

9/2/217/1

Eskom Boekenhoutskloof

TO:

**ESKOM
MENLYN**

**A HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT (HIA) STUDY FOR A
NEW PROPOSED 11KV POWER LINE ON THE FARMS
BOEKENHOUTSKLOOF 284JR AND KLOPPERSBOS
128JR NORTH-EAST OF PRETORIA**

**DR JULIUS CC PISTORIUS
Archaeologist and Cultural Heritage
Management Consultant
352 Rosemary Street
Lynnwood 0081
Pretoria
Tel/ fax 012 3485668
August 2003**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Eskom intends to establish an 11kV power line from an existing power line/connecting pole on the farm Kloppersbos 128JR (in the west) to Mr Theuns Loubser's residence on the farm Boekenhoutskloof 284JR (in the east). The new power line is located approximately 35km to the northeast of Pretoria in the Cullinan area.

The new power line was divided into three stretches that were subjected to a HIA study consisting of a survey on foot.

The HIA along the three stretches of the new proposed power line revealed none of the types and ranges of heritage resources as outlined in the National Heritage Resources Act (Act No 25 of 1999) (see Box 1).

Stone tools dating from the Stone Age and remains from the Late Iron Age do occur on Mr Loubser's property on Boekenhoutskloof 284JR but these remains will not be affected by Eskom's proposed development project.

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	2
1 INTRODUCTION.....	4
2 AIM OF THIS REPORT.....	4
3 METHODOLOGY.....	6
4 THE STUDY AREA.....	6
4.1 Location	6
4.2 Brief historical context	6
5 THE HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT (HIA).....	9
<u>The 1st stretch</u>	9
<u>The 2nd stretch</u>	9
<u>The 3rd stretch</u>	10
6 HERITAGE RESOURCES NEAR THE POWER LINE CORRIDOR..	11
7 CONCLUSION.....	11

1 INTRODUCTION

This document contains the report on the results of a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) study done for Eskom's proposed new 11kV power line to be established on the farms Kloppersbos 128JR and Boekenhoutskloof 284JR in the Cullinan area to the northeast of Pretoria.

2 AIM OF THIS REPORT

Eskom intends to establish a single pole 11kV power line from an existing power line/connecting pole on Kloppersbos 128JR to Mr T. Loubser's residence on the farm Boekenhoutskloof 284JR in the Cullinan area to the northeast of Pretoria.

In order to comply with legislation, Eskom requires knowledge of the presence, relevance and the significance of any heritage resources that may occur near or in the proposed new power line corridor. Eskom needs this information in order to take pro-active measures with regard to any heritage remains that may be affected, damaged or destroyed when the proposed new power line is built. Eskom therefore commissioned me to undertake a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) of the study area to be affected by the proposed new power line corridor. The aim of the HIA study is:

- to establish whether any heritage resources do occur near or in the proposed new power line corridor and, if so, what the nature, the extent and the significance of these remains are (see Box 1);
- to determine whether such remains will be affected by the proposed development project; and
- to evaluate what appropriate actions could be taken to reduce the impact of the development activities on such remains.

**BOX 1: TYPES AND RANGES OF HERITAGE RESOURCES AS OUTLINED IN
THE NATIONAL HERITAGE RESOURCES ACT (ACT NO 25 OF 1999)**

5

The National Heritage Resources Act (Act No 25 of 1999, Art 3) outlines the following types and ranges of heritage resources that qualify as part of the national estate, namely:

- (a) *places, buildings structures and equipment of cultural significance;*
 - (b) *places to which oral traditions are attached or which are associated with living heritage;*
 - (c) *historical settlements and townscapes;*
 - (d) *landscapes and natural features of cultural significance;*
 - (e) *geological sites of scientific or cultural importance;*
 - (f) *archaeological and paleontological sites;*
 - (g) *graves and burial grounds including-*
 - (i) *ancestral graves;*
 - (ii) *royal graves and graves of traditional leaders*
 - (iii) *graves of victims of conflict*
 - (iv) *graves of individuals designated by the Minister by notice in the Gazette;*
 - (v) *historical graves and cemeteries; and*
 - (vi) *other human remains which are not covered by in terms of the Human Tissue Act, 1983 (Act No 65 of 1983)*
 - (h) *sites of significance relating to the history of slavery in South Africa;*
 - (i) *moveable objects, including -*
 - (i) *objects recovered from the soil or waters of South Africa, including archaeological and paleontological objects and material, meteorites and rare geological specimens;*
 - (ii) *objects to which oral traditions are attached or which are associated with living heritage;*
 - (iii) *ethnographic art and objects;*
 - (iv) *military objects;*
 - (v) *objects of decorative or fine art;*
 - (vi) *objects of scientific or technological interest; and*
 - (vii) *books, records, documents, photographs, positives and negatives, graphic, film or video material or sound recordings, excluding those that are public records as defined in section 1(vii) of the National Archives of South Africa Act, 1996 (Act No 43 of 1996).*
- The National Heritage Resources Act (Act No 25 of 1999, Art 3) also distinguishes nine criteria for places and objects to qualify as 'part of the national estate if they have cultural significance or other special value ...':*
- These criteria are the following:*
- (a) *its importance in the community, or pattern of South Africa's history;*
 - (b) *its possession of uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of South Africa's natural or cultural heritage;*
 - (c) *its potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of South Africa's natural or cultural heritage;*
 - (d) *its importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a particular class of South Africa's natural or cultural places or objects;*
 - (e) *its importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics valued by a community or cultural group;*
 - (f) *its importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period;*
 - (g) *its strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons;*
 - (h) *its strong or special association with the life or work of a person, group or organisation of importance in the history of South Africa;*
 - (i) *sites of significance relating to the history of slavery in South Africa.*

The study area where the proposed new power line is to be established was subjected to a survey on foot.

This study does not claim to have discovered all possible heritage resources in or near the new proposed power line corridor. Heritage resources at times appear in the most unexpected places and surveys may not detect all heritage resources in any given study area. While certain remains may simply be missed during surveys (observations), others may occur below the surface of the earth and may only be exposed once development (such as the building of the power lines) commences.

4 THE STUDY AREA

4.1 Location

Eskom's new proposed 11kV power line is located on the farms Kloppersbos 128JR and Boekenhoutskloof 284JR which are located approximately 35km to the northeast of Pretoria in the Cullinan area. These two farms are located in a mountainous area to the northeast of Pretoria, approximately 5 km to the west of the national road (573) running between Pretoria (in the southwest) and Moloto (in the northeast) (2528CB Silverton; 1:50 000).

4.2 Brief historical context

It seems as if the farm Boekenhoutskloof may have some association with the Battle of Donkerhoek, which took place between ZAR and British forces in 1900. This battle was fought over a front of 40km with Boekenhoutskloof representing the northern frontier. After the British occupied Pretoria on 5 January 1900, General Louis Botha and 5 000 men took to the mountains east of Pretoria. They confronted the British forces of Lord F. S. Roberts which numbered 14 000 men over a forty kilometre front in order to avoid being outflanked. The British executed a pincer movement from Derdepoort in the north and from the Bronberge in the south. Infantry and artillery in the

centre held the main road and railway line through Donkerhoek and Pienaarspoort. After a two-day battle on 11 and 12 June 1900, and after great losses on both sides, the Boer commandos retreated. Numerous blockhouses can be seen in Pienaarspoort and Donkerhoek.

Figure 1. The new proposed 11kV power line on the farms Kloppersbos

9

128JR and Boekenhoutskloof 284JR to the northeast of Pretoria where Eskom intends to built a new power line on Mr Loubser's property.

5 THE HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT (HIA)

The new proposed 11kV power line runs from an existing power line/connecting pole on the farm Kloppersbos 128JR in the west in a near straight line across the farm Boekenhoutskloof 284JR to Mr Theuns Loubser's residence in the east. The power line will be 987m long and has two turns, one near the western starting point of the power line and the other near the eastern end of the power line.

The new proposed power line can therefore be divided into three stretches, namely:

The 1st stretch

The 1st stretch runs from the existing power line/connecting pole to the border fence between Kloppersbos 128JR and Boekenhoutskloof 284JR for approximately 120m. This stretch runs across pristine veldt and bends slightly to the northeast in order to join a two track dirt road on Boekenhoutskloof 284JR. (The 1st stretch of the power line is located on the property of Mr Loubser's neighbour).

No heritage resources were observed along this stretch.

The 2nd stretch

The 2nd stretch of the new power line runs across Boekenhoutskloof 284KR for approximately 620m along the northern shoulder of a dirt track road and parallel with a bob wire fence before bending slightly to the southeast after which it approaches Mr Loubser's residence.

No heritage resources were observed along the 2nd stretch of the new power line (see Figure 2, next page).

Figure 2 – The 2nd stretch of the new power line runs across Boekenhoutskloof 284KR and follows the shoulder of a dirt track road as well as a bob wire fence (above).

The 3rd stretch

The 3rd stretch of the new power line turns slightly to the southeast near the end of the dirt track road and runs towards Mr Loubser's residence. This part of the new power line is approximately 130 m long and runs across a disturbed piece of veldt.

No heritage resources were observed along the 3rd stretch of the new power line (see Figure 3, next page).

Figure 3 - The 3rd stretch of the new power line runs from the dirt track road across a piece of veldt to Mr. Loubser's residence.

6 HERITAGE RESOURCES NEAR THE POWER LINE CORRIDOR

Although no heritage resources of significance were observed along the three stretches of the new power line corridor, heritage resources were observed in close proximity of the new power line corridor. These resources include:

- stone tools dating from the Sangoan period (between the Early and Middle Stone Age). These tools are older than 200 000 years. A small hand axe was photographed (Figure 4). Large numbers of stone tools may occur on Klopersbos 128KR and Boekenhoutskloof 284KR considering the presence of large amounts of pebble stones on the surfaces of these farms.

- A Late Iron Age stone walled site is situated on a small plateau on a rocky reef approximately 70m to the north of the new power line corridor. This site is circular in its ground plan resembling a Zulu-styled village (*umuzi*). This site may have a historical association with Ndebele people who occupied the area during the Late Iron Age (the last three hundred years) (Figure 5).

These heritage resources will not be affected by Eskom's proposed development project.

Figures 4 and 5 – A stone tool (below) and a Late Iron Age site (far below) on Boekenhoutskloof 284KR. These remains will not be affected by Eskom's development project

7 RECOMMENDATION

The HIA done along the three stretches of the new 11kV power line running from an existing power line/connecting pole to Mr Loubser's residence has revealed none of the types and ranges of heritage resources as outlined by the National Heritage Resources Act (Act No 25 of 1999) (see Box 1).

Consequently, there is therefore no reason why Eskom should not proceed with the development project.

DR JULIUS CC PISTORIUS
Archaeologist and
Cultural Heritage Management Consultant

1

CULTURAL SITES & RESOURCES SEMINAR

Date: 3 September 2003

Presenter: Mohamed Shaheed Mathee, Centre for Contemporary Islam, UCT

Topic: Funeral Practices and Attitudes Towards Sacred Sites in Muslim Cultures

Present

M.G. Hartley, Shamil Jeppie, Seok-H Lee, Jackie Loos, Antonia Malan, Alan Morris, Noeleen Murray, Maghimada Ockards, Isabelle Ribot, Tasneem Rossouw, Cathy Salter-Jansen, Steve Townsend, Kerry Ward, David & Zulangar Worth

Apologies

James Eckley; Emmylou Rabe

Abstract

Looking across Muslim cultures the belief - giving rise to practice - in the sanctity of sacred sites (masjid and burial sites primarily) is an entrenched one. Not without qualification though. Since that belief is not only derived from the fundamental religious sources (Qur'an and the Sunnah) but equally the product of cultural labour. Islam obligates the rights of the dead - whether holy luminaries, political personalities or common folk - as a religious duty (fard kifayah) on all Muslims, though if carried out by some it falls away from the rest. These rights are: washing, enshrouding, praying over the deceased and burial. The rights of the dead fall within the broader ambit of being a focus in that the Muslim person enjoys inalienable (religious) rights from the time of being a foetus until she/he departs from this earthly life.

Very interesting though is the dynamic of how Muslim cultural practices towards the dead and specifically sacred sites have interacted with the sacred texts in justifying those practices. In short then the notion of sanctity is as much a historical product as it is an integral part of religion.

Presentation

The [usage of the] word, cultures, in the topic immediately conveys the understanding that there is no one single (monolithic) culture in Muslim attitudes and practices toward the dead in general and more specifically sacred sites - if we take sacred sites to mean the sites where pious personalities and saints are buried. Be that as it may, it would however be wrong to conclude that there is no single unitary attitude and practice that is based on the fundamental religious texts, the Qur'an and Sunnah. The Qur'an is replete with verses in the form of admonishments, reminders and exhortations on the inevitability of death.

Death is a fundamental aspect of a Muslim's belief and understanding of existence in a very broad sense. Preparation for death is something all Muslims are constantly reminded about and according to one illustrious personality in describing faith said that, amongst other things, faith is gathering ones provisions for the day of departure from this earth.

The deceased enjoy rights over the living. In fact these rights begin – in the case of illness or if death seems certain – whilst the person is still alive and on his/her last. Rights such as visiting, flattering (creating a happy atmosphere), being patient with him/her, entertaining good thoughts about the person, placing them on their right side facing Mecca, helping them to recite their declaration of faith, reading the Qur'an at the person's side and finally preparing for burial when death has finally taken over. These religiously enjoyed rights then continue, with the washing, shrouding, praying over and laying the person to rest. This process must be followed to the fullest or all those living would be

2

sinning and be held accountable by God.

The exception is made for the shahid, who died in battle to preserve the word of God. As an extreme form of honour that person is not washed, nor shrouded (except Abu Hanifa) - buried with the very blood stained clothes wherein he/she died – and not prayed over. The shahid is a martyr and has thus attained special favour with God.

Coming back to funeral practices and attitudes. Carrying out the religious injunctions regarding the dead does not mean that Muslims do differ in how they go about doing so. More so in the case of people perceived to have enjoyed a certain status of piety and even holiness. At times the deceased is only “anointed” to this position long after he has passed away; his sainthood “discovered” by some person (usually pious) in a dream. Meaning that sacred space erupts and makes itself known, merely to be discovered by us for pace cannot be chosen by us (Farouk-Alli, 2002: 64-65). Muslims live in history and are not immune to their own immediate idiosyncrasies that they develop themselves and in turn are shaped by in terms of how they bind and justify cultural practices to their religion.

Whether within lived social reality – those who is alive - as well as dealing with the dead. This dynamic then reveals the dialectic between the lived reality and the religious sources. Islam is in one word a civilization of text. It is human beings – Muslims – who interact with the text and produce certain practices – social, political, and cultural. According to Eliade one of the most outstanding characteristics of the production of sacred space – sites – is the ensuing distinction that is inevitably made between the sacred (divine texts and Muhammad’s life) and the profane (history and culture). This does not mean that all these practices are necessarily correct. Indeed there are some that are in total contradiction to the laws of Islam, both in letter and in spirit.

Our aim then is the influence of culture and customs on our funeral practices and attitudes towards sacred sites as products of cultural labour. We will see how the dynamic of power politics – from the earliest Muslims – as well as (a more later development) socio-religious class piety contributed to these attitudes and practices.

A few examples are necessary and helpful in this regard:

1) Essentially political

Tomb of Imam al-Husayn in Karbala (and by extension Damascus and Cairo)
Karbala (meaning of the word); a mixture of calamity and sacrifice giving rise to the example of a sacred site. The soil of Karbala is holy as the blood of al-Husayn and his companions we spilt thereon. As shi’as pray on a stone (or anything natural not edible) the best object is one that is made from the sand of Karbala (turbah). ** Many Shi’a scholars critical of this though reverence for al-Husayn absolute.

1) Extension of 1: political-cum religious

The shrines of the Imams in al-Madinah, ‘Askar, Najaf and Samarah.

“Between every Imam and his followers there is a covenant which should be fulfilled. It includes pilgrimage (**hajj) to the shrines... He who visits the shrines of the Holy Imams with great fervor and enthusiasm and pays attention to their objectives, will be recommended by the Imams to receive the divine blessings on the day of judgement (Muzaffar, 1985: 103). Thus visiting the shrines is a religious duty.

** Read from page 103: It establishes...

1) Religious-Gnostic

Tombs of well known saints such as ‘Abd al-Qadir al-Jalani...

1) The role and significance of sacred sites in South Africa: The Cape

- Coming of Islam in 1658 to the Cape.

3

- The role of Holy men: slaves and freemen between 17th and early 19th centuries. From after 1825 the community becomes more settled (after abolishment of slavery in 1834).
- Shrines mostly belong to people in the early history of Muslim presence at the Cape
- Exception is Durban: Sufi Saheb and Ahmad Badsha Peer (last quarter 19th century and beginning 20th century).

Function: Preserving Islam and disseminating knowledge (mosques and schools) build by Sufi Saheb.

Cape Muslim reverence of sacred sites unfortunately limited to shrines, mosques and graves (graveyards). Anything associated with the living – colonialist experience – neglected, such as the slave routes and the washing places. A poignant example was the dispute with the St. Cyprians School. Muslims – together with environmentalists as in the case of Oudekraal against Cassie Wiehahn – simply argued on the grounds of the presence of graves on that piece of land. From the perspective of resource methodology according to the principle of “Presumption of Continuity” the onus of proving the presence of graves lies squarely with Muslims. Dreams in Islamic religious tradition are not an acceptable means of evidence. Yes oral tradition does count. In this case Muslims completely ignored the slave route in other words did not regard it as a sacred site deserving of being claimed as heritage. The reason possibly not wanting anything to do with slave ancestry which was a social and in the case of Muslims at the Cape a European colonialist product. We see the role of class on conferring religious and spiritual value on potential sacred sites.

Brief look at the shrine of Tuan Yusuf – the father of Islam at the Cape – is quite intriguing.

- i) The plaque at the tomb laid acknowledging the reign of his Majesty King George the Fifth (1925)
- ii) At the door of the shrine sponsored by Suharto ex-dictator of Indonesia (1997)
- iii) The area all surrounded by canons, the symbols of colonialists hegemony
- j) A large Coca-cola poster.

General Funeral Practices

At Muslim burials and how they differ from place to place and in terms of schools of law.

Example: Cape vis-à-vis the North.

- Shafi'i (talqin) vis-à-vis Hanafi (no talqin)
- Making additional du'a(s) after the official religious designated prayers (Cape)
- No additional supplications (North)
- Funeral prayers at the mosque (shafi'i / Cape)
- Funeral Prayers only at the cemetery mosque not allowed – (Hanafi / North).
- The practice of seven nights, Forty nights (innovations).

Discussion

M.Hartley. High Level Road incident [selling off of burial ground for redevelopment in late 70s] – sheikhs believed to have taken the money for themselves.

S.Jeppie. Can burial sites be developed?

S.Matheo. Islamic law considers burial sites as sacred. Not clear about what happens with old graves. When in Egypt, stayed in hostel built over graveyard. Some people have been moved from one place to another. The person has passed on. However, visiting graveyards is commendable behaviour.

Z.Worth. Referring to case of Prestwich Place burial ground. What are rights of dead over living? - 'recently dead' have priority. Long-dead people may be different. What is right of those dead from myself as a living Muslim? How can one identify Muslim burials?

SM. Law has not addressed this. Could do symbolic rituals?

ZW. But is a common ritual adequate for an individual's obligations?

SM. Should not wait for authority to act, but find an answer from scholars. Perform a ritual for all burials – not just Muslims. This has a deep existential meaning.

4

N.Murray. Matters of interpretations – in both sacred/profane contexts. History is also in the present, for example the common obsession with elite genealogies. Mixed nature of Cape colonial context had had and needs more long debate. St Cyprians School context was a 'landscape of burial' rather than individual graves. SAHRA is avoiding these 'difficult' histories in favour of promoting 'happy' history.

SM. Critical Muslim perspective must be developed. Religious injunctions – law- says once you are buried that is it. Monumentalising 'Grave of Prophet' is not necessary – it is how you live your life. Sacred sites are 'invented' and now need critical assessment – their history. Issue of spending money on a shrine and neglecting the caretaker living in a hovel alongside.

M.Hartley. Prayers by everyone after death is a long Cape tradition – possibly Indonesian in origin.

K.Ward. Origins of slaves is red herring. Islamic practices in Indonesian area were very diverse in 17th and 18th century period. Calling Sheikh Jusuf a 'resistance fighter' is extreme simplification – idea that serves today's needs. Stereotypes – texts, traditions – require more research.

A.Malan. We do need more systematic research and translations of evidence, eg kitabts.

SM. We strive for an ideal – and 'myths' can be important, especially in terms of fighting for a cause. Diverse cultural practices throughout Muslim world – a dynamic culture. Problem is when we don't admit diversity and assign what is correct. Puritans also get stuck in this trap.

S.Jeppie. Modern Saudi Arabia promotes puritanical view – no regard for local cultures and sacred spaces. Therefore notion of 'sacred space' may not be expressed by all. Concept of 'public interest' in Islamic law is important – but can be ambiguous – for example can you justify development of land for 'public interest'? Muslim scholars now investing money – high finance and capitalism.

N.Murray. Boundaries between disciplines/languages – we need multidisciplinary. AM attempting to identify Muslim sacred sites. Without a big issue no one is much interested. Interpretations / evidence is used differently. Tensions between NHR Act and Shariah interpretations. Need to understand what evidence is needed and how to speak to each other.

SI. What is responsible action for burial sites under redevelopment? What are issues of ownership – religious / secular – over time?

SM. What is permissible in Islam is issue. Scholars take the traditional sources – eg public welfare – and then debate it. Principles: life, religion, dignity, honour, intellect. Therefore public welfare to be balanced with the five principles. This explains apparent lack of interest in issue until a crisis occurs – we make decisions and learn by debating the issue. Perhaps you can honour the dead AND care for the living. If redevelopment increases dignity of people, then the choice is based on reality married with ideal. People in abject poverty visit immensely ornate shrines – buying curios is part of popular culture. Lack of awareness is problem. Economics are real issues now – hence new loopholes in use of gambling/pomo money within Islamic capitalist circles.

K.Ward. What precedents are there in other Muslim states for town planning?

SJ. Cairo is plan-less.

NM. Town planning is issue of modernity. Old cities are rebuilt constantly. ICOMOS initiatives in old cities are not without problems. There is 'new' concept of environmental factors.

S.Townsend. Ownership issue needs reconciliation – in Cape.

NM. Broader intellectual project as well as practical issues.

SM. Consider letter of text and spirit of text for living circumstances.

DATAWORLD

5 Percarrow, Percarrow Office Park, Armstrong Avenue East, La Lucia Ridge
Tel: (031) 5663430 Fax: (031) 5663438
Stand 124 – Nike Building, Pimetro Park, 2 Tonnetti Street, Halfway House, Midrand, 1685
Tel: (011) 3121712 Fax: (011) 3121713
P.O. Box 190, Mount Edgecombe, 4300
Email: info@dataworld.co.za Internet: www.dataworld.co.za

July 9, 2003

Attention: The Manager – National Inventory

SAHRA
111 Harrington Street
Cape Town
8001

Quote – Development Of Heritage Management System, Database & GIS Development

Thank you, for allowing us the opportunity for quoting on the above mentioned project, and hourly rates, exclusive of vat, including disbursement costs, are as follows: -

Resource	Hourly Rate
GIS Technician	200.00
GIS Analyst	250.00
GIS Specialist	300.00
IT/GIS Consultant	450.00
IT Specialists	300.00
Web Design	250.00

Attached herewith, please find a copy of our company profile & CV's of key personnel, and please be advised that the rates quoted are negotiable, and can be revised, based on the requirements of the client, and should you require any further information, please feel free to contact us.

Yours truly,



Speedy Govender

Directors: W. Govender, N.B. Sangweni (Ms)