

**From:** AZOLA MKOSANA  
**To:** acoassociates@gmail.com; alex.schoeman@wits.ac.za; amanda.esterhuysen@...  
**Date:** 2012/03/01 04:33 PM  
**Subject:** Bonhams SA Permit Applications

**CC:** NOLITHA NGCAI; REGINA ISAACS

Dear Permit Committee Members

Following the circulation of a permit memorandum pertaining to 9 permit applications by Bonhams SA to permanently export 12 Artworks, two permit applications were declined to export two of these artworks, please see a memorandum that was sent to you for comments on 28 February 2012.

Based on the responses of Dr. Maria van der Ryst, Dr. Alex Schoeman and Dr. John Rogers, Permit Committee approves the recommendations of the Art Panel. Please come back to me should you need any clarity in this regard.

I trust that you find this in order.

Kind regards

Azola Mkosana  
Assistant Heritage Objects Control Officer  
South African Heritage Resources Agency  
PO Box 4637, Cape Town 8000, South Africa  
E-mail: amkosana@sahra.org.za  
Phone : 27 (0)21 462 4502  
Fax : 27 (0)21 462 4509  
cell: 27 (0)73 391 7140  
Web : www.sahra.org.za

This message may contain information which is confidential, private or privileged in nature. If you are not the intended recipient, you may not peruse, use, disseminate, distribute or copy this message or file which is attached to this message.

If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately by e-mail, facsimile or telephone and thereafter return and/or destroy the original message.

Any views expressed in this communication are those of the sender except where the sender specifically states them to be

those of South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA).

Please note that the recipient must scan this email and any attached files for viruses and the like. SAHRA accepts no liability of whatever nature for any loss, liability, damage or expense resulting directly or indirectly from the access and/or downloading of any files which are attached to this e-mail message.

**From:** "David Pearce" <davidp@rockart.wits.ac.za>  
**To:** "AZOLA MKOSANA" <AMKOSANA@sahra.org.za>  
**Date:** 2012/02/28 03:18 PM  
**Subject:** RE: BONHAMS Permit Applications

Dear Azola,

I must agree with the findings of the art panel except in the case of the J. H. Pierneef painting 'Elim K.P Naby Bredasdorp' (80/12/02/019/70). The art panel finds it of "mediocre quality", but nevertheless recommends that it be retained in the republic because it depicts a settlement of historic interest. I cannot see that this is sufficient ground to refuse a permit. It is not as if this is the only known depiction of the settlement, or, indeed, even a definitive one. It is a mediocre one. I can see no grounds to refuse a permit to export this painting.

Best wishes,  
David Pearce  
Senior Researcher

Rock Art Research Institute  
University of the Witwatersrand  
Private bag 3  
2050  
South Africa

Tel.: +27 (0)11 717 6062  
Fax.: +27 (0)11 717 6069  
E-mail: davidp@rockart.wits.ac.za

-----Original Message-----

From: AZOLA MKOSANA [mailto:AMKOSANA@sahra.org.za]  
Sent: 28 February 2012 10:37 AM  
To: crassool@uwc.ac.za; acoassociates@gmail.com; johnrogers1944@gmail.com; jboshoff@iziko.org.za; rsmith@iziko.org.za; cirpat@mweb.co.za; jhosford@mweb.co.za; davidp@rockart.wits.ac.za; deano.stynder@uct.ac.za; shadreck.chirikure@uct.ac.za; Tim.Hart@uct.ac.za; vdrysmm@unisa.ac.za; vdrysmm@unisa.ac.za; coen.nienaber@up.ac.za; alex.schoeman@wits.ac.za; Amanda.Esterhuysen@wits.ac.za  
Cc: DUMISANI SIBAYI; NOLITHA NGCAI; REGINA ISAACS  
Subject: BONHAMS Permit Applications

Dear Permit Committee Members

You are kindly asked to comment on the attached permit applications by 01 March 2011. Please note that your comments are the integral part of permitting procedure.

Kind regards

Azola Mkosana  
Assistant Heritage Objects Control Officer South African Heritage Resources  
Agency PO Box 4637, Cape Town 8000, South Africa  
E-mail: amkosana@sahra.org.za  
Phone : 27 (0)21 462 4502

Fax : 27 (0)21 462 4509  
cell: 27 (0)73 391 7140  
Web : [www.sahra.org.za](http://www.sahra.org.za)

This message may contain information which is confidential, private or privileged in nature. If you are not the intended recipient, you may not peruse, use, disseminate, distribute or copy this message or file which is attached to this message.

If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately by e-mail, facsimile or telephone and thereafter return and/or destroy the original message.

Any views expressed in this communication are those of the sender except where the sender specifically states them to be those of South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA).

Please note that the recipient must scan this email and any attached files for viruses and the like. SAHRA accepts no liability of whatever nature for any loss, liability, damage or expense resulting directly or indirectly from the access and/or downloading of any files which are attached to this e-mail message.

`<html><p><font face = "verdana" size = "0.8" color = "navy">`This communication is intended for the addressee only. It is confidential. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately and destroy the original message. You may not copy or disseminate this communication without the permission of the University. Only authorized signatories are competent to enter into agreements on behalf of the University and recipients are thus advised that the content of this message may not be legally binding on the University and may contain the personal views and opinions of the author, which are not necessarily the views and opinions of The University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. All agreements between the University and outsiders are subject to South African Law unless the University agrees in writing to the contrary.`</font></p></html>`

**From:** "Van der Ryst, Maria" <Vdrysmm@unisa.ac.za>  
**To:** AZOLA MKOSANA <AMKOSANA@sahra.org.za>  
**Date:** 2012/02/29 08:10 AM  
**Subject:** RE: BONHAMS Permit Applications

This message (and attachments) is subject to restrictions and a disclaimer. Please refer to <http://www.unisa.ac.za/disclaimer> for full details.

1. Permit no: 80/12/02/017/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/330  
Artwork Owner: Mr. & Mrs. P. Goetsch

Recommendations: Permit Approved: According to experts, this work of art does not meet the criteria of National Heritage significance, so a permit can be issued.  
RECOMMENDATIONS SUPPORTED

2. Permit no: 80/12/02/016/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/331  
Artworks Owner: Ms S.E. Jaffe

Recommendations: Permit Approved: According to experts, this work of art does not meet the criteria of National Heritage significance, so a permit can be issued.  
RECOMMENDATIONS SUPPORTED

3. Permit no: 80/12/02/017/70 File No: 3/3/8/1/4/322  
Artwork Owner: Mr. Matthew McElligoton

Recommendations: Permit Approved: According to experts, this work of art is not of heritage value, so a permit can be issued.  
RECOMMENDATIONS SUPPORTED

4. Permit no: 80/12/02/018/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/333  
Artwork Owner: Mr. H.P de Jager

Recommendations: Permit Approved: According to experts, this work of art is not of heritage value, so a permit can be issued.  
RECOMMENDATIONS SUPPORTED

5. Permit no: 80/12/02/019/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/334  
Artwork Owner: Mr. Aaron Stanger

Recommendations: Permit Declined.  
RECOMMENDATIONS SUPPORTED

6. Permit no: 80/12/02/020/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/335  
Artwork Owner: Mrs. Ruth Bernstein

Recommendations: Permit Declined.  
RECOMMENDATIONS SUPPORTED

7. Permit no: 80/12/02/021/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/336  
Artwork Owner: Mrs. Brendalyn Stempel

Recommendations: Permit Approved:  
RECOMMENDATIONS SUPPORTED

8. Permit no: 80/12/02/022/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/337  
Artwork Owner: Professor M.A Gillman

Recommendations: Permit Approved: According to experts, the painting is not of heritage value, so a permit can be issued.  
RECOMMENDATIONS SUPPORTED

9. Permit no: 80/12/02/023/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/330

Artwork Owner: Mrs P.M. Nel  
Recommendations: Permit Approved  
RECOMMENDATIONS SUPPORTED

Dr MM van der Ryst  
Archaeology Division  
Dept of Anthropology and Archaeology  
University of South Africa  
PO Box 392  
UNISA 0003 Pretoria  
Tel +27 - (0) 12 - 429 6477 Fax +27 - (0) 12 - 429 6091  
E-mail: vdrysmm@unisa.ac.za  
<http://www.unisa.ac.za/dept/vir/index.html>

**From:** AZOLA MKOSANA  
**To:** pculverwell@telkomsa.net; pennyculverwell@telekomsa.net  
**Subject:** Bonhams SA Permits

Dear Penny

Attached are the permits for 7 permit applications that were approved by the Permit Committee, two applications were declined as I have already told you on our telephone conversation earlier this week. Please note that I'll be sending the two letters for the declined applications on Monday next week.

Once again allow me to apologise for the delays, this is due to further investigations and consultations that are done to these artworks in order to check their heritage value.

Please come back to me should you need any clarity in this regard.

Kind regards

**CC:** NOLITHA NGCAI; REGINA ISAACS

**From:** AZOLA MKOSANA  
**To:** acoassociates@gmail.com; alex.schoeman@wits.ac.za;  
amanda.esterhuysen@wits.ac.za; cirpat@mweb.co.za; coen.nienaber@up.ac.za; crassool@uwc.ac.za;  
davidp@rockart.wits.ac.za; deano.stynder@uct.ac.za; jboshoff@iziko.org.za; Jhosford@mweb.co.za;  
johnrogers1944@gmail.com; rsmith@iziko.org.za; shadreck.chirikure@uct.ac.za; tim.hart@uct.ac.za;  
vdryssmm@unisa.ac.za; vdryssmm@unisa.ac.za  
**Subject:** Bonhams SA Permit Applications

Dear Permit Committee Members

Following the circulation of a permit memorandum pertaining to 9 permit applications by Bonhams SA to permanently export 12 Artworks, two permit applications were declined to export two of these artworks, please see a memorandum that was sent to you for comments on 28 February 2012.

Based on the responses of Dr. Maria van der Ryst, Dr. Alex Schoeman and Dr. John Rogers, Permit Committee approves the recommendations of the Art Panel. Please come back to me should you need any clarity in this regard.

I trust that you find this in order.

Kind regards

**From:** "John Rogers" <johnrogers1944@gmail.com>  
**To:** "AZOLA MKOSANA" <AMKOSANA@sahra.org.za>  
**Date:** 2012/02/28 01:07 PM  
**Subject:** RE: BONHAMS Permit Applications

Dear Azola

I agree with the recommendations of the Art Panel, who have the expertise that I lack.

Yours sincerely

(Dr) John Rogers

-----Original Message-----

From: AZOLA MKOSANA [mailto:AMKOSANA@sahra.org.za]  
Sent: 28 February 2012 10:37 AM  
To: crassool@uwc.ac.za; acoassociates@gmail.com; johnrogers1944@gmail.com; jbosshoff@iziko.org.za; rsmith@iziko.org.za; cirpat@mweb.co.za; jhosford@mweb.co.za; davidp@rockart.wits.ac.za; deano.stynder@uct.ac.za; shadreck.chirikure@uct.ac.za; Tim.Hart@uct.ac.za; vdrysmm@unisa.ac.za; vdrysmm@unisa.ac.za; coen.nienaber@up.ac.za; alex.schoeman@wits.ac.za; Amanda.Esterhuysen@wits.ac.za  
Cc: DUMISANI SIBAYI; NOLITHA NGCAI; REGINA ISAACS  
Subject: BONHAMS Permit Applications

Dear Permit Committee Members

You are kindly asked to comment on the attached permit applications by 01 March 2011. Please note that your comments are the integral part of permitting procedure.

Kind regards

Azola Mkosana  
Assistant Heritage Objects Control Officer South African Heritage Resources  
Agency PO Box 4637, Cape Town 8000, South Africa  
E-mail: amkosana@sahra.org.za  
Phone : 27 (0)21 462 4502  
Fax : 27 (0)21 462 4509  
cell: 27 (0)73 391 7140  
Web : www.sahra.org.za

This message may contain information which is confidential, private or privileged in nature. If you are not the intended recipient, you may not peruse, use, disseminate, distribute or copy this message or file which is attached to this message.

If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately by e-mail, facsimile or telephone and thereafter return and/or destroy the original message.

Any views expressed in this communication are those of the sender except where the sender specifically states them to be those of South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA).



Please note that the recipient must scan this email and any attached files for viruses and the like. SAHRA accepts no liability of whatever nature for any loss, liability, damage or expense resulting directly or indirectly from the access and/or downloading of any files which are attached to this e-mail message.

**From:** "Alex Schoeman" <Alex.Schoeman@wits.ac.za>  
**To:** "AZOLA MKOSANA" <AMKOSANA@sahra.org.za>  
**Date:** 2012/02/29 11:04 AM  
**Subject:** RE: BONHAMS Permit Applications

Dear Azola,

1. Permit no: 80/12/02/017/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/330

n Artist: Jacob Hendrik Pierneef  
 n Title: "A View of Chuniespoort"

Noting the recommendation of the art panel, and further investigations I support the issuing of a permit.

2. Permit no: 80/12/02/016/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/331

n Artist: Irma Stern  
 n Title: "Portrait of a Young Indian Woman"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art does not meet the criteria of National Heritage significance, I support the issuing of a permit.

3. Permit no: 80/12/02/017/70 File No: 3/3/8/1/4/322

n Artist: Jacob Hendrick  
 n Title: "South West African Mountains"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art is not of heritage value, I support the issuing of a permit.

n Artist: Jacob Hendrik Pierneef  
 n Title: "Transvaal Scene with a Dam in the foreground"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art does not meet the criteria of National Heritage significance, I support the issuing of a permit.

n Artist: Jacob Hendrik Pierneef  
 n Title: "Landscape with Trees"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art does not meet the criteria of National Heritage significance, I support the issuing of a permit.

4. Permit no: 80/12/02/018/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/333

n Artist: Jacob Hendrik Pierneef  
 n Title: "Okahandjeberge"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art is not of heritage value, I support the issuing of a permit.

n Artist: Jacob Hendrik Pierneef

n Title: "Mountain Landscape"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art is not of heritage value, I support the issuing of a permit.

5. Permit no: 80/12/02/019/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/334

n Artist: Jacob Hendrik Pierneef  
n Title: "Elim K.P Naby Bredasdorp"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art is of heritage value because it depicts exceptionally historically important town of Elim in the Cape Province, which is linked to the history of slavery in South Africa, I do not support the issuing of an export permit. I, however, am not opposed to the sale of the artwork, provided that it does not leave the shores of South Africa.

6. Permit no: 80/12/02/020/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/335

n Artist: Irma Stern  
n Title: "Books on a Table"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art is of heritage value because both because the subject-matter is very rare for this artist and because the strength of composition and execution is an unusually clear reminder of her German Expressionist background, I do not support the issuing of an export permit.

7. Permit no: 80/12/02/021/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/336  
Artwork Owner: Mrs. Brendalyn Stempel

n Artist: Maria Magdalena (Maggie)  
Laubser  
n Title: "Farmstead with Mountains  
Beyond"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art is not of heritage value, I support the issuing of a permit.

8. Permit no: 80/12/02/022/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/337

Artwork Owner: Professor M.A Gillman

n Artist: Maria Magdalena (Maggie)  
Laubser  
n Title: "Portrait of a Lady Wearing a  
Blue Dress and  
Hat"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art is not of heritage value, I support the issuing of a permit.

9. Permit no: 80/12/02/023/70 File no: 3/3/8/1/4/330

Artwork Owner: Mrs P.M. Nel

n Artist: Pieter Hugo Naude  
n Title: "Coastal Scene near Hermanus"

Noting that the experts indicated that this work of art is not of heritage value, I support the issuing of a permit.

Regards,  
Alex

-----Original Message-----

From: AZOLA MKOSANA [mailto:AMKOSANA@sahra.org.za]

Sent: 28 February 2012 10:37 AM

To: crassool@uwc.ac.za; acoassociates@gmail.com; johnrogers1944@gmail.com;  
jboshoff@iziko.org.za; rsmith@iziko.org.za; cirpat@mweb.co.za; jhosford@mweb.co.za;  
davidp@rockart.wits.ac.za; deano.stynder@uct.ac.za; shadreck.chirikure@uct.ac.za; Tim.Hart@uct.ac.za;  
vdrysmm@unisa.ac.za; vdrysmm@unisa.ac.za; coen.nienaber@up.ac.za; Alex Schoeman; Amanda  
Esterhuysen

Cc: DUMISANI SIBAYI; NOLITHA NGCAI; REGINA ISAACS

Subject: BONHAMS Permit Applications

Dear Permit Committee Members

You are kindly asked to comment on the attached permit applications by 01 March 2011. Please note that your comments are the integral part of permitting procedure.

Kind regards

Azola Mkosana

Assistant Heritage Objects Control Officer South African Heritage Resources Agency PO Box 4637, Cape Town 8000, South Africa

E-mail: amkosana@sahra.org.za

Phone : 27 (0)21 462 4502

Fax : 27 (0)21 462 4509

cell: 27 (0)73 391 7140

Web : www.sahra.org.za

This message may contain information which is confidential, private or privileged in nature. If you are not the intended recipient, you may not peruse, use, disseminate, distribute or copy this message or file which is attached to this message.

If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately by e-mail, facsimile or telephone and thereafter return and/or destroy the original message.

Any views expressed in this communication are those of the sender except where the sender specifically states them to be those of South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA).

Please note that the recipient must scan this email and any attached files for viruses and the like. SAHRA accepts no liability of whatever nature for any loss, liability, damage or expense resulting directly or indirectly from the access and/or downloading of any files which are attached to this e-mail message.

<html><p><font face = "verdana" size = "0.8" color = "navy">This communication is intended for the addressee only. It is confidential. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately and destroy the original message. You may not copy or disseminate this communication without the permission of the University. Only authorized signatories are competent to enter into

agreements on behalf of the University and recipients are thus advised that the content of this message may not be legally binding on the University and may contain the personal views and opinions of the author, which are not necessarily the views and opinions of The University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. All agreements between the University and outsiders are subject to South African Law unless the University agrees in writing to the contrary.</font></p></html>