

SECTION 6 ASSESSMENT OF PROPOSALS IMPACTS ON IDENTIFIED HERITAGE RESOURCES

6.1 INTRODUCTION

The assessment of the proposals is the assessment of the potential impacts on the identified heritage resources. Each site development proposal is assessed individually (i.e. site specific) and thereafter the cumulative impact on Langa. The assessment process is essence is:

- What are the heritage resources at risk?
- How will the development proposal impact the site, immediate context and Langa?
- If there are negative impacts on the identified heritage resources, how can these effects be mitigated?

6.2 ERVEN 2988; 2989; 2990; 2991; 3004; 3005; 3006; 3007; 3008; 3009 & 3011 (WITHIN CIVIC CORE): ASSESSMENTS OF IMPACTS OF THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

The revised proposal (October 2012) by Architects Associated has revised the previous designs by JSA due to the heritage indicators and comments received from Langa Heritage Foundation (refer Annexure 6 previous design proposals).

Table 6.1: Identified impacts of proposed development on the identified heritage resources on Erven 2988; 2989; 2990; 2991; 3004; 3005; 3006; 3007; 3008; 3009 & 3011 Langa.

Site		Sites within Civic Core		
Recommended nature of heritage significance		Historical, contextual significance		
Recommended degree of heritage significance		Grade 3A		
Renewable or non-renewable heritage resource		Non renewable		
State of heritage resource		Medium state: Grass field and informal residential structures		
Nature of the impact	Impact without Mitigation	Explanation	Mitigation measures	Impact with mitigation measures
Visual spatial impact on the loss of an open area that contributes to a portion of the definition of the core civic precinct.	POSITIVE	<u>Development is on the western section of the site</u> so that the open area will remain between the former officials residences and the former Main Barracks; Designed communal open precincts to accommodate residents <u>recreational and domestic needs</u> in order to prevent the communal spaces becoming derelict 'no man's land' that are unmaintained and limit recreational and domestic needs (as is visible in the New Flats). Designed to a <u>maximum heights</u> to 3 stories; <u>Include market area (if required)</u> on northern precinct; Open area to be rezoned as <u>Public</u>	Rezoning of the undeveloped portion of the sites to a POS in order to retain its public use and allow management on the site by CCT Parks and Sports Recreation Departments. The planting of trees on the site especially on the undeveloped area in order to maintain a landscaped corridor on Leretholi Avenue. Specification of appropriate hard surfaced materials (paving) to demarcate communal areas to be finalised in the detail designs.	POSITIVE All development on these core sites changes the spatial relationships of the civic core to a degree. However the present informal settlement on a portion of the site is indicative to the threat that can occur if the entire site is occupied with informal structures.

		<p><u>Open Space</u> to secure it from future development; <u>Historic commercial building on Lerotholi Avenue</u> retained; <u>Vehicular parking bays</u> within the development contained, especially within the inner courts.</p> <p>While it is accepted that any development on this site will completely change the spatial relationship existing between the component parts of this precinct of the civic core (Main Barracks, official housing, family housing, Lerotholi Ave and historic shops) and alter the meaning of the site itself, it is assessed that a certain amount of development can occur on the site’s western portion. The open space between the officials’ residences and the Main Barracks adjacent to Lerotholi Avenue is important to retain as an undeveloped site for the central spine (Lerotholi Ave). To allow development on the entire site is to remove these spatial relationships completely.</p>		
<p>Associational Impact Physical and material impacts (Loss of open space)</p>	<p>Negative – the loss of an open space</p>		<p>If the open space is appropriately landscaped to provide a functional space for the residents of the proposed development and the</p>	<p>POSITIVE</p>

			surrounding areas. This open area could be a combination of hard and soft landscaping to facilitate a degree of greening in the area and to provide outdoor and recreational areas (e.g. basketball, netball courts etc.)	
Extent of the Impact (Local, medium scaled, large scaled)	Large scaled Entire site is altered, immediate context and Langa is altered by development	Although the proposed development of the site will be visible in the local Langa context, it is within the precinct of the highest cultural value. It will be visible from Washington Street, associated residences, Ndabeni Street, adjacent Main Barracks and Lerotholi Avenue		
Duration of Impact Timescale	Permanent	Buildings are designed to last for a permanent duration		Permanent
Magnitude of the impact (Positive, neutral, negative)	Neutral: Development is contained within the western section of the site, which has the capacity to absorb without high negative impacts to the civic core.	Permanent change to the core of the historic area by the proposal of 3 storied multi buildings.		Neutral
SUMMARY: Level of Significance High, Medium, Low	Positive Positioning buildings on the western section of the site Securing a larger POS on site Low negative Change to the spatial relationships of the historic core	The development of the site will have an impact on the identified heritage resources of the core area and change the spatial relationships within the civic core precinct i.e. between the official buildings, Main Barracks and family housing.	Rezone portion to POS Develop communal areas to the benefit of the residents and beneficiaries	Positive Positive in the removal of the informal settlement, the provision of housing and the development of recreational open space, retention of the open area on Lerotholi Avenue.

6.3 ERVEN 2731 (NEW FLATS): ASSESSMENTS OF IMPACTS OF THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

Table 6.2: Identified impacts of proposed development on the identified heritage resources on Erf 2731 Langa (New Flats).

Site		New Flats		
Recommended nature of heritage significance		Historic, architectural and social significances		
Recommended degree of heritage significance		Grade 3C		
Renewable or non-renewable heritage resource		Non renewable		
State of heritage resource		Nine double storied degraded residential buildings and open degraded spaces between		
Nature of the impact	Impact without mitigation measures	Explanation	Mitigation measures	Impacts with mitigation measures
Visual spatial impact on the loss of the remaining nine original new barracks.	POSITIVE	<p>The removal of all 9 buildings on the New Flats developed in 1970s is mitigated by the willingness by the client to retain a hostel of the same design in Zone 2: The proposal has:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Limited vehicle access</u> and only allocate parking bays adjacent to these internal streets and not all communal courtyards; • Designed communal outdoor areas for <u>domestic and recreations needs</u> such as washing lines, waste bins positions, benches for seating; • Access facing the street is assessed as positive as it is in context to the hostels to homes development, providing activity on streetscape; • Proposed apartment blocks on Jungle Walk realized to a maximum of <u>4 stories</u> with the remained being maximum of <u>3 stories</u>; • <u>Access to apartments</u> differentiated within development e.g. 	<p>An <u>interpretative plaque</u> to the approval of the Langa Heritage Foundation and the CCT Environmental and Heritage Resources should be erected on site to explain the history of the site.</p> <p>Discussions with the informal traders on Jungle Walk to relocate their informal stalls to an alternate trading position such as Jungle Walk Zone 2.</p>	<p>POSITIVE</p> <p>Although a loss of historic fabric, a building of the same hostel design exists on the adjacent site (Zone 2)</p> <p>The positive impact is the improvement of the habitat for the existing residents on site and the accommodation of Langa inhabitants from temporary housing on the adjacent sites.</p>

		form vehicular courts		
Associational Impact Physical & material impacts, (Loss of buildings – similarity of footprint of proposed buildings).	Negative	There is a loss of associational significance to the former residents and the historic lifestyle and activities by the demolition of the remainder of the New Flats.	Recording names and stories that occurred in the New Flats by the LHF or / and CCT Arts and Culture / EHRM or their consultant	Positive The loss of associational significance is weighed up against the high positive impacts of habitable residences for current inhabitants of Langa
Extent of the Impact	Positive Local: Site and Streetscape scale	The proposed development of the site is confined to the local context. It is a similar scale to the adjacent hostels to homes development on the same and adjacent site.		Positive
Duration of Impact Timescale	Permanent	Buildings are designed to last for a permanent duration	None	-
Magnitude of the impact Scale	Positive	Position the approximate footprint of the existing buildings and adjacent to multi storied residential units (Hostels to Homes project)		
SUMMARY: Level of Significance High, Medium, Low	Positive	The development of the site will result in the demolition of 9 double storied buildings. As the majority of the proposed development will be situated within the mid site, the negative impacts on the surrounding context will be minimal; the impacts of the loss of the buildings type will be negated by the retention of the same type of hostel on Zone 2. The social benefits of the proposed development are highly positive. The design of interactive street facades will improve the streetscape.		Positive

6.4 ERVEN 311, 315 AND 2877 (SPECIAL QUARTERS): ASSESSMENTS OF IMPACTS OF THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

Table 6.3: Identified impacts of proposed development on the identified heritage resources on Erven 311, 315 and 2877 Langa

Site		Special Quarters		
Recommended nature of heritage significance		Historical, architectural, contextual and social significances		
Recommended degree of heritage significance		Grade 3B		
Renewable or non-renewable heritage resource		Non renewable		
State of heritage resource		Varying conditions: certain buildings indicate degrees of material failures		
Nature of the impact	Impact without mitigation measures	Explanation	Mitigation measures	Impacts with mitigation measures
<p>Visual spatial impact on the loss of existing single stored formal and informal buildings. The vast majority of the buildings are for residential use and a spaza shop is on Erf 315. Visual Impact is the removal of the vast majority of single storied buildings and the replacement of 3 and 4 storied apartment buildings. Vehicular parking bays are accommodated on the edges of certain buildings and on the interface of certain roadways. Pedestrian courts between certain buildings allow safe play areas for children.</p>	<p>LOW POSITIVE In the retention of four historic buildings as unique residential accommodation and the retention of the historic Washington Street streetscape</p> <p>Loss of Mr Naki’s former room as it is situated on the building on the northern edge of Erf 311</p>	<p>The existing buildings on either side of Washington street (Erf 2877 and Erf 311) are retained. One room in a building can be retained in its original form with the remainder buildings being renovated for residential or civic usage (e.g. crèche/ computer/study rooms and residential units). The new buildings on Harlem street need to accommodate a sensitive interface to the original Haarlem buildings opposite</p> <p>Create Interface between historic buildings and new development which considers impact of scale and a meaningful space.</p>	<p>Photographically record the ablution buildings as all Ablution buildings are proposed to be demolished.</p> <p>Photograph all the sites prior and during demolition for the CCT records</p> <p>Implement the restoration/alteration of historic buildings to the later submission to SAHRA and HWC (in terms of NHR Act S 34) and the CCT EHRM (proposed Heritage Area)</p> <p>When the demolition and construction of the proposed buildings are in process, suitably provide hoarding for the historic buildings in order to protect the structures.</p>	<p>POSITIVE The proposal is to retain an example of the Special Quarters residential units but not the Ablution block.</p> <p>(The retention of the Ablution Block on Erf 2877 is contained in the HIA recommendations)</p>
		General		

		<p><u>Access</u> to proposed buildings is from street facades as well as from the inner courts; <u>Parking</u> is limited to within designated parking courts- other courts retain for domestic a recreations needs; <u>Soft and hard landscaping proposed</u> e.g. paving, trees and benches; Design included of the <u>restoration/alteration</u> of historic buildings and their forecourt spaces during the project; Specific Erf 315 <u>Positioned the 4 stories apartment buildings</u> on Bhunga Avenue and Harlem street (adjacent streetscapes are assessed to cope with the higher buildings due to the width of Bhunga Ave and the neighbouring site on Harlem (safe house [former Langa hospital]; Erf 311 Provided a designed buffer areas between the historic and proposed buildings Limited the height of the proposed buildings adjacent to</p>	<p>The buildings can be used for site offices if the structure is carefully considered but not for storage of materials.</p> <p>Retain the Ablution Block on Erf 2877 if possible.</p> <p>Place an interpretive plaque at the retained historic buildings on Washington Street explaining the history of the site and the significant local residents that resided in the Special Quarters.</p>	
--	--	---	---	--

		<p>the historic buildings to 3 stories; Retained mature trees on corner of Bhunga Ave. and Washington Street Erf 2877 Maximum height of all building is 3 stories, except for building on Bhunga Avenue Provided appropriate designed spaced between the historical and proposed buildings; Demarcated and secured Bhunga Square during construction activities Vehicle access is designed for specific communal spaces within the development and children play areas and domestic needs such as hanging laundry, waste bins are accommodated in the non-vehicular areas.</p>		
<p>Associational Impact Physical and material impacts (Loss of the majority of the Special Quarters)</p>	Neutral	<p>The impact of the loss of mature trees and existing historic fabric is negative but is assessed against the provision of formal residential units on the current high-densities sites within unsuitable accommodation.</p>	<p>Significance change to this section of Langa by the insertion of multi level buildings</p>	
Extent of the Heritage	Negative	The impact of the proposed	Mitigation of the visual	Neutral

<p>Impact Local scale</p>		<p>development of the site is confined to the western precincts of Langa and eastern edge of Pinelands. The proposed development will be highly visible from a short section on the N2 (eastwards), railway line and from the surrounding residential precincts. From the broader context of Langa the proposed development will be visible beyond the single and double storied buildings until Lerotholi Ave. The impact of loss of heritage resources, change to the historic section of Langa is a national, provincial and local impact.</p>	<p>impacts is the location of the 4 storey buildings on Bhunga Avenue and the detail design of the building's facades. Mitigation of the loss of historic fabric is the retention of the 2 buildings on Washington Street.</p>	
<p>Duration of Impact</p>	<p>Permanent</p>	<p>Buildings are designed to last for a permanent duration</p>	<p>-</p>	
<p>Magnitude of the impact Significantly changes the character of the historic residential area in the site's context. Low and within the capacity of the site to absorb.</p>	<p>Higher buildings (4 stories) situated on Bhunga Avenue, opposite the former hospital and within the inner site.</p>	<p>Development of residential accommodation within medium density area in which many people live within cramped informal structures without services is assessed as positive due to the social impacts.</p>		<p>Medium</p>
<p>SUMMARY:</p>	<p>Medium Negative</p>	<p>The development of the site</p>	<p>Continual maintenance of the</p>	<p>Medium Positive</p>

<p>Level of Significance High, Medium, Low</p>		<p>will have a negative impact the identified heritage resources on the sites by the demolition of the majority of the structures and the removal of all trees outside the perimeter. However, considering that the existing buildings have not been adequately maintained by the CCT, the informal structures between the formal houses are expected to multiply. An example of the Special Quarters residential units is to be retained and a unit renovated and a landscaping component is included in the project, this impact is of local scale, and the benefits of residential accommodation to this Langa community are high.</p>	<p>historic structures by the CCT Housing Directorate. Retention of the Ablution Block on Erf 2877.</p>	
---	--	---	--	--

6.5 ERF 2574 (ZONE 2): ASSESSMENTS OF IMPACTS OF THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

Table 6.4: Identified impacts of proposed development on the identified heritage resources on Erf 2574 Langa (Zone 2).

Site		Zone 2		
Recommended nature of heritage significance		3C		
Recommended degree of heritage significance		Ungraded		
Renewable or non-renewable heritage resource		Non renewable		
State of heritage resource		Degraded		
Nature of the impact	Impact without mitigation measures	Explanation	Mitigation measures	Impacts with mitigation measures
<p>Visual spatial impact on the loss of the remaining nine original New Flats hostels</p>	<p>POSITIVE</p> <p>The HIA is a positive in principle to the development on this site.</p>	<p>The removal of the existing buildings to be replaced by new higher buildings on the same orientation in a streetscape is assessed to have a positive impact to the visual spatial character of the site and the immediate precinct.</p> <p><u>Designed entire site</u> in order to capitalise on development within a less culturally significant site and precinct.</p> <p>Included addition of apartment buildings on adjacent erf to maximise residential opportunities where possible without the negative impacts to the historic context;</p> <p><u>Considered streetscape</u> in the design with access to apartments from the street, landscaping, vehicular parking</p> <p><u>Limited parking</u> to adjacent streets;</p> <p><u>Proposed soft and hard landscaping</u> e.g. paving, trees and benches;</p>	<p>Detail on to the restoration and alteration of the historic building to the comment of SAHRA, approval of CCT EHMB;</p>	<p>POSITIVE</p> <p>Although a loss of historic fabric, the retention of the historic building with the retention of 1 historic unit is a positive for heritage records.</p> <p>Maximum use of site for the implementation of a collection of buildings that improves the streetscape (interfaces, vegetation), provides useful semi private communal spaces, celebrates the junction of the change of Langa's road network grid.</p> <p>The positive impact is the improvement of the habitat for the existing residents on site and the accommodation of Langa inhabitants from temporary housing on the</p>

		Design and Implement the <u>restoration</u> /alteration of historic building during the project; Developed the communal spaces on site for recreational needs, for example safe children play areas, benches for the elderly, washing lines and bin storage areas; Designed a <u>variety to the building</u> heights and elevations to prevent a 'one type fits all' scenario, which does not take the opportunities for the site's informants. Consideration of scale of the adjacent single storey buildings considered in the design.		adjacent sites.
Associational Impact Physical and material impacts (Loss of buildings – similarity of footprint of proposed buildings).	Neutral	There is a loss of associational significance to the former residents and the lifestyle and activities by the demolition of the remainder of the Zone 2 former hostel buildings.		Positive The loss of associational significance is weighed up against the immense positive impacts of the provision of habitable residences for current inhabitants of Langa
Extent of the Impact	Positive Local: Site and Streetscape scale	The proposed development of the site is confined to the local context. It is a similar scale to the adjacent hostels to homes development in this precinct of Langa.	-	Positive
Duration of Impact Timescale	Permanent	Buildings are designed to last for a permanent duration	None	-
Magnitude of the impact Scale	Positive	Position the approximate footprint of the existing buildings and adjacent to multi storied residential units		

		(Hostels to Homes project)		
SUMMARY: Level of Significance High, Medium, Low	Low Positive	The development of the entire site will result in the demolition of 13 double storied buildings.		High Positive

6.6 ERVEN 3280 & 3281 (ENTRY SITES): ASSESSMENTS OF IMPACTS OF THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

Table 6.5: Identified impacts of proposed development on the identified heritage resources on Erven Langa (Entry Sites)

Site		Entry sites Bhunga Avenue		
Recommended nature of heritage significance		Historical and social significances		
Recommended degree of heritage significance		Erf 3580 Grade 3C Erf 3581 Grade 3B		
Renewable or non-renewable heritage resource		Non renewable		
State of heritage resource		Degraded		
Nature of the impact	Impact without mitigation measures	Explanation	Mitigation measures	Impacts with mitigation measures
Visual spatial impact on the development of site consisting of scattered trees, and building ruins	LOW POSITIVE in the principle to develop the sites for a residential precinct is supported	<p>The surrounding context will be changed by the application for this site.</p> <p>Limited vehicle access to internal 'streets' and only allocate parking bays adjacent to these internal streets and not all communal courtyards;</p> <p>Landscaping on the historic route to indicate and celebrate the route;</p> <p>Provided a well-landscaped buffer area between the development and the initiation site;</p> <p>Limited the height of the buildings that are situated adjacent to the initiation site to 3 stories;</p> <p>Communal areas designed to accommodate domestic and recreational needs such as play areas, washing lines, benches;</p> <p>Buildings street facades differentiated to prevent the one size fits all scenario</p>	<p>CCT to liaise with the Langa Initiation site committee to investigate the landscaping the northern Initiation site boundary precinct with suitable trees and vegetated berm/s.</p> <p>CCT Human Settlements to liaise with the Langa Initiation Committee regarding the façade design on the buildings overlooking the Initiation Site</p> <p>Place an <u>interpretative plaque</u> by the CCT Environmental and Heritage Resources Branch and the Langa Heritage Foundation approvals on the historic route on the corner of Ndabeni and Bhunga Avenue</p>	<p>POSITIVE</p> <p>The retention and celebration of the cultural and historic route</p> <p>The development of the vacant site for formal accommodation</p> <p>The creation of a landscaped buffer adjacent to the Initiation site</p> <p>The proposal to the Langa Initiation Site Committee on the landscaping within the Initiation site for further noise and visual impacts</p> <p>The accommodation of existing Langa inhabitants from temporary housing on the adjacent sites.</p>

		Retention of the exiting historic trees that lined the route. The LHF have negatively commented on the proposal due to the proximity of the Initiation Site and the fact that Initiates use the site on route to the Initiation site i.e. it is considered a transitional space between the Initiation Site and Langa. In addition parking is required on the site for the Initiates families.		
Associational Impact Physical and material impacts (Loss of buildings – similarity of footprint of proposed buildings).	Positive	There is no loss of significance cultural structures and the few mature trees on Bhunga Avenue proposed for removal are of high cultural significance and are proposed to be replaced with landscaping on Bhunga Avenue.		Positive
Extent of the Impact	Positive	Local: Site and streetscape scale Medium: site is viewed from the N2 highway It is a similar scale to the adjacent proposed development on Erf 3580 approved by HWC (2011)		Positive
Duration of Impact Timescale	Permanent	Buildings are designed to last for a permanent duration	None	-
Magnititude of the impact Scale	Positive			Positive

<p>SUMMARY: Level of Significance High, Medium, Low</p>		<p>The development of the site will result in the demolition of ruins and the removal of few scattered mature trees. The negative impacts on the surrounding context and historical and cultural route can be mitigated as described and social benefits will be high.</p>		<p>Positive Although the LHF believe the development will be a loss to the Initiation site processes, the site is not the Initiation site and the transitional Initiation phases are assessed to occur either along Bhunga Avenue or within the Initiation site entry zone. The context of the Initiation site is likely to change in the future with the development of the Power Station Site into multi use activities (commercial, residential) with an access road possible between Erven 3580 and 3581 and the Initiation Site</p>
---	--	--	--	---

SECTION 7 STATE AND CIVIC CONSULTATION

7.1 INTRODUCTION

The requirement for comment on the HIA is specified in the NHR Act, Section 38(3) (e) states:

The responsible heritage authority must specify the information to be provided in a report.....provided that the following must be included...The results of consultation with communities affected by the proposal and other interested parties regarding the impact of the development on heritage resources'. The HIA includes comments obtained from the following civic organisations, CCT Departments and officials:

- Langa Heritage Foundation (LHF);
- Environmental and Heritage Resources Management, Central District, City of Cape Town;
- Spatial Planning, City of Cape Town;
- Alderman Brian Watkyns, Ward Councillor Ward 53

7.2 OUTCOME OF PARTICIPATION PROCESS

Prior to the appointment of the HIA process, the applicant and the main consultant AURECON conducted a series of participatory meetings with relevant Councillors, civic organisations such as the Langa Development Forum (LDF) and residents. The heritage consultant was not present at these meetings as they mostly occurred prior to the appointment of the HIA. These meetings were held to communicate the proposed project and site selections. Types of residential units in addition to the beneficiaries, standards of construction and suggestions of sites were discussed (refer Annexure 5).

Further formal meetings by the Heritage consultant occurred with the Langa Heritage Foundation (LHF) and the CCT Ward Councillor, Alderman Brian Watkyns. Informal discussions with residents on certain of the affected sites occurred during site visits.

7.2.1 Langa Heritage Foundation (LHF)

The civic organisation consulted within the HIA process was the Langa Heritage Foundation. The LHF is a group of Langa residents that have been in partnership with the CCT since 2002 in the identification of Langa's significant sites and the development of the Langa museums' in the Pass Office and the former Post Office. Certain committee members have been on the committee since its inception while others have joined in the past few years. It is a small and learned committee with immense knowledge of the cultural significances of sites within Langa. Most committee members have resided in Langa since they were children. The LHF currently operate the Pass Office Museum on a voluntary basis. The LHF have commented to the CCT Property Management Services on various development and lease applications on Langa's sites and are well versed on the histories and project sites situations.

The LHF have been circumspect to certain of the development proposals due to the high potential negative impact on the heritage resources on the site and/or Langa itself. A series of development proposals were submitted to the LHF for comment, such as:

- Initial JSA proposals;

- Initial Architects associated proposals;
- Final Architects Associated proposals.

In general the LHF supports the efforts of the CCT in their attempts to provide decent housing for all, but believes a balance should be found in balancing housing cultural and heritage needs of the community. The committee has a concern that high density residential buildings have a negative impact on crime in Langa as they believe the new residential development on Langa eastern buffer areas has indicated. The proposed developments of most concern to the LHF is on the 'Entry Sites' (Erven 3580 and 3581) due to its potential negative impacts on the Initiation activities on route and on the Initiation Site. Of secondary concern is the development on the Core Civic sites (Erven 2988, 2989, 2990, 2991, 3004, 3005, 3006, 3007, 3008, 3009 & 3011) due to the loss of an undeveloped site within Langa and the impact to the character and the spatial relationships between the civic core's buildings and sites. The LHF support the retention of the Ablution Block in the Special Quarters on Erf 2877 and its renovation for use by the site's residents and the immediate community (Refer LHF letter and notes from LHF meetings, Annexure 5).

Environmental and Heritage Resources Management, Central District, City of Cape Town the HIA focus on social

Over the duration of the assessment, meetings were held with the heritage officials, Mr Johan Cornelius, Mr David Hart, Ms Margot van Heerden and Mr Clive James regarding the draft HIA of the various sites. The latest comment by the CCT, dated 7 March 2013 supports the HIA assessment and provides further recommendations that are incorporated in the HIA. The Branch supports the public Participation process and HIA focus on social history. The EHRM recommends to HWC IARCOM to approve the Draft 4 November 2012¹ with its recommendations as specified (Refer Annexure 5 for minutes of the meetings).

South African Heritage Agency: Built Environment Landscape Committee (BELCOM)

As the site falls within the Grade 1 identified area, comment from SAHRA is required. SAHRA BELCOM's comment dated 23 February 2012 on the Phase 1 of the HIA was as follows:

An in-principle support is granted to the project with the condition that the approach in the HIA is expanded to include mechanisms for the implementation of beneficiary lists and, further, that recommendations in the HIA report are aligned to heritage principles (refer Annexure 3).

In telephonic discussion with the SAHRA official by the heritage consultant, the comment was confirmed as follows: (explanation of SAHRA written comments in red):

'An in-principle support is granted to the project (the HIA) with the condition that the approach in the HIA is expanded to include mechanisms for the implementation of beneficiary lists (who are the beneficiaries and how will the CCT housing ensure these beneficiaries obtain the residential apartments) and, further, that recommendations in the HIA report are aligned to heritage principles (Heritage principles - to be outlined by the Heritage Practitioner in the HIA - of the conservation and management of Langa as a Grade 1 Heritage Site)'².

¹ Draft 4 HIA November 2012 has been updated to include the PPP comments and named Draft 5 March 2013

² Personal Communication 12 March 2012 (via e mail) Mr Greg Ontong SAHRA

Ward Councillor: Alderman Brian Watkyns & Councillor

The meeting with Alderman Watkyns was to gain his assessment on the proposals. Only the Special Quarters sites are within his Ward. Certain other sites were discussed (such as the portion of the sports Fields and the Core sites). The redevelopment of the Special Quarters does constitute a protracted discussion between Ald. Watkyns and the sites residents. Alderman Watkyns confirmed his support for the redevelopment of the Special Quarters with retention of certain historic structures on site.

CCT Cross Sectoral Planning Meeting

A cross sectoral planning meeting was convened by the applicant, CCT Human Settlements on 20th April, 2012 in order to address issues raised during the process and to give officials from various CCT departments³ and Councillors⁴ an opportunity to discuss the development proposals. Objectives of this meeting were to achieve consensus on the project proposal, taking due cognizance of:

1. Extreme housing need
2. Scarcity of land in Langa
3. Heritage value of the original town planning layout
4. Heritage value of the buildings,
5. The tourism potential of the district
6. Safety and security of residents and visitors
7. Economic development opportunities for the community

The meeting was part of the integrative process of the HIA with discussion on the various sites and suggestions to the developments and conservation measures (refer of the meeting and the attendance list Annexure 6).

³ Human Settlements, Economic Development, Environmental and Heritage Resources Management

⁴ Executive Mayoral Committee Councillors and local Ward Councillors

SECTION 8 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

8.1 CONCLUSIONS

The sites proposed for the residential developments are all assessed as culturally significant sites to varying degrees and contribute to Langa's high cultural significances. In order to retain these identified heritage resources and their degrees of significance; the heritage impact assessment of the proposed developments was a process of negotiation with the client and the consultant team in order to mitigate as best as possible potential negative impacts on identified heritage resources. The HIA considered the disrepair of the CCT owned structures, the fact that the historic accommodation does not permit civilized living conditions (as single rooms with no closely accessible ablution facilities) and the urgent need within Langa for higher density residential accommodation for rental to residents currently living in unhygienic and unsafe conditions.

The HIA has recommended mitigatory actions of the proposed development as follows:

- The retention of a structure/s on the site if it is the only example of the structure in Langa;
- The retention of important vistas;
- The retention of significant spatial relationships between significant structures;
- The retention of significant landscape features;
- The renovation of the retained structures;
- The consideration of scale on the neighbouring sites and buildings;
- The retention of culturally significant routes;
- The enhancement of the streetscapes through interactive building facades and landscaping proposals;
- The variation of the design in order to address the range of sites and their position within Langa.

8.2 GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

The HIA recommends to the HWC IARCOM to approve the HIA's Draft 4 recommendations outlined below. The recommendations are specified as general or specific recommendations for all sites assessed.

General recommendations

- The development of residential apartments can proceed on all sites assessed providing that the proposals submitted by the CCT are not altered significantly from the proposals occupied in this HIA;
- The CCT commit to the regular maintenance of all remaining historic structures on the sites assessed;
- All positions of buildings to be demolished must be included within the HIA to receive approval from the HWC in terms of the NHR Act Section 34.

8.3 SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS

The specific recommendations on the entire site assessed deal with the specific site and context opportunities and constraints.

8.3.1 SPECIAL QUARTERS

The assessments of the application on Erven 311, 315 and 2877 are:

- The retention of the 4 historic residential structures adjacent to Washington Street on Erven 2877 and 315; this proposal allows an example of the Special Quarters to be retained and the part retention of the context of Bhunga Square: a single room within the retained Special Quarters building could operate as a Special Quarters single room residence museum. This room could be inhabited and with agreement between the CCT housing Directorate and the residents with input from the Langa Heritage Foundation (LHF), CCT Arts and Culture and the CCT Environmental and Heritage Resources Management (EHRM). The room could be a part of the Langa heritage sites available on walking tours and used as a part museum and 'living memory'. The remainder of the historic buildings is converted to be liveable family/single residential units and accommodation for civic uses (for example, crèche, information, technology room, civic facilities). This means the repair of structural faults and basic repairs (for example rainwater gutters, window and door joinery etc.) and the creation of bathrooms. The CCT Housing Directorate to restore the 4 historic buildings at the time of the project construction phase. The CCT Housing Directorate to investigate the naming of a historic building after Mr Hamilton Naki;
- The CCT Housing Directorate to generate a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) for the conservation of the site's historic buildings – this CMP should be approved the CCT Housing Directorate and EHRM and/or Arts and Culture;
- The retention of the Ablution Block on Erf 2877. This can be renovated for the ablutions use of the site's residents.
- The demolition of the existing structures on Erven 311, 315 and 2877 except for the 4 historic buildings as indicated on the development proposal (Section 5). This demolition entails the ablutions facilities on Erven 311 and 315, the formal and informal residential buildings except for the identified 4 building to remain on Washington street and the Ablution Block on Erf 2877;
- The construction of 3 and 4 level apartment buildings as indicated in Section 5;
- Photographically record the entire sites complex for the CCT records prior and during the demolition processes;
- Retain mature trees on corner of Bhunga Avenue and Washington Street;
- Effectively demarcate and secure Bhunga Square from negative impacts during the demolition and construction processes;
- Implement an Archaeologist watching brief at the time of construction;
- With the assistance of the Langa Heritage Foundation, install an interpretive plaque on the Special Quarters remaining historic building compiled by the CCT EHRM, mentioning the history of the precinct and the names of the significant past residents, for example Mr Chris Hani and Mr Hamilton Naki.

8.3.2 CIVIC CORE OPEN AREA (ERVEN 2988, 2989, 2990, 2991, 3004, 3005, 3006, 3007, 3008, 3009 & 3011)

To many people an open field is land opportunity should be used to accommodate the urgent need for residential accommodation. This opportunity can be realised in informal structures (by the local community) or formal structures (by the owners if the land). However, the assessment of the use and meaning of an undeveloped piece of land within a dense urban environment does result in an understanding of its cultural value.

In order to reduce the impacts of large new residential settlement in a sensitive historic precinct and site the proposal is recommended to:

- Further subdivision of the consolidated erf and a consolidation of this portion into the existing POS erf in order to secure it from future development and provide the necessary CCT management functions;
- Erven 3304, 3005 and 3006 are removed from the residential proposals in order for Guga S'Thebe to develop their theatre complex;
- The revised plan for the site with the exclusion of Erven 3004. 3005 and 3006 be submitted to CCT EHRM for approval.

8.3.3 NEW FLATS (ERF 3731)

The demolition of all the remaining buildings in the New Flats is assessed as satisfactory providing:

- A building of the same hostel type is retained on Erf 2574 (Zone 2);
- An interpretive plaque on the Jungle Walk street facade of the proposed building stating the history of the site and the stories of the names of the significant past residents to the approval of the LHF compiled by the CCT EHRM;

8.3.4 ENTRY SITES (ERVEN 3580 & 3581)

The specific recommendation for the proposed development is:

- An interpretive plaque on the corner of Ndabeni and Bhunga Ave is erected to the CCT EHRM and LHF approval stating the history of the site;

8.3.5 ZONE 2 (ERF 2574)

No specific recommendations for the proposed development are made for Erf 2574.

8.4 SOURCES

Interviews and personal communication:

Langa Heritage Foundation committee members: Mr Temba Nolutshungu, Professor Ron Davies

Mr Johan Cornelius, Mr Clive James and Mr David Hart: Environmental and Heritage Resources Management, City of Cape Town

Mr Peter Oscroft and Mr Sivuyile Mxokoze: Special Projects, Housing Directorate, City of Cape Town

Mr Peter Buttgens, Architect and Heritage Consultant

Project consultants:

- Mr Jac Synman and Mr Herman Potgieter: JSA Urban Designers and Architects
- Mr Stephen Boshoff: Consultant Planner
- Mr Manelisi Rarani and Mr Johan Kreuler, AURECON: Project Managers
- Mr Dieter Bassow and Mr Stephan Ohst: Architect Associated

Printed Materials

Adam, Arnoth: New Architecture in Historic Context paper presented at the ICOMOS general Assembly Budapest 1972

City of Cape Town, Hostels Transformation Programme Langa Gugulethu Nyanga Strategic Planning 2000, Consultants Architects Associated

City of Cape Town, Langa Heritage Survey, 2003

City of Cape Town, Spatial Development Plan and Environmental Management Framework Vol. 1 Basic Information and Analysis report March 2011

City of Cape Town, Cultural Heritage Strategy April 2005

City of Cape Town: Cru – Hostels Structural Report on Site Visits 2009, AURECON Consultant Engineers

Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning: Western Cape Provincial Spatial Development Framework, 2009

Fransen, H: *The Old Buildings of the Cape*, 2004 Jonathan Ball Publishers Limited

Herd, N: *The Bent Pine The trail of Chief Langalibalele*, Ravan Press Johannesburg 1976

Heritage Western Cape, A Short Guide to Grading Version 5, 2007

ICOMOS, Charter for the Conservation of Historic Towns and Urban Areas (Washington Charter 1987)

Marquis-Kyle, P and Walker, M: Australia ICOMOS: The Illustrated Burra Charter: making good decisions about the care of important places, Australia ICOMOS 1992

ICOMOS, Guidance on Heritage Impact Assessments for Cultural World Heritage Properties Draft May 2010

National Heritage Resources Act, No 25 of 1999

Ramphela Mamphela, Dr: *Bed Called Home: Life In The Migrant Labour Hostels in Cape Town* David Phillips Cape Town 1993

Worden, N., Bickford-Smith, V., and Van Heyningen, E. *Cape Town: The Making of a City*

David Philip 1998

Worden, N., Bickford-Smith, V., and Van Heyningen, E. *Cape Town: In the Twentieth Century*

David Philip 1999

City of Cape Town, Town Planning Conditions for Ikapa Date of Approval: 13 February 1990 File reference: GD2/19/2/D/5

South African Heritage Resources Agency, Submission to SAHRA Council Nomination for Grade 1 Status– the Township of Langa reference 9/2/111/0158