the study have indicated that the existing facilities (and associated infrastructure) is located within these flood lines and are susceptible to flood events after high rainfall periods. In an attempt to mitigate this potential impact, the proposed development was amended to decommission the existing facilities and reposition it further north. The new ablution blocks will include a larger underground conservancy tank (6,000-I) to cater for the potential increase in brown and grey water associated with the new ablution blocks. The Municipality will be tasked with the frequent maintenance of the facility and associated infrastructure (including the underground conservancy tank).

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	3. Raised walk ways are not going to work, the existing deck to nowhere, broke quickly and there is no one to repair, this is not likely to change any time soon. Laying the deck planks directly on the dune, linked by wire or something is cheaper, less prone to damage. As I am sure you are aware this is done in many parts of the world, France, Western Cape, Australia	The proposed walkways will be strategically positioned to minimise its degradation. The dune and coastal specialist has recommended preferred locations for the installation of the formalised walkways. The position of the walkways and viewing deck in the initial proposal was placed towards the south (the specialist has subsequently identified that this section of the dune cordon is transgressive in nature and not suitable for the positioning of walkways and viewing decks). The amended layout has repositioned the walkways and viewing deck further north along the dune cordon (the northern section of the dune cordon is stable and unlikely to become eroded).
	 I am very sceptical about the viewing deck, the dune and beach is very regressive at the moment, and the viewing deck will not last long, most likely supports will be eroded away by the wind. 	The three proposed viewing decks have been repositioned further north to accommodate the transgressive dune conditions. Furthermore, these viewing decks will be positioned further back from the beach within the coastal dune vegetation. The coastal dune cordon is more stable in this area and surrounding vegetation will provide natural protection from increased wind erosion and the unstable soil conditions.
	5. The dune forest on each side of any board walk and viewing areas, needs to have a low fence, with signage to discourage walking in the dune forest. The dune forest has decreased by about 40% in size, in the last 20 years, largely due to too much traffic in the dune forest and the demand for first wood.	The proposed development will include the installation of appropriate signage to guide pedestrians through the dune habitat. The proposed walkways will include balustrades to ensure that pedestrians do not deviate off the Walkways. To minimise the creation of informal paths within the dune cordon the three viewing decks will be linked with a dedicated poly-timber walkway.
	 Fire wood is a problem, especially for day visitors, which is the majority of people to the area. The easiest place to get is just from the nearest trees, which are the dune forest. Some thought needs to be given to this, else the dune forest will continue to disappear at an even quicker rate. 	Illegal firewood collection is a common problem being faced along the coastline. The proposed development aims to conserve the existing dune vegetation through the formalisation of beach and coastal access. Local authorities are also urged to monitor the removal and/or destruction of trees for firewood and other uses. Furthermore, the EAP suggests that the KSDLM host community campaigns that highlight the importance of preserving the fauna and flora associated with the coastline.
	7. Playground is a great idea -and is in need. I think the idea of a sand pit next to the beach has not been thought through, it is going to get dirty quickly, fleas and sand fleas become big problem in this area. Rather build another jungle gym or something.	The playground area aims to provide children with a safe environment that induces play, whilst providing parents an opportunity to monitor their kids from the dedicated braai and picnic areas. The playground area will include a jungle gym and, under the discretion of the appointed contractor, may include a sandpit for smaller children.

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	8. Life savers shelters - is not in a good position, it needs to be nearer the centre of the beach, the safer section of the beach is down the middle, there is more current and dangerous rips on the south end I hope it will be better than what is in the picture, else that is a step backwards from the current shelter.	Due to the transgressive nature of the frontal dune cordon at Coffee Bay, the existing lifeguard tower is susceptible to weathering and erosion and therefore requires replacement. The new lifeguard tower will be positioned further inland, protected by the surrounding dune vegetation. The beach and coastal specialist recommended that the new lifeguard tower be positioned closer to the formalised walkway and on the beach if possible.
	9. There needs to be an additional path through the dune further down the beach. People will naturally take the shortest path, they will not walk around.	Each viewing deck will be equipped and/or fitted with access to the beach front. The three viewing decks will also be linked by a formalised walkway with balustrades at appropriate sections.
	10. Paths down to the beach, need to go the whole way down to the high tide mark, else the dune and dune forest will continue to get flatted and destroyed due to all the traffic.	The proposed walkways to access the beach will extend down to the beach in order to limit disturbances to the coastal dune cordon.
	11. I do not think the walk way is a good idea, the dune forest asI have mentioned is so damaged and regressive already.This just provides more opportunity for visitors to climb offthe path onto the dune and dune forest.	Your comment is noted. Please note that the formalised walkways will be equipped with balustrades, which will significantly reduce informal access to the dune cordon by confining visitors to the walkways.
	I hope that all makes sense, please do not hesitate to contact me if you need further info or if I can be of assistance. Thank you for the feedback.	Thank you for your comment and willingness to participate. Please note that further comments are also welcomed during the comment period for the Draft Basic Assessment Report.
Date: 24 03 2021 (Email) Olwetu Vongwe Department of Water and Sanitation – Eastern Cape	The Department of Water and Sanitation would like to register as an Interested & Affected Party. The Background Information Document (BID) has been circulated within the Department's Operational Units for comments. These comments will reach you on or before 26 April 2021.	Thank you for your email. The Department of Water and Sanitation have been added to the projects database.
Date: 25 03 2021 (Email) Mr Jeff Brown I&AP/Property owner	Seems my email from XXX , requesting to be added as an I&AP, was not received. Please register me as an I&AP.	ACER has received your email and as discussed, please see the attached project notification documents which have been sent to you.

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	Received, thank you.	
Date: 25 03 2021 (Email) Mr Greg Quin I&AP/Property owner	Kindly register me as an interested/affected person for the project: KSD upgrade Coffee Bay/Hole in the Wall.	Thank you for your email. ACER has added you to the projects database. Find attached the announcement documents for your review and comment.
	I am a property owner at Hole in the Wall. Your assistance will be appreciated. G M Quin	
Date: 28 03 2021 (Email)	Please register me as an I.A.P. in respect of the 'current BID doc' at	Thank you for your email. ACER has registered you on the project database.
Mr Peter Lowe – I&AP	Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall - Peter Lowe (No. 1 Hole in the Wall).	Please find attached Announcement documents for your review and comment.
	We reserve all rights in this regard.	
Date: 28 03 2021 (Email)	Document received.	Thank you for your acknowledgement.
Mr Bongani Figlan		
DEDEA - Eastern Cape		
Date: 29 03 2021 (Email)	Many thanks.	Thank you for your call. As discussed, find attached the Announcement documents
Mr Bossie Bosman		for the above-mentioned project. ACER has added you to the project database.
Inchopo Coastal		
Developments (Pty) Ltd I&AP		
Date: 29 03 2021 (Email)	I would like to register as an I&AP for Coffee Bay Hole in the Wall	Thank you for your email. ACER has registered you on the project database.
Mr Mike Griessel – I&AP	project.	Please find attached the Announcement documents for the project for your review and comment.
	Michael Griessel,	
Date: 30 03 2021	Mr Ritilili's e-mail address is XXXXXX kindly copy our secretary as	Thank you for your email and details received. ACER has added Mr Ritilili and Ms
Ms Gloria Ramabitle	well Ms Linah Nani, ID Number XXXXX, cell XXXXXX e-mail: XXXXXX	Nani to the project database.
Iliso Lamatshezi		
Development Forum		
Deputy Chairperson		
Date: 09 04 2021 (Email)	I trust this email will find you in good health, this communique serves	Thank you for your email and information received. ACER has registered the
Mr Sibusiso Owen Ndidi	to register the Eastern Cape Environmental Network as an interested	Eastern Cape Environmental Network as an interested and affected party.
Eastern Cape	and affected party. The eastern Cape Environmental Network was	
Environmental Network	established in 2004, it's a network with over 60 organizations whose	
Provincial Co-ordinator	primary mandate is lobby and advocacy on social and environmental injustices. ECEN has a footprint in all the regions of the Eastern Cape	

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	and beyond.	
	Hoping that this email did manage to serve its massive role	
Date: 28 03 2021 (Email) Dr Ben Gaunt – I&AP	Please register me as an affected party so that my voice can be recorded objecting to the rubber-stamped destruction of genuine beauty.	Thank you for your email and comments received. ACER has now registered you on the projects database. Please find attached Announcement documents for your review and comment.
	While not all the plans you have been appointed as consultants to oversee are disastrous, the number 6 picnic area at the Hole is completely insane. If a company with the word Environmental in its name is happy to be associated with the bulldozing of old growth milkwood forest and its replacement with concrete and litter, then the industry has sunk to new lows.	Please note that the project description has been amended since the release of the Background Information Document. Given the sensitivity of the area, the EAP undertook an additional site visit to determine possible alternatives to the initial design layout. Following consultation between I&AP's, MBB and DFFE, the proposed development has been amended. The new layout does not include formalised walkways through milkwood forests, furthermore, the proposal does not intend to remove or destroy any vegetation on site which can be avoided through design changes.
	Nevertheless, I wish to be kept informed.	Thank you for your comments and concerns. Please provide additional comments after your review of the Draft Basic Assessment Report.
Date: 10 04 2021 (Email) Dr Ben Gaunt I&AP / Property owner	Please could you clarify what is meant by "initial comments during project announcement" - for which there is a closing date of 26 April 2021.	Please take note that project announcement forms part of the Public Participation Process as outlined in the EIA Regulations (GNR 326 Chapter 6, as amended on the 7 April 2017).
	Initial as opposed to what? Is this the main window to comment and object or are there further windows once the "developers" have a more concrete plan, if you'll excuse the rather dark-humoured pun.	The main purpose of the project announcement period is to obtain registrations for possible Interested and Affected Parties (I & AP's). This period also affords I&AP's the chance to comment on the documents as found in the circulated Announcement documents. I&AP's have until the 26 th of April 2021 to confirm their registration for involvement in the Basic Assessment Process (BA).
		In the interim, the Environmental Assessment Practitioner (EAP) is compiling a Basic Assessment Report (BAR) for the proposed developments at Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall. Once the BAR is finalised, a copy of the document will be submitted to the competent authority (Eastern Cape Department of Economic Development, Environmental Affairs and Tourism – DEDEAT) for comment. A copy of the report will also be circulated to all registered I&APs for comment.
		Just to confirm, the project announcement period is to inform the public and relevant

Name and Date	Comment	Response
		authorities of the proposed development and allow interested and affected parties to register on the project database. The 30-day commenting and review period for the BAR will also allow an opportunity for I&AP's and other stakeholders to comment.
	Thank you for the clarity.	ACER trusts this clarifies this query.
Date: 15 04 2021 (Email) Mr Jeff Brown I&AP/Property owner	I don't know if anyone has told you this already, and I don't want you to be blindsided:	Thank you for your email and comment.
	The Coffee Bay ablutions were never inaugurated or opened to the public as the septic tank/s are within the 50-year flood line and <i>below the water table</i> .	Noted. A pre-application meeting will be held with the Department of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation (DHSWS) to discuss the necessary legislated requirements for the proposed relocation of the existing ablution facilities.
	I was told of this by my former boss and mentor, Dr Calvo-Ugarteburu (Gugu) who ran the Mussel Rehabilitation Project in Coffee Bay for many years. I've also confirmed it with the owners of Coffee Shack.	Noted.
	Needs a serious rethink. Demolition and extending the picnic sites into that space is probably the only option. But where to put the ablutions is another thing altogether.	The project has been revised and will now include the decommissioning of the existing ablution facility. Due to its placement within the 1:50 and 1:100 year flood levels and its susceptibility to flooding, it was recommended that the existing facility be relocated further north. The location of the new facility will take into account the potential for flooding and will include the appropriate storm water infrastructure. The decommissioned site will be rehabilitated and repurposed as a parking area.
Date: 15 04 2021 (Email) Mr Ruan Brand South African Heritage Resources Agency Heritage Officer: Maritime & Underwater Cultural Heritage	Please see attached a comment sheet for the basic assessment of the development titled: "THE PROPOSED UPGRADE AND CONSTRUCTION OF COASTAL INFRASTRUCTURE WITHIN THE KING SABATA DALINDYEBO LOCAL MUNICIPALITY (KSDLM), EASTERN CAPE: COFFEE BAY AND HOLE IN THE WALL" If you have any questions related to the comment, please do not	Thank you for your email and comments received.
	hesitate to contact me.	
	A Consultant mentioned telephonically that there will be no work done below the high-watermark, and that a part of the development is within	Please note that a Heritage Practitioner (Active Heritage) has been appointed to conduct a Heritage Impact Assessment for the proposed developments at Coffee

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	the floodplain of the Mpako river (Beachfront Picnic Area) and therefore might be relocated. As part of the Basic Assessment (BA), please remember that if any work is to be done below the high-water mark that a case needs to be created on SAHRIS (sahris.sahra.org.za) to provide the South African Heritage Resources Authority (SAHRA) with an opportunity to comment. SAHRA does not accept emailed documents or hard-copy documents.	 Bay and Hole in the Wall. The heritage practitioner was responsible for: Identifying the presence of cultural/ historical resources. Identifying the possible impacts on cultural/ historical sensitivity at Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall. Managing all applications and submissions to SAHRIS for comment.
	During the BA, please also consider that when working in the dunes, that heritage material, such as historical wreckage, often washes up and becomes buried within dunes. Therefore, the development must consider the potential of finding heritage resources within the dunes as part of the general Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA). Please note that if any materials are found that these must be reported to the relevant authority in line with section 35(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act, No 25 of 1999 (NHRA).	Thank you for the comment. The heritage practitioner conducted a Heritage Impact Assessment and concluded that heritage resources, shell middens, bone fragments etc. were not present at both Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall. If any artefacts and/or remains are encountered during construction, a chance find protocol has been included into the Environmental Management Programme (EMPr) for the contractor to abide by.
	If you have any further queries related to this comment, please do not hesitate to contact me.	
Date: 26 04 2021 (Email) Mr Jeff Brown I&AP/Property owner	Please find attached my initial comments covering most of what we discussed. Thank you for meeting with me and doing a site tour last week.	
	For the record, I'd like to let everyone on the list know that you have kindly accepted all input through this mailing list as part of the participation process. And that you have also agreed to accept late submissions and comments due to the sensitivity of the area, and the initially somewhat confused project proposal. (Apologies. It had to be said. But I have realised that it was impossible for outsiders to even begin to know what they don't know about the area,) I look forward to your detailed feedback and concept plans.	The mailing database is still active and the EAP welcomes all I&AP comments. The amended concept plans/ layouts can be found in Appendix C of the Basic Assessment Report.
	RE: Proposed Upgrade & construction of Tourist Facilities in Coffee Bay and Hole in the Wall	

Name and Date	Comment	Response
	Please find my initial comments and suggestions below.	
	Coffee Bay	
	The ablutions which were built in the late 1990's / early 2000's and refurbished as an EPWP project under DEAT in 2010 were never inaugurated or opened to the public as the septic tank is below the water table and within the 50 year flood line. The ablutions need to be demolished entirely and the eyesore replaced with picnic sites and, possibly, the proposed children's playground. As an alternative it may be necessary to install a few self-composting toilets or long drops at strategic locations. Possibly rinse off shower booths, too, as one finds on popular city beaches.	The project has been revised and will now include the decommissioning of the existing ablution facility. Due to its placement within the 1:50 and 1:100 year flood levels and its susceptibility to flooding, it was recommended that the existing facility be relocated further north. The location of the new facility will take into account the potential for flooding and will include the appropriate storm water infrastructure. The new ablution blocks will also include an underground conservancy tank with an increased capacity and two above ground Jojo water storage tanks. A pre-application meeting will be held with the Department of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation (DHSWS) to discuss the necessary legislated requirements for the proposed relocation of the existing ablution facilities.
	It needs mentioning, further, that Coffee Bay desperately needs a pedestrian walkway come jogging path, rest areas, and trees planted along the main road from the Nenga River bridge into town. This would hugely improve the aesthetics and functioning of the townscape for tourists and the local populace and should actually be a far higher priority than parking lots for day visitors who contribute little or nothing to the local economy.	Thank you for your comment which ACER has passed onto the project engineers and DFFE. The proposed development will include dedicated walkways from the parking area to each viewing deck, and walkways between each viewing deck. Walkways will be fitted with balustrades to minimise informal access of deviation of these paths. Under the current contract/ proposal, funds have not been allocated for the installation of jogging paths and resting areas along the main road from the Nenga River bridge as the development is aimed at the formalisation of coastal access.
Date: 29 04 2021 (Email) Ms Glenda Esemang Department of Tourism	Via Telephone	Kindly find attached hereto Hole in The Wall - Coffee Bay Announcement Period documents.
		Please note that we have now added you to the Project database.
Date: 29 04 2021 (Email) Ms Onesimo Notobelo Department of	Good Day Cameroon, Can you kindly add the Department of Tourism as Interested and affected parties.	Hi Onesimo, Please note that Ms Fundiswa Mbam from the Department of Tourism has been added to the database.
Environment, Forestry & Fisheries	Regards Simo	Kind Regards.
Date: 29 08 2021 (Email) Ms F Mbam	Request for F Mbam to be included on the project database.	Good Day

Name and Date	Comment	Response
Department of Tourism		Kindly find attached hereto Hole in The Wall - Coffee Bay Announcement Period
		documents.
		Please note that we have now added you to the Project database.
		Kind regards
Date: 03 08 2021 (Email)	Good Morning Mr. Singh.	Good Day Mr. Paliso.
Mr L Maka		
King Sabata Dalindyebo	Please include the following key stakeholders on your distribution list:	Please note that the stakeholders have been added to the PPP distribution list.
Local Municipality	1. Ms. F Mbam (Department of Tourism)	
	2. Ms. R Tobia (Director of Human Settlements KSDLM)	Kind Regards
	3. Mr. O Pantshwa (Director Rural and Local Economic	
	Development)	
	Kind Regards	