Phase 1 Archaeological & Cultural Heritage Site Inspection -

Cemetery Site PNR-S4, Panorama Farm Centre Pivot Irrigation Development, near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Eastern Cape

- 26 February 2018 -

Report to:

Sello Mokhanya (Eastern Cape Provincial Heritage Resources Agency – EC PHRA, APM Unit) E-mail: smokhanya@ecphra.org.za; Tel: 043 745 0888; Postal Address: N/A

Chris Bradfield (Isi-Xwiba Consulting)

E-mail: isix@lcom.co.za; Tel: 083 441 1189; Postal Address: P.O. Box 2097, Komani, 5322



Prepared by:

Karen van Ryneveld (ArchaeoMaps)

E-mail: karen@archaeomaps.co.za; Tel: 084 871 1064; Postal Address: Postnet Suite 239, Private Bag X3, Beacon Bay, 5205

Specialist Declaration of Interest

i

I, Karen van Ryneveld (Company - ArchaeoMaps; Qualification - MSc Archaeology), declare that:

- o I act as independent specialist in this application;
- I do not have any financial or personal interest in the application, its' proponent or subsidiaries, aside from fair remuneration for specialist services rendered;
- o I am suitably qualified, accredited and experienced to act as independent specialist in this application;
- That work conducted have been done in an objective manner and that any circumstances that may have compromised objectivity have been reported on transparently;
- That all material information collected for purposes of this application, that may reasonably influence the decision of the competent authority, are transparently disclosed in the report; and
- That work conducted have been done in accordance with relevant heritage legislation, regulations and policy guidelines, and with cognisance to environmental legislation, regulations and policies, including the principle of Integrated Environmental Management (IEM).

Elynordel.

Signature –

- 26 February 2018 -

Phase 1 Archaeological & Cultural Heritage Site Inspection -

Phase 1 Archaeological & Cultural Heritage Site Inspection -

Cemetery Site PNR-S4, Panorama Farm Centre Pivot Irrigation Development, near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Eastern Cape

Executive Summary

Introduction -

The Panorama Farm Centre Pivot Irrigation Development (S32°00'22.1"; E25°29'45.1"), near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Eastern Cape, entails the installation of five (5) centre pivots covering an area of 138,32ha. The proposed development has been exempted from EA, as confirmed by Mrs. Mdekazi-Nkqubezi (Environmental Quality Management, DEDEAT, Chris Hani Region; E-mail communication to Chris Bradfield, Isi-Xwiba Consulting – 2018-02-23), with conditions, including amongst others compliance to requirements of the NHRA 1999 and formal comment by the EC PHRA. A HIA, including an AIA and PIA, was prepared and submitted to the EC PHRA and on SAHRIS (SAHRIS CaseID 11995). Four (4) archaeological and cultural heritage sites were identified during the Phase 1 AIA assessment. All identified sites comprised Colonial Period sites, including Sites PNR-S1 to PNR-S4. Site PNR-S4 comprises a Colonial Period grave site, described as: "Site PNR-S4 is defined as a grave older than 60 years, situated outside a formal cemetery and is formally protected by the NHRA 1999. The site is formally conserved with a permanent fence immediately surrounding the grave. The commonwealth grave site hosts the inscription 'M.Z3789 Manskap; John Adams; I.M.C.; 26 Mei 1947; Veilig in Jesus Hoede'. The commonwealth commemorative certificate contains limited additional information on the deceased, including 'Private; Adams, John; Service Number M/23789; Died 26/05/1947; Indian and Malay Corps; Son of Dick and Lydia Adams of Cradock; Husband of Dora Adams of Cradock' (https://www.cwgc.org/find-war-dead/casualty/2724337/adams,_john)" (Van Ryneveld 2017). Recommendations for heritage management purposes included conservation, with possible effect to the proposed development, or relocation of the grave.

The Phase 1 Archaeological & Cultural Heritage Site Inspection: Site PNR-S4 -

Vegetation clearing in the immediate vicinity of the grave of Private John Adams (S32°00'22.7"; E25°29'53.4") exposed approximately 25-30 additional graves, thereby confirming the commonwealth grave as part of a larger cemetery. Graves are scattered randomly across an approximate 30x20m area. Graves are not easily discernible and natural post-depositional processes have impacted heavily on the cemetery's integrity. Animal burrows, primarily of ant bear, have visibly destroyed some graves in totality.

The Site PNR-S4 cemetery is ascribed a SAHRA / EC PHRA High / Medium Significance and a Generally Protected IV-A Field Rating.

Recommendations –

With reference to archaeological and cultural heritage compliance, as per the requirements of the NHRA 1999, it is recommended that the proposed *Panorama Farm Centre Pivot Irrigation Development*, near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Eastern Cape, proceed provided the developer comply with the following recommendations regarding the conservation of Site PNR-S4:

It is recommended that the Site PNR-S4 cemetery be conserved within the pivot development. The approximate 30x20m cemetery area should be formally fenced, with an access gate. It is recommended that steel palisade fencing, similar to the fence at Private John Adams' grave be used. Pivot crops are not to encroach within 2-5m from the palisade fence, with wheels of the pivot to pass at a distance of approximately 5m from the site conservation fence.

Recommendations for inclusion of a conserved cemetery within a development remain the exception to the rule. In the case of the Site PNR-S4 cemetery it is motivated as follows:

- In the interest of the integrity of the site as a whole and the deceased, it is preferable that all graves be conserved together, or relocated as such, and reinterned at the same locale.
- Based on disturbance and poor grave discernibility at the site it is unlikely that all graves, or all human remains of the graves will be exhumed during a Phase 2 grave relocation programme.
- An emphasis on the in-situ conservation of the site, to conserve the integrity thereof within a development framework will have the following advantages:
 - i. Formal conservation of the site;
 - ii. Vegetation control at the cemetery will be done at regular intervals as part of pivot management; and
 - iii. Animal burrowing activities at the site will cease as part of pivot management.

The EC PHRA-APM Unit HIA Comment will state legal requirements for development to proceed, or reasons why, from a heritage perspective, development may not be further considered.

Cemetery Site PNR-S4, Panorama Farm Centre Pivot Irrigation Development, near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, EC

CONTENTS	
1 - Introduction	1
2 - The Phase 1 Archaeological & Cultural Heritage Site Inspection: Site PNR-S4	3
3 – References	8

List of Maps

Map 1: Phase 1 AIA findings for the Panorama Farm Centre Pivot Irrigation Development, near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local	
Municipality, Eastern Cape, study site	2
Map 2: Locality of the Site PNR-S4 cemetery	3

List of Plates

Plate 1: General view of the Site PNR-S4 cemetery, originally reported as a single grave5
Plate 2: General view of the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [1]5
Plate 3: General view of the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [2]5
Plate 4: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [1]5
Plate 5: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [2]
Plate 6: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [3]
Plate 7: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [4]
Plate 8: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [5]
Plate 9: An animal burrow on a grave site
Plate 10: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [6]7
Plate 11: The small fenced cemetery area, containing possibly two graves7
Plate 12: A stone gravestone from the small fenced cemetery area7

The Panorama Farm Centre Pivot Irrigation Development (general development co-ordinate S32°00'22.1"; E25°29'45.1"), near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Eastern Cape, entails the installation of five (5) centre pivots covering an area of 138,32ha, situated on the properties:

1

- Portion 4 of the Farm Doorn Rivier No 122, Division of Cradock (30,1927ha); 0
- Portion 14 of the Farm Doorn Rivier No 123, Division of Cradock (57,1661ha); 0
- Farm No 70, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Division of Cradock (251,9789ha); 0
- 0 Remainder of Farm No 69, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Division of Cradock (108,8127ha); and
- Farm Goedehoop No 126, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Division of Cradock (27,1007ha). 0

The proposed development has been exempted from Environmental Authorization (EA), as confirmed by Mrs. Mdekazi-Nkqubezi (Environmental Quality Management, DEDEAT, Chris Hani Region; E-mail communication to Chris Bradfield, Isi-Xwiba Consulting – 2018-02-23), with conditions, including amongst others compliance to requirements of the National Heritage Resources Act, No 25 of 1999 (NHRA 1999) and formal comment by the Eastern Cape Provincial Heritage Resources Authority (EC PHRA).

A Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), including an archaeological and cultural heritage study (AIA), and a palaeontological study (PIA), was prepared to meet heritage compliance requirements by the EC PHRA in terms of the NHRA 1999, with specific reference to Section 38(1)(c)(i). The HIA was submitted to the EC PHRA and on SAHRIS (SAHRIS CaseID 11995) in fulfilment of the NHRA 1999, Section 38(3) requirements, for purposes of a NHRA 1999, Section 38(4) / Section 38(8) Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) Comment.

Subject to	the provisions of subsections 7), 8) and 9), any person who intends to undertake a development categorized as -
a)	The construction of a road, wall, powerline, pipeline, canal or other similar form of linear development or barrie exceeding 300m in length;
b)	The construction of a bridge or similar structure exceeding 50m in length;
c)	Any development or other activity which will change the character of a site –
	i. Exceeding 5,000m ² in extent; or
	ii. Involving three or more existing erven or subdivisions thereof; or
	iii. Involving three or more erven or subdivisions thereof which have been consolidated within the past five years; or
	 The costs which will exceed a sum set in terms of regulations by SAHRA or a provincial heritage resources authority;
d)	The rezoning of a site exceeding 10,000m ² in extent;
e)	Any other category of development provided for in regulations by SAHRA or a provincial heritage resources authority,
Mu	st at the very earliest stages of initiating such a development, notify the responsible heritage resources authority
and	furnish it with details regarding the location, nature and extent of the proposed development.

Table 1: Extract from the NHRA 1999, Section 38

The said archaeological and cultural heritage study is referenced as:

Van Ryneveld, K. (ArchaeoMaps). 2017. Phase 1 Archaeological and Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment -Panorama Farm Centre Pivot Irrigation Development, near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Eastern Cape.

Four (4) archaeological and cultural heritage sites, as defined by the NHRA 1999, were identified during the Phase 1 AIA assessment. All identified sites comprised Colonial Period sites, including Colonial Period structures; Site PNR-S1 being structure ruins, Site PNR-S2 an old barn and Site PNR-S3 old workers residences, as well as Site PNR-S4, a Colonial Period grave site (Van Ryneveld 2017).

Site PNR-S4, the Colonial Period grave (S32°00'22.7"; E25°29'53.4") was described as: "Site PNR-S4 is defined as a grave older than 60 years, situated outside a formal cemetery and is formally protected by the NHRA 1999. The site is formally conserved with a permanent fence immediately surrounding the grave. The commonwealth grave site hosts the inscription 'M.Z3789 Manskap; John Adams; I.M.C.; 26 Mei 1947; Veilig in Jesus Hoede'. The commonwealth commemorative

Phase 1 Archaeological & Cultural Heritage Site Inspection -

Cemetery Site PNR-S4, Panorama Farm Centre Pivot Irrigation Development, near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, EC

certificate contains limited additional information on the deceased, including 'Private; Adams, John; Service Number *M*/23789; Died 26/05/1947; Indian and Malay Corps; Son of Dick and Lydia Adams of Cradock; Husband of Dora Adams of Cradock' (https://www.cwgc.org/find-war-dead/casualty/2724337/adams,_john)". Recommendations for heritage management purposes included conservation, with possible effect to the proposed development, or relocation of the grave (Van Ryneveld 2017).



Map 1: Phase 1 AIA findings for the Panorama Farm Centre Pivot Irrigation Development, near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Eastern Cape, study site

2 - The Phase 1 Archaeological & Cultural Heritage Site Inspection: Site PNR-S4

Subsequent to submission of the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) to the Eastern Cape Provincial Heritage Resources Authority (EC PHRA) and on SAHRIS, the developer proceeded with vegetation clearing in the vicinity of Site PNR-S4. All vegetation clearing was done by hand. Vegetation clearing exposed approximately 25-30 additional graves in the area immediately surrounding the grave of Private John Adams, thereby confirming the commonwealth grave as part of a larger cemetery. Graves are scattered randomly across an approximate 30x20m area. Identified graves are demarcated by simple, uninscribed stone headstones, or head and footstones. Some graves can be inferred to have been stone outlined, with portions of stone outlines still visible, and including brick outlines. Portions of settled stone cairns are visible and graves may also have been marked by earth mounds only. Natural post-depositional processes have impacted heavily on the cemetery's integrity. Animal burrows, primarily of ant bear, have visibly destroyed some graves in totality, most possibly due to softer, disturbed soils of the graves. Towards the south-eastern corner of the site a small fenced area houses a confirmed grave, demarcated by an uninscribed stone headstone. The size of the fenced area indicates that two (2) graves may be contained within the area.

Due to the disturbed nature of the cemetery (including discernibility of the graves and animal impact), it is highly unlikely that a Phase 2 grave relocation programme will successfully exhume all remains for purposes of reinternment in a municipal cemetery (or elsewhere on the property). Past animal burrowing activity may also result in scenarios where a grave marker is still visible, but actual remains may no longer be all, or in part present in the graves.

[The archaeological and cultural heritage site inspection was done on 2018-02-16, in the company of the developer and Isi-Xwiba].



Map 2: Locality of the Site PNR-S4 cemetery

HERITAGE SITE SIGNIFICANCE RATING: The Site PNR-S4 cemetery is ascribed the same heritage significance rating as the originally recorded Site PNR-S4 grave site of Private John Adams, namely a SAHRA / EC PHRA *High* / *Medium Significance* and a *Generally Protected IV-A Field Rating*.

RECOMMENDATIONS: With reference to the above it is recommended that the Site PNR-S4 cemetery be conserved within the pivot development. The approximate 30x20m cemetery area should be formally fenced, with an access gate. It is recommended that steel palisade fencing, similar to the fence at Private John Adams' grave be used. Pivot crops are not to encroach within 2-5m from the palisade fence, with wheels of the pivot to pass at a distance of approximately 5m from the site conservation fence.

Recommendations for inclusion of a conserved cemetery within a development remain the exception to the rule. In the case of the Site PNR-S4 cemetery it is motivated as follows:

- In the interest of the integrity of the site as a whole and the deceased, it is preferable that all graves be conserved together, or relocated as such, and reinterned at the same locale.
- Based on disturbance and poor grave discernibility at the site it is unlikely that all graves, or all human remains of the graves will be exhumed during a Phase 2 grave relocation programme.
- An emphasis on the in-situ conservation of the site, to conserve the integrity thereof within a development framework will have the following advantages:
 - i. Formal conservation of the site;
 - ii. Vegetation control at the cemetery will be done at regular intervals as part of pivot management; and
 - iii. Animal burrowing activities at the site will cease as part of pivot management.

[The commonwealth grave of Private John Adams was known to prior owner of the Panorama farm, Mr. D.J. Mulder, though he was not aware of the presence of further graves in the area. Mr. Mulder reported that no request for visitation to the cemetery has been received during his years of ownership of the farm].



Plate 1: General view of the Site PNR-S4 cemetery, originally reported as a single grave



Plate 2: General view of the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [1]



Plate 3: General view of the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [2]



Plate 4: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [1]



Plate 5: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [2]



Plate 6: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [3]



Plate 7: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [4]



Plate 8: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [5]



Plate 9: An animal burrow on a grave site



Plate 10: Identified graves at the Site PNR-S4 cemetery [6]



Plate 11: The small fenced cemetery area, containing possibly two graves



Plate 12: A stone gravestone from the small fenced cemetery area

- https://www.cwgc.org/find-war-dead/casualty/2724337/adams,_john [Accessed: October 2017]. 1.
- South African Government. (No 107 of) 1998. National Environmental Management Act. 2.
- 3. South African Government. (No 25 of) 1999. National Heritage Resources Act.
- Van Ryneveld, K. (ArchaeoMaps). 2017. Phase 1 Archaeological and Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment Panorama Farm Centre 4. Pivot Irrigation Development, near Cradock, Inxuba Yethemba Local Municipality, Eastern Cape.